BILINGUAL CLASSROOMS: A CASE STUDY OF EDUCATORS' AND LEARNERS' PERSPECTIVES AT PRIVATE AND PUBLIC SCHOOLS IN LIMPOPO PROVINCE, SOUTH AFRICA

by

LEKGWARANENG JOSEPHINE MOLEPO

MINI –DISSERTATION
Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of

MASTER OF LANGUAGES

in

LANGUAGE EDUCATION

in the

FACULTY OF EDUCATION
(School of Education)

at the

UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO

SUPERVISOR: PROF M F RALENALA

2008

ABSTRACT

Argument directed to bilingual instruction in South Africa is not new. The issue of eleven official languages in education remains contested .The apartheid language in education policy infused with imbalance proficiency demands for educators and learners' in the country. The policy was replaced in 1997 with a new policy based on non – discriminatory language use and the internationally accepted principle of home language education in the contest of bilingual or multilingual framework. The policy was designed to accommodate home language (HL) maintenance, proficiency and first additional language (FAL), English for the majority of learners and optimal cognitive development. The policy has not been accompanied by any significant government or language department to ensure the implementation plan. It has however been met with several arguments of bilingual resource and well –trained educators. The argument paved a way into publications which have been used to deflect government's responsibility regarding bilingual instruction .The difference in language policy however disregard the fact that South Africa is multilingual and that home language is the most appropriate language of learning everywhere in the world. The implementation and understanding of bilingual and linguistic interdependence of both English and African languages have a role to pay in the development and sustainability of democratic country. The underlying implication is that since English and Afrikaans as the media of instruction that disadvantaged the majority of South African citizens over the years, it is time African languages be implemented alongside English or Afrikaans in education system. South Africa's new language in Education policy (LiEP) has been regarded as one of the best progressive in the world. The dissertation describes research that investigates the gap between the policy expectations and what is prevailing at some private and public primary school in Limpopo province.

DECLARATION

I declare that the mini-dissertation, hereby submitted to the University of Limpopo, for the degree of masters in language education has not previously in submitted by me for a degree of this or any other university; that is my work in design and in execution, and that all material contained here in has been duly acknowledged.

_____   _____

Initials & Surname (Title)   Date

Student Number:_____

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION AND ORIENTATION

CHAPTER TWO

LANGUAGE POLICIES AND THE EMERGENCE OF BILINGUALISM

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

CHAPTER FOUR

ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF DATA

CHAPTER FIVE

FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION AND ORIENTATION

1.1 Introduction

The end of apartheid and the emergence of a democratic state in 1994 ushered in changes in various social arenas in South Africa. Education is one of these arenas of change; change which is still unfolding and is likely to do so for years to come. The nine provinces reconstructed their administration, education and economic jurisdiction. Over and above that they revised policies that play a major role in the process by promoting communication amongst people and tolerance of one another also came into being. These new policies include the recognition of nine indigenous African languages as being equal. This has led to the establishment of structures of control maintenance of policy direction, such as the Pan South African Language Board (PANSALB). Language is central to human life. It is through language that people express their feelings and ideas, express their cultural diversity and social relations to manage their world. It is essential for the people to acquire as many languages as they can.

The recognition of all the nine languages led to the need to redress the imbalance of the past in the school situation. Learners were taught through the medium of English or other foreign languages in the best possible way to understand and assimilate learning content with ease and insight. This led to the introduction of bilingual education in which teaching is provided through the language of learning in school. English is used in the classroom alongside the child's home language. Fillmore and Valdeg (1986:648) regarded this type of education as an instructional approach in which learners who do not speak the teaching language of the school are partly taught in their home language.

Hakuta (1990:2) summarizes the importance of bilingual education by alluding to the fact that first language is generally seen as instrumental in so far as it is helpful in the acquisition of English proficiency and helps students keep pace with the learning of academic content matter while they acquire sufficient skill in English.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 108 of 1996 (3) (a) states that the national government and provincial governments may use any particular official languages for the purpose of governance, taking into account usage, expense, regional circumstances and the balance of the needs and preferences of the population as a whole or in the province concerned; the national government and each provincial government must use at least two official languages. Limpopo Province, like other provinces, has been granted powers to enable it to pursue political and socio-economic objectives, including official languages spoken in the province. Major official languages include, English, Afrikaans, Sepedi, Xitsonga, Tshiveda and to a lesser extent Isindebele. The challenge to the province is to bring the four indigenous languages to parity with English and Afrikaans as media of instruction.

1.2 What motivated the study?

South Africa is a multilingual and multicultural country. In the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS Grades R-9, 2002: 4-5) it is stated that all learners will learn their home language and at least one additional official language. The linguistic diversity of this country is acknowledged and valued in the constitution.

The home language should continue to be used alongside the additional language as long as possible. Learners are, therefore, obliged to learn at least two official languages as Fundamental subjects and other languages may be taken as Core and/or Elective subjects (NCS Grades 10-12:9). This leads to the development and promotion of bilingualism. Baker (1995:10) avers that being bilingual is much more than the simple ability to function in two languages. He continued that bilingualism has educational, social, economic, cultural and political dimensions.

These dimensions are research areas in their own right, but for the purpose of this study, only one area, i.e., bilingual education will be researched. The statement made by Baker above motivated the researcher to investigate the extent to which bilingual education is practiced at school. This investigation will be confined to the primary school and mainly Grade 4 classes.

1.3 Statement of the problem

The South African Constitution (1996) and the Language –in- Education Policy (1997) have declared the eleven languages spoken in the country as official. The Language in- in Education Policy Act 27 of 1996 gives learners the right to choose the language of learning and teaching upon admission. The Department of Education gives provision for Code-switching and Code-mixing as a method of teaching and assessing learners. Despite these directives, it remains questionable when it comes to the issue of indigenous African languages and the language of instruction (English). Language of instruction may turn to be a challenge to educators of different languages at different institutions.

1.4 Aim of the study

The principle of bilingualism as defined in a number of ways by a number of researchers motivated the current researcher to believe that it is a wide spectrum of definitions that renders the concept to too many interpretations and different perspectives even among educators. There is little evidence that bilingual instruction is practiced at schools.

1.4.1 Specific aims

1. To investigate the viability of bilingual instruction in the classroom
2. To investigate the occurrence of code-switching and code-mixing in the process of teaching and learning as aspects of bilingualism.
3. To investigate the perception of educators and learners towards bilingual instruction.

1.5 Research Questions

1. To what extent do educators make use of bilingual instruction in their classrooms?
2. Is there any difference between public and private primary schools, with regard to the language of teaching and learning?

1.6. Significance of the study

The present researcher believes that this study will contribute towards the opinion of the country to implement bilingual education to build a multilingual and multicultural South Africa. Her wish in this study was to find out the perception of the educators and learners towards bilingual instruction at schools. Data collection from private and public schools contacted reveal that bilingual education is not practiced, yet the intention of the country is to use all eleven official languages where applicable.

The researcher trusts that the process of implementing indigenous languages as media of instruction is the wish of the Department of Education and the Department of Languages in particular. It is also the wish of the researcher to see the educators and the learners perceiving bilingual education as a significant weapon towards language domination.

The study may even serve as an awareness means towards parents who think that the implementation of African languages as media of instruction is an obstacle from English language acquisition. If educators and learners accept the use of African languages as media of instruction, they will influence the parents and together they build a multilingual country.

1.7 Delimitation of the study

Although bilingualism in education is largely a universal phenomenon, this study focuses only on the Limpopo Province in the Republic of South Africa. The sample for study was taken from six primary schools in the province.

Three schools were selected from Mankweng area and three from Polokwane area. One educator from each school was selected to take part in the research project. Two learners per school also took part in the project. The researcher wrote letters of request to access the research sites. Area managers, school managers and educators selected were informed. The limiting factor is that the research is based on a small sample. This may lead to doubts as to whether the findings can be used for generalization purposes. Another factor is time and financial constraints. Thus, the research was conducted at six schools with six Grade 4 educators and 12 learners from two districts in Limpopo Province.

1.8 Population and Sampling

A sample of three private schools and three public schools was randomly selected to participate in the project.

1.9. Research Methodology

The researcher mainly employed qualitative method to observe and interview Grade 4 educators, but quantitative method was used for statistical purposes.

1.9.1 Research Design

1.9.1.1 Qualitative Approach

Creswell (1994:1-2) defines *qualitative approach* as an inquiry process of understanding a social or human problem, based on building a complex, holistic picture, formed with words reporting detailed views of informants, and conducted in a natural setting.

1.9.1.2 Quantitative Approach

This is an inquiry into social or human problem based on testing a theory composed of variables measured by number, and analyzed with statistical procedures in order to determine whether the predictive generalization of the theory is true (Creswell, 1994:2). In the current study, theories about the feeling of bilingual instruction are measured and analyzed. The collected data determine the truth concerning the educators' perspective.

1.9.2 Research instruments

Two instruments were used to collect data, namely, classroom observation and interview. The present researcher started by observation of the language used during the classroom activities; this acted as a follow-up to what prevailed during the observation. A schedule for observation was drawn to record the activities.

1.9.2.1 Observation

The present researcher was involved in the classroom instruction to observe the use of bilingual education offered by educators. The observation was non-verbal communication and was a planned activity. The schedule was drawn and taken to the classroom observation. The present researcher intended to observe the language usage in the classroom activities. The above-mentioned questions will help to observe the relationship between the educator and the learners and the way they make use of the language(s). Some learners do keep quiet if the language used during the activity is a problem to them; but if they understand the language they are able to participate. Learner support materials are written in English only. Thus, the educator has to code-switch or code-mix while teaching the learners.

1.9.2.2 Interviews

Interviews can be characterized in terms of their degree of formality, i.e., ranging from unstructured, semi-structured to structured interview. A semi-structured interview was used to enable the researcher to be involved in the discussion. In this type of an interview, a researcher has a general idea of the direction of the interview. For example, how do educators perceive bilingual education as developed and promoted by the education policy and language in particular? The researcher does not enter the interview with full-predetermined questions, but has direction of what is to take place. Alwright and Bailey (1991:60) wrote that this type of interview is flexible and gives the researcher power and control over the course of interview without being authoritarian. It also gives power and control to the interviewees to participate freely.

1.10 Definition of Concepts

The following are definitions of concepts as used in this study:

1.10.1 *Bilingualism*: It is the native–like control of two languages possessing minimal communicative skills in a second or foreign language (Hakuta, 1990).

1.10.2 *Constitution:* The supreme law of the Republic (South Africa) Act 108 of 1996.

1.10.3 *Indigenous languages*: Languages spoken by blacks/Africans in South Africa, viz., Sepedi; Sesotho; Tshivenda; Setswana; isiZulu; IsiXhosa; IsiNdebele, siSwati, and Xitsonga.

1.10.4 *Medium of instruction:* The language of learning and teaching at school.

1.10.5 *Private school*- An institution that provides instruction for children and at times adults. The institution is established, conducted and primarily supported by Non-Governmental Organization; a church or business enterprise.

1.10.6 *Public school:* The tax-supported institution that provides instruction for children and at times adults.

1.11 Structure of the study

Chapter One: Introduction and orientation

Chapter Two: Language policies and the emergence of bilingualism

Chapter Three: Research design and methodology

Chapter Four: Analysis and interpretation of data

Chapter Five: Findings, recommendations and conclusion

1.12 Conclusion

The future and strength of bilingualism lies in the speakers of all 11 official languages of South Africa. There is a common interest in maintaining the diversity and the particularity of South African culture and life personality. The declaration of 11 official languages offered the education system the opportunity to develop and promote all languages despite the availability of resources and expertise in bilingual instruction. The following chapter dwells on the policies that support the idea of bilingualism or multilingualism in the country.

CHAPTER 2

LANGUAGE POLICIES AND THE EMERGENCE OF BILINGUALISM

2.1 Introduction

In countries where more than one language is used in official duties and work situations, one language may dominate other languages by either minority or majority language group. In such situations there is a need for control and ensuring of linguistic status for all citizens in the country (Grosjean, 2001:34). This chapter focuses on the language policies that were designed prior to, and the development after the 1994 dispensation to correct and redress the imbalance of the past.

2.2 What is a language?

Language is a tool for thought and communication. Language constructs and expresses culture diversity and social interaction. Learning to use language effectively enables learners to think and acquire knowledge, to express their identity, feelings and ideas, to interact with others and to manage their world language proficiency is central to learning across the curriculum as learning takes place through language (Learning Programme Guidelines, 2001:8).

Language serves to differentiate the speakers from others by making the speakers belonging to a certain group by means of a similar use of language. Shaping linguistic differences also has an identity function. Cumperz (1982b) and Le Page and Tabouert-Keller (1985) in Auer, (1984:63) state that the way people use certain co-occurring linguistic elements enables them to perceive each other as members of certain groups. They create 'rules', so as to resemble themselves as closely as possible, with which from time to time they are able to identify their members. Utterances such as *'thobela'* are associated with the Sepedi speaking people. In Limpopo Province, for example, there are also people who speak Xitsonga, Tshivenda and isiNdebele. These languages identify different languages spoken in Limpopo, let alone dialects in the province.

2.2.1 The purpose of languages

The inclusion of languages in the National Curriculum Statements is governed by national policy in the form of the Language in Education Policy and the Norms and Standards for Languages that stipulate that all learners must receive tuition in at least two official languages until the end of Grade 12 (NCS, 2003:10-11). The purpose of the Department of Education is to promote additive multilingualism. This means that learners must learn additional languages while maintaining and developing their home languages at a high level. Bilingual education will make it possible for learners to transfer skills such as reading, writing and speaking, from language which they are most proficient to their additional languages.

This will lead to careers such as journalism, translation, language teaching, marketing, advertising, diplomacy, and so on. Bilingual instruction through code-mixing and code-switching and other methods will promote home languages and lay a sound foundation for learning additional languages. Different people use bilingualism in different ways. For some, bilingualism means an equal ability to communicate in two languages; for others, it means the ability to communicate in more than one language but with the possibility of greater skills in two languages, i.e., the ability to write and understand the language (Appel and Muysken, 1987.59).

In Limpopo, for example, there are four African languages that are used side by side with English and Afrikaans, i.e., Sepedi, Tshivenda isiNdebele and Xitsonga. Thus, for the people of Limpopo to communicate and trade together, they must speak these languages.

Mawasha (1987:7) cited by de Wet (2002) states that English came in handy when blacks who speak different languages like to have a common means of communication. That was not to say Africans should loose their languages at the expense of English. Mawasha continued by stating that the linguistic tilt towards English has engendered certain beliefs bearing on education of black South Africans within the context of multilingual/multicultural South Africa. The languages cover all official languages as Primary Languages, First Additional languages, and Second Additional languages.

The goal of National Curriculum Statement (NCS) is additive multilingualism for all South African learners. It is assumed that learners come to school with the knowledge of their first language and that first and second additional languages will be easily acquired. Learners who are literate in their first language will be able to transfer that literacy to the First Additional language.

The majority of learners in South Africa learn through the medium of their first additional language (English). The reason might be that black South Africans initially had realized that the only way to cope with the "new world" that the colonial conqueror was creating out of their traditional one was through literary education that was enshrined mainly in English.

According to Crawford (1989), among native English speaking students, being bilingual is considered to be a sign of a superior education and culture. Yet native non-English speaking students are told that their native language is not valued. This issue results in problems to most schools in provinces like Limpopo. Some parents register their children to private schools to learn better English. Black South Africans must capture and apply the knowledge about their languages and culture so that these languages can survive the onslaught of today's media, schools, religions and misguided tirades from the domination of English as a medium of communication to most prestigious class of people.

2.3 Language policies

2.3.1 Introduction

Sciffman (1996: 3) explains language policy as an area of linguistic communication which is the set of position, principle and decision reflecting that community's relationship with its verbal, respective and communicative potentials. South African language policy during the apartheid era has failed the majority of the learners because most of them were expected to learn in the medium of English, which was their second language.

The dominance of English stigmatized local languages and prevented them from being regarded as equally valid. The language policy statement argued that all learners should acquire proficiency in an indigenous language by the time they complete phase nine of their high school learning.

2.3.2 Provision for Language-in-Education Policy

The problem of languages of instruction is still an issue to date. In an attempt to redress the imbalance of the languages, the African National Congress (ANC) has stated that it recognizes the multilingual reality in South Africa, and, that, when in government, eleven languages will be declared official.

The inclusion of language in the National Curriculum Statement is governed by national policy in the form of the *Language in Education Policy* and the *Norms and Standards for Languages* that stipulate that all learners must receive tuition in at least two official languages from Grade 3 until Grade 12. (RNCS, 2003:19). The Department of Education's *Language in Education Policy* promotes additive multilingualism. This means that learners must learn additional languages while maintaining and developing their home languages at high level.

2.3.3 The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa

In the spirit of the *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*, the relationship between language and the NCS will heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights.

Despite the assurance that all eleven official languages will enjoy the equal status, there are some parents and educators who think that the implementation of African languages will shift or totally abolish the status of English in the education system. Eleven languages are declared official from nine provinces. By recognizing the historically diminished use and status of indigenous languages of the people, the state took positive stance for languages usage.

The measures to elevate the status and advance the use of these languages is the purpose of this study, wherein the present researcher investigates the viability of bilingual policy, which is to be implemented firstly in the context of indigenous African language framework as media of instruction.

Heugh (1999:29) proposes that after first language literacy has been established at the end of Grade 3, all learners should be subjected to a dual-medium combination of an African language plus English or Afrikaans or another 'community' language.

Heugh continues that when English is highly prized, there is only one viable option and this is bilingual education whereby adequate linguistic development is fore-grounded in the mother tongue, whilst the second language is systematically added.

2.3.4 The use of indigenous languages in education towards bilingualism

The implementation of bilingual instruction at schools, and in the foundation phase in particular, will assist the promotion of a multilingual and multicultural country of South Africa. The implication is that learners should reach a high level of proficiency in several languages, and become competent in the additional languages, while their home language is maintained and developed.

The government uses the constitution and policies to govern and develop, among others, the languages to be used in the country. All stakeholders were consulted to come up with the views that every citizen must be accommodated in the constitution and the language plan.

When the constitution was drawn, language was one of the most important tools amongst the eight Learning Area Statements. This is because a language enables us to achieve human rights and environmental justice. It is recommended that learners' home language should be used for learning and teaching wherever possible. This is practically important in the foundation phase where children learn to read and write.

2.3.5 The Language- in –Education Policy

The Department of Education (DoE, 1999:13:) indicates that home language foundation acts as support in learning second language, and that most of the academic learning that was taking place in the first language can easily be transferred to the second language.

Therefore, the issue of Language-in-Education policy stipulates that:

1. Every School Governing Body (SGB) must decide on and announce the language(s) of teaching and learning to be used at its school and how it intends to promote multilingualism within the school;

2. Each of the eleven official languages shall enjoy equal status and respect and can be used as a separate language of teaching and learning; and

3. Learners/parents should choose the language of learning and teaching upon admission. Schools must keep records of all requests for teaching in specific languages. Learners cannot be refused admission to school on the basis for language.

The declaration of indigenous languages along side English and Afrikaans promotes and develops bilingualism in the country. A case study read from the NCS Grades 10-12 *Participant Manual* (2005:17), indicates how a Grade 11 learner was excited to speak Tshivenda, English and Afrikaans. The problem rises when the learner's parents got a transfer to Durban. At a new school eThekweni, both the learner's home language (Tshivenda) and Afrikaans were not used.

2.3.6 Norms and Standards

Norms and Standards, in compliance with the constitution of the country, aim for promotion, fulfillment and development of the status quo of languages. This will protect the individual's language rights and means of communication in education; and will also facilitate the national and international communication through the promotion of bilingualism or multilingualism through cost-effective mechanisms. As such, the neglect of the historically disadvantaged languages in school education will be redressed. Given these provisions, a School Governing Body (SGB) must stipulate how a school will promote multilingualism through using more than one language of learning and teaching and/or offering additional languages as subjects, and/or applying special emersion or language maintenance programmes (NCS, 2003:20).

2.3.7 The South African Schools Act

In this Act, the Minister of Education determines norms and standards for language policy, mainly in public schools. Language in Education Policy states that:

1. The new language in language policy is conceived of as an integral and necessary aspect of the new government strategy of building a non-racial nation in South Africa.

2. It is meant to facilitate communication across the barriers of colour, language and religion while creating an environment in which respect for languages other than one's own would be encouraged.

The governing body of a public school may determine the language policy of the school subject to the constitution. No form of discrimination may be practiced in implementing policy determined under this law (Bruton,C et al, 2003: B 6).

Despite the language policies implemented in South Africa, mother tongue instruction is still a debatable issue. Some educators, learners as well as parents in particular areas are against the idea of implementation of African languages as media of instruction. The main concern is that if African languages are used as media of instruction, the latter's children will no more learn English.

Language in Education policy in terms of Section 3 (4) (m) of the National Education Policy Act, 1996 (Act 27 of 1996) indicates that the new language in language policy is conceived of as an integral and necessary aspect of the new government strategy of building a non-racial nation in South Africa. In public schools, the governing body may determine the language to be used as medium of instruction.

According to the Act, no form of discrimination may be practiced in implementing policy determined under Section 3(4) of 1996. The design of the schools Act was meant to lessen the administration burden where learners are denied admission due to their home languages. Bilingual instruction will assist to accommodate languages to be used at school.

2.3.8 The Revised National Curriculum Statement (2001)

Due to the argument for and argument against English or indigenous African languages, most education specialists, and linguists in particular, support bilingual education, as this will then accommodate all languages in South Africa as well as the development and promotion of bilingual and multilingual country.

To this effect, the *Draft Revised National Curriculum Statement: Languages,* released in July 2001, was more specific in its recommendation. It is recommended that the learners' home language be used for learning and teaching whenever possible, and that, First Additional and Second Additional languages be added later on.

This is particularly important where children learn to read and write. The statement reads as follows:

> *English is an additional language for the learners, the teacher said the school should make provision for special assistance and supplementary learning of the additional language, until such time as the learners are able to learn effectively in the language of learning and teaching.*

The negative attitude towards home languages and the domination of English as a medium of instruction is condemned by the Language in Education Policy (LEP). Both LEP and the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS), encourage learners and educators to promote bilingualism by using African languages as media of instruction.

The RNCS attempts to embody and uphold a democratic vision of society and the citizens that should emerge from our school system. Through the Learning Area Statements, the RNCS identifies the goal expectations and outcomes to be achieved through related learning outcomes and assessment standards. The additional languages should be introduced as a subject as early as possible. The home language should continue to be used alongside the additional language for as long as possible.

When learners enter a school where the language of teaching and learning in the classroom may consist of different learners who speak different languages, this makes bilingual instruction difficult, or even impossible. Therefore, some educators, especially at public schools, strive for code-switching and code-mixing. Educators use this method of teaching sometime not being aware that they apply bilingual instruction, as discovered during classroom observation. The problem is that the educators cannot speak all languages to accommodate different learners who speak different languages.

Webb (2003:80) supports the above-mentioned, viz., the national constitution, the South African Schools Act, the Revised Curriculum Statement and the Curriculum Statement when saying:

> *Major official African languages should be brought to parity with English and Afrikaans and that must be catered for by policy to restore the power relations between all the official languages. Provincial government must develop policy to guide people as to how it intends raising the marginalized official language to equity with the other major official languages. It must state how the State departments should stop advantaging English and disadvantaging other official languages.*

A nation that has more than one language has to build its own linguistic repertoires. South Africans are occasionally, engaged in more than one language which leads to code- switching or code-mixing, especially if they cannot communicate effectively in English.

2.4 Different languages for different purposes

Most authors see the principle of multilingualism from different perspectives. From the Biblical point of view (Genesis 11:7), God uses mixed languages of people of Babylon as a tool to destruct their mission when they wanted to build a tower: (Negative use of languages). In the New Testament (Acts 2:2-7), the Apostles of Jesus Christ were filled with the Holy Spirit and began to speak in different languages such as Parthian, Elamites and Medes; languages of Mesopotamia, Judea and Cappadocia, Pontus and many others: (Positive use of languages). The purpose was that people should understand the Word of God through their languages. The same applies to South Africa today. People speak different languages for social, economic and political needs. Languages are equal only before God and the linguist". The sad and unfair reality behind the aphorism is the negative attitude towards mother tongues, which at the same time favours the international languages.

Langa (2005:14) states that one may not be wrong to assert that African languages are far from reaching the international language level. The languages still require the state to take positive measures to elevate their status and advance their usage. The languages whose status can be enhanced by holding a series of language awareness campaigns, where scholarship in the African languages and other prizes are provided, and a language if chosen by few learners to their language of learning and teaching, requires special and conditional attention that will not ultimately cripple the future of the learners.

There are people who feel comfortable when they speak English more or better than their home language(s). They usually claim that their languages do not have enough terminology to express themselves clearly. There are those who say that English is the language of communication worldwide, while at the same time is the language of business. They argue that people who speak English stand a better chance in life.

Jenkins (1995:52) quotes some of the South African school children speaking, who live in big cities and attend English medium schools whose home language is not English, and this is what they said:

> *When it comes to speaking English I think I am real good. English is a real*
> *good language. When I talk it I feel it because it is tomorrow's language,*
> *it is tomorrow's jobs, and it is everything to me. I like using big words in*
> *English I think they make me feel intelligent, words like extraordinary*
> *and superstitious. English is the best…up with English up!*

The above-given extract indicates that it is a very common feeling for school learners to wish to be taught in English than their African languages. English still enjoys the enormous prestige as an official language in most African countries due to its utility in education, securing good jobs and advancements, and also due to the negative prejudice Africans have towards their own languages.

It is not English per se that is a concern to most researchers, but that the language is still dominating even though African languages are declared official too. Without African languages alongside English South Africa will never reach the destiny of a multilingual and multicultural country.

Hartshorne (1992:63) supports the idea of mother tongue instruction that children should first learn in mother tongue and later on transfer to First Additional and Second Additional languages. When he points out that language is a repository and means of articulation of values, beliefs, prejudices, traditions, past achievements and history. It is the distinguishing characteristics of the human being, it is what it makes people see themselves as different, and it is related to issues of identity, position and power.

2.5 The importance of language in cultural activities.

Language is a dual character: it is both a means of communication and a carrier of culture. Bokomba (1995:1) stresses the role that language plays in the cultural identity of children. Bloch (1999) is of the opinion that the tendency to ignore home languages in school may have very damaging effect hardly conducive to the feeling and comfort which go hand in hand with successful learning.

A possibility exists that English is the African child's most important language of learning and teaching, the child can become anglicized - at the expense of his/her own cultural heritage (Matsela, 1995:50; Webb, 1992:114; Mawasha:1987:114) cited by de Wet:2002)). Most children like to greet, sing and pray in English, even though their first language is Sepedi, Xitsonga, Tshivenda and so on. (Matsela: 1995:50 also cited by de Wet: 2002) as well observed the inclinations in fellow Africans: outright dislike for or indifference to cultural and traditional artifacts, values, and ways of behaving and relating; and "hurried assimilation of the so called modern culture's obvious and translucent ways and items." Bilingualism solves the differences as all languages will be used.

2.6 Valuing language diversity as a natural resource

If languages represented by both White and Black Africans were seen as resources for the country, such as gold, silver, platinum and other important minerals in the country, there would be public clamour to set up investigative commission to monitor and prevent their rapid extinction.

Littlebear (2007) supports the use of both English and African languages that pupil must devise their own means to counter the negative effects of cultural transition. The transition forces the current educational, economic, political and social circumstances to pull together towards the multilingual and multicultural society. The linguistic resources represented by these groups need continuous and focused attention by educators and policy makers who should exercise creatively in finding means through which these resources can be harnessed and developed. The valuing of other languages as equally important may avoid conflicts such as the one that happened in Limpopo Province, where some parents are against the development of African languages in the school.

Management of Capricorn High school rejects the inclusion of African language in their school curriculum. That made Capricorn high school to disagree with the Department of Education. The school being the only Ex-Model C institution in the Limpopo Province that is still resisting the implementation of that language policy was visited by a delegation from the Department of Education for inquiry and intervention. The principal was even suspended and some investigations were conducted. The policy dictates clearly that learners should take their mother tongue as their first subject and then the institution's medium of instruction as a second subject. Although 80 percent of the learners are black, 99 percent of the teaching staff is white. This may be the reason to resist against the implementation of African languages (Molefe 2006:6).

English is generally associated with higher socio-economic status. It is the common social language of the educated and economically better off. Schmied (1991:105) states that providing learners with bilingual education is a way of providing the nation with language investment.

 Schmied continued that the advantage of language education is that, learners ensure basic literacy and fluency in home languages before adding other language dimensions like English. It is clear that English is associated with better education, behavior and social life.

2.7 Choices of language of instruction

When schools provide education in their mother tongue, they give them two things at the same time: knowledge and literacy. This helps make the English they hear and read more comprehensible. This is because people learn to read by reading. Once they can read in one language (home language), they will be able to read in another language (English).

2.7.1 Mother tongue instruction

The indigenous African languages were considered unofficial, and as such the languages were regarded for informal uses such as cultural activities, rituals and interpersonal communication among members of the community.

Therefore, it is believed that the languages were incapable of expressing modern concepts, especially in Mathematics and Technology. So, as a newly-independent country, South Africa was also faced with some of the problems typical of many post-independent multilingual countries (Herbert, 1992:115).

According to the Revised National Curriculum Statement (2003:27), learners should master basic skills in their home language (i.e., African languages) and simultaneously or shortly after, they should master the First Additional Language (i.e., English) to such an extent that they can switch to this language as their Language of Learning and Teaching (LoLT) in the Intermediate Phase and still practise to learn more.

The ANC's "Policy Framework for Education and Training" (1994:64) document, points out that since language is essential to thinking and learning, learners must be able to learn in the language or languages which best suit this purpose". Such a language is assumed to be one's mother tongue.

Parents should be encouraged to become more involved in laying the foundation for the mother tongue of the learners, and not to only facilitate their children's development in this language, but to also encourage the mastery of as many language skills in mother tongue as possible.

Parents should be engaged in regular conversations with their children through their home languages to enrich the children' language, and minimize to speak in English. This will enable them to acquire more concepts and later transfer them into second language.

2.7.2 Opposing views to mother tongue instruction

Despite the language policies implemented in South Africa, mother tongue instruction is still a debatable issue at academic institutions. Some educators, learners and parents are against the idea of implementing African languages as LoLT. According to Mawasha (date unknown), the English engendered certain beliefs on black South African education. The black Africans have a notion that the medium of African languages will lower the standard of their education and training.

Therefore, it must be discouraged. The notion is further discouraged by the perception that African languages are too local and cannot be used internationally.

2.7.3 Opting for English instruction

According to Kaschula and De Vries (2000:3), it is ironic that English is regarded as the language of trade, because it is spoken by a small minority and it is thereby excludes a large proportion of the population from participating in the economic mainstream.

Webb (2003:107), and Beukes & Barnard (1994: 47) stress that upward mobility is impossible without proficiency in English. Most African speakers do not prefer African languages as the media for instruction. They prefer English at the expense of their language and culture. Many learners are of the opinion that English is a prestigious language even where the majority of the population consists of non- English speakers. Proficiency in English, per se, has a prestige factor among many South Africans.

It is indicated before that some people associate English with better opportunities for education, life and bright future, the above-mentioned quotation shows the difference between learners at private and public schools. This emphasizes the fact that, since language goes hand in clove with culture, the learners in private schools behave better than those who attend public schools.

2.8 Bilingual Education

The current educational system offers the choice between English, Afrikaans or African languages as media of instruction for their children. A better solution would be to offer genuine bilingual education (Luckett et al., 1993). South Africa, like other bilingual or multilingual countries, is engaged in code-switching between various languages of the country.

Heugh (2001:28) puts it that bilingual education for each child within a multilingual education policy does not mean the choice between English, Afrikaans or African languages. It means both developing the first language and adding a second or third language in the best possible manner to ensure the successful learning of the second language.

The same author argues that African languages do indeed have the capacity to deliver quality education to the majority of South African learners, and that they will benefit enormously, both linguistically and cognitively, from (bilingual or multilingual) mother tongue education, alongside English. The option of balancing the African languages with English and Afrikaans is to apply the principle of bilingual instruction at school level. The more the speakers use more than one language through code-switching, the more flexible and proficient they will be.

This can be obtained through additive bilingualism. The concept of additive bilingualism means the gaining of the second language while the first language is maintained. Heugh (2001:4), like other linguists, issued a plea for mother tongue as the language of learning alongside English. The statement is that, in a multilingual society, where a language such as English is highly prized, the only one viable alternative, and this is bilingual education, wherein adequate linguistic development is fore-grounded in the mother tongue while the second language is systematically added. If the mother tongue is replaced, the second language will not be adequately learned and the language proficiency in both languages will be compromised.

2.8.1 Structured bilingual education

The Department of Education has now opted for a system of "structured bilingual education found in dual-medium programmes" (DoE, 1997:1). The ultimate intended outcome of this policy is that two or more languages (declared official languages) will be used as languages of learning for all learners in the country (Vinjevold, 1999:211; Alexander, 2000:17). When people use their languages, no one will feel little, that his /her language is a minor.

2.8.2 Bilingual approaches

a) *The maintenance or Developmental approach fosters parallel learning in two languages Bilingual instruction teaches academic subjects in the learners' primary language.*

b) The *Transitional approach* teaches academic subject's primary language but progressively use more English. As the learners' English language proficiency increases, the primary language is dropped.

c) *English Second Language (ESL) approach* is where learners attend one or more classes in which they learn to speak and write in English and sometimes go over material studied in other classes.

If languages are treated equally starting from academic institutions people will consider these languages equally important everywhere, i.e., in public places, public transports, and wherever a conversation is taking place.

2.8.3 Reasons for bilingual instruction

Most Black Africans are without English background knowledge from home. They learn the language for the first time at school. Their parents can hardly help them to do the homework as they are as well illiterate about the language. Therefore, the diversity of languages plays a major role to Black Africans in general. Learners learn effectively when they are instructed through the medium of more than one language.

Ramirez et al (1991) state that, native- language instruction does not retard the acquisition of English, well-developed skills in the native language are associated with high levels of academic achievement. Therefore, bilingual education is a valuable skill, for individual and for the country. The option of balancing the African languages with English is to apply the principle of bilingual instruction at school level. This can be achieved by additive bilingualism. This means the gaining of the second language while the first language is maintained.

The new South African government learnt from the mistakes of the former government and through several processes of consultations that legislated language policy that gave eleven languages official status. Prior to 1994, English and Afrikaans were privileged and used as the official languages of South Africa. African languages were undervalued and underdeveloped by the education system. The learners, who protested against "Bantu Education" and in particular against Afrikaans as medium of instruction, realized the effect of the exclusion of African languages in the education system.

2.8.4 Bilingual instruction and learning

Bilingual instruction will be used to develop competency in an African language, not at the expenses of competence in English.

The present general understanding of the process is that there are no educators who are experts of bilingual instruction, and that there are no learners support material written in bilingual curriculum. Schools are open to learners of all races, cultures, and religion and value systems. Educators are increasingly being confronted with multicultural learners who speak different languages.

They have the right to learn through the languages of their choice. This necessitates a totally new teaching style and approach to the learners. Krashen (1996: 3) supports the idea of bilingualism when he states that "Bilingual programs provide learners with both subject matter and literacy in the first language. Learners who previously developed literacy in the first language have a fair easier time developing literacy in a second lingua franca".

The knowledge of several skills and languages enables people to venture through the society and the world at large. The skill of operating a computer, for example, can enable one to seek for information nationally and internationally. The knowledge of many languages is needed for effective participation in the society that has to expand beyond listening and speaking. In Cape Town, for example, most primary schools practice their classroom activities in isiXhosa, English and Afrikaans. Educators are trained by PRAESA (i.e., Project for study of Alternative Education in South Africa) and School of Education at the University of Cape Town (Pluddeman, 2002:4).

According to Pluddeman (ibid) the implementation of IsiXhosa as medium of instruction is that the increasing use of English as the Language of Learning and Teaching (LOLT) in the foundation phase, (Grades 1-3) negatively affects teaching and learning. Educators teach in English and clarify the learners in IsiXhosa (home language).

Arias and Casanova (1993: 192) state that: Teachers who wish to work in bilingual setting must be proficient in at least two languages. They must be knowledgeable about pedagogical strategies in those languages.

They must also know how to integrate the learners at various levels of linguistic and conceptual complicity. Finally they must have working knowledge of the rules of appropriate behavior of at least two ethnic groups and be able to infuse the knowledge into the teaching process. The distinction between functional skills used in interpreting language and the contextualized language maybe the challenging factor for the educators. Krashen (1998) states that one of the most fundamental assumptions underlying the efficiency of bilingual instruction is that, skills and knowledge in native language transfer to English.

Thus, a child having the content knowledge already available should greatly facilitate the learning of the appropriate vocabulary items (in the second language) since they provide comprehensible input. The notion of transfer of skills is also supported by Goldman, Reyes and Varnhagen (1984) in Krashen (1998), when they say that bilingual children employ similar comprehension strategies when listening to Aesop's fables in two languages, thus providing indirect evidence that high order cognitive processes manifest themselves regardless of the specific language.

Tara (1997: 22) in Smith(1994) supports bilingual instruction when citing an example of a Mrs. Lam who is said to use three languages, viz., English, to teach the learners; Cantonese, to help the learners when they encounter problems; and Mandarin language, to counsel learners who have personal problems. This method helped Lam to teach Mathematics classroom successfully. Despite the success, the practice raised questions such as the following:

 1. Should learners switch to their home languages in the classroom where language of instruction is not their home language?
 2. Should multilingual educators be encouraged to practice bilingual or multilingual instruction in the classroom?
3. Whose language is accommodated in the system of education?
4. Are all languages used equally?

The above-mentioned questions may lead to the notion that some people do not like to promote their languages. People like to see English being the only language of instruction from generation to the next. This seems to be the case in South Africa. Stakeholders responsible for Language Planning and the Language Policies tried their best to balance languages and give them the same status, but English is still the dominating language of learning and communication.

The Department of Education through RNCS (2003: 20) states that Home and First Additional language address the six Learning Outcomes in the Curriculum. They may differ in the Assessment Standards prescribed for each Learning Outcomes. Once the learners are able to understand some simple classroom instructions in their Additional Language, the educator can manage the classroom in two languages, i.e., bilingual instruction. This provides learners with exposure to their Additional Language in a practical way and Language in Education Policy's view to develop multilingualism.

2.9 Bilingual Education in South Africa

South Africa has had different models of schools since the schooling became a mass enterprise in the first half of the 20th century. The majority of South African learners went to state schools. Prior to 1991, schools were racially exclusive in their staff and pupils profiles. The abolition of racial school segregation in the early 1990s saw an influx of Black learners into city schools formerly reserved for Whites, Indians, and Coloureds (Lubisi & Murphy, 2002:255). Schools in Black African townships, however, were entirely Black African in terms of learner profile.

However, despite the declaration of the government to promote multilingualism, people choose to learn and teach in English only to the detriment of African languages. It is clear to most Africans that speakers of African languages have been denied proper access to English, and yet it is proficiency in English that opens the doors of learning and success in life.

2.10 The results of bilingual programme

The National Coalition of Advocates for Students (Vinjevold, 1999:220) has identified the following six components of quality bilingual programmes:
   a) Clearly articulated goals;

b) Identification and assignment of learners;

c) Qualified and well-trained staff;

d) Availability of appropriate instructional material;

e) Strong evaluation and research component; and

f) Parental and community involvement.

The cited results indicate that to be proficient in more than one language is important especially to those who live in multilingual and multicultural countries like South Africa. People travel around the country trading, work-shopping different people of different languages. Sometimes their expectations are not fulfilled because of language differences. There are people who still believe that a person's status is often measured by his/ her proficiency in English. Some people seem not to be proud of their languages and culture. According to Beukes and Bernard (1994:47) the unwillingness of many African language speakers, to use their language as LoLT stem from their fear that they will loose the opportunity of education and better jobs if they are not able to converse fluently in English.

Buckett (1995:74) writes about additive bilingualism as the gaining of competence in a second language while the first is maintained. Bilingualism can only develop in a social context where both languages and their cultures are valued and reinforced. To develop and promote bilingualism, the first language of a child must be used as the initial medium of instruction to ensure that the academic progress is not hindered.

The acquisition of other languages will be practiced as additive to what the child knows from the first language. The new generation must be versatile in languages. The government needs leaders with a vision that includes African languages and cultures; leaders who can articulate that vision to the society; and leaders who can transfer that vision into constructive action for the greater educational, economic, political and social advantage for the people.

2.11 Bilingual education in other countries

It is helpful to distinguish two goals of bilingual education: The development of academic English and school success, and the development of heritage languages build a bilingual country. Confusion about the first goal is how children can acquire English, their second language, while being taught in their first language?

When the child is given good education in primary language, the child is given knowledge that makes English input more comprehensible. A child who understands Life Orientation in the first language will have a better chance understanding Life Orientation taught in English more than the child without this background knowledge. More comprehensible English input means more acquisition of English. There are countries that support the idea of bilingual or multilingual education to minimize linguistic and cultural diversity, and South Africa is one of those countries.

2.12 Bilingual education in the United States of America

In 1664, there were eighteen languages spoken in the Northern America. English was established in the 17th century, but not accepted by all the citizens. Bilingualism was used among the working class and the educated as a spoken language (Crawford, 1989:19).

According to Crawford (1989:19), Franklin, a politician, also failed to influence the German speaking people to speak English. He used the Christian Knowledge School to re-establish English to the Germans. Everything went well until the German parents realized his mission and withdrew their children from the school. They discarded English in favour of German, French, Greek or Hebrew as their national languages. An Ohio law of 1839 authorized instruction in English – German in areas where parents requested it. During 1870s, however, new restrictive language laws began to appear. Even native –born, English-speaking Black Americans were affected by the Jim Crow laws that imposed literacy requirements for voting.

According to Fillmore (2004), bilingual education is hardly a radical idea. It is the most logical, humane and pedagogically sound approach to educating children where there is great language diversity in the population, and a desire to development. This practice, in turn, calls for a lot more planning, preparation and development than people realized.

Fillmore continues that German-English bilingual schools were run in Ohio, Minnesota, and Maryland at the turn of the century. Norwegian, Italian, Czech, Dutch and Polish were also used in bilingual instruction at the beginning of that century. In 1947, Louisiana adopted the identical provision for English and French. Later in 1850, the Territory of New Mexico did so for English and Spanish. By the 1900, according to historian, Kloss, more than 6 000 000 American children were receiving education through bilingual instruction.

When a country, as a language developing country, is in the process of implementing bilingual instruction at school level, code-switching and code-mixing are necessary tools. The challenging factor is the resources to run the system. There is a great need for learners' support material as well as trained educators who can offer bilingual instruction. Maybe, this will minimize the exodus of learners to private schools, because both public and private school will turn to be bilingual medium schools.

2.13 Bilingual Education in Canada

In Canada, bilingual education was introduced through immersion education. In this model, half the curriculum is taught in English and the other half French. When the model is applied in the Intermediate Phase of schooling (Grades 4, 5 and 6) it is referred to as Mid-Immersion Program (Keith and Swain, 1997).

Cummins and Swain (1992:41) conducted a research and discovered that teaching literacy skills in two languages at the same time causes confusion in mastering linguistic features and thus came out with dual-medium instruction. The implication for bilingual education is that it is preferable initially to teach literacy-related skills directly in only one language. Once literacy-related skills are well-established in one language, they will then transfer readily and rapidly to other languages.

Herbert and Lauren, (1991) overviewed the French immersion programmes offered in Canada. They gave evidence that a programme is considered to be immersion if 50% of each school day takes place in French and 50% in English. The programme was applied by the time children are 10 to 11 years. Some learners perform better in English than in their first languages, that is, reading and writing through their home languages. The reason might be that most of the learners are exposed to English resources than to material written in their first languages. While, on the other hand, young people prefer movies and TV programmes that are broadcast in English.

They like to read books and magazines written in English than the once written in African languages. Some young children can hardly read a Bible written in Sepedi, yet they are also not such proficient in English. The development and promotion of African languages is to use English together with these African languages to promote bilingualism.

2.14 Bilingual education in Israel.

Spolsky, (1996) states that, a number of fundamental changes have taken place in policy concerning the place of languages in Israel education. Israel is one of the countries with 600 000 Russian speakers, 50 000 Ethiopians and 5 500 000 Hebrew speakers. The population did not support the idea of bilingualism except the Hebrew-Arabic bilingual among the minority Arabic speaking population.

Gradually English continues to flourish and spread in all sectors of Israel population, but Hebrew was maintained to be the language of law even in court. In Israel, English is considered the first foreign language and is optional in the 3rd and 4th grades of schooling and becomes compulsory throughout the rest of the school system. French is recognized as important because of cultural, political and economic ties and is taught as optional from Grades 5 to 12. Russian language, on the other hand, is an optional language for new immigrants. Students are also encouraged to study languages such as Latino, Spanish and German. In the 1970s English became the compulsory language at high school level. English was considered the international language and was taught by the immigrant English speaking teachers.

The trend in language education strengthened the move from monolingual (Hebrew) plus English as a programme to multilingual and language maintenance. The programme raised the following questions among the Israelis:

- Will English ultimately threaten Hebrew?
- Will Russian be more successful in maintaining itself than other languages?
- Will significant sections of the Jewish population learn Arabic?
- Will the Arabic minority maintain their language?
- How can other languages be added?

These questions brought about the new emphasis on language education, and new policy provides an atmosphere in which more questions were raised and discussed. This is how bilingual education came into existence from generation to another.

A similar parttern is portrayed by the statistics released after the 1996 census, which indicates that 84 percent of Polokwane's residents were Sepedi speaking, followed by 7,5 percent Afrikaans, 2,3 percent English, 2,2 percent Xitsonga speaking residents. Tshivenda (0,6 percent) and isiNdebele (0,6 percent) speakers were by far the minority cultural group. The statistics support the complaint that Sepedi as the major language in Polokwane is not used as the language of instruction in schools and medium of communication in economic empowerment. Bilingual education is the remedy for the above complaint because when people mix languages, the implication is that all languages are accommodated and promoted.

The knowledge of languages as being the key to all information is supported by Brussels (2003: 13) when he states that language learning is for all citizens throughout their lives. People need to be aware of other languages. These need to happen in every home, every library and every cultural centre or business.

Every language is a system, different from others, in which are culturally ordained the form and categories by which the personality does not only communicates, but also analyze nature, notice or neglect types of relationships and phenomena, channels reasoning and builds the house of consciousness.

An example of bilingual instruction is cited in Cape Town where Neville Alexander (2005) conducted a sink or swim project through the SABC 3 programme. The theme of the project is 'The importance of mother tongue instruction'. In a Grade 6 science class, the educator, Mr. Bishop, asked a Xhosa speaking educator to teach through the medium of IsiXhosa. The science classroom consisted of both Xhosa and white learners. It was hard for the English speaking learners to pronounce the term 'ghada' meaning 'fry' in English. The English speaking learners complained that they will fail the subject if it is taught in the medium of IsiXhosa. On the other hand, the Xhosa speaking learners complain that they will fail science if the medium of instruction is English.

The indication is that bilingual instruction is the solution (i.e., both English and IsiXhosa). This statement is supported by the isiXhosa first language examiner (SABC 3 programme 2005) of the Western Cape Department of Education that the Xhosa should know English, and the English speaking should as well learn IsiXhosa. The emphasis was on the two-way-programme.

In a 2005 *The Star* article, Naledi Pandor, the Minister of Education, stated that it was never the intention of the Education Department to make English optional as it was previously reported. The minister continued to say that English will remain the compulsory subject in schools where it is used as medium of instruction. The statement was responding to the concern that the Minister wanted to replace English with African languages as media of instruction.

In a 2005 *The Citizen* article, Pandor's stated that all 11 official languages must be promoted and allowed to thrive. All languages must be available as subject choices. There is no campaign against single-medium. People should make use of their languages fearlessly. They must consider their languages as valuable to market and communication. Educators face the challenge of cultural and language diversity at schools. Some parents support the idea of bilingualism through the implementation of African languages.

2.15 The use of English as medium of instruction at primary school level

As it was discussed in the previous sections, most African language speakers do not prefer mother tongue as the LoLT. They prefer English at the expense of their language and culture. English is regarded as the language of economy, social and politics globally.

Most learners are generally of the opinion that English is the precious language even where the majority of the population consists of non-English speakers.

Crawford (2007:3) states that "The English-Only movement' is not about promoting English. It's about restricting the use of other languages. It is about scapegoat immigrants for many of this country's social problem. It is about limiting the rights of language minority groups. For everyone who believes in the principle of democracy, tolerance and equality, there are plenty of reasons to oppose English-Only law.

In South Africa, for instance, English is still the dominating language of learning and teaching. The Member of the Executive Council (MEC) for Education in the Limpopo Province, Dr Motswaledi is concerned about the use of English at the expense of mother tongue, especially at lower grades. The MEC says that parents who want to challenge the government policy just because they want their children to be taught English as their first language, should be ashamed of themselves. How can they promote things which rob their children of their heritage and roots? *Sunday Sun* (2006). This issue made the MEC to instruct that all schools (including private schools) in the Limpopo Province should ensure that pupils from Grades R to 3 are taught in their mother tongue.

The MEC continued to say:

> *I thought I share my happiness with all African parents who sent their children to model C schools, but I was wrong. For those who don't know much about the language policy, it is simple to say learners whose home language is not English, are required to take their home language as first language in school. We have learnt with regret that this policy is no longer being implemented. We are worried because our children are being academically terrorized. Our education system is being negatively affected.*

The MEC assured the citizens that the inclusion of African languages does not ban English as the medium of instruction. The only concern is that English is perceived as superior to the children's mother tongue; and it is so strong that even two year-olds at crèches are being forced to speak the language. Despite the declaration of the government to promote African languages, people choose to learn and teach in English instead of African languages, continued Motswaledi.

It is clear to most South Africans that speakers of African languages have been denied proper access to English and yet it is proficiency in English which opens the doors of learning and success in life. In South Africa, for instance, the law is not against indigenous languages as the LoLT's, but English is the dominating LoLT.

Most parents fear that the implementation of African languages as media of instruction will deny their children the opportunity to become better and full citizens of South Africa, more especially, because currently English is the language of economic and social empowerment. Black South Africans are in the majority in this country; together they can improve and develop a successful bilingual education.

Some educators, especially at primary school level, opt for code-switching and code-mixing to clarify some concepts to the learners in the classroom situation. This strategy is even practiced at secondary school level. Time and again, educators switch to mother-tongue to clarify the learner. The pedagogical considerations involve bilingual education. Knowledge and skills acquired in the first language not only transfer to the second language; they also support English acquisition. So, at the classroom level, restrictions on the use of native-language instruction, especially in the early grades, are likely to make the English Second Language educators' job more difficult.

Crawford's (1996:13) review and response to the Congressman's arguments to support bilingual instruction is that:

a) English has been the major force uniting Americans as a nation;
b) 'The good old' immigrants of yesterday were quick to learn English and make America great – unlike today's ungrateful newcomers;
c) Bilingual services make life 'too easy' for non-English-speakers, providing a distinctive to learning the language; and
d) Language diversity is inherently divisive and will inevitably lead to ethic conflict.

According to Kaschula and De Vries (2001:1), the death of apartheid has paved the way for change regarding the status and use of African languages. Theoretically, the new constitution provided status and an official role to all South African languages. However, in reality, it would seem that English remains the preferred (LoLT).

The South African Language Board (PANSALB) notes that most of the people who are multilingual in South Africa, speak languages which are indigenous to the country, at home and in their immediate community. It is established by the PANSALB (1998:10) that multilingualism is of value in South Africa because it enables, among others the following:

1. The constitution to offer the opportunity to reclaim the value of linguistic pluralism, and in so doing to rediscover a hidden store of knowledge; and
2. The value of people who have access to indigenous knowledge and language systems including South African Sign Language, and who are multilingual.

The concern of mother-tongue is indicated in Nicol (2005) when he states that a mother had to pay for her daughter to attend isiXhosa lesson which is her home language. The reason is that her child is fluent in English but very poor in isiXhosa. The mother's concern is that English becomes the medium of instruction too early. They have no language skill at all, neither mother tongue nor English. This stops them from having a deep *Understanding* of important ideas in Mathematics, Science and Literature.

The concern of the Xhosa parent indicates that some parents are impressed when the children speak English fluently, but they do not want them to be illiterate with their home languages. Children should learn English but not at the expense of African languages. Most parents intend to invest language and culture in their children's education. Education should be the investment of African language and culture through the ages. Smith (1994:11) is of the same opinion when he writes that language development occurs when children develop literacy in their home language and the language develops to second language. People learn to read by reading, by making sense of what is on the page. It is, therefore, easier to learn in the language they understand.

The two statements above make the researcher to investigate the usage of languages at private and public schools. It has come to the researcher's attention that most learners at private schools are more proficient in English than in their home languages. Most public school educators switch from the language of instruction to African languages in the process of the activity. The reasons being, learners sometimes participate when educators switch to their home-languages.

2.16 Code-switching

Code-switching and code-mixing are well-known traits in speech pattern of the average bilingual in human society**.** Hymens defines *code-switching* as a common term for alternative use of two or more languages, varieties of languages even speech style, while Bokamba (1989) in Ayeomoni (2006) defines *code-switching* as the mixing of words, phrases and sentence boundaries within the same speech event.

Auer (1984:51) states that research methodology and its underlying assumptions have resulted in long discussion about what should not be considered code-switching versus, code-shifting, code-mixing, borrowing, transfer, insertion, trans-code marker – or whatever the concepts in use may be.

Code-switching is one possible outcome of speakers acting in a particular situation of language contact. It is observed, especially in public areas, and public transport where people of different languages become virtuosos in loud and fast code-switching conversation. In the current study, code-switching was observed between the educators and the learners.

For example, in Life Orientation lesson, the educator was code-switching when she emphasizes that *'morogo wa leroto* (wild spinach) is one of the best vegetables available in most communities. The educator had to code-mix and says 'do you like *leroto* learners?' It was interesting to observe that even those who indicated that they do not know *leroto* said 'yes'.

In most public schools code-switching has been increasingly observed. As for linguistic forms, code-switching educators mostly switch discourse markers, for example, when concluding their turns with '*le a kwešiša*'? meaning, *do you understand*? *O, ga go bjalo*? meaning, *isn't it*?

According to Le Page (in Auer, 1984:63), a speaker's choice of language is regulated by his or her aims, interlocutors, such as parents, teachers, friends, superiors, as well as through media, a speaker learn when and how to code-switch. Furthermore, the speaker knows which values of functions or identity are transported thereby. Code-switching if not used carefully may result in a language problem of not reflecting the actual language usage of the speaker, and that the 'unit of a language is not always the sole salient and relevant sociolinguistic unit for the speaker.

This is usually observed when the speaker is angry or excited. For example, when a child misbehaves in class the educator may use any language other than the medium of instruction, like, what do you think you are, *ke tla go bolaya o a kwa*?'(I will kill you, do you understand?).

On the other hand, Li Wei in Auer (1984:157) states that code-switching can be used together with other repair mechanisms to solve problems arising from violation of the rules governing turn allocation, which generates simultaneous talk. Sometimes when utterances in one language sound more polite, it is better to switch to it to calm the situation. For example, when an elderly person is angry, one may say *'a e tshwe lebja mmina Tlou'*, meaning *take it is easy*.

2.17 Code-mixing

Bokamba (1989) in Ayeomoni (2006) defines *code-mixing* as the embedding of various linguistic units such as affixes, words, phrases and clauses from a co-operative activity where the participants, in order to infer what is intended, must reconcile what they hear with what they understand.

Grosjean (1985), in Hamer and Blanc, 1990:35, states that bilinguals use language as a mode of communication with other bilinguals who share their languages and with whom they mix languages. This means that mixing languages occurs by dispensation between interlocutors. Some times the conversation may start with English for example, but as the conversation continues the speakers mix languages, for example, *"Ke tla ba late mosomong because ke ya go thoma Circuit office"*, meaning that "I will be late to work because I have to start at the Circuit office".

In most societies, it is common to use mixed code in several occasions. The mixing of languages may occur to speakers with both language proficiencies. For example, during church sermons, the pastor may even start by reading scriptures in English and ask one member of the congregation to read in African language. The whole sermon will be delivered in mixed languages.

The principle of code-switching and code-mixing in the Yoruba-English bilingualism starts at primary school stage of education. The reason being that grammar of the first language has not been thoroughly grasped, and the learner would naturally want to express him/her using all linguistic resources at his disposal. This makes code-switching and code-mixing manifest in the child's linguistic performance right.

Switching from one language to another can serve the referential function because it often involves lack of knowledge of one language or lack of facility in that language on a certain subject. The subjects may be more appropriately discussed in one language, but some concepts may lead to a switch. For, '*uncle*' in English may mean my mother's elder/younger brother or my father's elder/younger bother, while English on the other hand may clarify some concept more clearly than Sepedi, for example, '*Mosadi o bolawa ke noka*'. (a woman has a waist problem); '*Mma o noka dijo ka letswai*', (mother sprinkle salt in the food), '*Re tloga re sela noka*' (we are about to cross the river). The word **noka** is clarified when used in a sentence.

Myers-Scotton (1993b:122) in Auer (1984:79) states that:

> *The young men in Zimbabwe and (Kenya are not satisfied with either the*
> *identity associated with speaking Shona or Swahili alone when they converse*
> *with each other. Rather, they see the rewards in indexing both identities of*
> *themselves. They solve the problem of making a choice by evolving a pattern*
> *of switching between two languages.*

Code-mixing can be one variety of unconnected to and unconditioned by the full knowledge for two separate languages. In Sepedi, for example, my mother's brother is *'malome'* (uncle) and my father's elder brother is *'ramogolo'* (uncle) and *'rangwane'* (younger uncle). There are more concepts that are clearer when code-switching is applied, while in English all the terms are uttered as "uncle."

Unfortunately, the way bilingual education programmes have been implemented, their impact tends to be subtractive. They often encourage children to lose native languages that would benefit them personally and benefit a country that is short on critical language skills, like African languages.

There is a claim that bilingualism is a recipe for ethnic strife of conflict: that people cannot get along unless they all speak the same language. Appel and Mysken (1987:80) claim bilinguals switch from one language to another in their daily interactions. The form of code-switching takes place between sentences as well as within sentences. They continue that generally children are faster and better second-language learners than adults. Children seem to acquire a second language more or less without any effort and they generally attain high level of proficiency. It is, therefore, recommended that children start learning second language as soon as possible.

The present researcher investigates the extent to which African languages and English are used to enrich the learners' knowledge as early as Grade 4. There is a notion that a person who is permanently in contact with two languages does not speak either of them correctly. This may lead to those who feel that their children should be taught in English only. The positive effect of bilingualism is the widening of horizons, increase of mental alertness and improved grasp of the relativity of all things.

Peires (1994:148), who conducted a study on bilingual discourse, concluded that discouragement of two or more languages in a school where learners are not the mother tongue speakers of the language of learning and teaching is against current practice. She cited evidence of this from research carried out by English Language Teaching Information Center (ELTIC), and *Edu-source Data News* (1993), which showed that 63% of teachers in black schools would like to, and actually already use two or more languages in class in order to help learners.

The reality of code-switching is that the majority of learners and teachers are not competent in English, as compared to those in private schools. However, it is of course true that code-switching can be used to explain, elaborate, and clarify concepts and procedures to learners' experiences.

2.18 Reasons for code-switching

Code-switching in an English medium environment is that learners (including educators) are usually incompetent in English to sustain their activities.

Cook (1996:150) outlines the following reasons for code-switching:

1. To report what someone has said:

2. To use markers from one language to highlight in another; and

3. To express certain ideas and feelings that can only be successfully done in English   not any other language.

2.19 Problems associated with code-switching

The fact that the Department of Education now sanctions code-switching in the classroom has encouraged parents, educators and learners to neglect the much talked about Language Across the Curriculum policy, which most schools have adopted.(cf.4.6).

So, all efforts to raise the level of English competence to the extent where learners can deal with the content subject, with reasonable ability, simply fall away. Hence, code-switching is perceived as an aid to some and as a detractor by others. Thus, some parents feel that their children should be taught in English only.

The negative effect of code-switching is that learners are expected to read and write the tests and examinations in English. If throughout the activity their teaching and learning is conducted in a mixed mode, they are also to answer the way they were taught, i.e., mixing languages. Different learners from different language groups may experience impossible bilingual instruction. Educators will not speak all languages to accommodate all learners when they code-switch or mix the languages.

The other negative side of code-switching is that the educator cannot speak all eleven languages declared as official in South Africa. An example cited at NCS workshop in 2005 states that Tshifhiwa, a Tshivenda speaking learner, had to leave Mphephu High School due to her father's transfer to Durban. Tshifhiwa was doing Tshivenda as a home language, English as a First additional language and Afrikaans as a Second Additional language.

In South Africa, all eleven official languages are supposed to be used at school level, where applicable. The problem is that some schools, as well as parents, have the notion that African languages do not have adequate terminology as well as resources to qualify as languages of learning and teaching.

In a global economy and a world of many languages and cultures, English alone is not enough. Despite the preference of English over home languages, there is challenge of learner/ teacher support material in bilingualism. This serves as a factor that learners acquire English more than their home languages.

This lack of resources was observed by Ralenala (2003:15) as another factor when he states that there are new demands placed on schools to improve and derive more meaning and quality from teaching and learning, whilst on the other hand the demands are not being reciprocated by resources and personnel to enhance their achievement.

It is a fact that a comprehensive Learner and Teacher Support Material (LTSM) development strategy should be provided with the view of serving bilingual instruction. South Africa has 11 official languages, therefore, the choice and usage of a particular language in a particular situation is determined by the context in which it is practiced; the function; the audience; and the message for which it is employed. For example, languages that are appropriate to Limpopo Province are Afrikaans, English, isiNdebele, Sepedi, Tshivenda and Xitsonga.

Rammala (2002:129) states that, for the province to transform socially, it should ensure that the citizens are well informed about the formulation and implementation of language policies. Information will prevent misunderstanding and misperceptions about the inclusion of African languages in the curriculum.

Heugh (2002:13) concurs that the language policy flaw indicated above was pointed out by a Senior Language Education Researcher of the Human Science Research Council (HSRC), when saying that "the majority of school-going children are expected to learn through a second language (English) even before they have developed sufficient proficiency in their home languages."

Heugh (ibid) continues that she finds it impossible for non-English speaking learners to learn enough of the second language in the first three years, and later switch to a second language medium of instruction in Grade 4. She goes on to suggest that in South Africa, where most educators themselves struggle with proficiency in English, instruction should continue in first language at least to the end of Grade 9.

Parental interest, parental involvement in their children's education and parental co-operation with teachers are intervening factors. The educators' enthusiasm and commitment to the education program is also important. They should support the implementation of bilingual instruction into the curriculum. This will develop and promote bilingualism in the country.

It is believed that most learners who attend English medium schools in South Africa perform far better than their counter-parts in public schools. This may mean that the learners at public schools are taught in the medium of the second language. But the same African learners are doing well at private schools. The question might be, since the learners are from the same background, then, who is to blame for such a vast difference.

In the South African context, there is no language restriction, socially, politically, because everyone has the right to use the language of his/her choice. The only concern is the pace at which the African languages are to be implemented as languages of learning and teaching. SGB's are empowered to choose the suitable language(s) for their children. This gives room for schools to provide learners with their right to learn in the language they understand better.

2.20 Conclusion

The educator's role is one of facilitator or guide rather than the giver of knowledge to the learner. He/she will make new discoveries, not only of how languages work, but also of how much knowledge of languages in a single classroom or activity. This will make both the learners and the educators to develop positive attitude towards languages rather than their own. By using as many languages as the class has, any knowledge of language becomes fun and multilingualism desirable rather than conflicting. The following chapter deals with the research design. It also explains the sampling method and the research approaches the researcher has followed when collecting data.

Chapter 3

Research Design and Methodology

3.1 Introduction

In Chapter one, provision was made to describe and clarify the focus of the research - the challenges of bilingual instruction. The purpose in this chapter is to investigate the challenges through data collection and analysis. Babbie and Mouton (2001:647) define *research design* as a plan or structured framework of how you intend conducting the research process in order to solve the research problem. Research designs can be classified according to whether they are for empirical or non-empirical studies. Research methodology refers to the method, techniques, and procedures that are employed in the process of implementing research design or plan, as well as underlying principles and assumptions that underlie their use.

3.2 Research approaches

Research approaches inform the reader how data were collected and explains the method that was used to process it (Leedy, 2001:94). In this study, the researcher made use of a combination of qualitative (observation and interview) and quantitative research approaches.

3.2.1 Qualitative approach

Qualitative approach refers to a broad methodological approach to the study of a social action. This term refers to a collection of methods and techniques which share the same principles. Qualitative studies typically use qualitative methods of gaining access to research subjects. Qualitative methods of data collection include participants' observation, structured interviews, as well as semi-structured interviews. Qualitative Methods of analysis include Grounded theory approach, Analytical induction, Narrative analysis and Discourse analysis (Babbie and Mouton, 2001:270).

3.2.2. Quantitative approach

Quantitative approach describes some fraction of the population (i.e., a sample) through the data collection process of asking questions to people. The data collection in turn enables the researcher to generalize the findings from a sample of responses to a population (Creswell, 1994:117).

From the two approaches, the present researcher used the qualitative research to conduct the study. Creswell (1994:143) outlines the following assumption of qualitative methodology:

1. Qualitative researchers are concerned with the process rather than the outcomes or products.
2. The researcher is a primary instrument for data collection and analysis. Data are mediated through this human instrument, rather than through inventories, questionnaire, or machines.
3. The researcher is interested in meaning - how people make sense of their lives, experience and their structure of the world. Qualitative research involves field work. The researcher physically goes to the people, setting sites or institutions to observe or record behaviour in a natural setting.

The two approaches guided the present researcher to be involved in the observation and interview processes to collect data. The guide as well helped the researcher to use setting sites as the relevant situation for investigation.

3.3 Population

Population is that aggregate of elements from which the sample is actually selected (Babbie and Mouton, 2001:174). The present researcher identified a population of 3149 Grade 4 learners from six schools of the two circuits, who were randomly selected from six circuits in Mankweng and one in Polokwane. The schools are located in the Polokwane Municipality within the Limpopo Province. Grade 4 educators from the same schools above comprised the educator population in the study.

3.4 Sampling

A sample is the element or set of elements considered for selection in some stage of sampling (Babbie & Mouton, 2001: 174). According to Ralenala (2003: 156), a sample is a group of subjects chosen from a larger group or population to which the findings of the study are to be inferred through focusing on a portion of a population rather than the entire population.

From the population of 3149 learners, a sample of 228 was randomly selected to take part in classroom observation. Twelve learners were interviewed as a follow-up to the observation. Six educators were selected as a sample for taking part in the observation and interview.

3.5. Research Instruments

Research instruments are tools that are used to collect data. Two research instruments were used to collect data for this study, namely, observation and interviews. The instruments were selected on the basis of their compatibility with the purpose of the study, the nature of the data collected and size of the sample contemplated. Six educators took part in the observation and interview sessions. Two hundred and eighty eight learners took part in the observation and twelve went through to the interviews. The summary of data gathering process is briefly described hereunder, followed by the description of each instrument used.

3.5.1 Classroom Observation

There are two types of observation, namely, Simple observation, wherein a researcher remains an outside observer, and Participant observation (Mouton, 2001:293), wherein a researcher is simultaneously a member of the group she/he is studying in a research. In this study the researcher used simple observation method.

Patton (1990:203-205) says that observational data are attractive as they afford the researcher the opportunity to gather 'live' data from 'live' situation. In this study, the researcher observed 6 lessons offered by 6 educators. Three educators were from public schools and the other three were from private schools (See Table 3.2).

The researcher had the observation schedule (for each activity) to detect the information. There were items on the schedule to be completed during the observation. The researcher observed the kind of language(s) used by the educators in presenting their activities, and the language(s) used to define and clarify terminologies.

3.5.2 Reasons for observation

The researcher observed the classroom activities and particularly concentrating on the language usage. The following have been observed: (See Appendices 1-6).

1. The language(s) the educators uses for baseline assessment (i.e., at the beginning of the activity);
2. The dominating language(s) during the classroom activity;
3. The way an educator sometimes code-mixes the languages; and
4. The ways educators motivate the learners to mix languages so as to express themselves.

3.5.3 Interview Questions

The 'interview question' has to be developed once the decision has been made to use the interview to collect data. The guide should consist of all the questions that the interviewer is going to ask. Some of the responses will be written by the researcher while the responses will be recorded on an audiocassette. Questions should be relevant to the topic, that is, they should be directly related to the objectives of the investigation. The written questions should be those that will be asked orally even though the responses need follow up questions that are not or were not written beforehand.

According to Sayed (1998:30), there are three types of interviews, namely, Structured, Semi-structured and Unstructured interviews. Structured interviews require limited responses. These are questions to multiple choice answers. Respondents choose only one answer from the set of answers given to him/her. This form of questioning provides very limited insight on the topic.

Semi-structured questions are the open-ended questions with fairly specific intentions. These questions, according to Sayed (1998: ibid), are conducted with the use of a research schedule. The schedule guides the researcher, for it contains questions and themes which are important to the researcher.

De Vos (1998:300) agrees with Sayed that this kind of questioning provides for relatively systematic collection of data and at the same time it ensures that important data is not forgotten. Unstructured questions on the other hand, are those questions that allow the researcher a wide and broader scope of asking questions in whatever order that suits the researcher. These are the type of questions that develop spontaneously in the course of the session/interaction between the researcher and the respondent. The respondents have the latitude to say what they feel as long as it is relevant to the topic.

This means much more information is gathered, but ordering and interpreting the collected information is time consuming. For the purpose of data collection for this study, semi-structured questions were asked during the interview.

Table 3.1: Summary of data gathering instruments

Research instrument	Description	No. of Responses	Male / female
observation	written schedule	6 educators	4 females males
interviews	6 questions	6 educators + 12 learners	females males

3.6 Permission

In the preliminary stage, the researcher wrote letters to the Department of Education requesting permission to conduct research in the sample schools (mentioned in 3.3 above). The next stage was the actual contact with the head masters and the Grade 4 educators of the schools taking part in the project. The researcher explained the aims and objectives of the research and aspects all the other related to ethics, such as informed consent, the right of participants to take part or withdraw from the research at any time and issues relating to confidentiality, privacy and anonymity.

3.7 Procedure

The researcher used an observation schedule to yield the kind of data needed for the study (see Annexure A). The number of learners per classroom ranges from 22 to 55. During the contact sessions the researcher observed that there are more female educators than male (i.e., from the educators who participated only 3 educators are male).

Although the types of schools are both public and private, all learners are black, from different cultures and languages. The researcher observed 12 activities in the following learning areas furnished in the table given below:

Table 3.2 Summary of observation

School	learners	Learning area	Activity	Duration
A	20	MLMMS	Fractions	30 minutes
B	45	Life orientation	Recycling	30 minutes
C	48	Life Orientation	Nutrition	30 minutes
D	22	English	Adjectives	30 minutes
E	46	HSS	Transport	30 minutes
F	47	HSS	Our Languages	30 minutes

3.8 Conclusion

It is understood that data collected by means of observations and interviews serve as the 'live' data from a 'live' setting. Although some educators were reluctant to respond to some questions, generally they were anxious to see the development of bilingual instruction practiced at school level. In the following chapter, the researcher discusses how data that were collected in this chapter were analyzed and finally interpreted.

Chapter 4

Analysis and Interpretation of Data

4.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses on analysis and interpretation of data collected during field work. Sarantakas (1988:313) explains analysis as the process of data processing and converting raw material into meaningful statement. Data collected from six schools are analyzed in accordance with the observation and interview questions.

4.2 Analysis of observation

The observation schedule was structured in a way that the present researcher would find out the language(s) used by the educators for instruction. The researcher observed that, in private schools, English speaking educators stick to English only, while black African language speakers occasionally switch to African languages. Six educators were observed, and some are set as sample of what prevailed during observation sessions.

4.2.1 Observation at private schools

School A: The researcher visited the school situated at a farm, South East Polokwane on the 20th of September 2005. The principal welcomed the researcher and led her to the selected classroom. The researcher was introduced to 22 Grade 4 learners from an enrolment of 420for the school. In the classroom, the educator used English to teach Mathematics. The educator also used Sepedi and Xitsonga to clarify unfamiliar concepts. All learners were involved in placing figures (fractions) together to make a whole figure. The learners were free to ask for assistance in one of the three languages. The educator grouped them into four learners per group. Six groups were given plastic figures to fit together. They were mixing English and Sepedi to say "*half le kotara di ka se dire whole number wena*", meaning *"half and a quarter cannot make a whole number"*. Some learners were speaking Xitsonga.

The educator was walking around helping the learners to place the figures together. The educator was mixing the languages to communicate with the learners. The group that completed their activity raised their hands and was considered the best.

The fractions were later written on the chalk board. Every learner wanted to complete the sum of fractions on the chalkboard. Some learners were still struggling to find the correct Lowest Common Multiple (LCM) to add or divide fractions. What was observed at the school was that learners were free to mix languages. They seemed to enjoy the activity because they were all involved in giving answers through any language of their choice, as indicated above.

Freedom from language barriers for the learners enabled them to be fully involved in the activity. There was no bilingual instruction observed, but code-mixing indicated that learners can be taught in more than one language. Learners felt more comfortable and competent when they learned through the languages they understand better. The educator sometimes switched discourse markers when concluding turns with *'ga go bjalo?'* meaning, *is that not so?* or using final orders like *'le a kwesisa?'*, meaning *do you understand?*

School B: The present researcher visited the school situated in Polokwane on the 4th of October 2005. The classroom had 12 Grade 4 learners, mixed with 10 Grade 5 learners. An educator who spoke English only had an assistant educator who explained some of the concepts to the learners in Sepedi. Occasionally, the African language speaking educator explained to the learners in their own language (viz., Sepedi).

The learning area was English (LLC$_2$) and the activity was 'Adjective' -'lehlaodi', the word that qualifies the subject or the noun. That was the first terminology the black African educator translated for the learners. The English speaking educator continued teaching in English, while assuring that learners capture all what the poem was all about.

The educator read the poem 'Matty's Complaint' to the learners. Learners were reading silently from their textbooks (page 70). The educator wrote some few adjectives on the chalkboard and asked learners to identify more adjectives from the poem. As the assistant educator had already explained what an adjective is, it was easy for the learners to identify adjectives from the poem.

They identified words such as 'small nose', 'crooked teeth', 'skinny neck' etc. The educator asked learners to identify more adjectives from the classroom. The assistant educator occasionally translated concepts such as *'nko ye nnyane',* meaning small nose, to the learners. This made it simple for the learners to understand the concept *'lehlaodi'* (adjective). Learners were able to identify 'green chalkboard', 'round globe', 'small cupboard', etc. Learners indicated interest in their activity. English and Sepedi were integrated for teaching and learning as was observed by the present researcher when the educator asked the assistant educator to explain some concepts to the learners.

School C: The research visited the school at an area called Ga-Mashashane South West Polokwane on the 5th of October 2005. The school master led the researcher to a Grade 4 classroom of 55 learners from enrolment of 429 learners. After an introduction by the principal to the educator, the lesson of the day was introduced to the learners. The educator gave some handouts to the learners, and the learners were initially requested to bring along empty plastic bags, bottles and empty cans.

The educator asked learners to identify objects that can be produced from empty cans, plastic bottles and plastic bags. The educator was mixing English with Afrikaans and few learners seemed not to follow the activity. The observation was that, although there was no bilingual instruction as the educator indicated, there was code-mixing and code-switching of languages to clarify the learners. Time and again the educator was demonstrating by either cutting a plastic bottle or cutting a plastic bag. It was interesting to discover that even at private school; educators do code-switch to clarify the learners.

4.2.2 Observation at Public schools

School A: On the 5th of October 2005, the present researcher visited a school in a suburb outside Polokwane. The school has the enrolment of 780 learners. The researcher was welcomed and led by an educator to a Grade 4 classroom. The educator introduced the researcher to the learners and the activity started. Life Orientation was offered to 48 learners. The topic was 'Nutritious food'. The educator read from pages 6-7 of the learners' textbook.

The educator asked learners about types of food they eat at home also told learners about junk–food like 'sephatlo', i.e., sandwich made of achaar, egg, vienna, mayonnaise etc. Learners were participating in English and Sepedi, the activity proceeded smoothly.

The learners had to match each picture from the text books with relevant food for the healthy lifestyle. The educator was using English and Sepedi, and the learners were participating and answering the questions. The observation is that learners understand when the educator is mixing the languages.

School B: The researcher visited a school situated at a rural area, eastern Polokwane, on the 6th of October 2005. The researcher was introduced to 47 learners from the enrolment of 560 learners in the school, and the activity started. The activity was about family tree in Life Orientation. The educator talked about the importance of African languages and culture. The educator asked learners to greet in their own languages.

Learners demonstrated how they greet each other. They were using Sepedi to say *'Thobela'* while bowing their knees. The other two learners slept on the ground with one side and greeted in Tshivenda 'ndaaa'. Learners enjoyed the activity as they were given the opportunity to speak in their own languages. They were told that language goes hand in clove with culture and that their way of greeting shows respect. The observation was that learners are encouraged to use their home languages. There was no bilingual instruction but African languages were used.

School C: The researcher visited a public school, situated in the eastern Polokwane. The target group was 57 Grade 4 learners from the school population of 960 learners. The educator was teaching Human and Social Sciences. The topic was 'How transport changes over time'. The educator was using English and Sepedi. The learners were participating, answering all questions. Learners were mixing the language to say but sir, '*dikoloi tša dipokolo le dikgomo ga di sa bonala ka bontši*', meaning that '*wagons driven by donkeys or oxen are scares today.*'

The learners gave types of transport, i.e., those which use the land, water and the sky. It was in the interview where the educator explained that the learners participate when they sometimes mix the language of instruction with their home languages.

4.3 Interviews at private schools

4.3.1 Introduction

Oral interview, as a data gathering method, provides a wider background to the problem on a person-to-person contact. Such a background put the observation in a better perspective for data analysis and interpretation. Since oral interview is conducted in the form of a conversation between two or more people, the respondents are more willing to communicate. This enables the interviewer access to research subject (Yin, 1998:89).

Educators were interviewed in the classrooms immediately after the observations. The tape-recorder was used to supplement the questions to save time and to remind the researcher during data analysis. Some educators were interviewed in their staff-rooms, depending on the possibility of privacy and freedom of the interviewee.

4.3.2 Interviews with private schools educators

Interview questions were meant to bring out the educators' and learners' perception about bilingual education. The questions covered aspects such as their feelings towards English as the medium of instruction in the foundation phase; whether the educators are comfortable when they teach through the medium of English only (see Appendixes B and C). Three educators were interviewed in the venues of their choice, i.e., either the classroom or the staffroom.

Question 1: To what extent do you make use of bilingual instruction in your classroom?

Respondent A*: I use African languages to clarify the learners when I realize that they do not follow the activity. I speak Sepedi as my first language. I use the language to explain some unfamiliar concepts to the learners. I use code-switching to clarify the learners.*

Respondent B: "*I teach the learners in English, but where I realize that they do not follow the activity, I have an assistant educator who explains to the learners in their first language. This enable the learners to participate more than when I continue teaching them even when I realize that they do not understand what I'm saying.*

Respondent C: *I use English only. Some of the learners here know English from home. Most parents want their children to learn English that is why they have registered their children at the English-medium school. Learners who are backward in the languages remain at school for extra lessons.* **only?**

Respondent A: T*he approved medium of instruction is English. I use Sepedi and Xitsonga to clarify*

Respondent B: *English is the only medium of instruction presently. English cannot be balanced with any African language. Although not all participate, they must be taught to respond and take part in English activities.*

Respondent C: *For now English is the only medium of instruction. So it cannot be balanced with any other language(s).Most learners have background knowledge of English. They respond to questions asked in the classroom and participate fairly well.*

Question 3: What is the advantage or disadvantage of code switching and code-mixing?

Respondent A: *The advantage is that most learners are able to follow the activity. That makes them to participate and show their capability in the progamme. If you teach in English only, some learners don't answer, not that they don't know the answer, but that they cannot construct correct sentences.*

Respondent B: *Learners catch up faster than when one teaches in English only. Most learners do not have English background as the language of communication. They learn the language as a subject and medium of instruction at the same time from home; there is no need to teach them in any other language than English.*

Respondent C*: I am not using any other language than English. I do not see the difference from those who use two or more languages in the classroom.*

Question 4: Have you ever been trained or work-shopped in bilingual instruction?

Respondent A: *"I have never been trained or attended a workshop for bilingual instruction. I like to be equipped with the knowledge of teaching in many languages. I wish the government can do something towards the development of bilingual instruction. There are no resources written in bilingualism.*

Respondent B: *"No, I wish that something be done concerning the issue so that I can explain whatever concept in any African language spoken in the province. It is sometimes embarrassing to find that you cannot clarify the learners due to language problem."*

Respondent C: *"I have never attended a workshop or trained to teach in bilingual instruction. I speak Afrikaans as my first language. I like to know African languages for communication. There are no books written in bilingualism yet.*

Question 6: What is your perception towards the future of bilingual education?

Respondent A: "*The future of bilingual instruction lies in the hands of the language policy makers to monitor the fruits of their effort to sustain African languages as media of instruction, parents to motivate their children and show them the importance of first language in their lives, and particularly the educators who are the facilitators or these languages."*

Respondent B: "*We perceive English as the language of educational and economic access and we are concerned to provide support for learners to adjust to English language of learning and teaching. The future of bilingual education will take time, especially that there is no learner support material written in Bilingualism presently."*

Respondent C: I *don't have an idea, but I wish the process might be fast because I personally want to learn how to teach in more than one language .What we are doing now is not bilingual instruction but rather, mixing English with African languages.*

4.3.3 Interviews with private school learners

As indicated in (a) above, the interview questions were meant to bring out the learners' perceptions about bilingual education. The questions covered aspects such as the way the educators mix languages during the lessons, their feelings about English as the medium of instruction in their phase, languages they prefer to use in the classroom to express themselves during class discussions and the languages they use when they speak to their parents and friends. (See Annexure C).

Respondent A: *Outside the classroom I communicate in Sepedi with my friends, but I like to be taught in English because this is an English-medium school. I like the way the educators teach us here.*

Respondent B: *The language of instruction here is English. Although I like to learn better English than my friends who attend at public school, I sometimes feel ashamed when they use African terminology that is very unfamiliar to me.*

Question 2: Do your educators mix languages when they teach you?

Respondent A: *Our educator mixes languages and we enjoy her activity. This makes us to feel free because if I do not know a certain term in English I switch to my mother tongue and I would not be penalized.*

Respondent B: *I like to be taught in English only because if teachers mix languages, I think I miss something from that activity. Here at school, our Afrikaans teacher sometimes mixes English and Afrikaans. That does not bother because she mainly teaches us in Afrikaans.*

Question 3: If you were asked to give a speech in class which language would you prefer to use?

Respondent A: *"I will prefer to use English because it is the language I can express myself better. I speak Sepedi at home but since I came here at a private school, I speak English better than my home language.*

Respondent B: "*I like to speak English, but I don't feel more confident than if I was using my own language*. I *sometimes think that if I make a mistake my friends will laugh at me."*

Question 4: Which language do you use when you speak to your parents or your friends?

Respondent A: "*When talking to my friends I mostly speak English to show them that I learn the language at school. To my parents I speak Sepedi, but they speak to me in English and that is what I like most."*

Respondent B*:" To my friends here at school I speak English but to my friends at home I speak Sepedi. I am afraid that my friends at home may think that I am trying to be a better person as English language is associated with better people.*

4.4 Interviews at public schools

4.4.1 Interviews with public school educators

Question 1: To what extent do you make use of bilingual instruction in your classroom?

Respondent A: *"I am not using two languages to teach, but, African language to clarify the learners when I realize that they do not follow the activity. I speak Sepedi as my first language; I use the language to explain some unfamiliar concepts and continue with English.*

Respondent B: *"I am not using two languages to teach, but, African language to clarify the learners when I realize that they do not follow the activity. I speak Sepedi as my first language; I use the language to explain some unfamiliar concepts to the learners.*

Respondent C: *"I am not using two languages to teach, but, African language to clarify the learners when I realize that they do not follow the activity. I speak Sepedi and Xitsonga. I use any of the two languages to explain some unfamiliar concepts to the learners. .*

Question 2: How do learners respond when you teach in the medium of English only?

Respondent A: *"English is presently the only medium of instruction. Other languages are used as subjects. I only switch to African languages when I realize that the learners do not follow the activity. Learners participate and perform well in the medium of instruction, but I realize that they do not understand the activity, I clarify them in their language."*

Respondent B: *"Learners usually respond positively towards the activity given to them. Once I discover that they do not follow, I switch to their language to simplify their activity."*

Respondent C: *"I switch to African languages to clarify the learners. That makes the learners to participate because they understand what is expected of them."*

Question 3: What is the advantage of code-mixing and code-switching?

Respondent A: *Most learners participate when you switch to their home language. Mastering more languages help learners to understand the activity even faster.*

Respondent B: *English is the medium of instruction, but teaching in many languages help those who cannot understand English only. Learners can translate what you have just said in English into what you explain to them in their home language.*

Respondent C: *I cannot say I am conversant in English. Sometimes I switch to Sepedi because I don't know the concept in English. So, code-switching and code-mixing do not only help the learners, but the educators as well.*

Question 4: Have you ever been trained or work shopped in bilingual instruction?

Respondent A: *"No training or workshop so far. The only workshop I attended so far is about the National Curriculum Statement. I wish the government and the Department of Education in particular can do something concerning this issue. Multilingualism is the norm here in South Africa. As educators we must know the languages and teach them to the learners.*

Respondent B: *"I was never trained, and I want to be trained so that I can cope with the current developments. The curriculum is ever changing, so we must as well be trained to advance with the circumstances."*

Respondent C: *"I have never trained or attended a workshop for bilingual instruction. I like to be equipped with the knowledge of teaching in many languages.*

I wish the government can do something towards the development of bilingual instruction. There are no resources written in bilingualism."

Question 5: What is your perception towards the future of bilingual education?

Respondent A: *"Bilingual education will benefit learners, educators and the community at large. The problems lies with those who use the language now, they prefer to use English as medium of instruction disregarding the shift and loss of African languages."*

Respondent B: *African language speakers do not appreciate their own languages; they undermine the qualities of the language as media of instruction. The Minister of Education tried to show the importance of indigenous languages by re-implementing them at private school but all the same.*

4.4.2 Interviews with public school learners

Question 1: Do your educators mix languages when they teach you?

Respondent A: *Yes, 'ge ba ruta ka English fela, gare kwešiši'(When they teach in English only ,we do not understand***).**

Respondent B: *Our teachers mix languages, but sometimes are difficult when we have to answer in English. We also answer in Sepedi*

.

Question 2: If you were asked to give an English speech in class are you able to express yourself in the language?

Respondent A: *I hate giving speech in class because I do not know English well.*

Respondent B: *I try to speak but I cannot express myself because English is not my first language.*

Question 3: Which language do you use when you speak to your parents or your friends?

Respondent A*: To my parents, I use Sepedi, but I use English to communicate with my friends. I want to show them that we learn English at school.*

Respondent B: *I use any language that I think they will understand and respond to. Mostly, I use Sepedi to speak to either my friends or my parents.*

4.5 General comments on private and public school interviews

1. Generally, educators perceive English as the only medium for instruction, and the language of communication and economic access to a better life, but their concern is to support learners to adjust to English medium and be proficient in the language.

2. Virtually all Grade 4 educators interviewed use bilingual instruction through code-switching and code-mixing. As a result, they supported move intended to provide an appropriate support for bilingual education which would largely give additional insight into, and practice of these characteristics of bilingual instruction.

3. Educators were of the opinion that the envisaged principle must be undertaken by those with proper training in bilingual education to ensure maximum service to the usage of the language system.

4. Educators from private schools, especially those who are English native speakers, maintained that medium of instruction is English and so learners had to use English in order to master it. The educators from private schools acknowledged that they respect the languages and culture of African learners, but they got the impression that it was both African learners and educators who had to accommodate their language and culture.

5. Educators who code-switch argued on the basis of conceptual and affective reasons that it is necessary to explain difficult concepts which the learners did not understand in English and also help learners to feel free in class.

6. Learners form private schools responded that they should be able to speak English without feeling inferior that English is not their first language. They indicated that, that was what they had paid for.

7. Learners from public schools prefer to be taught in both English and their first language as that will provide them with bilingual education. This supports the idea mentioned earlier that the more the speaker uses code-switching the more flexible and proficient he/she will be.

8. Learners from public schools said they were keen to learn English although they experience their own language loss. For example, a learner from a bilingual family gets lost between parents who speak to them in their third language (English).

4.6 Conclusion

English is the language of learning and teaching at school, but home languages of all the learners and educators are the languages of communication in the community. In this chapter, data were analyzed and interpreted. It has come to the researcher's notice that there is a divergent believe and opinion about the success of bilingual education in Limpopo Province. It is also observed that code-switching and code-mixing play a major role when teaching black African learners.

The majority of the respondents have similar opinion about bilingual instruction to be implemented and practiced at both private and public schools. It has also come to the researchers' notice (through literature study) that some parents are against bilingual instruction. They wish that their children be taught through the medium of English only. This notion is an obstacle to the progress of bilingual instruction at school.

Chapter 5

Findings, Recommendations and Conclusions

5.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses on the findings that were derived from the data collected and analyzed and the recommendations that ensued, as well as drawing up of the conclusions of the study. In Chapter one, questions and hypothesis were set. In Chapter three, research instruments were used to collect data. The analysis of data in Chapter Four highlighted the perspective of the educators towards bilingual instruction.

5.2 Summary of the findings

It is discovered that bilingual instruction is practiced indirectly, i.e., through code-switching and code-mixing at primary schools in Limpopo Province. Educators, especially at public schools, switch from one language to the other during the lessons. They argue that code-switching and code-mixing provide learners with the opportunity to function and perform better in their home languages. Learners, also, feel motivated and encouraged by the educators when they use more than one language in the classroom. Learners' languages errors are less as they switch to their own languages when they cannot find the relevant concepts.

Based on the responses from both public and private school educators, English is the only medium of instruction. Another discovery is that they are comfortable in using English only as the medium of LoLT. Some educators from public schools have a concern that learners do not cope if they stick to English; thus, they code-switch and code-mix English with the African languages.

Most educators are professionally unequipped with the necessary skills of teaching through the medium of African languages. As such, this lot would like to attend the training or bilingual workshop. From the educators' responses, the indication is that educators are not trained, and thus poorly equipped and less confident to teach in more than one language, and they wish that the government can implement workshops. This is a far and general cry from the majority of the respondents.

The reason is that they teach multilingual and multicultural learners from different back-grounds. Both private and public school educators are uncertain about the future of bilingual education in South Africa, Limpopo Province in particular. The reason being that since the adoption of Language- in-Education Policy (LiEP) a year after the 1996 constitution that guaranteed the right to all languages on equal footing, English is still the language of instruction and communication in most institutions. Concerning language functions, English is still in more use in the system including Education.

The African languages still have little real meaning, low public status and are used for low-function communication purposes mostly. African languages lack Western terminology and technological vocabulary. Although African languages are adequately equipped to be used as media of instruction at primary school level, the schools contacted still stick to English, claiming that there are no textbooks written in bilingualism.

5.3. Recommendations

5.3.1 General Recommendations

● **Usage of primary language in schools**

The primary language provides a bridge between the first language and the second language. It also satisfies the demand of the new environment in the school. Through their own languages, learners can express themselves because what they think is processed through language. If they communicate in the language they know, they feel free and become creative to say what they think and feel.

● **English in actual classroom practice**

The factors comprising teaching and learning environment, under which the research took place, indicated that the actual classroom practice was English, in some schools, and English and mother tongue, even though English was the medium of instruction according to the Language Policy.

● English and parental pressure

What becomes more challenging is the fact that most parents want their children to be taught in English only. (See general response by learners). These demands add to the already difficult task the Department of Education is experiencing (to re-implement African languages in the curriculum, especially at private school). They are placed at schools to improve and derive more meaning and quality from bilingual education.

●The future of African languages in schools

The future of South African languages is a concern in South Africa, let alone bilingual education in Limpopo. For the success of bi-/multilingualism in a multicultural country, attention should focus on the reason why most people prefer English than African languages.

●The hegemony of English in South African schools

English first speakers are in the minority, but their language is in the majority, i.e., English is widely spoken even in South Africa. Most schools use English as their medium of instruction. Most South African citizens use English as their medium of communication and trading.

5.3.2 Specific Recommendations

The following specific recommendations are made on the basis of the findings made in the study:

1. Black South Africans should appreciate the promotion of their languages and be proudly South Africans not longing to be proficient in English only.

2. English should be their first additional language as indicated in the curriculum.

3. Learners, educators and the society should be sensitized towards the opportunity by being afforded the latitude to exercise their primary languages. It is noticed that some educators (even non-African language speakers) wish to acquire African languages.

4. Parents should fully support the Department of Education and the schools in particular to teach bilingual education. Parents should limit the notion that African languages will prohibit their children the opportunity to find better jobs.

5. All 11 South African official languages should be practiced as media of learning and teaching where necessary, so that technological development could take place in the country. English should be used side by side with African languages for the best of the future generation.

6. The appreciation of African languages by all South Africans (including English and Afrikaans speakers) will maintain the status of all 11 official languages of South Africa. The country will develop functional multilingual and multicultural, as in Final Draft: Language Policy and Plan for South Africa (2002:12). Much has been written about multilingual South Africa. PANSALB is also in the notion against the government's apparent endorsement of the domination of English as the only medium of instruction.

7. Educators should be trained to cope with multilingual challenges. Educators as accelerators of transformation, especially at school level should be empowered to develop bilingual education at school. The Department of Education and other relevant authorities should develop programmes that will equip educators with the necessary skills that will help them to deal with the bilingual, multilingual and multicultural needs of learners in their classrooms. This will help to create an enabling environment for learners to maximize communication and understanding of the various concepts in the different learning areas of the school curriculum.

8. Most people feel marginalized about African languages as compared to English. Educators are the major instrument if the government wishes to reach the destination of multilingual and multicultural country.

5.4 Conclusion

It was mentioned in the findings that bilingual and multilingual instruction is not yet implemented in both public and private schools. The major recommendation is that the government should strive for the development of Multilingualism as medium of instruction.

Everyone, especially black South Africans, want to be proficient in the English language despite the promotional development of African languages.

As much as it was useful to obtain the responsible opinion on the perspective of bilingual instruction, it was even important to canvas the opinions of the respondents on their attitude towards the government's effort to promote African languages. South Africans should not feel intimidated or threatened by the constant pressure to conform to the national consensus (i.e., 11 official languages should have the same status in the country). Black Africans should be proudly South Africans, and be excellent speakers of English and other languages. Indeed, it is useful to see the changes after the declaration of 11 official languages of South Africa. Promotion and knowledge of all the eleven official South African languages is not only an cultural diversity advantage to its citizens but also a cultural treasure that is waiting to be tapped and exposed to other countries as a cash cow waiting to be milked and its returns enjoyed by all.

Bibliography

African National Congress's Policy Framework for Education and Training(1994)

Ayeomoni, M O.2006. Codeswitching and Code-mixing style of language Use in Childhood in Yoruba. Nordic Journal of African Studies 15(1) 90-99, 2006

Alexander, N. 1989. *Language Policy and National Unity in South Africa / Azania*. Buchu.

Alwright, D and Bailey, K M.1994. *Focus on the language classroom*. UK.Cambridge University Press

Appel, M., and Muysken, P. 1987. *Language Contact and Bilingualism*. Great Britain. Edward Arnold Publishers.

Auer, JCP.1994. Bilingual Conversation. Amsterdam. J. Benjamin Publishing Company

Babbie, E., & Mouton, J. 2001. *The Practice of Social Research*. New York: University Press.

Baker, C.1993. *Foundation of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. Australia: Library of CongressCataloguing in Publication Data.

Baker, C.1995. *A Parents'and Teacher' Guide to Bilingualism*. Libraryof Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data.

Beukes, A., & Bernard, M (Eds) 1994. *Proceedings for Languages for All Conferences Upwards: A Pan South African Language Board* (27 – 28 May 1994) CSIR Conference Center. Pretoria. *Bilingual Education*. 2001. The need for Bilingual Education.

Block, C. 2002. A Case Study of Xhosa and English bi-literacy in the Foundation Phase versus English as a 'medium of instruction'. *Perspective in Education.Vol.20 No1. March 2002.*

Blonch, C.1999.Literacy in the Early Years: Teaching and Learning in Multilingual Early Childhood Classroom. *International journal of Early years Education. Vol. 7 No 1: 359.*

Bokamba, G.E. 1995. The politics of Language Planning in *Africa: Critical choices for 21st Century. Perspectives on the Namibian Experience*. New York Berlin.

Bokamba, G.E. 2007. The politics of language Planning in Africa. Critical choices for the 21st Century: In Putz, M. 1995. *Discrimination through language in Africa? Perspective on the Namibian Experince*. New York: Berlin de Gruyter.

Bruton, C., & Associates. 2003. Policy Handbook for Educators. South Africa. (Elrc).

Cook, V. 1991. Second Langue Learning and Language Teaching. London.New York. British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data.

Cook, V.1996. Going beyond the native speaker in language.TESOL. Quarterly 33.2.185-209

Creswell, J.W. 1994. *Research Design Qualitative and Quantitative approaches*. USA. Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data.

Crawford, J.1989. *Bilingual Education: History Politics, Theory and Practice*. Treton. Grane Publishing Company. Inc.

Crawford, J.1996*. Surviving the English Only Assaut: Public Attidutes and the Future of Language Education*.http.// ourworld.compuserve:com/homepages/JWCRAWFORD/mitesol htm.

Crawford, J.2007. Surviving the English Only Assault: Public Attitude and Future of Language Education.

Cummins, J.1999 *Research Ethics and Public Discourse. The Debate on Bilingual Education. Presentation at the National Conference of the American Association of Higher education*. March 1999. Washington. *The teaching of English Vol 30.1.7-74.*

Cimmins, J and Swain, M.1992. Bilingualism in Education. United Kingdom. Longman Group.

Department of Education,1996. National Education Policy Act. Act 27 of 1996

Department of Education.1997. Statement by Prof. S.M.E. Bengu. Minister of Education on a New Language Policy in General and Further Education. Pretoria.

Department of Education.1999. Language in Education Policy

Department of Education, 2001. Draft Reviced National Curriculum Statement.

Department of Education. 2002. Revised National Curriculum Statement. Grades R-9 (School) Policy. Languages. English- First Additional Language.

Department of Education. 2003. *National Curriculum Statement. Grades (10-12. (General) Languages. English Home Language*.

Department of Education.2005.National Curriculum Statement: Participant Manual.

De Vos, S.A. (Ed) 1998. *Research in Grassroots.* Pretoria. South Africa. Van Schaik Publishers

de Wet, C. 2002. Factors Influencing Choice of English as language of learning and teaching (LoLT). *South Africa Journal of Education. Vol. 23 No.2.119-123.*

Fillmore, L.W., & Valadez, C. 1986. *Teaching Bilingual learners*. New York: Macmillian.

Fillmore, L.W.2004. *Keeping Multilingual Society Multilingual.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Final Draft: Language Policy and Plan for South Africa (2002)

Grosjean, F.2001.The Bilingual's Language modes, in Nicol, J.L.(Ed).One Mind two Languages: Bilingual Language Processing(pp1-17). Oxford. Blackwell.

Guidelines for Language Planning and language Policy. Briefing by PANSALB to Parliamentary Education. 2001. Pretoria. South Africa.

Hakuta, K. 1986. Mirror of Language: The debate on bilingualism, New York.

Hakuta, K.1990. Bilingualism and Bilingual Education: A Research Representative.http//www.ncela.gwv.edu/ncehpubs/focus/.htm.

Hardy, M., & Bryman, A. *Data Analysis*. London: SAGE Publication.

Hartshorne, K.B. 1992. *Crisis and challenges: Black Education. 1910 – 1990.* Cape Town: South Africa. Oxford University Press.

Herbert, R K.1992. Language and Society in Africa: The Theory and Practice of

Sociolinguistics.Johannesburg.Witwatersrand University Press.

Heugh, K. 1987. Trends in Language Medium Policy for Post Apartheid South Africa. In D. Young(Ed). Language Policy and Medium in Education, 206-20 University of Cape Town.

Heugh, K. 1999. Language, development and reconstruction. *Journal of Education Development. Vol. 19 No 30 – 131.*

Heugh, K. 2001. Many Languages in Education: Issues of Implementation. *Perspective in Education. Vol. 20. No 1. March 2002.*

Heugh, K. 2002. The Case Against Bilingual/ multilingual Education in South Africa. Laying Bare the Myths. *Perspectives in Education. Vol. 20 No. 171.*

Jenkins, E.1995. *English in the melting Pot: The salad and the Rainbow.* Pretoria: Vista University

Krashen, S. 1996. *Interviews*. London. Sage Publications.

Krashen, S.1998. Bilingual Education: The Acquisition of English and the retention and loss of

Spanish. http//ourworld.Compuserve.com./homepages/JW Crawford/ Krashen7htm.

Krashen, S.1999. Bilingual Education. Arguments for (Bogus) Argument Against. May 1999. University of Southern California.

Krashen, S. 2000. Bilingual Education in Arizona: What the Research says. University of California and Seldin. California Riverside.

Langa, K.1996. Issues of Ethics Participation in Language Planning an Age of Ethics Empowerment: Observation from Gautemala. In ; Hickey, T., & Williams, J. (Eds). *Language, Education and Society in a Changing World*. England. Multilingual matters.

Langa, M.R. 2005. Attitude of Black Learners Towards African Languages as Opposed to English as Medium of Communication at Schools.University of Limpopo.Unpublished BEd Project. Language Policy for South Africa. Advisory Panel on Language Policy. 6 March 2000.

Leedy, P D.2001. Practical Research: Planning and Design (7th Ed). Upper Saddle. New.Jersey: Prentice Hall Inc.

Littlebear, D. 2007. Effective Language Education. http// jan.ucc.nan.edu/-jar/NAL 1 html.

Lubisi, R.C., & Murphy, R.J.L.(2002) Assessment in South African Schools*. Assessment in Education. Vol 9. No. 2. 255-271*.

Mackey, W.S. 1977. *Bilingual School for Bicultural Community*. UK: Congress Publication Data.

Mackey, S.L. 1998. Language Plan and Policy for South Africa.July 14 1998.http//www.und.ac.za/und/ling/achieve/mck/.htn.

Mawasha, A.L.1976. The Teaching of English Second Language. With Special Reference to Oral Communication. An Imperial study. Unpublished Thesis. University of the North. Pietersburg. South Africa.

Mawasha, A.L. 1978. "English Second Language in Black Education". Crux. Volume 13 No.2 June 1979. Paper presented at Fort Hare University

Mawasha, A.L.1993. Learner Perception of English Language Teaching in African High Schools. Implication for Lanuage Policy per lingum. A Journal of Language Learning. Volume 9 1993.

Mawasha ,A.L. 2001. The role of African languages in DemocraticSouth Africa. University of the North.

Mawasha, A.L (date unknown) "English teaching and Multicultural Environment. Occasional Paper. University of the North. South Africa.

McKay, S.L. (date unknown) Teaching in Multilingual Settings. San Francisco University.

Molefe, R. 2006. Capricorn High locks horns with govt. City Press, 12 March 2006.

Mouton, J. 1996. *Understanding Social Research*. Hatfield, Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Mouton, J. 2001. *How to Succeed in Your Master's and Doctorial Study*. Hatfield, Pretoria: Van Schaik.

National Education Policy, Act 27 of 1996

Nccrd. 2000. Language in the Classroom. Towards a Framework for Intervention Department of Education, Pretoria.

National Curriculum Statements Grade 10-12.2003. Languages. Participants' Manual.

 Patton, M.Q. 1990. Qualitative, Education and Research Methods. London. SAGE Publication.

Pluddeman, P. 2002. Action and Reflection: Dual-Medium Primary Schooling as Language Policy realization .*Perspective in Education: Vol 20;No 1. 47-63*.

Ralenala, MF. 2003. Reading and Behaviour of First year Physics Students at the University of the North. PhD Thesis. RandAfrikaans University.

Rammala, J.R. 2002. Language Planning and Social Transformation in Limpopo. The Role of Language in Education. Unpublished Thesis. University of Pretoria South Africa.

Sciffman, H.F. 1996. *Linguistic: Culture and Language*. London and New York: Routledge.

Schmied, J. 1991. English in Africa. An Introduction. UK. Longman Group.

Smith, P.H(1994) *An Introduction to Bilingualism and Bilingual Education in Mexico*.

Stein, P., & Potenza, E. 2005. *English Today. Learners' Book Grade 8*. Cape Town. Maskew Miller. Longman.

Sunday Sun. 2006. Robbing our children. Sunday Sun, 12 February 2006

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996.Act 108 of 1996

The Teacher. 2006. African Languages. The Year of African Languages. Vol.1 No. 1 January 2006.

Webb, V. 2003. African Languages as media of instructions in South Africa: Stating the http://www.up.co.za./academic/Afrkaans/Publkas:pub2003/webmed%20of%.

Wolff, H.E. (date unknown) Multilingualism, Modernization, and Post-Literacy: Some central issues concerning the promotion of indigenous African languages in democratic society. Proceedings of the workshop: The role of the African languages in democratic South Africa.

Yin, R.K.2003. Case Study Research.Design and Methods. Third Edition.USA. Sage Publication Inc.

ANNEXURE

Annexure A: Classroom Observation Guide

<div style="border:1px solid">

<u>CLASSROOM OBSERVATION SCHEDULE</u>

Date: _____   School :

_____

Teacher:_____ Class   :

_____

Observer:_____ Time & Duration of Observation:

_____

The educator	The learners	Language	Activity		Comments

</div>

Annexure B: Interview Questions with Educators

Interviewer: _____   Date._____

Interviewee: _____

School   : _____

Grade   : _____

1. To what extent do you make use of bilingual instruction in your classroom?

_____

_____

2. How do learners respond when you teach through the medium of English only?

_____

_____

3. What are the advantages code-mixing and code-switching?

_____

_____

4. Have you ever been trained or attended a workshop on bilingual instruction?

_____

_____

5. What is your perception towards the future of bilingual education?

_____

_____

Annexure C: Interview Questions with Learners

1. Do educators mix language during the lessons, i.e., English and African languages?

_____

_____

2. If you are asked to give a speech in class, which language do you prefer to use?

_____

_____

3. Do you mix languages when you speak to your friends?

_____

_____

4. Which language do you prefer to use when you speak to your parents?

_____

_____

Annexure D: Observed lesson plan: Mathematics

Subject: Mathematics	Grade: 4		Date : 20-09- 200
			Time : 30 minutes
Context : fractions		**Content:** Work with halves, quarters and eighths	

Learning outcomes :Lo1	Assessment standard
- The learner will be able to recognize, describe and present numbers and their relationship with competence and confidence in solving problems.	Recognizes, describe and use the equivalents addition, division and fraction.
Integration within	**Integration across**
Lo 2and Lo 4	Technology Lo3
	EMS Lo2
Prior Knowledge	Linking with new knowledge
Learners are able to identify patterns.	Introduce fractions.

Teacher	Learner	Teaching strategies	Resources
-The educator shows learners a full sheet and explains what a whole number is.	-Learners observe and listen.	- whole class - discussion	- Oxford P. 134-135.
- Folds the sheet into two and asks learners to identify two equal shapes.	- Learners look at the shapes and give the answers. - Learners fit the figures to make halves, and eighths.	- Group leaders report when they completed the fraction.	- worksheets Plastic shapes
		- Individual work.	
Expanded Opportunity	- They write fractions on the chalkboard.		- Chalkboard
		Homework	
More challenging for other learners to fit fractions together.		Learners draw shapes of quarters, halves and eighths**.**	

Annexure E: Observed lesson plan: Life Orientation

Subject: Life Orientation	Grade: 4	Date : 04-10-2005
		Time : 30 Minutes

Context :Recycling	Content: Getting rid of rubbish

Learning Outcomes: The leaner is able to demonstrate an understanding and appreciation of the value and rights that underpin the constitution in order to practice responsible citizenship, and to enhance social justice and sustainable living.

Prior knowledge:	Linking with new knowledge
Learners are able to identify household refuse such as can, plastics and glasses.	Identify things that can be produced from cans ,plastics etc.

Teacher	Learners	Teaching strategies	Resources
- Asks learners what they do when their dustbins are full. - Individual learners give types of empties they throw away. -Ask learners what they can produce from empty cans, plastic bags and bottles. **Expanded Opportunities** More challenging for learners to say that they can produce hats, money boxes from empties.	- Give answers - Name different type of empties. -Give things they can produce from empties such as hats, money boxes etc.	-individual learning. - Group learning - Individual work **Homework** Learners are asked to make hats, money boxes from empties**.**	- Hand outs Activity 3. - Empty plastic bags, cans, plastic bottles. - Chalkboard.
Educator's reflection : Are learners able to clean their environment?			

Annexure F: Observed Lesson Plan: English

Subject: English	Grade: 4	Date : 04-10-2005 Time : 30 Minutes

Context : Building Language skills   **Content: Poem** : Matty's Complaint

Learning Outcomes: The learner will be able to listen for information and enjoyment, and
                Respond appropriately and critically in a wide range of situation**.**

Assessment standard 1

-respect other learners, listen to their additional language

-Encourage learners their attempt to speak their additional languages

LO 2 Recall and describe the sequence of parts of speech.

Teacher	Learner	Teaching strategies	Resources
- The teacher reads the poem to the learners. - Write adjectives on the chalkboard. - Asks learners to identify other objects in the classroom to give more adjectives. - Asks learners to write the adjectives on the chalkboard.	- Listen when the teacher reads. - Name objects from the classroom and give adjectives from the objects. -Individual learners write adjectives on the chalkboard.	- Whole class - group discussion - individual work	- Oxford English Page 70. - Classroom objects. - Chalkboard

Expanded opportunities:	Homework
Some learners cannot identify adjectives.	- Learners are to write more sentences that contain adjective.

Reflection: Most learners participated to show the skills creativity in parts of speech like adjectives. They also show their ability by identifying objects in the classroom whereby the chose adjectives.

Annexure G: Observed lesson plan: Human and Social Sciences

Subject: Human and Social Sciences	Grade: 4	Date : 05-10-2005 Time : 30 Minutes
Context: Transport and Traveling		**Content**: How has transport change over time

Learning Outcomes:

LO 1 Define trade and transport

AS 1 Describe types of transport

Prior Knowledge:

Learners are able to identify transport use for the past.   Linking knowledge:

Learners are able to differentiate old and Modern transport.

Teacher	Learners	Teaching Strategies	Resources
- Asks learners how they go to school, i.e., Mode of transport. - Asks them to give types of transport. - Arranges the class into groups and every group to list water transport, air transport, land transport respectively.	- Individual learners give mode of transport they use to come to school. -They give types of transport they know. - They write a list of types of transport and the leaders report the types they have in their group.	- Individual learners give answers. - Individuals give types of transport. Group leaders give report.	- Oxford Page 57. - Pictures - Chalkboard.

Expanded opportunities:	Homework
Learners able to give modern types of transport but most failed to give old mode of transport such as cart, wagons etc.	Learners were to paste pictures of different types of transport in their exercise books.

Reflection:

The activity strengthened the learners' understanding of different mode of transport and their degree of speed.

Annexure H: Observed Lesson Plan: Life Orientation

Subject: Life Orientation	Grade: 4	Date : 06-10-2005 Time : 30 minutes

Context: Nutritious Food   **Content :** healthy Diet

Learning Outcomes:

Make informed decisions regarding personal, community and environmental health

Linking with previous lesson

Social and personal problems associated with lifestyle choices and high-risk behavior (LO 1; AS1

Core knowledge :

-Analyze your diet.

-Improve your nutritional value of food you eat.

- Evaluate solutions to environmental health problems.

- Prepare suitable food for people living with diseases.

-Encourage people living with diseases to get the best of life.

Identify personal feelings, community norms, etc. about sexuality.

Teacher	Learners	Teaching strategies	Resources
- Asks learners to discuss about junk- food and their nutritional value. - Each group gets information on one of the following : I) How learners clean-up the nature reserve. ii) Discuss their ideas about sexuality.	- Learners discuss their daily diet. - Write list of junk food they know. - discuss their knowledge about sexuality.	- Individual learning. -Group learning. -Group work.	Text books : Oxford p. 6-7. - Worksheets - Health leaflets

Expanded opportunities:	Homework
Learners are able to give types vegetables and fruits; and other nutritional food they know	Learners are given a task to fulfill at home. E.g. Looking for more pictures on types of food.

Reflection:

-The activity strengthened learners understanding and awareness of nutritious food.

-Activities encourage greater open-mindedness on sexuality issues.

Annexure I: Observed Lesson Plan: Life Orientation

Subject: Life Orientation	Grade: 4	Date : 06-10-2005
		Time : 30 Minutes

Context: Relationship with other people   **Content**: Respect

Learning Outcomes: The learner is able to achieve and maintain personal well-being.

AS 1 Explain different life roles, and how they change and affect relationships.

LO 2 The learner is able to demonstrate an understanding and appreciation of the values and rights that underpin the constitution in order to practice responsible citizenship, and to enhance social justice and sustainable living**.**

Prior Knowledge :   **Linking with new knowledge**

Learners are able to identify their members of family.   Identify extended family members.

Teacher	Learners	Teaching Strategies	Resources
- Asks learners how they greet their elders. - Group learners to discuss and compare their relationship with their peer, parents and educators. - Asks learners to greet with different languages.	- Learners respond and demonstrate how they greet. - They demonstrate how they greet in Sepedi Xitsonga and Tshivenda.	- Individual earners - Group learning.	-Oxford P. 30-31 - Chalkboard - Learners themselves

Expanded opportunities:	Homework
-More challenging text for the learners. -There is need for more activities to learners who do not achieve the outcome.	- Learners are to exercise more language when they greet one another.