

**DISSATISFACTION OF MALAMULELE RESIDENTS WITH SERVICE DELIVERY**

**IN MALAMULELE AREA, LIMPOPO PROVINCE: A SOCIOLOGICAL**

**INVESTIGATION**

BY

**NTSAKO SIMEON MATHONSI**



Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Arts in

Sociology

in the

**FACULTY OF HUMANITIES**

**(School of Social Sciences)**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO**

**Supervisor: Prof SL Sithole**

2017

## **Declaration**

I wish to declare that the work on Dissatisfaction of Malamulele residents with service delivery in Malamulele area, Limpopo Province: A sociological investigation submitted towards fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Arts in Sociology has not previously been submitted by myself for a degree at any other university, and also that the work is my own in both design and execution, and that all material contained herein has been acknowledged accordingly.

---

**Mr NS Mathonsi**

---

**DATE**

## **Dedication**

This work is dedicated to my wife - Wisani Mathonsi, my daughters - Vun'we Blessing Mathonsi and Xilavelo Abundance Mathonsi, as well as my parents - Mr Yobert and Mrs Maria Mathonsi, who are my source of strength and my support structure. I also wish to dedicate this work to my late grandfather, patriarch Shabane Samuel Mungoni who has been and always will be my inspiration.

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to express my sincere gratitude for assistance and support to the following authorities, people, and institutions:

- The Almighty God who is the author and perfecter of my faith.
- My supervisor, Professor SL Sithole - for his wisdom, guidance, advice, support and supervision, and his trust upon me.
- The Health and Welfare Sector Education and Training Authority (HWSETA) for the financial assistance.
- My siblings Mikateko, Ripfumelo, Nsovo, and Ntiyiso Mathonsi for their moral support and prayers.
- My friend and uncle, Mr RJ Hlungwani for his assistance during data collection sessions.
- Every person who served as a participant in the study (Respondents).
- All my friends in Limpopo and Gauteng, thanks a lot for your support.
- My colleagues and church mates for their moral support and prayers.
- Dr S Kubayi for his editorial assistance.

## **Abstract**

The study sought to investigate the problem of dissatisfaction by residents of Malamulele in Thulamela Local Municipality (LM) with service delivery. The dissatisfaction of the residents manifested in violent protests in Malamulele and surrounding communities where citizens demanded to have their own municipality separate from Thulamela LM. Residents alleged that the Thulamela LM gives preference to Thohoyandou area and surrounding communities on issues of governance and service delivery while neglecting Malamulele. The problem under study was viewed from a social exclusion and relative deprivation points of view, which elucidate possible causes of dissatisfaction and resultant protests. The study adopted a qualitative research design where data was collected through interviews with sampled residents that were purposively selected took into consideration the manner in which the sample would assist in providing data towards achieving the aim and objectives of the study. Data was analysed using the thematic method of analysis where themes and categories emerged to assist in interpreting the data. Based on the findings of the study, recommendations were made. Some of the key findings were that Malamulele residents were dissatisfied with poor service delivery and poor governance by Thulamela LM, the violent protests were due to poor service delivery and tribalism and poor service delivery, Malamulele residents needed their own municipality, and that the relationship between the Venda-speaking people and Tsonga-speaking people is bad. Some of the key recommendations are leaders should engage communities to manage their hopes and expectations from government, exercising Constitutional rights should not result in devastating government property and violence, and citizens should be consulted in policy-making and other government activities that involve them. It is believed that these recommendations will go a long way to address similar problems and to enhance literature on the ongoing debate on governance and service delivery issues.

## Abbreviations and Acronyms

ACCEDE	- African Centre for Citizenship and Democracy
ANC	- African National Congress
AsgiSA	- Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa
BLA	- Black Local Authority
CBO	- Community-based Organisation
CoGTA	- Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs
COSATU	- Congress of South African Trade Unions
DFID	- Department for International Development
DoRA	- Division of Revenue Act
DPLG	- Department of Provincial and Local Government
EPR	- Economic Recovery Programme
GDP	- Gross Domestic Product
GEAR	- Growth Employment and Reconstruction
HSRC	- Human Science Research Council
Idasa	- Institute for a Democratic Alternative for South Africa
IDP	- Integrated Development Plan
IMF	- International Monetary Fund
MDB	- Municipal Demarcation Board
MDG	- Millennium Development Goals
MTEF	- Medium-Term Expenditure Framework
MSPP	- Municipal Service Partnership Policy
NDP	- National Development Plan
NGO	- Non-Governmental Organisation
NPC	- National Planning Commission
OECD	- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
RDP	- Reconstruction and Development Programme
RSA	- Republic of South Africa
SABC	- South African Broadcasting Corporation
SAIRR	- South African Institute for Race Relations
SAP	- Structural Adjustment Programme
SARS	- South African Revenue Service

- SGT - Self-Governing Territory
- SoNA - State of Nation's Addresses
- TRC - Truth and Reconciliation Commission
- TVBC - Transkei, Venda, Bophuthatswana and Ciskei
- UN - United Nations
- UNICEF - United Nations Children's Fund
- WLA - White Local Authority

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration.....	i
Dedication.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	iii
Abstract.....	iv
Abbreviations and Acronyms.....	v
Contents.....	vii

### CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Research Problem.....	2
1.3 Rationale of the Study.....	4
1.4 Aim and Objectives.....	5
1.5 Theoretical Framework and Literature Review (Preliminary).....	6
1.6 Methodology.....	13
1.7 Ethical Consideration.....	14
1.8 Significance of the Study.....	15
1.9 Limitation of the Study.....	16

### CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction.....	17
2.2 South African 'Welfare State'.....	18
2.3 Legislative Framework on Service Delivery.....	20
2.4 Macro-Policy Framework on Service Delivery.....	23
2.5 Governance and service delivery policies.....	29
2.6 Structure of South African Government.....	30
2.7 Analysis of Some Related Literature.....	31
2.8 Challenges on Governance and Service Delivery in South Africa.....	34
2.9 Addressing Governance and Service Delivery Challenges.....	36
2.10 Theoretical Framework.....	41

### CHAPTER 3: PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF FINDINGS

3.1 Introduction.....	56
3.2 Research Methodology.....	57
3.3 Research Procedure.....	59



3.4 Sample.....	60
3.5 Data Analysis.....	67
3.6 Discussion of Empirical Findings.....	103

**CHAPTER 4: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

4.1 Introduction.....	110
4.2 Synopsis of the chapters.....	110
4.3 Summary of the Study.....	111
4.4 Key findings.....	112
4.5 Conclusion.....	113
4.6 Recommendations.....	114

References.....	116
-----------------	-----

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1.....	61
Table 2.....	69

**ANNEXURES**

Annexure 1: Interview Guide Questions (English and Xitsonga Versions).....	130
Annexure 2: Letter of Consent (English and Xitsonga Versions).....	136

## **CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND**

### **1.1 Introduction**

The South African government faces a major challenge of delivering basic services to most of its citizens. The delivery of basic services to historically marginalised communities proves to be both a major test for South Africa's post-apartheid government as it is an issue that will always pose questions about the country's political stability. Notwithstanding the government's attempts to address the legacy of apartheid through policies and strategies that were translated into programmes and projects for implementation, the government continues to have deficient delivery of basic services such as water, housing, electricity, education, health and sanitation especially in black urban townships as well as in rural areas in South Africa. These basic services were conceptualised around 'the big five' social services, which are education, healthcare, housing, personal social services and social security (Erskine, 2004:14). The Local Government: Municipal Systems Act, 2000, Act 32 of 2000 defines basic municipal services as those services that are necessary to ascertain an acceptable and reasonable quality of life and, which if not provided, would endanger public health, safety, or even the environment (Republic of South Africa (RSA), 2000). Joseph (2002) concurs as he opines that basic services are those services at a level adequate to ensure the health and safety of consumers.

From the year 2009 to 2011, South Africa had the worst wave of service delivery protests across the country since the attainment of democracy (Shaidi, 2013). Several direct causes and reasons for such protests have been identified. Among others, protests are due to the following: non delivery of services, poor sustainability of services, and dissatisfaction with the delivery of basic services where service delivery occurred (Nleya, 2011; Managa, 2012). Hough (2008) argues that the more immediate causes of the protests are linked to frustration about promises that are not kept regarding service delivery. Alexander (2010) indicates that protests have been about inefficient service delivery and against self-serving and corrupt leaders in municipalities. Grasso and Giugni (2016) add that economic crisis can also contribute towards increasing protests. The deficient provision of basic services in predominantly rural provinces affects residents adversely, hence the South African

Institute for Race Relations' (SAIRR) (2011) argument that deficient service delivery in more rural provinces such as the Eastern Cape and Limpopo affects residents more negatively.

A series of service delivery protests occurred in Malamulele, Limpopo. This includes a major protest that occurred at the beginning of the year 2015 in which Malamulele residents demanded to have their own municipality (News24, 2015a). The residents acknowledged that the problem of deficient service delivery in their area can be addressed if they could have their own municipality. They were of the view that they qualified to have their own municipality, and they no longer wanted to be under Thulamela LM (Nduvheni, 2009). This view was also expressed during the funeral of the former minister in both the Presidency as well as in Public Service and Administration, Honourable Collins Chabane. The deceased family remarked that "It was his (the former Minister) wish that Malamulele be granted a municipality. As a family, we would also request that the municipality be called Collins Chabane Municipality" (News24, 2015b). According to the protesters, there was reluctance by the Limpopo Provincial Government to declare Malamulele as a municipality on its own. The MEC's spokesperson for Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (CoGTA) was quoted as saying "No, they are not getting it", referring to a municipality (City Press, 2015). The Municipal Demarcation Board (MDB) had argued that Malamulele was "not viable" to have its own Municipality since it did not have a tax base that could yield sufficient revenue to deliver services on its own and also that it is "only a quarter of the population" (MDB, 2015:33; Citizen, 2015). However, after reconsidering the matter and having noted that the residents had threatened to continue with their protests until their demand for a new municipality in Malamulele was met. According to the South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC) News, the MDB had subsequently announced the reconfiguration of local municipalities in Vhembe District, and as such, an announcement was made by the Board that a new municipality that would encompass Malamulele and Vuwani areas would be established (SABC News, 2015a).

## **1.2 Research Problem**

The residents of Malamulele area and its surrounding communities were not satisfied with the manner in which services were delivered in their area. This dissatisfaction

was evident through service delivery protests that had been going on in the area. The residents of Malamulele had alleged that they are poorly serviced, alleging that priority in the delivery of services was given to the Thohoyandou area. At the time of the study, Malamulele was currently under Thulamela LM which, according to the Constitution, is designated as a Category B municipality. According to Section 156 (1 and 2) of the Constitution, a Category B municipality has executive authority in respect of, and has the right to administer these services, among others: electricity, health, refuse removal, water and sanitation. The Constitution also provides that a Category B municipality may make and administer by-laws for the effective administration of the matters which it has the right to administer (RSA, 1996). Thulamela LM is one of the four local municipalities currently under Vhembe District Municipality in Limpopo Province, which was predominantly inhabited by two ethnic groups, vhaVenda (in Thohoyandou area) and vaTsonga (in Malamulele area). The evident dissatisfaction of Malamulele residents with the manner in which services are delivered started after the 2000 local government elections where Malamulele was demarcated along with Thohoyandou to form Thulamela LM.

It is important to note that there is no Tsonga connotation in terms of the name "*Thulamela*", instead the name is ascribed to Venda and Karanga origins to mean "a place of giving birth" in Venda and "a crest or treeless hilltop" in Karanga (South African History Online, Sa; Wild Card, 2015). Besides the controversy associated with the name of the Municipality, Malamulele residents argued that poor service delivery was a serious challenge in their area and it was about time that the Limpopo Provincial Government and the National Government intervened.

The dissatisfaction by the Malamulele community manifested through protests that had been taking place in the area where some of the schools, shops and municipal offices were burnt down. There were times where education, businesses, and other social activities had to be stopped under what the protesters referred to as "a shutdown of activities and services" (SABC News, 2015b). During this shutdown period, no cars were allowed to move in and out of Malamulele area, no businesses or related activities took place, and nobody went to work. Protesters moved around to monitor and ensure that nothing happened.

This problem of service delivery dissatisfaction by the Malamulele community necessitated a contribution through this sociological study. It is important to understand the challenge of service delivery and governance, and to understand (alleged) concerns by poorly serviced residents who demonstrated their dissatisfaction. The incidents of municipal service delivery protests are on the constant increase in number. This increase is symptomatic of growing dissatisfaction with the sphere of government (local government) closest to the people and responsible for addressing the needs of citizens in communities (Paradza, Mokwena and Richards, 2010). One of the most important development challenges in South Africa is inequality of access to basic services across different demographics or populations. The divide between the “haves” and “have-nots” in terms of social amenities stems from the historic legacies of colonial rule and apartheid which sought to separate and disempower the majority black African population (Nnadozie, 2013:98). The cause of the problem experienced in Malamulele can be theoretically viewed from a social exclusion and relative deprivation points of view. According to Smith, Pettigrew, Pippin and Bialosiewicz (2010), relative deprivation is the judgment that one is worse off against some standard, exacerbated by feelings of anger and resentment. Social scientists such as Runciman (1966), Gurr (1970) and Khan (2012) use relative deprivation theory to predict a wide range of significant outcome variables such as collective action, deviance and intergroup attitudes. The theories of relative deprivation and social exclusion will be discussed under theoretical framework below.

### **1.3 The Rationale and Motivation of the Study**

The research problem identified had to be scientifically investigated in order to interpret the situation and to make recommendations that would assist to remedy such kind of situations. According to Burawoy (2005:1), there is a need for ‘organic intellectuals’ or inter alia, ‘sociologists’ to contribute through undertaking research in order to understand and interpret social problems. Thus the study was also necessary in order to enhance existing literature and to contribute to the ongoing debate in the quest for solutions to service delivery and governance challenges in the country. It was envisaged that the outcomes of this study would yield recommendations that would assist in policy enhancements and the reconfiguration

of institutional arrangements geared at addressing citizens' dissatisfaction in municipalities. It was anticipated that interaction between the researcher and the participants (Malamulele residents) of the study would provide residents with an opportunity to voice out their concerns that (presumably) could not be efficiently heeded to through other forms of public participation.

## **1.4 Aim and Objectives**

### **1.4.1 Aim**

The aim of this study was to investigate the dissatisfaction about service delivery by residents of Malamulele, in Limpopo Province in order to interpret the situation and to make recommendations that would assist in addressing similar challenges in local government.

### **1.4.2 Objectives**

The following were the objectives of the study:

- To interpret and describe the extent of the alleged poor service delivery in Malamulele.
- To identify the causes of the alleged poor service delivery and how the situation can be remedied.
- To understand the extent of the desire for the Malamulele residents to get their own municipality.
- To provide recommendations that will assist in policy enhancements geared at addressing the citizens' dissatisfaction.

## 1.5 Theoretical Framework and Literature Study (Preliminary)

### 1.5.1 Key Conceptual Frameworks

The dissatisfaction demonstrated by Malamulele residents was an indication of a feeling of social exclusion on the delivery of services by Thulamela LM. The social exclusion theory was adopted as a lens through which the alleged poor service delivery and its resultant reactions of dissatisfaction (protests) by Malamulele residents were viewed. As a theory that underpins the study, it was important to understand it within the context of this study. According to Khan (2012:5), social exclusion first started as a concept in Europe, where there had tended to be a greater emphasis on spatial exclusion. This was followed by a policy that focused on assisting people who resided in areas considered as 'deprived areas'. These areas were characterised by (i) *poor housing*, (ii) *inadequate social services*, (iii) *weak political voice*, and (iv) *lack of basics for decent living*, which when combined, create a feeling of marginalisation. The concept gained popularity in other countries through the European Union while endeavouring to fight the effects of social exclusion.

De Haan (1999) argues that there is inter-connectedness between the concept social exclusion with notions of poverty, marginalisation, lack of integration, lack of social services, vulnerability, relative deprivation, and lack of adequate participation of a particular group in society. Sen (2000:1) argues that in a "practical context of identifying 'the excluded' in France, René Lenoir, as the *Secrétaire d'Etat à l'Action Sociale* of the French Government, spoke of the following as constituting the excluded" - a tenth - of the French population: mentally and physically handicapped, suicidal people, aged invalids, abused children, substance abusers, delinquents, single parents, multi-problem households, marginal, asocial persons, and other social 'misfits'. These are the groups of people that are usually found to be victims of marginalisation and deprivation in societies.

An important point in this context is the relationship between the concept *social exclusion* and relative deprivation (as a theory), lack of service delivery and marginalisation. Thus the concept of social exclusion is seen as covering a remarkably wide range of cultural, socioeconomic and political problems. According

to Khan (2012:55), social exclusion is contested because it is always difficult to 'objectively' identify who is socially excluded, as it is usually a matter of criteria set and adopted, and judgements used differently in various circumstances. By way of defining social exclusion notwithstanding the fact that there is no common definition that commands universal acceptance, it is prudent to consider the definition used by De Haan (1999:6), who defines social exclusion as the condition by which individuals/groups are wholly/partially excluded from full participation in society within which they live, which is an opposite of social integration and of being 'included'. The Department of International Development (DFID) defines *social exclusion* as a process by which certain groups in society are systematically disadvantaged through being discriminated against on the basis of their ethnicity, race, religion, sexual orientation, caste, descent, gender, age, disability, HIV status, migrant status or place of their residence (DFID, 2005). State institutions cause exclusion when they deliberately discriminate in their laws, policies or programmes. According to Khan (2012), most commonly, social exclusion is seen to apply to groups, involving the exclusion of individuals due to their membership of particular groups that suffer discrimination on racial, ethnic, gender, geographic or age grounds. One critical aspect of social exclusion is that it can be better understood by the group that feels deprived and vulnerable. Social exclusion emphasises people's own perceptions of their situation, rather than relying on definitions by outsiders (De Haan, 1999). This was what (arguably) Malamulele residents can easily identify with given their situation.

It is interesting to note that social exclusion is a systemic process rather than just a practice. Khan (2012) agrees that social exclusion is a process that can involve the systematic denial of entitlements to services, and the denial of rights to participate on equal terms in social relationships in economic, social, cultural, or political arenas. Exclusionary processes can occur at various levels and dimensions. For example, in the latter, it occurs within households, villages, cities, states and globally. Institutions unofficially perpetuate exclusion when public sector workers reflect prejudices of their society through their positions. In this manner, they institutionalise some kind of discrimination. Social exclusion goes beyond mere descriptions of deprivation and focuses on social relations, processes and institutions that underlie and are part and parcel of deprivation (De Haan, 1999).



In addition to levels at which the exclusionary process may occur, there are exclusionary dimensions through which social exclusion may occur (De Haan, 1999). Khan (2012:4, 22) argues that there are four dimensions of social exclusion: political, economic, social and cultural. Political exclusion can include the denial of citizenship rights such as political participation and the right to organise, and also of personal security, the rule of law, freedom of expression, and equality of opportunity. Economic exclusion includes lack of access to labour markets, credit and other forms of 'capital assets'. Social exclusion may take the form of discrimination along a number of dimensions, including gender, ethnicity and age, which reduce the opportunity for such groups to gain access to social services and limit their participation in the labour market. Cultural exclusion refers to the extent to which diverse values, norms and ways of living are accepted and respected. Flynn (Sa: 101) presents the same argument in respect of the relative deprivation theory, that relative deprivation theory is applied to socio-political, economic and organisational problems. The social exclusion theory is considered to facilitate a broader understanding of the multiple dimensions of poverty and marginalisation. While poverty and social exclusion are closely related, social exclusion has been described as the existence of barriers which make it difficult or impossible for people to participate fully in society or obtain a decent standard of living (Social Exclusion Unit, 2003).

According to Lipton (1997), the social exclusion theory is acceptable in as much as social exclusion itself is measurable. To understand the extent to which the socially excluded group from the mainstream society is important since it makes it easy to understand the consequences and effects of their deprivation. The measurability of social exclusion is tied to its definition. Some forms of social exclusion are relatively easy to measure, while others are quite difficult (Khan, 2012). In cases such as dissatisfaction demonstrated by Malamulele residents, it appeared that their extent of exclusion was adverse, resulting in the demand for their own municipality. They indicated that they no longer wanted to be under Thulamela LM anymore, claiming that they have had enough of being ignored and deprived of services. As a consequence of their exclusion, there have been violent protests. Khan (2012) argues that there are close links between social exclusion, conflict and insecurity

both in terms of causes and consequences. He also argues that some forms of social exclusion generate conditions in which conflict can arise, ranging from civil unrest to violent armed conflict and terrorism. For this course, there had been violent protests, shutdown of services, and ethnic acrimony with the vhaVenda, where cars were barred from moving freely between Malamulele and Thohoyandou. Severely disadvantaged groups with shared characteristics (such as ethnicity or religion) may resort to violent conflict in order to claim their rights and to redress inequalities. It is, therefore, understandable why unrest in Malamulele took the form of ethnic acrimony over and above the issue at hand.

### **1.5.2 Preliminary Literature Study**

Service delivery protests are indicative of feelings of deprivation, exclusion, marginalisation, lack of integration and autonomy. Social exclusion has been further defined as “the lack or denial of resources, rights, goods and services and the inability to participate in the normal relationships and activities available to the majority of people in a society” (Levitas, 2007:9). Related to social exclusion is the concept *marginalisation*. According to Billson (2005), marginality has actually been applied in sociology in three (3) ways: (i) *cultural marginality* - which refers to dilemmas of cross-cultural identities and assimilation, (ii) *social marginality* - which describes tensions that occur when an individual is restricted from belonging to a positive reference group, and (iii) *structural marginality* - which refers to political, social, and economic powerlessness and disadvantage. Social exclusion and marginalisation are understood in the same context with deprivation. Black Africans, who constitute 76% of the population, were more likely to be affected by inequality and relative deprivation than any other group in South Africa (Krugell, Otto and Van Der Merwe, 2009). The people of Malamulele felt excluded, marginalised, and deprived of services, hence they resorted to protesting as a way of demonstrating their dissatisfaction (SABC News, 2015b).

Emanating from a study on service delivery conducted in selected districts that are considered deprived, marginalised and socially excluded in England, Duffy (2000) argues that there is a belief that public services do not really meet the needs of citizens in deprived areas, and this frustrates the residents. Frustration for the

poorest communities occurs when they get the poorest public services such as police, education and health, among other services. According to him, these services should be governments' best weapons against deprivation since governments have resources and experience to deliver them. He also argues that residents in deprived areas tend to be more reliant on government public services as they do not have resources to purchase private services (Duffy, 2000). The needs for the deprived areas have not been a major focus of mainstream public service provision, meaning that government departments have not really been encouraged to prioritise marginalised areas in delivering some of the key mainstreaming services. The result is that, despite much greater need in deprived areas, little additional money is being spent on them. There are other factors suggesting that services in deprived areas may not be meeting the needs of the citizens. These services are also of lower quality because of the following reasons: (i) residents in deprived areas do not have professional and political contacts as in other areas. These contacts can be important in exerting pressure for high quality services; and (ii) it can also be more difficult to recruit and retain high quality staff to assist in service delivery in deprived areas (Duffy, 2000).

In a study Bernt and Colini (2013) on *Exclusion, Marginalisation and Peripheralisation: Conceptual Concerns in Urban Inequalities*, it is clear that the three concepts are related from a theoretical point of view. They argue that on a theoretical macro-level, the concepts exclusion, marginalisation and peripheralisation are far from being mutually exclusive, and many social scientists (among which Wacquant, 2008) use these concepts as synonyms, without caring much about the intellectual backgrounds of the concepts. They also argue that this is due to the fact that there are actually similarities and overlaps between the three concepts. Among these is the fact that they all foster a relational approach towards inequalities; they are concerned with the inter-connectivity of disadvantaged places to socio-spatial dynamics outside these places; and they all share the *problematique* of a potentially dichotomist understanding of the relations between the imagined *centre* and the *peripheries*. Thus, while all three concepts come from different intellectual traditions and focus on different historical and socio-spatial contexts, they all share a large number of overlaps (Wacquant, 2008).

While poor service delivery might be a result of a number of causes inclusive of poor capacity in municipalities, corruption, financial constraints, poor planning, and many other causes, it should be noted that local government needs to engage with communities in order to provide as much information as possible to ascertain that communities are not ignored by government. It has become clear that dissatisfaction by Malamulele residents was directly linked to poor service delivery, whose reasons were not known to the community members. Failure of public participation by local government leads to its mistrust by citizens. According to Karamoko (2011), community protests should be expected as a result of systemic failures in the provision of basic services to poverty-stricken members of South African society as well as poor communication channels between government and communities. It is believed that when services are delivered effectively, it is because there is both engagement and accountability between citizens and their leaders (Sithole and Mathonsi, 2015). Citizens have a way of voicing their desires about the types of services provided and their quality. On the other hand, political leaders have to listen to those demands and ensure that services are provided in line with their policies and programmes (Hofmeister and Grabow, 2011).

Nnadozie (2013) analysed the issue of access to basic services in post-apartheid South Africa with particular interest on what has changed since the apartheid era. According to him, the incidents of mass protests in response to inadequate service delivery in recent years can be explained through the social theory of relative deprivation. He utilised the concept of relative deprivation as a situation where a demographic segment of the population is deprived of some goods or services to which they perceive entitlement, while another segment of the population enjoys such goods or services (Nnadozie, 2013). This brings in the notion of the dichotomy of the imagined “centre” and the “peripheries” (Bernt and Colini, 2013:21). Nnadozie (2013) features an argument from a study on *Relative Deprivation and Social Justice...Attitudes to Social Inequality in the 20th Century England* by Runciman (1972), who argues that the feeling of relative deprivation could have consequences for attitudes and perceptions towards service delivery and the deprivation thereof. This could lead to protests as people join together to demand what they perceive as their fair share of the system. Nnadozie (2013) argues that backdrop for mass action is social deprivation and lack of basic services, which still negatively impacts on the

majority of individuals and communities in South Africa and prevent their escaping from the trap of poverty.

Citizens are not only neglected on the delivery of services, they also suffer from being neglected during the engagement value chain for service delivery, notably, public participation processes.

The majority of the people in South Africa are not only deprived of access to basic services but also side-lined from the mainstream activities and processes leading to the provision of such services. Against this backdrop, government intervention is required for a complete overhaul of the system. A participatory community development intervention may be most effective to effect such wholesale change (Nnadozie, 2013:85).

He also featured Freire's theoretical model from his work on *The Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (Freire, 1970), who argues that communities and individuals must be active agents in their development generally, rather than perpetual passive agents, on the receiving end of governmental or institutional aid (Nnadozie, 2013). This argument supports some aspects of good governance, among many, that public participation and transparency are important for both governments and citizens.

Deficient service delivery remains an overwhelming challenge in most municipalities in South Africa. This is evidenced by protests that are recorded all over the country. The World Bank (2003) notes that the delivery of basic services is rapidly becoming one of the most important developmental issues for governments to strongly consider and deal with. Joseph (2002) concurs, arguing that the delivery of basic services enhances the quality of life for citizens, and increases their social and economic opportunities by promoting health and safety, facilitating access to work, education and recreation, and stimulating new productive activities. Thus, government cannot afford to ignore this problem any longer. All relevant stakeholders should be brought on board in order to work together to address the problem of deficiency in the delivery of services.

## **1.6 Methodology**

### **1.6.1 Research design**

The research project adopted a qualitative research approach and applied a case study design to study the situation in Malamulele area and to arrive at the interpretation of the situation. The design adopted allowed for a once off investigation of an event or incident (Baxter and Jack, 2008; Yin, Sa). In this case, the study was conducted following violent service delivery protests in Malamulele.

### **1.6.2 Sample**

Malamulele residents were purposively sampled (judgemental sample) in groups, whose members included five (5) traditional leaders, five (5) religious leaders, five (5) members of the pressure group (task teams) and five (5) community members. Since not all sampled respondents were available during the data collection process, the researcher had to improvise in order to reach the initially targeted number of participants. The criteria for selection of the sample was that the participants had to have, firstly, witnessed the protests, and secondly, lived in Malamulele before, during, and after the violent protests that occurred in the area.

### **1.6.3 Data Collection Method/Instrument**

In-depth interviews are a predominant method for data collection in qualitative research designs (De Vos, Strydom, Fouche and Delpont, 2005; Welman, Kruger and Mitchel, 2005). According to the research plan, the researcher wanted to record the participants of the study during the interview sessions. As envisaged, the nature of the study would best yield relevant data through interviews. The interview guide that was utilised to collect data is **annexed** to this report as annexure 1.

### **1.6.4 Data Analysis and Interpretation**

According to De Vos *et al* (2005), qualitative data analysis comprises some of the following steps: planning for recording of data; managing or organising of data;

writing and reading memoranda; generating categories, themes and patterns; coding the data; testing emergent understandings; searching for alternative explanations; and writing a report.

The thematic analysis model of data analysis was applied. Individual interviews generated data in the form of field notes. Data was carefully studied and impressions that emerged were recorded. The purpose of the entire investigation was revisited and juxtaposed with the data obtained. Categorisation, themes, and sub-themes were identified. Patterns and connections within and between the categories were also identified. Themes and connections were utilised to explain the findings, thereby interpret the data.

### **1.6.5 Quality Criteria**

As an aspect of ascertaining quality, Shenton (2004) and Anney (2014) argue that trustworthiness, authenticity, and credibility are common in interpretive studies. Credibility provides confidence in the truthfulness of the findings. In this case, and as opposed to positivist traditions, the study ascertained authenticity, credibility, authenticity and trustworthiness of the findings by ensuring that the respondents understood the questions before they made their responses, and by piloting the data collection instrument to test whether or not it would yield the type of data that would address the aim and objectives of the study (Lincoln and Guba, 1985; Shenton, 2004; Anney, 2014).

### **1.7 Ethical Considerations**

The researcher guaranteed anonymity of the participants of the study and no deception of the contents of the study to the participants. There was neither harm nor jeopardy to the participants of the study. According to Babbie (2008), participants of the study are often harmed psychologically during the course of a research study, hence a researcher must guard against the subtlest danger that might occur. He further argues that social science research should never injure the participants regardless of whether they volunteered to participate in the study or not, with emphasis on the importance of guarding the interest and well-being of the participants of the study by protecting their identities. He adds that revealing their

responses may negatively affect them, hence a researcher should be ethically considerate (Lincoln and Guba, 1985; Babbie, 2008)

### **1.7.1 Confidentiality**

As the facilitator of the study, the researcher ensured that the data gathered was kept safe and utilised for the purposes of the study, and the names of the sources thereof were not disclosed anywhere as promised that confidentiality and anonymity would be guaranteed.

### **1.7.2 Informed consent**

The researcher also ascertained that before engaging in the collection of data from the respondents, he obtained their consent. He issued out letters of consent to the respondents who participated in the study on time in order for them to append their signatures as an indication of their consent. It was reflected on the letters that the study would neither harm nor cause prejudice of any kind to the participants, and that consent to participate in the study was voluntary. The letter issued to the respondents is ***annexed*** to this report as annexure 2.

### **1.7.3 Provision of debriefing, counselling and additional information**

The participants were notified of what was going to happen in the study and that there would be no relevant information to be known that would be kept away from them. Additional information and changes which concerned the participants that might occur were communicated to them on time.

## **1.8 Significance of the Study**

It was envisaged that the study would broaden existing knowledge and literature on service delivery and community dissatisfaction matters. It would also contribute to the ongoing debate in respect of addressing poor governance in rural municipalities in South Africa. The study also sought to determine better ways in which the



government and citizens can work together to address identified problems on governance and service delivery.

### **1.9 Limitations/Possible risks of the study**

In terms of the scope of the research project, the study was limited to Malamulele Town and its surrounding communities. Part of the limitation of the study and a possible risk was the likelihood of reluctance by the participants to be recorded during the interviews. However, this risk/limitation was mitigated by preparing field notes and requesting the participants to repeat their responses where necessary. Another possible risk was that not all participants could be available for interviews. As such, a mitigation measure of adding participants from other available sample groups was considered.

## **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW ON GOVERNANCE AND SOCIAL SERVICE DELIVERY**

### **2.1 Introduction**

The debate on governance and the delivery of social services is associated with a number of phenomena that include community protests especially in welfare states. Phenomena such as community protests and other psycho-social responses to social problems are not new to social science analysis. Literature around the phenomena in question is available for discussion and analysis (Human Science Research Council (HSCR), 2002; Paradza, Mokwena and Richards, 2010; Nleya, 2011). Also, a number of theories have been developed in order to study such phenomena. Therefore, this chapter focuses on literature review and the *theoretical framework* around the issues of dissatisfaction by societies about social services as well as the outcomes thereof. With regards to literature review, the discussion on some of the existing literature on governance and service delivery are made. Literature review is organised through a number of sub-headings including legislative and policy framework on governance and service delivery, challenges facing governance and service delivery in South Africa, as well as remedial interventions to the challenges. Literature review is aimed at exposing existing knowledge and gaps in research. As part of the theoretical framework, a discussion on the importance of sociological basis of the study is made. This includes a discussion on theories that underpin the study.

Deficient service delivery is one of the global challenges that made it impossible for the world to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) commitment that 192 United Nations (UN) members and 23 international organisations agreed to achieve by the year 2015. Although this commitment had entrusted states with major responsibilities that included effective delivery of basic services to citizens, the global challenge of poor service delivery appeared to be huger than anticipated, thus various authors took note of this challenge (Duffy, 2000; OECD, 2008). Social scientists and researchers have already contributed with literature and analysis on issues of governance and service delivery (Haarhoff, 2008; Krugell, Otto and Van Der Merwe, 2009; Institute for a Democratic Alternative for South Africa (Idasa),

2010). Thus research reports and publications by various institutions, government reports, specialised texts on governance and service delivery, journals and articles, scholarly work, policy and legislative frameworks and other relevant sources were utilised in respect of this review.

## **2.2 The South African 'Welfare State'**

To outright argue and conclude that South Africa is a welfare state may create a controversial discussion. However, it cannot be ignored that some of the legislative provisions around governing service delivery and governance position create the impression that South Africa is a welfare state in that it provides a sense of ascertaining access to social services to the citizens, and some of those services are pronounced as rights of citizens (RSA, 1996). It should be noted that the concept 'welfare' derives from two words 'wel' and 'fare', that is from "well in its still familiar sense as well as fare, mostly understood as an expedition, arrival, and also as supply of food". As such, the concept has, since the 20th century, been historically associated with prosperity, happiness and well-being (Williams, 1976:281; Spicker, 1988; Jaeger, 2006). Provision of social services such as health care, housing, social security and education is understood as a responsibility of a welfare state in order to avoid social problems (Spicker, 2000).

Classic work by Gøsta Esping-Anderson, a Danish Sociologist on *The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism* (1990) bears reference as a classical prototype. In social sciences, it is either rare or close to impossible to identify classic work on any subject (Bloom, 1987). However, an acknowledgement is made (Emmenegger, Kvist, Marx and Petersen, 2015) that Bloom's (1987) position could be setting social science to stand too high. In response to Bloom's argument, Gift and Krislov (1991) set up criteria for classic work. They believe that social science analysis on a particular subject becomes classic when it: produces novel insight; incorporates previous knowledge by synthesis/antithesis on the subject; provides a standard for reference on the subject; influences broader debate on the subject; incites further research across disciplines; wields cross-cultural timeless impact; and is worth studying again and again (Gift and Krislov 1991; Emmenegger, Kvist, Marx and Petersen, 2015). This makes social scientific analysis of a subject to be referred to as a classic work.

Therefore, Esping-Anderson's work on the welfare state serves as a classical prototype.

According to Esping-Andersen (1990:1), various kinds of states have increasingly enjoyed the status of 'welfare states'. It is held that welfare states have become a new subject of study given the history of capitalist societies. According to him, welfare states originate in situations where countries were afflicted with wars, and governments sought to redress the situation through the redistribution of goods and services to the citizens in order to normalise the situation. Thus, the provision of social services forms part of a narrow definition of welfare states, whereas a wider definition of welfare states is associated with Keynesian welfare practices and welfare capitalism (Esping-Andersen, 1990; Spicker, 1988). Welfare states are clustered into three worlds. These are conservative capitalist welfare states, liberal capitalist welfare states, and social democratic capitalist welfare states. It is contended that where capitalism features, the system becomes associated with stratification and class structures (Esping-Andersen, 1990). As opposed to stratification and class structures, welfare states were supposed to yield essence of equality in societies through social policies. Therefore, welfare states are tantamount to a stratification system (Esping-Andersen, 1990).

Among the three (3) worlds of capitalist welfare states, attention is hereby given to the social democratic welfare state due to its ideological proximity with the South African governance regime, democracy. Social democratic welfare states and democratic welfare states can pride themselves on a greater facility for remedial defects or for correcting errors committed in the past. These are states that are committed to redressing wars, apartheid tendencies, tyranny, and other cruel practices. This is referred to as *social reform* (Esping-Andersen, 1990; Schmidt, 2001). In South Africa, social reform seeks to achieve equality. In the spirit of this equality, services and benefits should be in a level that is commensurate for all citizens regardless of their race, spatial configuration and ethnicity. In addition, equality should be guaranteed to everyone for full participation and the rights of the citizens respected in societies (Esping-Andersen, 1990). However, it is ironic to consider that in South Africa, there are areas that are deprived of social services which citizens are entitled to. There is clearly a gap between the social democratic

ideals of the welfare state and the prevailing practice of the South African welfare state (Haarmann, 2000; Pauw and Mncube, 2007). Service delivery protests (justifiably) occur in the light of the social democratic nature of the citizens' rights as conceived in the Constitution. The Constitution and macro-policy framework such as the Reconstruction and Development Programme are typical aspects of a social democratic welfare regime.

According to Kastning (2013), the principal values of social democracy are equality, justice, freedom and solidarity. Therefore, in establishing credible social democratic states, laws and constitutions become the first step of ensuring that freedom and equality before the law are maintained. Moreover, active solidarity within societies provides real freedom and justice for citizens. Social democracy ascertains availability while emphasising positive civil rights for citizens to an extent that social democracy is implemented and assessed for its effectiveness from time to time (Kastning, 2013). The reason for constant checks and balances is a result of a dynamic social democracy. While the core values of social democracy remain the same, social democratic policies must be adjusted from time to time in order to adapt to the ever-changing circumstances in societies. Therefore, one special aspect of the social democracy debate is that it is an ever changing phenomenon which considers societal developments, perceives risks and opportunities, and then uses these possibilities for policy adjustments. This distinguishes social democracy from other political governance models since social democracy neither clings to what has been handed down to it nor is it blind to changed realities and new challenges (Kastning, 2013). Among other aspects, social democratic policies that are adopted should emphasise delivery of social services to citizens. Social democratic states are expected to deliver services and be accountable to the citizens on services (Merkel and Petring, 2007; Nelson, 2007; Reitzes, 2009).

### **2.3 Legislative Framework for Social Service delivery in South Africa**

Legislative framework governing social service delivery gives expression to a number of important provisions through Acts of Parliament. The principal Act that expresses on the delivery of services is the Constitution (1996), Act No 108 of 1996. According to this Constitution, service delivery is one of the objectives of municipalities. Section

152 (1) (b) provides that the objectives of local government are to provide democratic and accountable government for local communities and to ensure the provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner (RSA, 1996).

Helmsing (2000) and Mmola (2012) argue that local municipalities have been given a mandate to provide basic services to the communities within their areas of jurisdiction. As such, municipalities should ascertain that communities get access to government services and to access benefits such as local economic development programmes and other processes for the improvement of the lives of citizens. The Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (2000), Act 32 of 2000 affirms the same provision in arguing that the key business of municipalities is to deliver basic services to communities. Section 73 of the Act provides that a municipality must give effect to the provision of the Constitution and:

- (i) give priority to the basic needs of the local community;
- (ii) promote the development of the local community; and
- (iii) ensure that all members of the local community have access to at least the minimum level of basic municipal services.

According to the Act, municipal services must be:

- (i) equitable and accessible;
- (ii) provided in the manner that is conducive to the prudent, economic, efficient and effective use of available resources and the improvement of standards of quality over time;
- (iii) financially sustainable;
- (iv) environmentally sustainable; and
- (v) regularly reviewed with a view to upgrading, extension and improvement (RSA, 2000).

Another important Act of Parliament that gives an expression to service delivery is the Local Government: Municipal Structures Act (1998), Act 117 of 1998. Section 19 provides that:

- (i) A municipal council must strive within its capacity to achieve the objectives set out in Section 152 of the Constitution,
- (ii) A municipal council must annually review-
  - a) the needs of the community,
  - b) its priorities to meet those needs,
  - c) its processes for involving the community,
  - d) its organisational and delivery mechanisms for meeting the needs of the community, and
  - e) its overall performance in achieving its objectives.
- (iii) A municipal council must develop mechanisms to consult the community and community organisations in performing its functions and exercising its powers (RSA, 1998a).

The Act further states that municipalities, through municipal councils, should oversee service delivery to communities in a sustainable manner (Sec 44(3) (e)) (RSA, 1998a). Failure to do so, poses a question of credibility in municipalities (Mathoho, 2011).

Another important Act of Parliament that expresses important provisions for service delivery is the Division of Revenue Act (DoRA), which is published in annual editions. The division and allocation of government revenue among three spheres of government is regulated by the annual editions of the DoRA. The Act seeks to set up mechanisms to coordinate the work of all spheres of government in alleviating poverty, providing services and promoting socio-economic development (Singo, 2012). Last, but not least, is the Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act (2003), Act 56 of 2003, which provides for the pricing of provision of municipal services (RSA, 2003).

It is common knowledge that there is a serious challenge regarding non-compliance to legislation (Mgwebi, 2010). The positive welfare ambitions as legislated are not forthcoming when it comes to implementation. This is due to the fact that municipalities are not financially sustainable, and they are unable to spend allocated funding due to capacity constraints. This in turn adversely affects poor people who are longing for social services. With regard to access to minimum level of basic

services as legislated, the institutional and residual welfare philosophies are called to perspective. According to Ife and Fiske (2003), the more welfare states become - the better, and the role of the states is to provide comprehensive and universal programmes of basic social services, among other things. They also argue that the institutional view leads to high government spending and universal programmes of services for the benefit of all citizens, whereas residualism leads to low government spending, selective means-tested programmes and the provision of basic services only to those seen as most in need (Wilensky and Lebeaux, 1958; Fiske, 2013). Residual welfare operates where welfare is seen as a secondary institution for citizen assistance, which steps in to fill the gap where primary institutions of the market and the family are unable to deliver and meet the needs of a person or a family. Institutional welfare acknowledges welfare as an overriding institution that meets the needs not only of the disadvantaged, but for all citizens (Wilensky and Lebeaux, 1958; Ife and Fiske, 2003). Could it be that the South African government has unwittingly adopted both in their conflicting nature? What about prioritising the previously disadvantaged groups? These are the questions that will further the debate on the legislation around the service delivery subject.

## **2.4 Macro-Policy and Policy Frameworks on Service delivery**

At a macro-policy level and in relation to service delivery, South Africa witnessed a journey that started with the adoption of the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) in 1994 to the adoption of the National Development Plan (NDP) in 2011, with a number of other macro-policies adopted between 1994 and 2011. While transformation has occurred on political and social spheres in South Africa and regardless of the redistributive intentions of the RDP macro-policy, there has not been radical change in respect of ascertaining equal access to service delivery from the apartheid regime to democracy; instead inequalities have perpetuated (Nnadozie, 2013; Sithole and Mathonsi, 2015). Among other priorities, the RDP emphasised a policy programme that was designed to meet the basic needs of the citizens. Basic needs in this instance refers to basic services such as housing, water, electricity, transport, a clean and healthy environment, nutrition, health care and social welfare, among others (RSA, 1994). Visser (2004), Gelb (2007), Singo (2012), and Nathan (2013) emphasise a significant shift in the national government's policy framework in



1996 from the equity-oriented RDP to the growth-oriented Growth, Employment and Reconstruction (GEAR) macro-policy framework. While the RDP advocates for access for all citizens to the most basic of services, on the other hand, the GEAR, which is a neoliberal macro-policy programme, advocates for recovery of service costs from the users. The GEAR prescribes growth through the neoliberal list of more freedom of the market, less regulation of international trade, more integration into the global economy, and the restructuring of the state in order to facilitate those processes. The adoption of the neoliberal GEAR framework by the post-apartheid government has perpetuated great divides between different population groups' access to basic urban amenities such as waste collection, water, electricity, shelter and transportation, and has regenerated casual labour markets created under the apartheid government (Miraftab, 2004; Singo, 2012).

Adelzadeh (1996) argues that the RDP to yield its purpose adequately thus the GEAR was adopted. However, the GEAR also did not adequately address its purpose. The failure of the GEAR gave rise to another strategy (initiative) called the Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa (AsgiSA). AsgiSA identifies several binding constraints that prevent the country from achieving elevated levels of economic growth. It was prognosticated that improvements in the growth of the economy will assist the country in terms of improvement on the area of service delivery. Although AsgiSA was adopted and implemented, the service delivery challenge appeared to be forcefully persisting. This was clear from the service delivery protests that were constantly rising at the time. Towards the end of the second decade of democracy, the government introduced the NDP which emphasises the state that the country should be in 2030. The NDP focuses on addressing issues such as economic development for job creation, reversal of apartheid spatial effects, improvement on quality of services delivered, public services reformation, fighting corruption, and enhancing social cohesion, among other key issues (National Planning Commission (NPC), 2011). The NDP acknowledges that there are still challenges on the service delivery front. Thus the outbreaks of violent community protests reflect frustration not only over the pace of service delivery, but also concerns that communities are not being listened to sincerely. Therefore, citizens have the right to expect government to deliver certain basic services, and to hold leaders accountable for their actions (NPC, 2011).

As noted above, the RDP policy framework did not achieve maximum outcomes for which it was purposed. Academics, analysts and researchers argue that the RDP failed to deliver, especially in transforming the state's economy and on service delivery to meet citizens' basic needs. In his analysis of works done by other scholars and researchers, Visser (2004) analyses factors that led to the failure of the RDP framework. To start off with, he argues that authorities responsible for the RDP lacked planning and implementation skills. The minister that was responsible for the RDP (Minister without Portfolio, Mr Jayaseelen Naidoo) did not command respect to his ANC parliamentary colleagues with regard to the RDP. The manner in which he managed the implementation of the RDP satisfied capitalist interests rather than the primary intended targets (Visser, 2004). The RDP did not spell out a detailed plan that would set guidelines towards the achievement of its principal objectives. It was formulated in a broader sense and ended up as a wish list rather than a focused macro-policy strategy (Heymans, 1995; Meyer, 2000; Terreblanche, 2003).

As GEAR came into effect, its neoliberal nature became evident through the analysis of the macro-economic policy strategic objectives, which have been apparent from President Thabo Mbeki's tenure of office. GEAR strategically aims for the following: privatisation and commercialisation of companies owned by the state and services (such as water, electricity and telecommunication), reduction in social expenditure and size of public service labour force, growth of a layer of unstable workers (contract employment), deregulation of trade and prices, and the promotion of the flexible labour market. According to Bikisha Media Collective (2001), GEAR resulted in austere neoliberal fiscal policies and reduction in government expenditure, where job creation and investment are led by external private business, especially foreign investors. There have been cuts in state pensions, dismissal of public servants, deterioration in infrastructure, massive decline in wage levels, regular disruption of services in rural and poor urban communities, and the impact of globalisation on competition. Spending on welfare services consistently dropped since 2000, while company taxes have been cut to an extent that they make less than 15% of overall government income reduced from over 50% in the 1970s (Bikisha Media Collective, 2001). By emphasising privatising and commercialising of services against welfarian

ambitions of the Constitution, which pronounces some of the services as citizens' constitutional rights, GEAR constitutes contradiction.

Aspects of neoliberalism such as privatisation and commercialisation of services have been approached with much resistance in South Africa, especially by ANC partners. According to Visser (2004), there was no thorough consultation between the ANC and its partners (alliance) during the formulation of GEAR. Labour unions resisted GEAR and the Mandela government prevailed against them, thus privatisation was adopted as one of the fundamental policies of the ANC. Labour unions have been challenging GEAR, arguing that it is a form of privatisation and segregation which is approached with much opposition in communities (Narsiah, 2002). Privatisation and commercialisation of services are not good for the South African context in its current form, since there are poorer citizens who cannot pay for services, and a clear indication of this inability to pay for services is the social unrest that took place in Mankweng, Limpopo Province (News24, 2016). The Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) organised anti-privatisation strikes and marches with millions of working class towards government against GEAR. There have also been community groups and Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) that have been contesting privatisation. For example, Anti-Privatisation Forum, Anti-Eviction Campaign as well as academics (scholars) who have been debating the failure of GEAR (Mayher and McDonald, 2007). Bikisha Media Collective (2001) argues that there have been campaigns that demonstrate the willingness of workers to fight privatisation and commercialisation austerity in different areas. Community organisations are against neoliberal practices by local government. In Chatsworth Township (Durban), Indians and Africans fought against evictions and service disruptions, where residents are unable to pay for services. A committee on electricity crisis in Soweto mobilised resistance to electricity disruptions and outrageous service charges (Bikisha Media Collective, 2001).

MacEwan (1999) shows that neoliberalism in oriental (East Asian) states served developmental purposes as intended. There is evidence of success of neoliberal policies in Asian states who were able to neutralise labour unions which is the route that South Africa cannot risk doing considering the role played by the unions in protecting the interests of labourers and consumers. However, to think that

neoliberalism can effectively work in South Africa is fallacious. The *one size fits all* approach does not necessarily work. For example, developments relating to the implementation of neoliberal policies experienced in countries such as Japan cannot be successfully implemented in other states whose material conditions are different to those of Japan. Sociologists argue that societies differ. One intervention can be productive in one society and not necessarily productive in other societies due to different societal dynamics and contexts. It is therefore important to consider regional dynamics and levels of growth in state democracies before the adoption of one size fits all approaches in some interventions. In the South African context, GEAR was adopted in 1996, two (2) years after the embrace of democracy. One can argue that the state's democracy was at a very early stage to be bombarded and complicated with neoliberal policies, hence neoliberalism is incompatible in the South African context from a service delivery point of view. Thus, the implementation of neoliberal policies is not as effective in South Africa as much as it is in oriental states where neoliberalism has been practised for almost nine decades. As argued earlier, the failure of GEAR gave rise to AsgiSA.

Embedded in neoliberalism is the economic development programme known as the *Structural Adjustment Programme* (SAP), which was introduced in the Western world and steadily adopted in other continents such as Latin America, Africa and Asia (Mohan, 2009). Heidhues and Obare (2011) argue that since independence in the 1960s, some African countries became concerned about economic growth and development, especially because economic development began to slow down in the 1970s and stagnated in the 1980s. As a way of turning the situation around, the states' attempts to reinvigorate economic growth through state-led investments and import substitution industrialisation strategies were unsuccessful, and it was during the same period when the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and Western donors developed and advocated SAPs and Economic Recovery Programmes (EPRs), which emphasised macro-economic stabilisation, privatisation and free market development (Briggs and Yeboah, 2001; Heidhues and Obare, 2011). This was in the absence of a tailor-made African programme to succour economic growth in Africa while the continent was increasingly globalised (Briggs and Yeboah, 2001). SAPs reduce government expenditure on goods and services for citizens, while promoting free market (Ng'ong'ola, 1996). The SAP approach

generated considerable debate within African countries and development circles, while its proponents argued that the reforms were essential and without alternatives. However, critics charged that SAPs paid insufficient attention to the social dimension of development and to the institutional weaknesses of developing countries (Ng'ong'ola, 1996; Briggs and Yeboah, 2001; Heidhues and Obare, 2011). This became an interesting debate in developing countries.

Bond (2002), Visser (2004) and Gelb (2007) argue that macro-economic policy and service delivery framework in post-apartheid South Africa has shifted from RDP to GEAR, and from GEAR to AsgiSA. The failure of GEAR, as argued above, created an environment for the implementation of AsgiSA. AsgiSA is not a policy a programme as such, but a national plan that needed to be supported by government economic agencies, state-owned enterprises, labour force, business and all spheres of government for it to realise its objectives. The Presidency (2006) argues that AsgiSA originated from a commitment made by the ANC in its election manifesto in 2004 to reduce unemployment and poverty rates by 50% by 2014. An average growth rate of 6% per year was necessitated in order for the government to realise the 50% reduction of unemployment and poverty by 2014. In 2004, economic growth rate had exceeded an average of 3% growth per year of the first ten (10) years of democracy. However, the challenge that remained was to increase and sustain growth rates at levels adequate to meet intended targets (Presidency, 2006).

AsgiSA was designed to create a conducive environment for service delivery. In accordance with its purpose, AsgiSA identified major constraints that prevented the state from achieving desired growth rate, from among which are shortages of suitably skilled labour, spatial distortions of apartheid affecting low-skilled labour costs, deficiencies in state organisations, and leadership capacity. The constraints identified through AsgiSA resulted in poor performance in local governments, especially on meeting developmental goals and delivery of services as conceived in both the Constitution (1996) and White Paper on Local Government (1998). With regard to issues of local government and service delivery, AsgiSA focused on addressing the problem of shortage of skills through a programme called *Project Consolidate* (PC), where experienced professionals and managers were deployed to municipalities in order to improve project development implementation and maintenance capabilities

(Presidency, 2006). Rural municipalities that struggled to deliver basic services were assisted by the PC in planning and coordination of service delivery. This was in part the failure of AsgiSA, which saw the introduction of the NDP. The NDP was designed to set into perspective the condition that the country will be at by the year 2030. From a governance and service delivery points of view, the NDP takes note of the governance challenges, and acknowledges that the violent community protests reflect frustration in governance and service delivery. However, it provides citizens with powers to hold leaders accountable for their actions concerning service delivery (NPC, 2011).

## **2.5 Governance and service delivery policies**

Within the context of service delivery policy, the White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery (1997) aims to address the need for a specific policy and criteria for the transformation of public service delivery. The principles for public service delivery outlined in the white paper include aspects such as consultation with the public as the client, service standards, access to services, courtesy, information, openness and transparency, redress or responsiveness and lastly, value for money (RSA, 1997). Thus far, the *Batho Pele* (People First) principles serve as a national policy guide for the public service to consider citizens (service delivery beneficiaries) as customers or clients that that government ought to serve.

The White Paper on Local Government (1998) was the first detailed policy statement to explore how local government can meet the constitutional obligation to be developmental. It defines developmental local government as a government that is committed to work with citizens and groups within communities to find sustainable ways to meet their social, economic, and material needs and to improve the quality of their lives (RSA, 1998b). The White Paper also maintains that the contribution of local government to social and economic development is the provision of basic household infrastructure services like water, sanitation, electricity, roads, and storm water drains. The White Paper promotes Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) as a key tool to improve delivery in municipalities. The White Paper further suggests that key performance indicators should be developed to measure the performance of the

municipality against human development indices and value for money in service provision (RSA, 1998b).

The Election Manifesto of the Ruling Party for the 2000 local government elections provides important provisions regarding service delivery. It states that public, private, or community partners may be introduced to assist in supplying and extending municipal services. Local governments shall develop the capacity to oversee private service providers to achieve municipal service delivery (ANC, 2000). The last piece of framework to note is the Municipal Service Partnership Policy (MSPP) published by the then Department of Provincial and Local Government (DPLG) and now CoGTA. The policy aims to provide a clear framework within which to leverage and marshal the resources of public institutions, CBOs, NGOs, and the private sector towards meeting the country's overall development objectives. The MSPP derives from the *Batho Pele* principles. It promotes an ethos of participation by consumers and other stakeholders through the process of determining and implementing service delivery options. The MSPP also endorses universal access to basic services, progressive improvement in service standards, and openness and transparency in the processes used for selecting service providers (CoGTA, 2000). Underlying all these policy frameworks is a core principle that services should be affordable, sustainable and delivered efficiently among all citizens (Joseph, 2002).

## **2.6 Structure of the South African Government**

It is important to consider the structure of the South African government as provided in the Constitution. According to the Constitution, the government of South Africa is hierarchically divided into three (3) spheres/levels. In their hierarchy, the top most sphere is referred to as the national government and is headed by the state President. The second and middle sphere is referred to as the provincial governments, and is led by the nine (9) premiers across the provinces, and the third and bottom sphere is called the local government, and is led by the executive mayors and mayors across the three 3 categories of municipalities. As noted in chapter 1, within the local government sphere, there are three categories of municipalities, which are the metropolitan municipalities-Category A, local municipalities-Category B, and district municipalities-Category C (RSA, 1996; RSA, 1998c). Van Der Waldt and Helmbold (1983) argue that local government is autonomous and it regulates

matters that relate to local affairs on its own. It is given rights to make by-laws, which do not conflict with or contradict the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa.

According to Botes, Brynard, Fourie and Roux (1996), Segooa (2006) and Idasa (2010), the three (3) spheres have a universal objective of ascertaining the well-being of the South African citizenry, although they have different mandates to perform towards reaching the same goal. As provided for in the Constitution, the spheres are distinctive, interrelated, and interdependent on one another in that they interact on programmes and projects of common good while they have their own peculiar responsibilities and functions. As such, programmes and projects that are designed at national and provincial are implemented at local level. For example, housing is a national and provincial competency function. However, according to Section 156(4), the housing function can be implemented at local level (RSA, 1996). Segooa (2006) argues that it is at the local sphere that the country's welfare is either made better or worse in that the performance ability of this sphere has a direct impact on the overall government's achievement. Regardless of the fact that the local government is an autonomous sphere on its own, its functions are under the supervision of provincial government. As such, Section 139 goes beyond Section 156(1) in that it gives the provincial sphere powers to intervene when the local spheres is unable to perform on its mandate (RSA, 1996). This gives effect to supervision and monitoring of local governments by the provincial government in order to ensure that service delivery occurs in municipalities. This takes care of the configuration of government in South Africa.

## **2.7 Analysis of Some Related Research Projects**

Paradza, Mokwena and Richards (2010) conducted a qualitative study on the *Assessment of the role of Councillors in Service Delivery at Local Government Level* to examine councillors' fulfilment of the broader mandate of developmental government and the facilitation of socio-economic development at local level. The study sought to enhance the debate on the role of councillors in developmental local government in influencing policy debate on the impact of local governance on service delivery to facilitate interaction between citizens and councillors. Among other positives of the study is that it was conducted in 2009/10, which was the best time



since there were service delivery protests in the country, and also because the 2011 local government elections were soon to take place. Councillors' role regarding service delivery protests had to be explored. Unfortunately, the study utilised a small sample of only four (4) municipalities in the Northern Cape, Gauteng, Free State and North West. This is one of the limitations of this study, since out of the nine (9) provinces, a sample of less than five (5) provinces does not give a complete sense of what can be conclusive of the country regarding the role of councillors. From its topic, the study qualifies to be a nationally sampled project rather than a study based on four municipalities. However, the study provides an opportunity for further research. The topic has a political bearing involving councillors, hence the political dynamics of provinces should have been taken into account. Another area of note is the omit residents, traditional leaders, religious leaders, and civil society organisations in examining the role played by councillors. The impact of councillors is best explored through the views of these subjects. Otherwise, the study is very useful in inciting debates and as basis for policy recommendations on issues of governance and service delivery (Paradza, Mokwena and Richards, 2010).

Another study was undertaken by the Human Science Research Council (HSRC) (2002) on public opinions with respect to topics such as citizens' satisfaction with service delivery and perceived national priorities. The HSRC sampled 2 704 respondents for in-depth interview. The study ascertained adequate representation of the nine (9) provinces, races and typified settlements. The findings on citizens' satisfaction with the ANC-led government indicated that 42.5% of the sampled population was not satisfied with governance, while 37.8% was comfortable. The findings also reflect that the citizenry puts more trust in civil societies, churches and media rather than in the government. There is a large degree of unhappiness with the state of governance in South Africa, and the highest levels of unhappiness are in local government (HSRC, 2002). The researchers argue that democracies throughout the world have proportions of citizens which are not satisfied with the performance of their political leaders. However, instead of replacing their political leaders, they choose to withdraw from voting, which is an unfortunate trend. The conclusions drawn from this study are that citizens' behaviour and decisions are not much affected by racial identities; instead politicians are the ones who are preoccupied and influenced by racial consciousness. Citizens are not happy with the

system of governance, and society institutions are less effective (HSRC, 2002). This is a good example of a qualitative research study because the methodology used achieved the intended objectives. From the citizens' unhappiness with the system of governance, the country experience continuous protests. This is one reason that should propel the government to act accordingly.

In another study where the country's democracy was assessed, Kgomo (Sa) sought to review changes in political and state institutions, and examined the effectiveness of government measures in improving citizens' access to institutions of governance and to deepen their participation in political decision making. She relied on a number of data sources that included, among others, research reports and articles, government literature, and reports on public opinions (Kgomo, Sa). The methodology in terms of data sources was wide. However, primary data directly from the citizens over and above public opinions would have made the findings of the study richer and credible. Another critical source of information would have been international literature. Specialised texts on democracy should have been used in order to model or compare South Africa's democracy with that of other countries in the global community. The findings of her study indicate that South Africa's participatory democracy is still evolving and developing. He provides an example of the way the government has not yet adequately mastered the practical part of the democracy, arguing that local government is often projected as the potential embodiment of 'taking government to the people'. However, it has been unsuccessful both in terms of creating effective representational mechanisms and in fully facilitating local development (Kgomo, Sa). The study yielded valid outcomes that confirmed that South Africa's democracy is still young. This is confirmed by authors such as Uwizeyimana (2009), Leon (2010) and Maree (2012).

Nleya (2011) conducted a study on *Linking Service Delivery to Protests in South Africa, the Case of Khayelitsha*. For the study that commands attention such as this, it could have been important to extend it to all areas that are considered as 'hotspots' for service delivery protests. Although one takes comfort in the fact that Khayelitsha had a streak of service delivery protests for some times. The study utilised data from a survey carried out by researchers in the African Centre for Citizenship and Democracy (ACCEDE) in 2008/09. The critical view could ask if this was the latest

survey at the time. A sample of 300 interviewees was selected from five (5) areas of Khayelitsha. Two of the areas selected in the sample are formal settlements, a further two are informal settlements, and one is a mixed area consisting of both informal and formal dwellings. It is uncertain if aspects such as income levels and socio-economic status was considered in sampling, unless if it taken accordingly that the type of settlements gives a sense of income levels and socio-economic status. Although it is considered that the sample proportion between informal settlements and formal settlements was designed to mirror the split between the informal settlement populations of Khayelitsha, it should be considered that service delivery challenge affects the poor and the rich differently. It will be useful for a follow-up study to be carried out on the same subject covering a number of areas.

## **2.8 Challenges of governance and service delivery in South Africa**

As far as governance and service delivery woes are concerned, whilst it can be argued that the current government has performed better than the pre-1994 government, ghost problems such as poverty, acute shortage of services, and corruption are still prevalent in most parts of the country just as in the pre-1994 era (Nathan, 2013). This shows that notwithstanding the work done by the government thus far, there is still a long way to go in improving governance and service delivery. Scholars, analysts, media reports and other commentaries seem to agree on a number of issues that are bedevilling good governance and effective service delivery as anticipated in a democratic context. Also, there seems to be agreement in their arguments that the challenges of governance and of service delivery appear to be similar, therefore comfort is taken in discussing them simultaneously. They argue that challenges such as corruption, nepotism, carelessness and wasteful, poor financial management, lack of requisite skills and capacity, low morale and laziness, lack of cooperation and communication (among municipal officials, political principals, private sector, civil society, citizens and intergovernmental structures) are major challenges facing local government (Wolfe, 1994; Liebig, Fuesers and Schoenhofen, 2007; Nengwekhulu, 2009; Stanton, 2009; Mgwabi, 2010; Managa, 2012; Mmola, 2012).

Mdlongwa (2014) summarises what he perceives as challenges hampering governance and service delivery in South African municipalities. Although some of them are vicariously noted already, according to him, some of the key challenges that are scourging local governance and service delivery include the following:

- human resource challenges - municipalities lack requisite skilled personnel who can assist them in rendering quality services to the people;
- corruption and maladministration - local government mourns the scourge of corruption and maladministration which has become endemic;
- financial challenges - many municipalities are either bankrupt, or on the brink of bankruptcy, and this affects their ability to deliver services;
- lack of awareness and limited knowledge by communities on their rights- this affects service delivery negatively since communities do not know how or who to approach when they face service delivery challenges; and
- slow rollout of services - the pace of service delivery is slow and tedious.

Mmola (2012) views governance and service delivery challenges in local government as an outcome of the following: inequality on the delivery of basic services, poor quality of services provided, lack of requisite skilled officials on the service delivery value chain, mismanagement of funds, and corruption and nepotism in the appointment of employees. A number of municipalities that are affected by the challenges mentioned above experienced violent community protests. As such, residents in areas found in those municipalities have resorted to violent protests in order to make their cry for service audible. While the study focuses mainly in service delivery challenges in Thulamela LM, it should be noted that other parts of Limpopo province share the same challenges (Monashane, 2011; Beyers (2015).

The World Bank (2003) notes that the delivery of basic services is rapidly becoming one of the most important development issues at the current era for governments to highly consider for the development of citizens. Joseph (2002) and Thompson and Nleya (2008) concur that the delivery of basic services enhances the quality of life for citizens and increases their social and economic opportunities by promoting health and safety, facilitating access to work, education and recreation, and stimulating new productive activities. Ramaipadi (2011) fortifies the argument, claiming that there is a

strong relationship between service delivery and poverty alleviation in order to improve quality of life for the citizens. This, therefore, means that service delivery is an important tool for socio-economic development of societies. It is a central symbolic part of the actualisation of a meaningful life in poor urban, deprived and excluded areas. Thus, it is important for services to target such areas since improved service delivery is linked to increased dignity of residents in areas that were denied legitimate space and decent living conditions under apartheid (DFID, 2005; Nleya, 2011). Therefore, this makes it very important for the government and its partners to address the governance and service delivery challenges that are evident in the country. As noted earlier, the government cannot afford to ignore this challenge anymore since its growing worse on a daily basis.

## **2.9 Towards Addressing Governance and Service Delivery Challenges**

Literature shows that service delivery is negatively affected by the challenge of defective governance (Rose-Ackerman, 2004; Mbecke, 2014). This societal challenge has to be addressed in order to avert the effect it has on service delivery. Therefore, in addressing societal problems, those who are involved in planning need to explore which problems should be prioritised, what may be done about such problems, and how any intended action may be organised and executed (Dale, 2004). The reliance by poor people on welfare services is such that any blockage in service delivery has adverse effects on them. Carney (1999) argues that poor people rely on public services to sustain their livelihood and for the fulfilment of their basic human rights, hence an improvement in the delivery of basic services should be local governments' priority. This will mean that intense analysis of all aspects of the problem throughout its value chain has to take place.

Notwithstanding the fact that the journey towards sustainable and equitable service delivery is still a long way for the South African government and the citizens, however, since the beginning of the democratic system, the government has tried several interventions to address service delivery and governance issues. The ANC Youth League (2010) quotes President Zuma as saying:

“...after the 2009 elections we reconfigured government departments to improve their performance... Government

also established the NPC and Monitoring and Evaluation departments in the presidency ... among other matters that must be attended to, is the problematic relationship between municipal officials, elected representatives, and political parties...as this causes tensions that hinder service delivery”.

The relationship between officials and politicians could be addressed through determining clear roles and responsibilities among them. All these plans and structural changes were intended to be implemented during the first term of President Zuma's tenure of office. According to the ANC's 52<sup>nd</sup> national conference policy resolutions, there will be partnerships/cooperation across citizens, government, stakeholder, and all other relevant institutions in order to strengthen social cohesion and ensure that the nation achieves the values of a caring society, inspired by the traits of human compassion, which informed the struggle back in the days (ANC, 2007).

A number of authors agree on a number of key interventions for improving service delivery. The agreement on the interventions provides a level of confidence in the credibility of the interventions such that when those are addressed, then service delivery is likely to improve. According to the authors, the government and all its stakeholders on governance and service delivery should focus on issues such as enhancing public and private partnerships, involving all stakeholders (public participation), compliance to legislative and policy frameworks, enhancing the functionality of the tax system, intergovernmental relations and privatisation (Dilger, Moffett and Struyk, 1997; Russell and Bvuma, 2001; Mhone and Edigheji, 2003; World Bank, 2003; Niksic, 2004; Kroukamp, 2014; Sithole and Mathonsi, 2015).

Mdlongwa (2014) identified ways in which the challenges on governance and service delivery can be addressed. In his view, the challenges can be addressed through the following:

- There should be increased awareness campaigns to be carried out by NGOs in communities to educate them about citizens' rights, participation in municipal affairs, and to understand legislation such as Municipal

System Act and the Municipal Finance Management Act and how these legislations impacts on them;

- government officials that are corrupt should be investigated and dismissed if found guilty of committing crimes to ascertain integrity of government and for citizens to curry confidence in government since there is zero tolerance on corruption;
- municipalities should encourage citizens' participation in key municipal processes like the Integrated Development Plans (IDPs). Citizen participation can be through Izimbizo (public gatherings), media, and announcements, among other options. They should also communicate with citizens through the media such as posters, newspapers, memos, and community radio stations which are more accessible to ordinary community members; and
- local government should improve compliance with legislative and policy frameworks. Through adherence to legislations, service delivery will certainly improve.

Furthermore, Managa (2012) argues that that government, particularly local government, should start implementing the promises and provisions contained in the Constitution. In order to address the poor state of our municipalities, he further suggests that the following should be implemented:

- improve human resource skills and capacity in order to enable local government to deliver its constitutional mandate;
- admit that the 'one size fits all' approach does not work for all municipalities since communities have different needs;
- reinforce monitoring, supervision, and support of the local government sphere by provincial and national spheres of government;
- obliterate corruption and nepotism in areas of appointment of officials and in awarding of tenders;
- institute legal punitive measures on officials who they do not disclose their business/pecuniary interests, and
- fortify government procurement systems, policies and procedures.

As a way of addressing the service delivery challenge and of fortifying the argument above, Pretorius and Schurink (2007) hold that service delivery should occur as guided by the IDP process, the intergovernmental relations model, *Batho Pele* principles, as well as policies and procedures developed to regulate the delivery of services. These are not the only factors identified in their study. However, these were identified as the most crucial ones in governing service delivery. Haarhoff (2008) emphasises that conventional methods of service delivery have to make way for new innovative ways of solving governmental problems through cooperation between the public and private sector. He identifies the following as prerequisites for effective service delivery, among others: public management, prioritisation of needs, sound management systems/practices and ethical conduct. Viewing citizens as customers suggests that governments should treat citizens as clients. This is in line with the ideal practice of the *Batho Pele* principles, which the public service aims to achieve, which advocate for a culture of good and effective public service delivery (Joseph 2002). This needs a dire effort to achieve since the service delivery challenge is taking place regardless of the contrived practice of *Batho Pele* principles.

Service delivery in an intergovernmental context is simplified by Nyalunga (2006:3), who argues that in human settlements or housing delivery space “...*the cooperation between different spheres of government sets up the framework for delivering housing services through a shared responsibility between national (funding provision for low income housing), provincial (allocation of subsidies for housing), and local (freeing up the land providing the appropriate services for new housing construction) governments...*”. As part of cooperation and participation among stakeholders, it will be important to involve traditional leaders as custodian of governance in rural communities (CoGTA, 2014; Sithole and Mathonsi, 2015).

Effective governance involves establishing an effective tax system to finance the activities of the state such as the delivery of services. The DFID (2009) argues that every government should have a tax system which is efficient, effective and equitable in order to finance the activities of the state. The DFID acknowledges that creating an efficient, effective, and equitable tax system is difficult, especially in countries whose governments are corrupt with a poor political institution and ineffective governance



(DFID, 2009). Friedman (2003) argues that the collection of tax depends on effective mechanisms of coercion since people will not pay voluntarily. The DFID (2009) further argues that taxes supply revenues to govern, and thus establishing a government tax system should be a priority even in most under-developed countries. Owing to that, it should be noted that an effective and fair tax system promotes good governance because: raising taxes efficiently requires political effort to require tax payers' consent; raising taxes effectively requires the development of a competent bureaucracy; and raising taxes equitably requires fair and equal treatment of citizens by states. The South African Revenue Service (SARS) thus has to enhance the taxation system in order to ascertain that it is not cheated, all individuals and organisations that have to pay tax are doing so appropriately, and as an aspect of good governance, a tax system generates adequate revenue to finance the welfare ambitions as conceived in chapter 2 of the Constitution (Bill of Rights).

According to the study conducted by the OECD to improve service delivery in OECD regions and non-OECD regions that are predominantly rural, there are six (6) policy areas that can assist governments to enhance service delivery in rural regions. Governments should ensure that:

- the supply of services should be designed appropriately with the characteristics of rural regions;
- equity and efficiency targets should be carefully balanced;
- innovative rural-urban contracts should guide service delivery;
- there is a shift from the logic of spending to a logic of investment;
- effective and inclusive governance is key to rural service delivery; and
- service delivery innovation should be encouraged (OECD, 2008).

While the above can be understood as some form of guidance in policy development to address the challenge of service delivery, it should be acknowledged that regional contexts might not necessarily be the same in Africa and in Europe. Thus, the OECD adds that 'the one size fits all' approach does not always work in developing service delivery improvement policies, hence contextual realities of various societies should be taken into account when governments plan service delivery matters (OECD, 2008). According to Wangwe (Sa), the main actors for service delivery are

government (central and local), the private sector, NGOs, CBOs and citizens. This is a pattern that democratic states should follow in the provision of services, meaning that all relevant stakeholders should be involved.

## **2.10 Theoretical Framework**

### **2.10.1 The Sociological Framework of the Study**

Sociology has an interest in all aspects of societies that affect the well-being of citizens, groups and institutions. All human arrangements in the form of relations, class structures, and organisations are instigated, directed, enacted and influenced by sociologists (Lengyel and Kazancigil, 1981). As a discipline, sociology focuses on communities, citizens and social order. Hence governments, as custodians of governance and service delivery, are implicated as areas of sociological interest. For example, while welfarian governments are concerned about the delivery of welfare services to citizens, sociologists are concerned about how citizens respond to the delivery of such services in terms of sustainability, equality, gender sensitivity, prioritisation, and addressing the actual needs of the citizens (Lerner, 1989; United Nations, 2006). It is also argued that sociology can be applied to critically analyse citizens' living conditions and societal problems using theories and scientific methods of research (Merton, 1961). It can be deduced from this argument that sociology utilises social scientific research to study social problems, social well-being, social relationships, cultures as well as social realities experienced by members of societies. Newman (2010) argues that what is understood as reality is socially constructed, manipulated and accepted in societies. Therefore, theories can be used to examine social realities. Like other social scientists, sociologists utilise theories in order to make sense of all aspects that affect societies.

Researchers in different fields of study such as sociology, economics, anthropology, and political science investigate methods of applying a variety of theoretical frameworks to their research problems (Ocholla and Le Roux, 2011; Imenda, 2014). Thus, one theory or theoretical framework alone cannot always provide a comprehensive explanation of a subject matter that is being studied. It is for this reason that this study adopts two (2) theoretical frameworks, *social exclusion* and

*relative deprivation* in order to understand the challenges of poor governance, deficient service delivery, and the resultant violent protests in Malamulele area.

### **2.10.2 Theories of Social Exclusion and Relative Deprivation on Social Unrests**

An understanding of the theories of social exclusion and relative deprivation and their related concepts will be helpful in understanding Malamulele residents' dissatisfaction with service delivery from Thulamela LM and the resultant outcry for a separate municipality. As noted in chapter 1, the problem experienced in the Malamulele area can be looked at from a *social exclusion* and *relative deprivation* points of view since the violent protests by the residents can be associated with feelings of being excluded and deprived by the Municipality. It is important to understand social exclusion within the context of this study. According to Khan (2012) and Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell (2006), although social exclusion first started as a concept in Europe where there had tended to be a greater emphasis on spatial exclusion, it gained popularity in developing countries throughout the world.

Definitions of social exclusion by various authors are almost similar in that they carry almost the same connotations. For the purposes of this study, three (3) definitions of the concept are considered. The first definition is provided by Beall and Piron (2004) and Zeitlyn (2004), who view it as a form of discrimination from social, political and economic institutions resulting from a complex and dynamic set of processes and relationships that prevent individuals or groups from accessing resources, participating in society, and asserting their rights. The second definition is provided by the DFID (2005), which defines social exclusion as a process by which certain groups in society are systematically disadvantaged through discrimination on the basis of their ethnicity, race, religion, sexual orientation, caste, descent, gender, age, disability, HIV status, migrant status or place of their residence. The third and final definition is provided by De Haan (1999:6), who defines it as the condition by which individuals/groups are wholly/partially excluded from full participation in society, which is the opposite of social integration, and being 'included'. These definitions seem to provide an overall picture of what social exclusion is all about in the context

of this study in the sense that it stresses the issues of undue denial of access to resources for individuals or groups.

De Haan (1999) and DFID (2005) look at social exclusion in a manner that fits its application, denoting that there are excluded/discriminated groups/individuals in society on the basis of certain characteristics which disadvantage them. However, their definitions diverge when De Haan (1999) emphasises the aspect of non-participation in societal activities by the excluded group, whereas the DFID emphasises an aspect of exclusion based on where an excluded group stays/lives, which is referred to as spatial exclusion (DFID, 2005; Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). Spatial exclusion is understood as the likely cause of violent protests by citizens. It therefore becomes important to determine whether this is true in the case of the protests in Malamulele. According to News24 (2015c), residents were protesting against lack of services in Malamulele, while preference was allegedly given to the Thohoyandou area. As such, they demanded their own municipality, which would be able to service their area, among other things. An argument relating to tribalism arises since it is the vhaVenda ethnic group that lives in Thohoyandou area, with the vaTsonga ethnic group living in Malamulele area. Residents of the latter felt excluded because of the area that they stayed in, which was spatial exclusion on service delivery. This brings to the fore an aspect of tribalism and ethnic acrimony between the two ethnic groups. In its original conception, social exclusion carries more emphasis on the fact that group/ethnic exclusion is associated with the space where people live. Khan (2012) espouses the application of social exclusion, arguing that social exclusion applies to groups, and involves the exclusion of individuals due to their membership of particular groups that suffer discrimination on racial, ethnic, gender, geographic or age grounds.

One critical aspect of social exclusion is that it can be better understood by the group that feels excluded, deprived and vulnerable. Thus, it emphasises people's own subjective perceptions of their situation rather than relying on definitions by outsiders (De Haan, 1999). The occurrence of social exclusion is very complex and multi-faceted since it can range from individual to groups' subjective perceptions when making comparison of their own situations with those of others (Bhalla and Lapeyre, 1997). As noted earlier, residents from Malamulele area feel deprived of basic

services when they compare themselves with residents in Thohoyandou area where, according to them (Malamulele residents), there is a conscious and deliberate discrimination. The DFID (2005) argues that at times, social exclusion is open and deliberate especially when state institutions deliberately discriminate in their laws, policies and programmes. An example of this occurred in Lesotho where it is only until recently that women have been disadvantaged through the law. Women in that country could not inherit land/property or sign a contract without the permission of their husbands. In instances where a woman does not have a husband, the case would be treated differently. In another example featuring an incident that occurred in Pakistan where evidence provided by a Muslim woman in court is worth half that of a man, an unfair discrimination towards women is exercised. This is gender-based social exclusion which disadvantages women from enjoying equal benefits as men. In many countries such as South Africa, certain benefits are denied to non-citizens, leaving foreign nationals vulnerable to poverty. In other cases, there are stringent systems that dictate peoples' positions in societies on the basis of heredity, just like in the South Asian caste system (DFID, 2005). Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell (2006) and DFID (2005) posit that governments may act as a potential instigator of exclusion and violence by introducing discriminatory and exclusionary policies, and refuse to concede when citizens protests against those policies.

### **2.10.2.1 Social Exclusion**

#### **2.10.2.1.1 The process and levels of social exclusion**

It is interesting to note that social exclusion is a systematic process rather than just a practice (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006); Silver, 2007). Khan (2012) holds the view that social exclusion is a process that can involve the systematic denial of entitlements to services, and the denial of rights to participate on equal terms in social relationships in economic, social, cultural or political arenas. Exclusionary processes can occur at various levels and dimensions (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). For example, in levels, it occurs within households, villages, cities, states and globally. Khan (2012) and Beall and Piron (2004) argue that social exclusion has four (4) dimensions, and these are: political, social, cultural, and economic dimensions. As noted in chapter 1, political exclusion includes denial

of citizenship rights such as political participation and rights to security, equality before the law, freedom of expression and equal opportunity. Socially, it occurs when institutions unofficially perpetuate exclusion when public sector workers reflect prejudices of their society through their positions. In this manner, they institutionalise some kind of discrimination. The complexity of the occurrence of social exclusion is exacerbated by the fact that it occurs multi-dimensionally. Economic exclusion can include lack of access to credit, labour markets, economic participation, and other forms of capital assets. Social exclusion may take the form of discrimination along a number of dimensions, including gender, ethnicity and age, which reduce the opportunity for such groups to gain access to social services and limit their participation in the labour market. Cultural exclusion refers to the extent to which diverse values, norms and ways of living are accepted and respected.

#### **2.10.2.1.2 Characteristics of social exclusion**

Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell (2006), Mathieson, Popay, Enoch, Escorel, Hernandez, Johnston and Rispel (2008) and Brinkman, Attree and Hezir (2013) raise a number of issues that characterise social exclusion, although some of them are already noted above. They argue that social exclusion is characterised by the following:

- It is multi-dimensional, including political, social, economic and cultural dimensions;
- Lack of equal power relations as the root of exclusion;
- Its process involves agents and institutions, leading to the exclusion of certain groups;
- It tends to exist in group level more rather than individual level. These excluded groups may be distinguished from others in society due to their culture, religion, colour, gender, nationality or migration status, or caste; or they may be identified by gender, age, physical/mental disabilities and even illness.
- It is relational, which means that its definition depends on what is considered as a norm/normal in the particular society where people live.

With regards to social exclusion being characterised as relational, in the South African context, citizens consider themselves against the legislative and policy provision governing service delivery. It is understood as normal when government delivers services equally across various ethnic groups living in different areas. However, for the *excluded* citizens, it becomes abnormal when other citizens become more equal than others on access to services. Citizens view themselves in relation to others and in relation to what the Constitution and policies say about equal access to services for all citizens. They start to view themselves as excluded when they notice a significant discrepancy between what service delivery provisions provide for and their conditions, and this is made worse when they compare themselves against other citizens living in other areas and note that those other residents have access to services. For example, if there is a certain group of citizens that enjoys the rights as conceived in the Constitution, and there is another group that is discriminated from enjoying the same rights, then a feeling of exclusion is generated. Silver (1994) indicates that the excluded group then begin to mobilise itself and develop solidarity among its members as a deprived class made out of people under the same deprived condition who can work together to fight for change on their condition, as such, they mobilise into a consolidated effort such as protests among other collective actions. Bhalla and Lapeyre (1997) assert that social exclusion occurs when citizens suffer from disadvantage and are unable to secure these social rights as enjoyed by others in society.

There is a distinctive characteristic of social exclusion that perpetuates it, and that is misconception of diversity. Wale (2013) argues that in the South African context, social exclusion can be caused by the diverse nature of the country. South Africa has eleven (11) official languages that equally designate 11 ethnic and racial groupings with different socio-economic status and living across the width of the country. She starts off by indicating that South Africa is a diverse society, and to asks: "...when does diversity become a source of division and exclusion?" (Wale, 2013:14). Previously, a divisive and exclusionary system was created on the basis of racial difference among the people who lived in South Africa. The country's apartheid history bears testimony to this. However, as it stands, South Africans are challenged to understand the nature of the continuing exclusion in post-apartheid society. South

Africans have cited the division between poor, middle and wealthy South Africans as the biggest source of division in the country (Wale, 2013). This is in contradiction to the celebrated motto of *Unity in Diversity* in South Africa since the same diversity is critiqued as the cause of what is opposite to unity, exclusion.

#### **2.10.2.1.3 Assessment of social exclusion**

It is important to understand the intensity of exclusion in order to understand and predict the likelihood of the effects that normally follow exclusion. It is undeniable that social exclusion has inherent negative effects. It is, therefore, important to measure its extent on the people who are *excluded*. Mathieson, Popay, Enoch, Escorel, Hernandez, Johnston and Rispel (2008) argue that although there are different ways of measuring social exclusion depending on the various contexts that are determined by various societies, determining the intensity of poverty rate, material deprivation, per capita income, education level, life expectancy, unemployment rate, infant mortality, are common aspect in measuring social exclusion. Lipton (1997) posits that social exclusion is acceptable in as much as it is measurable. To understand the measure of feeling to which the socially excluded group from the mainstream of society is important since it makes it easy to understand the consequences and effects of their deprivation. The extent to which social exclusion can be measured is tied to its definition, and some forms of social exclusion are relatively easy to measure, while others are quite difficult (Khan, 2012). The measurability of social exclusion can also depend on the complexity of what people are deprived of. For example, in a democratic context, if it is about exclusion on participation in political activities of a particular group of people, it is likely that the excluded group can conspire and start to rebel. In a case where unfair labour discriminations practices are introduced by employers, workers are likely to unionise and engage in industrial action. These examples of exclusion are easy to measure and can predict the likelihood of what the effects will be. However, there are instances where there are complex systematic policy and legislative issues involved to an extent that it becomes difficult to even point at an exact feature that brings out exclusion which affects people differently. In such case, exclusion cannot be easily measured.



A feeling of being socially excluded comes along with other concomitant feelings. Feelings of being marginalised, discriminated against, vulnerable, and deprived go hand in hand with social exclusion, thus, the relationship between theories of social exclusion and relative deprivation in this context. It should be noted that social exclusion goes beyond mere descriptions of deprivation and focuses on social relations, processes and institutions that underlie deprivation of some individuals or groups in societies (De Haan, 1999). A strong relationship and commonalities exist between the feelings of social exclusion and relative deprivation. This is where the issue of poverty comes in, to serve as an ultimate outcome in the combination of these concomitant feelings. Wolfe (1994), Bhalla and Lapeyre (1997), De Haan (1999), Nleya (2011) and Sithole and Mathonsi (2015) attest that there is a strong connection between the concept social exclusion with notions of poverty, marginalisation, lack of integration, lack of social services, vulnerability, relative deprivation, and lack of adequate participation of a particular group or individuals in society. As a close ally to the theory of social exclusion, the theory of relative deprivation appears to be similar to that of social exclusion.

#### **2.10.2.2 Relative deprivation**

In defining relative deprivation, Runciman (1966) argues that it can be conceived that a person is relatively deprived of something when: (i) that person does not have that particular something; (ii) that person sees some other person or persons, which may include himself at some previous or expected time, as having that particular something, (iii) that person sees it as feasible that he should have that particular thing. He adds that the extent of a relative deprivation is the amount of the difference between the desired situation and that of the person desiring it (Runciman, 1966; D'Ambrosio and Frick, 2004). In society, citizens that are unable to sustain the same standard of living as others around them experience a relative deprivation that has been shown to reduce feelings of well-being (Chen, 2015). Relative deprivation studies assume either external comparisons of a group with a better off or richer counterparts or internal comparisons with a person's past or future self (Chen, 2015).

With regard to the theory of relative deprivation, Smith and Huo (2004) raise the following key issues:

- Deprivation is subjective rather than objective in the sense that it is not about the magnitude of the gap of inequality between the compared groups that matters, but about how people make sense of why the gap exists and whether anything can be done about it.
- Relative deprivation is ruinous to health and well-being of the deprived people especially because they believe that their situation is undeserved.
- Policies to better the lives of the deprived may backfire if they serve very few disadvantaged individuals among the deprived people.
- Fair treatment of groups can alleviate the adverse physical health impact of relative deprivation and decrease the likelihood of violent protests.

There are various effects of relative deprivation experienced in societies. Issues of anger, psycho-social impact, and violent protests are common among the resultant outcomes of relative deprivation. The case of violent protests in Malamulele appeared to have been driven by feelings of relative deprivation by the citizens. A well-known proponent of the relative deprivation theory, Gurr (1970) emphasises the role of relative deprivation as the key driver of violent protests. He also argues that poverty, economic want, and poor living conditions rouse feelings of resentment that are responsible for the generating of protests.

Smith and Huo (2014) and Flynn (Sa) argue that just like social exclusion, relative deprivation happens in levels and dimensions. As such, relative deprivation theory is applied to socio-political, economic and organisational problems. Smith and Huo (2014) argue that relative deprivation can also happen at an individual level, otherwise referred to as individual relative deprivation, and at a group level, which they refer to as group relative deprivation. Group relative deprivation is an inter-group comparison between an individual's group and another group, or between the group's current situation and that group's past or future situation, whereas individual relative deprivation occurs in interpersonal comparison between an individual and another person (Smith and Huo, 2014).

Smith and Huo (2014) also argue that the manner in which people respond to relative deprivation depends on: (a) the intensity of disadvantage experience directed towards them at an individual level or at a group level. A good example of this is an ethnic group; (b) a feeling of anger aroused by such deprivation; and (c) the manner in which they view the system as open to change or not. The costs of relative deprivation (including physical illness) increase if the perceived inequities cannot be effectively addressed. Relative deprivation explains why simply enumerating resources and opportunities does not fully explain how relative disadvantage produces outcomes ranging from social protest to illness (Smith and Huo, 2014). Indicators of deprivation often include lack of access to basic services such as sanitation, water and electricity, which are regarded as basic services in South Africa (Baloyi, 2013). Thus, in many municipalities where service delivery protests occur in South Africa, protesters argue that the cause of their protests is lack of these basic services, among others. In the case of Malamulele, residents had gone past the stage of protesting for basic services, they needed their own municipality that would heed to their call for basic service delivery.

### **2.10.3 The linkage in social exclusion and relative deprivation effects**

There is a strong correlation between social exclusion, deprivation and violent conflicts in societies, since the former two are about discrimination of individuals/groups from the mainstream of societies due to their ethnicity, culture, religious affiliation, gender, race and caste, among other categorisations (DFID, 2005; Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). The outcomes of social exclusion are always detrimental since they also have an effect on the psycho-social well-being of the excluded groups. Outcomes such as anger, hostility, suicide, social protests, looting and other related activities are common among people who feel excluded.

Social exclusion can have effects that can range from anger through violent protests and wars and subsequently death of people (The DFID, 2005; Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006; Khan, 2012). Khan (2012) argues that there are close links between social exclusion, conflict and insecurity both in terms of causes and consequences. He also argues that some forms of social exclusion generate conditions in which conflict can arise, and this can range from civil unrest to violent

armed conflict and terrorism (Khan, 2012). The socially excluded are generally severely economically deprived and lack access to political power. As such, they appear to have little to lose by taking violent actions (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). They also argue that while peaceful mobilisation may be the first step with marches, strikes and remonstrations, if these have no effect, or if governments react violently to such peaceful mobilisations, then protests may take a form of violence. This may be true, considering the violent protests that took place in Malamulele. Residents argue that they have been raising their concerns about service delivery since early 2000s, and this is when differences between the two cultural/ethnic groups began to emerge. Cultural differences are not enough to cause conflict, as it can be noted that there are many peaceful multi-cultural societies that exist today and have done so throughout history. However, when cultural differences combine with deprivation, cultural ties become a powerful source of mobilisation towards massive conflicts. In many countries, governments have tendencies of ignoring citizens whenever they raise their concerns peacefully, thus they resort to violent protests and that is when their problems are attended to (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006).

The DFID (2005) maintains that social exclusion is a leading cause of conflicts and insecurity in many parts of the world since groups that are excluded suffer from a number of disadvantages, and they may come together and contemplate on their unequal rights, denial of political voice, and feelings of marginalisation from the mainstream of their society. Of course, as seen in the case provided above by Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell (2006), peaceful mobilisation may be the first step towards other forms of industrial actions such as marches, strikes and remonstrations. However, if peaceful mobilisation does not have effect, or if governments react violently to such mobilisations, then groups are more likely to resort to violent conflict if they feel there is no other alternative. For example, in Guatemala, what had begun as a peaceful and not very strong protest turned into a 20-year civil war, whereas in Cote d'Ivoire, violent government reaction appears to have spurred violent opposition (DFID, 2005). When social groups feel unequal compared to others in societies, conflicts are most likely to arise. In relation to this, there are many examples that can be mentioned. For example, conflicts between ethnic groups in Rwanda, Burundi and Kosovo. One example is about the conflict

between Hindus and Muslims in India; another one is about the north-south conflict in Sudan; the sectarian violence in Northern Ireland; and yet another one is about the separatist movement in Aceh (Indonesia) - this is just to mention a few. Research revealed that political and social forms of inequality are the most common causes of ethnic conflicts, revolutions and carnages. In sub-Saharan Africa, the risk of ethnic war is ten times more likely to occur in areas where there is discrimination among ethnic groups. In Sierra Leone, social exclusion is understood to have been the principal cause of prolonged civil war, as compared to the diamond trade and political instability (DFID, 2005).

According to the discussion of theories of social exclusion and relative deprivation, it is clear that some of the unrest that are experienced in societies are caused by feelings of being deprived and excluded. What becomes important is to identify ways in which the effects of these two feelings can be addressed. It will also be important to note who is capable of dealing with the cause in order to determine better ways of stopping the cause. From the analysis of the two theories, it is understood that social exclusion and deprivation can be addressed through governments' efforts to develop policies that are aimed at developing and mainstreaming groups that feel excluded (DFID, 2005; Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). The DFID argues that there are many examples where governments worked successfully to lessen exclusion and its impact on poverty. The main ways they have done this are:

- through the creation of legislative, policy and regulatory frameworks to promote social integration/inclusion;
- through ensuring that socially excluded groups benefit from public expenditure at least as much as other groups;
- through improving economic opportunities and access to good-quality services for excluded groups; and
- through promoting political participation by all groups in society (DFID, 2005).

Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell (2006) contribute towards addressing these causes, indicating that government policies geared towards poverty reduction will

normally make an important contribution towards reducing social exclusion. These government policies can include policies of extending public services to all citizens, policies of improving productivity, and pro-poor growth (these are policies biased towards assisting the poor to improve socio-economically). Policies solely on assisting the poor are not enough to address social exclusion because social exclusion has discriminative nature as well as social, economic, political and cultural dimensions. Other policies to address discrimination on the four dimensions should be developed and implemented. General policies towards addressing social exclusion can be referred to as a form of affirmative action (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). This is the case in the South African context where affirmative action policies are developed to favour previously disadvantaged groups that were deprived and excluded during the apartheid regime. This is action taken towards the allocation of economic, political and social entitlements on the basis of membership of specific groups in order to increase share of entitlements for those specified groups (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006). In devising policies, the first requirement is careful diagnosis of salient characteristics of social exclusion. This is done due to the fact that it is sometimes not easy to identify excluded/deprived groups (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006; Khan, 2012). It is important to collect as much data as possible groups' position on matters of socio-economic and political outlook. Information/data of this type is relatively rare except in countries where racial/ethnic discrimination is acknowledged such as in South Africa and Malaysia, and policies are being adopted towards addressing the problem of discrimination (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006).

In the South African context, it is argued that social exclusion and deprivation can be addressed through reconciliation among ethnic and racial groups. A commission, known as the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC), was established to this effect to deal with the crimes of the past (Stanley, 2011). According to Wale (2013), the concept of radical reconciliation was proposed in order to transit South Africa to improve in ways which foreground economic injustice but not at the expense of continuing work to bridge relationships of division and exclusion at a psychological level.

This should be done in the spirit of building a cohesive nation that the President of the Republic of South Africa rarely miss to mention in his annual State of the Nation Address (SoNA). Radical reconciliation among the vaTsonga and vhaVenda people is important because it will give a sense of cohesion in the province since it is clear that the declaration of a new municipality in Malamulele will not serve to change perceptions of the two ethnic groups towards each other. While the introduction of a new municipality will address service delivery challenges, the government should think about building a cohesive nation towards the alleviation of hostilities among the ethnic groups in South Africa.

Civil society can also assist to reduce social exclusion. The DFID (2005) argues that civil society organisations can play an important role through these four (4) main ways:

- by ascertaining citizen protection using the rule of law;
- by contributing in policy-making;
- by ascertaining the delivery of services in areas where government is unable to reach; and
- by influencing behavioural change and tackling prejudice; and discrimination among groups within societies.

With regards to service delivery in excluded/deprived areas, where public/government institutions are extremely weak or non-existent, civil society organisations can also play a crucial role in delivering services to excluded groups who have no access to public services (DFID, 2005). The DFID also argues that in fragile states where government's ability to deliver is weak, and in areas where there is hostile political environment, NGOs and the UN can play a role in direct service delivery to the excluded and deprived populations. For example, in Sudan, the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) has been linking marginalised communities and regional levels of government to improve the delivery of basic services (DFID, 2005).

As noted earlier in the chapter, feelings of social exclusion and relative deprivation can have an adverse effect on the well-being of the citizens. What happened in the

case of Malamulele could happen in other parts of the country. It will, therefore, be naive and indifferent for the government to ignore this problem. The violent protests caused by these two concomitant feelings by the residents of Malamulele left schools, roads, shops and government buildings in horrid and obnoxious conditions. It ultimately becomes the responsibility of the government to refurbish all the infrastructures destroyed during the time of social unrests for both service delivery and for a new municipality. The two theories discussed provide a lesson of what to expect in instances where citizens are feeling discriminated in societies. Therefore, it is believed that the Malamulele incidents will serve as an eye opener for the government and relevant stakeholders to handle similar matters differently before the worse can happen in other areas. It is clear that the government does not have enough money to go around and fix damaged infrastructure because of violent protests. The government cannot afford to be reactive on matters of this nature. It is believed that the government will use the fiscus proactively in order to avoid the inevitable loss that is likely to be caused by violent protests across the country.



## **CHAPTER 3: PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF EMPIRICAL FINDINGS**

### **3.1 Introduction**

This chapter presents the findings and analysis of empirical data obtained during the research project conducted to study the problem of dissatisfaction of the residents of Malamulele with service delivery. The residents had alleged that service delivery under Thulamela LM was biased towards the Thohoyandou area while theirs (Malamulele) was neglected. The researcher adopted a qualitative research design (case study) in order to obtain views and feelings of the residents in order to understand how the situation ended up in violent protests in their area.

The researcher applied a purposive sampling procedure where he intended to select five (5) representatives among the groups comprising of residents (community members), religious leaders, traditional leaders, and members of the task team who were elected by the residents to lead the quest for the establishment/declaration of a new municipality in Malamulele. Details on the sampling procedure and the justifications thereof will be discussed under the relevant sub-heading below.

The researcher focused on the aim and objectives of the study to develop a guide for interview questions that were utilised to obtain data from the respondents. The researcher conducted interviews with the sampled respondents. According to DiCicco-Bloom and Crabtree (2006) as well as Bless, Higson-Smith and Sithole (2013), interviews are among the most common strategies for gathering qualitative data as they are used to elicit responses an interviewee. The purpose of the data obtained during interviews varies according to the research question and the disciplinary perspective of the researcher. Thematic data analysis was utilised to make sense and to provide clarity of the data collected in relation to the research problem. The data obtained from the interviews was captured as field notes. During data analysis, themes, sub-themes and categories were developed from such field notes. A demonstration of how data was analysed and how themes were developed to make sense of the data in relation to the research problem is provided in the chapter.

The empirical findings are also interpreted in a way that demonstrates the manner in which the objectives of the study were achieved. The chapter is organised under the following five (5) sub-headings: *methodology*, which provides the general approach to the study; *research procedure*, which explains the manner in which the methodology was applied; *sample*, which provides details on the profiles of the participants; *data analysis*, which details the manner in which themes, sub-themes and categories emerged out of the data collected; and *interpretation of the data*, which looks at the meaning of the data analysed and the contextualisation of the service delivery and governance challenges in Africa, especially in post-conflict countries.

### **3.2 Research Methodology**

As reported in the introduction, the researcher applied a qualitative research design. According to Moriarty (2011), qualitative research design adopts a range of research approaches whose theoretical origins are rooted in disciplines such as anthropology, sociology, philosophy and psychology, wherein such qualitative research designs aim at providing an in-depth and interpreted understanding of the social world from the views of participants by studying their socio-material circumstances, experiences, perspectives and history. In this kind of design, samples are usually small in scale and are purposively selected on the basis of salient judgemental criteria. Data is collected using techniques that usually involve close contact between the researcher and the participants (interviews). As such, the data yielded is normally detailed, information rich and extensive. Methods of data analysis in such designs are open to emergent concepts and ideas, and they produce detailed descriptions and classification (themes). They identify patterns of association as well as typologies and explanations (Snape and Spencer, 2003; Alhojailan, 2012).

As the study conducted was qualitative in nature, a case study design was adopted considering the nature of the research problem and the objectives that the study sought to achieve. Baskarada (2014) posits that case studies provide an opportunity for researchers to obtain a deep and holistic view of the research problem, and may facilitate description, explanation and understanding of the research problem at

hand. Barker and Edwards (2012) conducted a study to determine how big an average sample of a qualitative research study should be. They interviewed a number of social science researchers whose responses were that it depends on how much responses are received from a particular sampled number of participants. A sufficient number of responses can offer guidance on epistemological, methodological and practical issues to take into account when conducting research projects. Their responses also emphasise that it also depends on the research problem, research aim and objectives, whereas some social scientists provided an average number of between twenty (20) and thirty (30) respondents (Creswell, 2007; Barker and Edwards, 2012).

As reflected in the introduction, the researcher decided on the sample size of 20 participants. Thus, a sample comprising five (5) community members, five (5) task team members, five (5) religious leaders and five (5) traditional authorities was targeted for the project. Five representatives out of each of the four (4) identified groups were targeted to participate in the project. However, not all five (5) representatives in all 4 identified groups were available for interviews. For example, three (3) out of five (5) members of the task team were available and agreed to be interviewed. Out of five (5) targeted traditional leaders, only four (4) were available. The total shortfall of 3 participants from the targeted 20 was compensated by increasing the number of community members and the number of pastors to seven (7) and six (6), respectively. This follows the understanding that what is important in sampling is satisfying the principle of saturation (Mason, 2010).

Interviews were conducted with 20 participants as planned. As noted in the introduction, thematic data analysis was utilised where themes, sub-themes, categories and their sub-categories emerged from the data obtained. The findings are discussed according to the themes and illustrated by direct quotations from the data as captured in the field notes. The relationship between the data obtained and the existing literature was discussed as a way of demonstrating the trustworthiness of the study and to demonstrate that the findings obtained contribute towards confirming and enhancing literature and the theoretical framework (as discussed in chapter 2).

### **3.3 Research Procedure**

The researcher addressed all logistical arrangements for interview meetings with the sampled respondents. The logistical arrangements included calling respondents and setting up appointments for interviews where the researcher agreed to visit the respondents in their respective homes for the purpose of interviews. The participants were requested to sign letters of consent before they were interviewed. The interviews conducted with each respondent took an average time of 30 to 45 minutes. This was inclusive of the time spent in clarifying interview questions and probing in instances where more clarity was sought from the respondents. The whole data collection process lasted for a period of two weeks, inclusive of weekends. Each interview was captured into field notes after obtaining permission from the participants. Saturation with the sample was reached before considering all sets of field notes. However, the researcher studied all sets of 20 field notes that were captured for each interview for analysis and reporting.

Attempts to audio-tape interview proceedings were made. However, the first five (5) respondents indicated their discomfort regarding the recording arrangement. Although the respondents were assured of the confidentiality with which their responses would be handled, they still maintained their discomfort with the recording arrangement. Some pointed out that they had never taken part in a study. As such, they did not know the fate of their responses. Others argued their discomfort, citing that there is no need for the researcher to record them since they could provide the same information in writing without revealing their identities. Somehow the researcher understood the political sensitivity of the issue investigated and security concerns of the respondents, and yielded to their insistence not to be audio taped. The researcher decided to withdraw the audio-taping attempt and decided to maximise on taking notes during interview discussion. This was outlined as one of the possible risks of the study.

Issues such as credibility, authenticity and trustworthiness of the study were taken into consideration as a standard practice in interpretive qualitative studies. As guided by Shenton (2004) and Anney (2014), the researcher ascertained the quality criteria by ensuring credibility, transferability and confirmability of the study. On credibility,

the researcher attempted to demonstrate that a true picture of the phenomenon under investigation is presented without exaggerating or under-reporting. On transferability, the researcher provided details on the context of the fieldwork to ensure justification of the findings. As far as confirmability is concerned, the researcher demonstrated that findings emerged from the data gathered and not from the researcher's own predispositions. During the research process, ethical consideration was adhered to as outlined in chapter 1.

### **3.4 Sample**

#### **3.4.1 Criteria for the Selection of the Sample**

In order to be selected, participants might have witnessed the violent protests in Malamulele in 2014 – 2015. People were selected to see whether their dissatisfaction justified the violence that occurred in the area. This was considered in order for them to respond based on what they felt and witnessed during the protests. In order to be selected, the respondents should have stayed in Malamulele for a period dating back to early 2000s, which makes it almost sixteen (16) years from the period when the municipal demarcation was made to join Malamulele and Thohoyandou areas to form Thulamela LM. In this context, this period is considered adequate for the residents of Malamulele to have experienced the alleged poor service delivery.

#### **3.4.2 Demographic Profile of the Participants**

Table 1 provides a detailed demographic profile of the participants of the study. The demographic profile provides specific details regarding the selection criteria that were used to determine the sample.

**Table 1: Demographic Profile of the Sample**

Respondents		Gender	Employment Status	Location	Marital Status	Educational Level	Number of people in Household	Age
<b>Group 1: Community Members</b>								
1.	Community Member 1	Female	Unemployed	Shithelani Village	Single	Under-Graduate	5	18-35
2.	Community Member 2	Female	Employed	Mudabula Village	Married	Graduate	4	36-60
3.	Community Member 3	Female	Pensioner	Muchipisi Village	Married	Graduate	3	36-60
4.	Community Member 4	Male	Unemployed	Mapapila Village	Married	Under-Graduate	5	36-60
5.	Community Member 5	Female	Unemployed	Dinga Village	Single	Under-Graduate	5	18-35
6.	Community Member 6	Female	Employed	Shigalo Village	Widow	Graduate	6	36-60
7.	Community Member 7	Male	Unemployed	Madonsi Village	Married	Graduate	5	36-60
<b>Group 2: Pastors</b>								
8.	Pastor 1	Female	Employed	Malamulele	Widow	Post-Graduate	5	36 -60

9.	Pastor 2	Male	Employed	Muchipisi Village	Married	Graduate	5	36 -60
10.	Pastor 3	Female	Employed	Malamulele	Married	Post-Graduate	3	36 -60
11.	Pastor 4	Female	Employed	Malamulele	Married	Graduate	5	36 -60
12.	Pastor 5	Female	Employed	Shigalo Village	Married	Post-Graduate	10	36 -60
13.	Pastor 6	Male	Employed	Malamulele	Divorced	Post-Graduate	4	36 -60
<b>Group 3: Chiefs/ Tribal Authorities</b>								
14.	Chief 1	Male	Employed	Village (Protected identity)	Married	Under-Graduate	7	18-35
15.	Chief 2	Male	Employed	Village (Protected identity)	Married	Post-Graduate	3	61 and above
16.	Chief 3	Male	Employed	Village (Protected identity)	Married	Under-Graduate	4	36 -60
17.	Chief 4	Male	Employed	Village (Protected identity)	Married	Under-Graduate	11	36 -60
<b>Group 4: Task Team Members/Pressure Group</b>								
18.	Task Team Member 1	(Protected identity)	Employed	(Protected identity)	Married	Post-Graduate	20	36 -60

19.	Task Team Member 2	(Protecte d identity)	Employed	(Protected identity)	Married	Graduate	6	36 -60
20.	Task Team Member 3	(Protecte d identity)	Employed	(Protected identity)	Married	Post-Graduate	5	36 -60



### **3.4.3 Importance of demographic variables to the study**

This section discusses the importance of each demographic variable as identified in Table 1.

#### **3.4.3.1 Gender**

The views of both males and females are equally important on social phenomena regardless of the fact that females have been disadvantaged and considered inferior especially in traditional patriarchal societies (Lerner, 1989). Corner and Repucci (2009) argue that women find it difficult to participate in some social issues due to obstacles such as their lower literacy levels, limited exposure to politics, policy issues and decision-making processes. Such obstacles are entrenched barriers of patriarchal societies, misogyny and femininity conceptions that impede females from taking part in issues (Corner and Repucci, 2009). As far as protests are concerned, the males are commonly predominant and take a lead in protests since such is viewed as playing a leadership and heroic role that involves risk-taking (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). While female residents did take part, it was male residents that were at the forefront of the protests in the quest for the establishment of a new municipality in Malamulele. As noted in the demographic profile of the participants, there were more male participants than female participants that were interviewed. It is for the same course that the researcher deemed it fit to secure a sample of 11:9 which is 55%:45% representation of both men and women, respectively, on the sample. The researcher's intention was to have equal representation of males and females. However, due to issues such as the dominance of males in traditional leadership, religious leadership and task team membership, at least nine (9) females formed part of the sample.

#### **3.4.3.2 Marital status**

A conventional household structure consists of parents and children. This is also emphasised by Jacobsen, Mather and Dupuis (2012), who argue that a household consists of a couple and one or more additional people who are related to the couple by birth or adoption. Central to the conception of a household is the issue of marriage which is normally a minimum criterion in household formation. However, due to the nature of the research problem under study, which affects different people

almost in the same way regardless of their marital status, the researcher interviewed 75% of people who were married, 10% of people who were single, 10% of people who were widowed, and 5% divorcees. While the primary focus was on the married people as representatives of households, it was important for the researcher to consider the views of other groups within the marital status in relation to the research problem.

#### **3.4.3.3 Area of residence**

The OECD (2008) argue that while delivery of services is important in all types of human settlements such as towns, cities, urban, and rural environment, such delivery is most important in rural areas mainly because people in rural areas depend more on government services for their well-being. As a small town, Malamulele is surrounded by a number of villages which were actively involved during the protests. The researcher considered selecting more participants from villages around Malamulele town. He interviewed 75% of the respondents from the surrounding villages and the other 25% from Malamulele town. The researcher was mindful of the notion that government normally finds it challenging to deliver services in rural areas due to the issue of accessibility in terms of roads and transport connection. Thus, it became important to sample more participants from villages around Malamulele because their location has an impact in the manner in which they receive services. This view is also noted by Berry, Forder, Sultan and Moreno-Torres (2004), who opine that location is a contributory factor to poor service delivery.

#### **3.4.3.4 Employment status**

Nwachukwu (2011) conducted a study on the impact of people's socio-economic status on their participation in developmental programmes. The study confirms that employment status and income levels have a significant impact on people's involvement on societal issues. People without any form of income who are dependent on government for basic services are most likely to be easily influenced to embark on protest actions. In accordance with the judgemental sampling method chosen, most of the people that were selected are employed. This was due to the anticipation by the researcher that these people would have more insights on the research problem under investigation because of their occupational status. In

respect of this study, the researcher sought to have three (3) sub-groups of people under the employment status group to be interviewed in order to share their views on the research problem. The three sub-groups were employed people (75%) with regular basic incomes, unemployed people (20%) without regular income and pensioners (5%) who rely on social grants.

#### **3.4.3.5 Educational Level**

The researcher did not necessarily choose the respondents based on their qualifications, but because of high likelihood that the chosen sample would be able to provide responses that would enhance the quality of the findings. This is notwithstanding the fact that the respondents' education level was important in analysing the research problems such as the one at hand. Educated people would normally prefer to apply logic when they demonstrate their discontent rather than taking to the streets where they would burn tyres in an attempt to influence others to do the same. In terms of the manner in which the protests were organised, it was probably the case that the protesters were influenced by knowledgeable people who would not want to be seen protesting themselves. The researcher noted that 30% of the respondents were under-graduates, 35% had at least a degree/national diploma (graduates) and 35% held post-graduates qualifications. The researcher considered that a combination of views across the three (3) variables under educational level would be important to give a sense of diversity in terms of views regarding the research problem.

#### **3.4.3.6 Age**

Kishita, Fisher and Laidlaw (2015) argue that attitudes and views on social phenomena are, to a particular extent, guided and influenced by people's age. Erik Erikson's theory of the eight (8) stages of psychosocial development provides guidance on possible predominant thoughts across different groups (Light, 1973; Fleming, 2000). The study was more relevant for people aged at 18 – 35 years (intimacy versus isolation stage), 36 – 60 (generativity versus stagnation), and 61 and above (integrity versus despair) in accordance with Erikson's classification. The researcher selected 15% of respondents aged between 18 and 35, 80% of them were aged between 36 and 60, and 5% were aged at 61 and above. During the protests, mostly young people were seen burning tyres and barricading roads.

Although the elderly and the pensioners supported the protests, they were not as actively involved as the youth. This made it important for the researcher to have a sample of various age groups in order to obtain their views.

### **3.5 Data Analysis**

This section presents the manner in which thematic data analysis was applied whereby themes, sub-themes, categories and sub-categories were developed from that data gathered from the participants. Themes are discussed in relation to literature and the theoretical framework of the study. As an entry point to the analysis and to provide a sense of focus for the interviews that were conducted, a summary of the guiding questions is highlighted below.

#### **3.5.1 Interview Questions**

The interview guide that was utilised to ask questions had two sections. The first section consists of questions that sought to establish the demographic profiles of the respondents. The second section consists of questions that were developed from the aim and objectives of the study. Interview questions under the second section focused on the following:

- the understanding of what services delivery is and what services are;
- views on the causes of protests;
- solution to the challenges faced;
- experience of governance and service delivery by Thulamela LM;
- damage of infrastructure and facilities during protests;
- expectation from the new municipality; and
- relationship between Xitsonga and Tshivenda-speaking people.

The participants provided responses that were thoroughly studied in preparation for the data analysis process out of which themes, sub-themes, categories and sub-categories were developed.

### **3.5.2 Themes (and Sub-themes) and Categories (and Sub-categories)**

Table 2 below shows the operationalisation of the thematic data analysis by the identification of themes and their sub-themes as well as the categories that were developed during the process of data analysis.

THEME 1: KNOWLEDGE ABOUT SERVICE DELIVERY		
Sub-Themes	Categories	Sub-Categories
1.1 Respondents' knowledge and understanding of service delivery	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Defining the concept <i>service delivery</i></li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Service delivery as a legislated provision</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Entitlement</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No clear understanding of what service delivery is</li> </ul>	
1.2 Respondents' knowledge of services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Examples of services</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Failure to differentiate between services and service delivery</li> </ul>	
THEME 2: CAUSES OF PROTESTS		
Sub-Theme	Categories	Sub-Categories
2.1 Service delivery related reasons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protests were due to poor service delivery in Malamulele (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protests were due to lack of service delivery</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protests were due to the bias of the Municipality in service delivery</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Priority was given to Thohoyandou area</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Malamulele area was neglected</li> </ul>
2.2 Poor governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of public participation of Malamulele residents (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Exercising the Constitutional Rights</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nepotism</li> </ul>	
2.3 Demand for a new municipality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Demand for a separate municipality for Malamulele residents (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Government refusal to declare Malamulele as a separate Municipality</li> </ul>	
<b>THEME 3: SOLUTION TO THE CHALLENGES FACED</b>		
<b>Sub-Themes</b>	<b>Categories</b>	<b>Sub-Categories</b>
3.1 A new municipality in Malamulele	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Establishment of a new municipality in Malamulele (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
3.2 Improve municipal performance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Improvement in governance and service delivery</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Public participation</li> </ul>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Improve delivery of services</li> </ul>
3.3 Prioritising citizens' needs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Needs of the citizens</li> </ul>	
<b>THEME 4: PROTESTS</b>		
<b>Sub-Themes</b>	<b>Categories</b>	<b>Sub-Categories</b>
4.1 Protests as a way of communication	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Communicating in anger and frustration</li> </ul>	

	(dominant view)	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Government responds when citizens protest</li> </ul>	
4.2 Judgements on protests	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protests as a good idea</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protests as a bad idea</li> </ul>	
<b>THEME 5: EXPECTATIONS FROM THE NEW MUNICIPALITY</b>		
<b>Sub-Theme</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Sub-Category</b>
5.1 Service delivery expectations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Improved service delivery (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
5.2 Socio-economic development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Job creation/employment</li> <li>• business opportunities</li> <li>• Development</li> </ul>	
5.3 Improved governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Public participation (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
<b>THEME 6: RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN TSONGA-SPEAKING AND VENDA-SPEAKING PEOPLE</b>		
<b>Sub-Theme</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Sub-Categories</b>
6.1 Respondents shared their views on the relationship between the two ethnic groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship is bad (dominant view)</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship is good (less dominant view)</li> </ul>	

Table 2: Operationalisation of thematic data analysis- Development of themes and categories



### **3.5.3 Discussion of Themes and Categories**

During the data analysis process, six (6) themes emerged. The themes and their accompanying sub-themes as well as the categories and their accompanying sub-categories are discussed in relation to the literature and theoretical framework underpinning the study. The themes and categories will be confirmed by direct quotations of the responses obtained during the interviews. Verbatim responses are provided under the categories that emerged under each sub-theme.

#### **3.5.3.1 Theme 1: Knowledge about Service Delivery**

Theme 1 and its sub-themes were developed from the responses provided by the participants. The participants responded to a question that solicited their views on what service delivery is and what services are. Within the parameters of this study that sought to understand citizens' dissatisfaction with service delivery as conducted by the Thulamela LM, the respondents expressed their knowledge and understanding of service delivery.

The responses given provided the researcher with a sense of understanding of how the respondents are clued up on service delivery. This was an important starting point to assist the researcher to note whether or not the respondents knew what service delivery and its lack thereof is as argued in the literature. Their responses led to the development of the theme as well as the sub-theme that are herewith discussed.

Two sub-themes emerged during the process of analysis of responses under the first theme.

##### **Sub-Theme 1.1: Respondents' knowledge and understanding of service delivery**

The respondents demonstrated their understanding of what service delivery is by attempting to define the concept. What was noteworthy is that some of the definitions provided align to the definition provided by authors such as Fox and Meyer (1995), who define service delivery as the provision of public activities, products and benefits to satisfy the needs of the citizens. The respondents indicated that:

*"Service delivery is the distribution of basic resources to people..."*

*"Rendering or providing of services to the people".*

*"Service delivery is when the government improves the lives of the people by providing them with change and safety where they stay".*

Marshall (1963) and Spicker (2000) posit that social citizenship constitutes the core idea of a welfare state whose responsibility, among others, is to deliver social services to citizens. It is within this context of citizenship and entitlement to social services that respondents define what service delivery is. Considering the definition by Fox and Meyer (1995), it can be noted that service delivery can either be in a tangible (products) form or intangible (services) form. The respondents seemed to have taken into account such aspects when they noted the issue of rendering of services (intangible) and also when they noted the issue of the distribution of resources and products (tangible). The researcher's view is that most residents understand what is meant by services delivery.

### **1.1.2: Legislated provision of service delivery**

Under this category, the respondents indicated the following:

*"Service delivery has to be done by government according to the Constitution".*

*"Everybody has the right to receive services, and the leadership is responsible for providing the needs of the society".*

This category noted that service delivery is a legislated provision of government. Section 73 of the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act, 2000 (Act 32 of 2000) provides that municipalities must give effect to the provision of the Constitution, prioritise basic needs of local communities, and ensure that all members of the local community have access to minimum level of basic services in an equitable manner (RSA, 2000). As noted in the literature review, the provision of social services is understood as a responsibility of a welfare state (Spicker, 2000). Due to its legislative and policy frameworks around governance, service delivery, social security system and political orientation, South Africa can slide more towards a

welfare state with more features of social democratic taxonomy using the guidance set out by Esping-Anderson (1990). Mmola (2012) and Helmsing (2000) are of the view that municipalities have been given a mandate to provide basic services to communities, meaning that they should ensure that communities get access to government services, local economic development programmes and other socio-economic activities to improve the lives of the citizens.

The respondents noted that they are entitled to receive services from the government. Some indicated that *"the leadership"* should supply the needs of the societies. One respondent noted that *"the government needs to provide for the people"*. According to the researcher, residents consider service delivery as a legislated provision that obliges the government to render services to the citizens since citizens consider themselves as legislated beneficiaries of services. This sense of entitlement brings with it expectation of service delivery.

### **1.1.3 Entitlement to receive services**

The respondents that considered themselves as entitled to receive services from the government provided the following responses:

*"Service delivery means that people are entitled to be given indispensable services for their welfare and well-being economically, socially, politically, and culturally as well"*.

*"Government should reach out to the people and deliver the promised services"*

*"Government should hasten to attend the citizens and give them solutions on what they are crying about"*.

According to Marshall (1963), citizenship is about an individual's full membership of a particular community with political and socio-economic rights. These rights give rise to a sense of entitlement for the citizens. The responses provided show that the respondents have a feeling of entitlement to services. This feeling can be traced back to the Bill of Rights (chapter 2 of the Constitution), which provides for rights of access to housing, education and health care services (Sections, 26, 27 and 29, respectively), among other sections. When the progressive realisation of citizens' rights is delayed owing to bureaucratic processes and bottlenecks, they begin to

compare themselves with citizens who appear to be receiving services ahead of them in other areas. As noted in chapter 2 under the theoretical framework, this is when they begin to feel deprived and excluded, and ultimately embark on protest actions.

The researcher's view in this regard is that citizens' entitlement is based on a possible misinterpretation of the very same provisions of the Constitution. The researcher posits that there is a difference between a right of access to a particular service and a guarantee to receive particular services. The researcher is of the view that citizens consider the right of access to services as tantamount to a guaranteed promise that they will receive services, let alone aspect of the progressive realisation of such rights given the available resources, which is key in the context but likely to be ignored. It is important for citizens to study and understand legislation, and ask for help towards understanding some of the provisions.

#### **1.1.4: Respondents that could not clarify what service delivery is**

There was a minority of respondents that could not provide a clear explanation of what service delivery is. From this category, two (2) respondents whose educational level was under-graduate were requested to share their understanding of what service delivery is. The two respondents provided the following responses, respectively:

*"People must get what they want, Malamulele is on the way to stand on its own. We need to be provided services..."*

*"Is when we provided by our daily needs"*

The majority of the respondents were able to provide clarity of what service delivery in their view is. However, the two noted above did not really clarify this point. The researcher's view is that the respondents know what service delivery is all about although some of them could not provide clear explanations of the concept. Although the researcher's view is based on the clarity provided by the majority of the respondents, a minority who could not provide clarity are noted as well.

## **Sub-Theme 1.2: Respondents' knowledge of services**

Unlike the first sub-theme which was more on the knowledge and understanding of service delivery as a concept, the second sub-theme focuses on the understanding and knowledge of what services are. Two categories of respondents under sub-theme 1.1 emerged. The categories are as follows:

### **1.2.1: Respondents that gave examples of services**

Just as Erskine's (2004:14) conceptualisation of the big five (5) social services, which are education, healthcare, housing, personal social services and social security, the respondents mentioned the same. However, most of them added the following: "*water*", "*roads*", "*electricity*", "*sanitation*", and "*refuse removal*". Additional to these, some respondents mentioned "*infrastructure*", "*street lights*," and "*toilets*".

The researcher noted that there were instances where respondents would say "*schools and colleges*" when referring to education, and in some instances, some mentioned "*clinics*" and "*hospitals*" when referring to health care. The researcher would discover such instances as he probed further, in order to make sense of some of the responses. The overall impression of the researcher was that the respondents have an understanding of what services are. As such, he considered that they know what would be the lack of, or poor delivery of services.

### **1.2.2: The respondents that could not provide the difference between services and service delivery**

The second category under sub-theme 1.2 comprised of a minority respondents who could not provide a clear difference between services and service delivery. They indicated that service delivery means "*water, roads, sanitation, and housing*". Some noted that services are "*the distribution and provision of services.*" Others mentioned "*job opportunities*", "*old age and children's grants*", "*catering for the disadvantaged and down-trodden*". Of course provision of social grants is not a function of municipal competence. This gave the researcher an impression that some respondents could not separate the two (service delivery and examples of services), and also that there are those who could not know what services are. Fortunately, this category comprised of three (3) respondents. The researcher took caution of the less

dominant view with regard to the few respondents who did articulate what services are as did other respondents.

### **3.5.3.2 Theme 2: Reasons for protests**

The second theme which is about the reasons for protests was developed while the participants were responding to the question that sought to establish the reasons for the protests in Malamulele. As noted in the discussion of the theoretical framework, where a link was drawn from feelings of social exclusion (and deprivation) to protests, governments tend to ignore citizens when they raise their concerns peacefully until they escalate their concerns to violent protests, and that is when their concerns are attended to (Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006:8). This has been the practice in South Africa where the government finds itself in a condition where it has to utilise the financial resources to refurbish devastated infrastructure and other facilities as a result of violent protests that occur. Residents feel justified when they protest because of their sense of entitlement. As such, Malamulele residents argued that they would continue protesting until their demands were met (News24, 2015c).

The common reasons for the violent protests have been about service delivery, governance, and other demands by the citizens. Three sub-themes emerged and confirmed the respondents' knowledge of the causes of the protests. The verbatim responses are provided under the categories that emerged under each sub-theme.

#### **Sub-theme 2.1: Service delivery-related reasons**

As noted in the literature review, authors argue that poor service delivery is among the main reasons accounting for the occurrence of protests. Among others, Nleya (2011) conducted a study wherein he made links between service delivery to protests in South Africa, where he argued that most protests are caused by poor service delivery. Nleya (2011), Managa (2012) and Twala (2012) posit that protests are due to non-delivery of services, poor sustainability of services, and dissatisfaction with the delivery of basic services where service delivery occurred. In addition to these service-delivery related causes of protests, Hough (2008) argues that the more immediate possible causes of the protests are linked to frustration

about promises that are not kept regarding service delivery. As noted in the discussion under the first theme (Knowledge about Service Delivery), citizens consider themselves entitled to services from government as provided for by legislation. Such entitlement brings with it expectation of services that if not met, citizens feel aggrieved and seek to demonstrate their dissatisfaction through protests. The sense of entitlement derives from the legislative provisions that give rights of access to some services.

The data obtained also confirms that protests can be traced to service delivery related matters in one way or the other as a dominant view by the respondents. In the case of the respondents that were interviewed, three categories emerged. The following categories revealed various views of the respondents regarding the service delivery-related causes of protests:

#### **2.1.1: Protests were due to poor service delivery in Malamulele**

Herewith are some of the excerpts from the interviews as following the participants' responses:

*“There was no adequate service delivery, and that is the reason why there were protests”.*

*“People were tired of poor service delivery for over 17 years...”.*

*“The protests that occurred in Malamulele were caused by poor service delivery”.*

Among the respondents, there was the majority emphasised that the protests in Malamulele were caused by poor service delivery.

The responses from the participants comprising category 2.1.1 emphasise that the protests in Malamulele were due to poor service delivery. This is the same global challenge that made it impossible for the MDGs to be met by UN member states. Poor service delivery can mean delivery of services on irregular intervals, which leave citizens expecting services that are not delivered at times and on time. Poor service delivery can also mean the delivery of services that are of sub-standard in

terms of quality. The researcher's view is that category 2.1.1 raises a realistic cause of service delivery protests. Poor service delivery is common among municipalities, and some protests have been reported by the Municipal IQ regarding the same cause (Allan and Hesse, Sa).

### **2.1.2: Protests were due to lack of service delivery**

Some of the direct responses from participants under category 2.1.2 are as follows:

*“Protests were caused by lack of service delivery in Malamulele”.*

*“The failure by the Thulamela Municipality caused service delivery”.*

*“Lack of services and lack of infrastructure resulted in protests”.*

Among the respondents under sub-theme 2.1, there was a second bigger category of respondents (compared to that of category 2.1.1) that indicated that service delivery protests in Malamulele were caused by lack of service delivery. This category is different from the previous category, which argued that service delivery protests were due to poor service delivery. Lack of service delivery means no service delivery at all.

The researcher posits that *lack of service delivery* as indicated by the respondents could be a bit extreme, and as such, close to being unrealistic because there is absolutely no way in which there was no services delivered whatsoever. The argument on poor service delivery as argued under category 2.1.1, and appears more realistic to the researcher as compared to lack of services. Instances that can be argued alongside the conception of lack of services or no services are those in African countries such as Rwanda, Somalia and Burundi, where governments are unable to deliver services in some parts of the countries at all (Abbott and Rwirahira, 2012). Lack of service delivery is also common in post-conflict and fragile states (McLoughlin, 2012).

### **2.1.3: Protests caused by bias of the Municipality in service delivery**

The last category of respondents under service delivery-related possible causes of the protests in Malamulele indicated that Thulamela LM was biased. Under the



category of 'bias' of the Thulamela LM, two (2) sub-categories which are discussed simultaneously below, emerged:

2.1.3.1 Priority was given to Thohoyandou area.

2.1.3.2 Malamulele area was neglected.

During the interviews, some respondents indicated that the Municipality was biased towards the Venda-speaking people. Some of their responses are as follows:

*“The Municipality was biased towards vha-Venda in the delivery of services”.*

*“Malamulele was treated as a mere geographical locale and contemplated as non-existent, and neglected on service delivery”.*

*“Vha-Venda practised tribalism....and nepotism, they only focus on providing for their own”.*

News24 (2015d) indicates that Thulamela LM is biased in the sense that Malamulele residents “claim they are not receiving services from Thulamela LM, which they allege has been channelling services to Tshivenda-speaking areas”. The bias of government towards a certain ethnic group in society at the expense of others creates feelings of social exclusion and deprivation. According to De Haan (1999), a relationship exists between exclusion, poverty, marginalisation, lack of integration, lack of social services, vulnerability, relative deprivation and lack of adequate participation of a particular group in society. The responses provided by participants begin to shed some light to possible inequality among residents in Thulamela LM which in a democratic context can be a source of protests. Berg (2013) discusses linkages between inequalities, collective action which are protests as well as democratic transition.

Considering the responses quoted above, it can be noted that the respondents felt socially excluded. As far as social exclusion is concerned, Khan (2012) argues that in most cases, social exclusion applies to groups and individuals. De Haan (1999) adds that one critical aspect of social exclusion is that it can be better understood (and explained) by the group that feels deprived, vulnerable and excluded. Social exclusion emphasises people's own perceptions of their situation rather than interpretations by people who are not part of those considered as excluded. As the feelings of social exclusion and relative deprivation brew, they result in protests.

The view of the researcher in this regard is that in municipalities where there are more than one ethnic groups and characterised by conflicts among them, government should ensure that there is equal treatment of these groups in order to avoid allegations of bias and ethnic rivalry among citizens. One among other possible ways of proactively dealing with such incidents is to try and involve all ethnic groups in all governance and service delivery planning issues, which is the practice of inclusive public participation.

### **Sub-theme 2.2: Poor governance**

Sub-theme 2.2 focuses on poor governance as the cause of the protests in Malamulele. Effective governance goes hand in hand with the effective provision of social services. This idea was emphasised by Wild, Chambers, King and Harris (2012), who argue that poor service delivery in developing countries is a result of political and governance factors. In Namibia, service delivery has also been poor since independence in 1990 because good governance is not practised (Helao, 2015). The Namibian government had introduced service charters whose monitoring and evaluation for implementation of service delivery proved to have a gap which caused further problems on service delivery (Tjirorua, 2010).

The NDP by the NPC acknowledges that there are persisting governance challenges in South Africa. Some of the violent community protests reflect frustration of citizens of governance and service delivery challenges. Interestingly, the NDP also provides citizens with powers to hold their leaders (government) accountable for their actions concerning service delivery (NPC, 2011). Unfortunately, as part of ways of holding the government accountable for poor governance, citizens engage in protests.

### **2.1: Lack of public participation by Malamulele residents**

The respondents argued strongly that Malamulele community was not involved in public participation activities. Some of their responses were as follows:

*“The Municipality did not conduct public participation to involve us”.*

*“There was never an opportunity for public debates on issues of developments”.*

*"The Municipality ignores Malamulele area".*

The government and all its stakeholders should focus on enhancing public and private partnerships involving all stakeholders (public participation), and intergovernmental relations (Russell and Bvuma, 2001; Mhone and Edigheji, 2003; Niksic, 2004; Sithole and Mathonsi, 2015). Public participation is part of the IDP process which should be an all-inclusive municipal plan, which expresses the developmental plan of a municipality, thereby demonstrating what is planned in various parts of a municipal area.

The allegations made by the respondents quoted above appear to be influenced by the uneven delivery of services between Thohoyandou and Malamulele areas to which News24 (2015c) acknowledges as the cause of riots in Malamulele.

In his work on policy-making and implementation in Mauritius, Babooa (2008) argues that public participation is considered as one among the fundamental milestones of democracy and governance. Failure to involve the public (citizens) in policy-making and decision-making is tantamount to deprivation of citizens of their democratic right. Manuel (2013) emphasises the issue of democracy and delivery of services, which in democratic context citizens strongly feel that they are deprived of their right should they suffer non-delivery of services. The researcher holds the same view that in a democratic context, citizens should be involved in policy-making and in planning. Involving citizens makes them feel that the leaders (government) that they have elected to power are accountable to them, and this is one of the fundamentals of democracy. As such, Malamulele residents sought to be engaged by the Thulamela LM, however, according to their responses, they were ignored.

### **2.2.2: Protesting as a way of exercising Constitutional Rights**

The respondents indicated that among other reasons/causes of the protests in Malamulele, residents understood that they were exercising their Constitutional rights. They indicated that:

*"Every citizen has the right to protest..."*

*"People were exercising their Rights of protest..."*

*"The Constitution allows us to protest and to be free to say anything."*

Section 17 of the Constitution provides for the right of everyone to assemble, to demonstrate, to picket, and to present petitions in a peaceful and unarmed manner. Alexander (2010) and Mottiar and Bond (2011) indicate common means of protests in South Africa as: toyi-toying, mass gatherings, election boycotts, stay-aways, processions, blockading of roads, looting, chasing of unpopular individuals out of townships, construction of barricades, burning of tyres, destruction of buildings, drafting of memoranda and petitions, confrontations with police, and forcing the resignation of elected officials. All these means of protest occur when residents are dissatisfied, and it is understood that they are practising their constitutional right of protest.

The responses noted above provide a sense that citizens do know their constitutional rights to demonstrate their dissatisfaction and to present petitions. However, the Constitution provides a condition that such demonstrations and petition presentation should be done peacefully. Within the context of constitutional provisions, it was noted that the strike in Malamulele was not peaceful because some people were hurt, and all activities, including education, among others, were shut down.

The researcher's view is that once the exercise of one's constitutional right compromises other rights, there is a problem with citizens' understanding of the rights. For example, the right to strike had compromised the right to education (Section 9 of the Constitution) because schools were shut down. As such, the balancing act should have been exercised so that the rights can be exercised simultaneously without one compromising the other. A study conducted by Deacon (2014) on the *balancing act between the Constitutional Right to strike and the Constitutional Right to education* concurs.

### **2.2.3 Protests were caused by tribalism and nepotism by vha-Venda-speaking officials**

Under this category, the respondents indicated that:

*"Thulamela Municipality service delivery was only focused in one area of Thohoyandou. Thulamela Municipality is self-centred and greedy. This Thulamela is full of tribalism and nepotism".*

*"Thulamela Municipality was biased because jobs were given to their own people. The money budgeted for the entire Municipality was channelled to cater for the needs of their own people".*

*"Service delivery in Thulamela was one-sided, for example, improvement of roads were only done in Thohoyandou area, water, sanitation, and even in terms of employment in the Municipality were always one-sided".*

According to Nothwehr (2008), tribalism is both an attitude and practice of sustaining a strong feeling of loyalty to one's own tribe while excluding others who do not belong to the group. Some people outside one's tribe are considered barbaric and even non-existent since tribalism prompts an individual or a group to hold positive attitudes towards people of the same family, clan, kinship and ethnic group, alienating other tribes (Nwaigbo, 2005). Tribalism perpetuates social exclusion in the sense that the respondents feel that service delivery, job opportunities and development were biased towards Thohoyandou area while Malamulele was deprived of the same, which made the residents of the latter feeling excluded and deprived.

Regardless of the less dominant view raised by some respondents regarding 'good' relationship that has been in existence between the VaTsonga and vhaVenda people before apartheid separated them, the majority of the respondents indicated that the vhaVenda practised tribalism. Tribalism and nepotism become problematic to the alienated individuals or groups, especially in instances where ethnic groups are vying for the same scarce resources, goods and services in society. According to Paglia (2006), ethnicity and tribalism lead to conflicts among ethnic groups, and the Sudanese conflicts are a case in point. Rashe (2017) and Daley (2006) analyses ethnicity and political violence in Africa.

When considering the budget of Thulamela LM, it can be noted that the equitable share (funds transferred from the national fiscus annually) amount for the 2014/2015 financial year was R338 million, while in the 2015/2016 financial year, the equitable share was budgeted for R443 million to service both Thohoyandou and Malamulele areas. Both areas have more than 400 villages, with VaTsonga people estimated at

201 302 (33%) and vhaVenda at 389 911 (64%) of the total population, according to Census 2011 (Statistics South Africa, 2011; Thulamela LM, 2015).

In Sudan, conflicts occurred until the country was split into two regions, North Sudan and South Sudan. Conflicts continued over oil, political power and religious dominance, among other reasons (Ottaway and El-Sadany, 2012). Maphosa (2012) advises that whenever resources have been identified as a source of social violence, government should intervene through the equitable distribution of resources to unlock economic potential of building peace in fragile societies and post-conflict countries. The responses quoted above justify how tribalism can lead to protests. The researcher's view is that government should ensure that ethnic rivalry is monitored accordingly in order to limit its negative effect among multi-ethnic citizens in municipalities.

### **Sub-theme 2.3: Demand for a new municipality**

The issues of poor service delivery and the demand for a new municipality separate from Thulamela LM have been noted as a common and major outcry by the residents of Malamulele area. The media has featured instances of violent protests that took place in the area. According to News24 (2015c), residents protested citing that there is a problem of lack of services in Malamulele while preference is given to the Thohoyandou area, and because of this problem, they demanded their own municipality which will service their area, among other things. The demand for a separate municipality by the residents of Malamulele came as a protest that captured the national attention when they boycotted the 2014 general elections. Residents of the Malamulele area argued that boycotting the general elections was a form of protest against the government, and a demand for their voices of seeking a new municipality to be heard (SABC News, 2014).

While analysing the responses provided under sub-theme 2.3, two categories emerged.

#### **2.3.1: Demand for a separate municipality as a cause of protests**

Some of the responses in this regard were as follows:

*"Malamulele should be given a municipality that is all-inclusive".*

*"The solution was to have a municipality closest to the people (meaning that the new municipality is expected to attend to the needs of the residents in Malamulele".*

*"Malamulele to have its own municipality...".*

Residents of Malamulele had embarked on a protest action demanding a separate municipality from Thulamela LM (SABC News, 2015b). The respondents demanded a separate municipality since they no longer wanted to be under Thulamela LM. As such, they protested as a way of raising their demand. According to SABC News (2015b), Malamulele has been wrecked by protests as residents demanded a separate municipality following the complaints about service delivery by Thulamela LM. While responding to the interview questions, the participants provided a dominant view that residents demand their own municipality.

The responses emphasising the demand for a new municipality for the residents of Malamulele area were overwhelming. As such, this was considered as a dominant view alongside poor service delivery as the main reasons for protests in the area. The researcher posits that democracy should be practised where the voice of the citizens should be heard. The only challenge that the researcher became wary of is whether what happened in Malamulele could set a trend in other parts of the country where residents can make the same demand and expect the government to respond the same way as it did in the case of Malamulele.

Following the establishment of a new municipality in Malamulele which would incorporate Vuwani area, the Vuwani residents engaged in violent protests where schools were vandalised, roads were barricaded and services were shut down (Limpopo Online, 2016; Cilliers and Aucoin, 2016). The residents were contesting the government's decision, arguing that they want to remain under Makhado Local Municipality. SowetanLive (2016) adds that tribal tensions between the vhaVenda and VaTsonga groups fuel conflict in Vuwani.

### **2.3.2: The refusal to declare Malamulele as a separate Municipality as a cause protests**

Some of the responses that were noted under category 2.3.2 were as follows:

*"The protests were caused by the failure by the MDB to give Malamulele people their own municipality".*

*"Refusal by government to declare Malamulele as a separate municipality caused the protests".*

*"Government failed to give the people what they wanted, and people were angry"*

During the first quarter of 2015 which was a period before the Municipal Demarcation Board (MDB) considered the case of demarcating a municipality for Malamulele area, there was resistance by government to grant Malamulele residents their own municipality. As noted in chapter 1, the spokesperson for the MEC for Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (CoGTA) was quoted saying, "No, they are not getting it", referring to a municipality (City Press, 2015). Besides CoGTA, the MDB had initially argued that Malamulele is "not viable" to have its own municipality since it does not have a tax base that can yield sufficient revenue to deliver services on its own (MDB, 2015:33). However, CoGTA and the MDB subsequently gave in to the outcry of the residents of Malamulele. The initial reason for refusal to establish a municipality in Malamulele were no longer valid since the new municipality covers the Vuwani area.

It appeared that the initial refusal had to be withdrawn because Malamulele residents intensified their protests to a point where peoples' daily activities and socio-economic activities had to be stopped as residents demonstrated their dissatisfaction through violent protests. Of course, every case is considered through its own merits and other dynamics. As such, this does not mean that Vuwani residents will definitely obtain their own municipality using the same approach adopted by Malamulele residents. During the protests, schools and trading centres, among other buildings, were looted.

The researcher posits that the government has learned a lesson from the Malamulele issue. His view is that government should enhance communication mechanisms with citizens in order to harmoniously reach agreements and compromises that do not adversely affect both parties.



### **3.5.3.3 Theme 3: Solution to the Challenges Faced**

As noted in chapter 1, the second objective of the study was to determine solutions for the challenges encountered using the views of the citizens. The third theme that is about the solutions to the challenges faced emerged. It is important to take note of some of the solutions to the challenges faced in order to customise them and apply them when other municipalities are faced with similar challenges. It is taken into account that municipalities are dynamic. As such, similar challenges can be experienced differently and that municipalities might have unique challenges. Therefore, it becomes important to customise and tailor-make solutions that fit the contexts of different municipalities.

As far as solutions for local government are concerned, literature provides a variety of options that can be considered depending on challenges faced. However, at a generic level, solutions might include, among others, the following: improvement of human resource skills and capacity; compliance to legislative and policy frameworks; reinforce monitoring, supervision and support for municipalities; fortifying government procurement systems; enhancing the functionality of the tax system; obliterating corruption and nepotism; tightening intergovernmental relations; and privatisation (Dilger, Moffett and Struyk, 1997; Russell and Bvuma, 2001; Mhone and Edigheji, 2003; Niksic, 2004; Haarhoff, 2008; Managa, 2012). These are just a few options provided by literature in order to address governance and service delivery woes in municipalities.

During the process of data analysis regarding solutions to the challenges faced, three (3) sub-themes emerged. These are:

#### **Sub-theme 3.1: A new municipality in Malamulele**

It was part of the objectives of the study to determine the extent of the desire by citizens to have their own municipality. Sub-theme 3.1 notes the establishment of a new municipality in Malamulele as a solution to the service delivery and governance challenges faced by the residents. Residents strongly argued that the best solution is to get a municipality. One dominant category under this sub-theme emerged, where

the participants emphasised the same message of the declaration of a municipality in Malamulele.

### **3.1.1: A new municipality in Malamulele should be established**

The excerpts below bear reference to the respondents' desire for the declaration of a municipality in Malamulele:

*"Malamulele should have its own municipality".*

*"Malamulele should be given a municipality".*

*"Grant a new municipality in Malamulele".*

Media releases have been noted where Malamulele residents had been quoted making demands for their own municipality since they claimed to have suffered under Thulamela LM. The Deputy Secretary of the Task Team, Mr Isaac Nukeri was quoted by IoL News saying that, "We no longer want Thulamela...We have suffered a lot," (IoL News, 2015). The researcher maintains his view as noted in sub-category 2.3.1 (Demand for a separate municipality as a cause of protests) that democracy has to be practised by government where the voice of the people should be heard. Although the challenge that the researcher is wary of is whether or not the Malamulele issue will set a trend in other parts of the country such that citizens can protest whenever they need government's attention without considering the merits of the issues and contexts around which a separate municipality can be duly established. For example, the Allan and Hesse (Sa) discusses hotspots in terms of protests where residents are showing dissatisfaction from time to time.

### **Sub-theme 3.2: Improved municipal performance**

The second sub-theme is about the improvement of municipal performance. Although this was a less dominant view, some respondents indicated that Thulamela LM should improve its performance. This view was in the light that residents felt excluded on governance activities and deprived of services since they indicated that they were not consulted by Thulamela LM. The residents also felt that service delivery was biased towards Thohoyandou area. As noted in the discussion of the theoretical framework in chapter 2, social exclusion and deprivation can be addressed through governments' efforts to develop policies that are aimed at

developing and mainstreaming groups that feel excluded (DFID, 2005; Stewart, Barron, Brown and Hartwell, 2006).

One category of respondents emerged under the sub-theme.

### **3.2.1: Enhance governance performance and service delivery**

Literature shows that service delivery is negatively affected by the challenge of defective governance (Rose-Ackerman 2004; Mbecke, 2004). Mmola (2012) views governance and service delivery challenges in local government as an outcome of the following: inequality on the delivery of basic services, poor quality of services provided, lack of requisite skilled officials in the service delivery value chain, mismanagement of funds, and corruption and nepotism in the appointment of employees. If this remains unchanged in local government, it creates a high likelihood for community protests to continue.

As noted in the literature review, the government and all its stakeholders should focus on issues such as enhancing public and private partnerships, involving all stakeholders (public participation), compliance to legislative and policy frameworks, enhancing the functionality of the tax system, intergovernmental relations, and privatisation (Dilger, Moffett and Struyk, 1997; Mhone and Edigheji, 2003; Sithole and Mathonsi, 2015).

Category 3.2.1 (Improve governance and service delivery) developed into two sub-categories. These are:

#### **3.2.1.1: Ensure public participation**

Residents raised the following issues:

*“The government should focus on meeting the demands of the people by having public debates and public participation”.*

*“Citizens need opportunities where they have a direct communication and influence decision-making in government planning on matters that affect their lives and environment”.*

*“The views of the people should be considered during the IDP (Integrated Development Plan) process”.*

As it stands, some citizens in South Africa are not happy with the manner in which government conducts itself on issues of decision-making as well as on performance issues. According to the HSRC (2002), citizens are not happy with the system of governance and with situations where institutions are less effective. The starting point to address the poor governance challenges, which in turn result in citizens' unhappiness, is to address the public participation mechanism.

The responses by the citizens emphasise the need for government improvement in public participation. Citizens want to feel as part of the government which they elected into power. According to the researcher, the desire for citizens to be consulted is a genuine desire that needs to be considered towards better partnership between the people and their government. As noted in the responses provided by the participants, Thulamela LM did not conduct public participation in Malamulele.

### **3.2.1.2: Improve delivery of services in Malamulele area**

Sub-category 3.2.1.2 (Improve delivery of services in Malamulele) was constituted by the respondents who indicated that:

*“There should be improvement in the manner in which services are delivered in Malamulele and the poor surrounding communities”.*

*“Poor communities around Malamulele rely on the services by government to fulfil their basic needs”.*

The DFID (2000) indicates that poor people rely on public services to sustain their livelihood, and for the fulfilment of their basic human rights. Hence an improvement in the delivery of basic services should be a priority for local governments.

Ramaipadi (2011) argues that there is a strong relationship between service delivery and poverty eradication in order to improve quality of life for the citizens. With the

shift from poverty alleviation to poverty eradication, Mafeje (2001) and Osei-Hwedi, (2004) maintain that poverty eradication is not just about getting the poor to pass a certain level of consumption. It is about reaching a sustained increase in productivity, and an integration of the poor into the process of growth where they have access to resources. The delivery of basic services enhances the quality of life of citizens and increases their socio-economic opportunities as it promotes health and safety, facilitates access to work, education and recreation, and stimulates new productive activities (Joseph, 2002; Thompson and Nleya, 2008).

### **Sub-theme 3.3: Citizens' needs**

Sub-theme 3.3 is about the needs of the citizens. According to Heywood (1994), citizenship represents a relationship between citizens and states wherein the two are bound by mutual rights and obligations between them. According to Marshall (1963), citizens' socio-economic and political rights involve provisions from the right of access to a modicum of socio-economic welfare and security to the right of access to sharing socio-political heritage and to live the life of a civilised being according to the standards prevailing in society. Thus, understanding citizenship is important towards claiming rights and entitlements.

One of the challenges that governments faced in the 21st century is finding ways to secure the future of democracy by making governments effective and responsive to the needs of the citizens (United Nations, 2006). The United Nations also argues that equally important is the challenge to adapt democratic institutions in order to meet the specific needs of diverse societies. This means that institutions, democratic constitutions and political processes cannot be transferred from one society to another because they have to be customised to suit the needs of the people (United Nations, 2006). The needs of the citizens vary from one society to another. It is, therefore, important for democratic governments to understand those needs and to address them.

During the data analysis process, a category of respondents emerged to provide views about the needs of the citizens.

### **3.3.1 Addressing the needs of the citizens**

Respondents argued that the needs of the citizens should be prioritised. Some of the responses that were provided by the participants under this category included the following:

*"The government must adhere to the symbolic statements they made prior 1994 and vest on their Batho Pele Slogan practically and not theoretically by being emphatic to the people's plea".*

*"The government should give citizens what they need so that they can manage their own budgets".*

*"Citizens should be given what they need in democracy".*

In most cases, municipalities lack adequate capacity to gather the kind of information on "citizens needs that is necessary to respond effectively" (United Nations Development Programme, 2000:4). Community-based planning that reflects the needs of the entire community, especially the disadvantaged groups such as disabled people, women, children, the elderly, the poor, minorities and the youth is the single most effective way of identifying priorities that reflect the needs of the community. The United Nations also indicates that the implementation of participatory strategic planning is increasingly becoming important to the development of effective municipalities, "and the linking of the outcomes of such processes to the development of budget priorities is even more important" (United Nations Development Programme, 2000:6).

### **3.5.3.4 Theme 4: Protests**

In their meanings, the concepts public participation and protests are far from being synonymous. However, the gap in their meanings appears to be gradually closing due to the understanding by citizens that they seem to yield the same results. However, future scientific investigation will be vital in order to establish facts on whether protests and public participation do yield the same results and whether protests can be formally adopted as another option for public participation.

During the analysis processes, two sub-themes with relevant categories emerged under theme 4. The two sub-themes are as follows:

#### **Sub-theme 4.1: Protests as a way of communication**

Citizens are starting to consider protests as the quickest way of triggering responses from government. Van Holdt, Langa, Molapo, Mogapi, Ngubeni, Dlamini and Kirsten (2011) argue that in some cases where protests occur, there are visible responses, including the suspension of municipal officials, the probing into cases of alleged corruption by municipal officials, and tangible initiatives aimed at improving service delivery. Twala (2014) concurs, positing that protests occurred as a way of making government aware of service problems, and that these protests yielded desired outcomes during the run-up to the 2006 elections, where new candidates were brought in to replace the incumbent cohort of councillors that were under-performing.

Two categories of responses that emerged under sub-theme 4.1 are as follows:

##### **4.1.1: Protests as desperate communication in anger and frustration**

Under category 4.1.1, the respondents indicated that the protests in Malamulele were a way of communication with government. Some of their responses are as follows:

*"The protests were a way of showing communication in frustration and a wakeup call for government to intervene".*

*"The residents were angry and crying because of poor service from Thulamela Municipality, so crying people can act in different ways. The actions showed anger and because of this, good results came".*

*"Residents exercised patience, but to no avail...hell broke loose. Any angry person can run berserk if it takes a long time to meet his demands. It is true that actions speak louder than words".*

While respondents provided their views regarding protests as a way of communicating in anger and frustration, a sense of detachment and isolation from Thulamela LM was noted. The likelihood is that the chasm might have developed during the period leading up to the protests. Manson and Arian (2011) and Twala (2014) argue that protests have become a form of communication platforms where affected communities vent their anger and frustration about social phenomena. The researcher maintains that future scientific investigation will be vital in order to establish facts on whether or not protests and public participation yield the same

results such that they can be considered as equal options to convey citizens' views to government.

#### **4.1.2: Government responds when citizens protests**

Under this category, the respondents indicated that the government listens and responds when citizens communicate their issues in the form of protests. In their responses, the participants argued the following:

*"Those might be seen as damaging, but in our country, if you want to get what you want, you must first damage the little that you have. That is the way of drawing the attention of government".*

*"The protests were very well because after that, the va-Tsonga people were taken seriously".*

*"Citizens were angry since they cried for 15 years. Residents only believe that the only language that the government could understand is through damaging infrastructure".*

The researcher's view is that an Act of Parliament should be developed to specifically regulate the manner in which citizens raise their concerns, especially in protests in order to remove the aspect of violence around protests. While it is within their constitutional right to demonstrate their dissatisfaction and their freedom of speech, an element of acting out of anger and disgust should be regulated since violent protests leave amenities, infrastructures and facilities that belong to the government destroyed and incinerated.

#### **Sub-theme 4.2: Judgements on protests**

Under sub-theme 4.2, the respondents expressed their judgement on whether engaging in protests was a good or a bad idea. Two categories emerged under the sub-theme. These are:



#### **4.2.1: Protests were an effective idea**

Category 4.2.1 provided a dominant view which argued that Malamulele residents came up with a good idea of engaging in protests. They considered protests as a good idea because what they wanted, a municipality, was granted. Some of their responses are as follows:

*"Damage of facilities was a right practice because it made the government to heed to the call by Malamulele people".*

*"The action was excellent because government reacted fast".*

*"Protesting was a good idea because people received a municipality which they wanted".*

Residents in Malamulele were convinced that the idea of damage to infrastructure works better when they demand something from government. Regardless of how convinced the citizens are that violence yield positive results, the researcher's view is that acts of vandalism during protests are not always a good idea since the very scarce resources will have to be spent to fix the damages caused by protests. As such, the researcher considers that government should make efforts to respond to matters raised by citizens or to demonstrate (timeously) to them that their cries are receiving the necessary attention.

#### **4.2.2: Protests were a bad idea**

Under category 4.2.2 (Protests were a bad idea), a less dominant view was expressed to argue that protests were a bad idea. It is important to note this less dominant view in order to locate it within the whole idea of judgement by the respondents upon the protests. The respondents indicated the following:

*"The idea of protests was wrong because people of Malamulele suffered during the time of shutdown because shops were closed, schools were closed, and nothing happened".*

*"Damaging of property was wrong, problems are addressed through communication".*

*"I am totally against vandalism and damaging of property. I think people need to be capacitated with knowledge and education about riots".*

The responses noted above give a sense that not all citizens prefer protests as a way of addressing issues. This view was maintained as a less dominant view as compared to those that preferred protests. The researcher's view is that a cohesive nation and a united citizenry is not built out of violent protests. The fact that in some cases, protests seemed to have yielded desired results does not justify that citizens should hold government to ransom because there would be situations where government is completely unable to deliver according to the demands of the citizens under justifiable grounds, and protests would be a waste of time in such circumstances.

### **3.5.3.5 Theme 5: Expectations from the new municipality**

Theme 5 deals with citizens' expectations of the newly declared municipality. Given the history of poor service delivery that the residents have emphasised in their responses, it arouses curiosity to note what they expect from the new municipality. While respondents were sharing their views on what they expected from the new municipality, three (3) sub-themes and categories emerged. The sub-themes are as follows:

#### **Sub-theme 5.1: Service delivery expectations**

Under sub-theme 5.1, one category which emphasised a dominant view regarding service delivery expectation emerged.

##### **5.1.1: Residents indicated that they expected service delivery**

Some of the responses that were noted under category 5.1.1 include the following:

*"The new municipality will assist the people in many respects such as water, roads, and employment".*

*"We expect the new municipality to bring infrastructure, offices, tarred roads...".*

*“The positive change will be to the advantage of the people since the services will be brought nearer to the people”.*

This category of respondents emphasised what appeared to be the dominant view across the theme. Responses by the participants indicate that service delivery is what they needed the most. Poor communities around Malamulele area depend on government service delivery assistance, thus the overwhelming responses about the expectation of service delivery. This is one important aspect of a democratic government that citizens from poor communities have rights of access to services that will make them better off. According to Merkel and Petring (2007) and Reitzes (2009), democratic states are expected to deliver services and be accountable to the citizens on the services delivered.

Against the background of poor service delivery as argued by citizens, it appears justifiable for citizens to have expectation of service delivery as a dominant view under this category. The countrywide challenges of poor service delivery still need to be addressed in order to avoid potential protests. The NDP acknowledges that there are still challenges on the service delivery front, thus outbreaks of violent community protests reflect frustration not only over the pace of service delivery, but also over concerns that communities are not being listened to sincerely. Therefore, citizens have the right to expect government to deliver certain basic services, and to hold leaders accountable for their actions (NPC, 2011). The researcher noted the recognition of the expectation of service delivery by the NDP with keen interest. The fact that the NDP recognises citizens' expectation of service delivery and that leaders should be accountable to citizens on services demonstrates that the country is in the positive trajectory towards addressing the poor service delivery challenge.

### **Sub-theme 5.2: Socio-economic development**

According to Titmuss (1968), social policy should address an aspect of redistribution for socio-economic development of society. In addition to GEAR and AsgiSA which we discussed in chapter 2 (Literature Review) as part of socio-economic macro-policy framework development that were introduced as part of the SAPs, which, the DoRA seeks to set up mechanisms that coordinates intergovernmental relations in alleviating poverty, providing services, and promoting socio-economic development

(RSA, 2011; Singo, 2012). Sub-theme 5.1 is about citizens' expectation of socio-economic development in Malamulele under the newly declared municipality. Socio-economic development of citizens is important since it has net socio-economic growth of the country. The more the country has people who can positively contribute to the national economy, the more the country maximises its chances for economic stability and growth in Gross Domestic Product (GDP).

Under sub-theme 5.2, two categories emerged as follows:

### **5.2.1: Expectation for job creation/employment**

Some of the responses noted under this category are as follows:

*“We expect employment and more job opportunities for the youth”.*

*“People of Malamulele will develop, job creation will be there”.*

*“Job creation is anticipated because Thulamela was only employing vha-Venda in hospitals, works, police, education...”.*

From the responses noted in some of the preceding categories, the respondents were quoted arguing that Thulamela LM practised tribalism and nepotism in job creation. As such, they feel it is time that such kind of practices comes to an end. They expect the new municipality to create jobs that will assist some of the unemployed graduates, among other job seekers, to take care of themselves and their facilities. However, there is no guarantee that the new municipality will meet citizens' demands. What is anticipated is that the municipality will try its best to address the basic needs of the citizens.

It appears that there are high expectations for the newly declared municipality from the residents of Malamulele area. Unlike expectations that many South Africans had towards the first general elections in 1994, which have not been met thus far, citizens hope that their expectations will be met. The researcher's view is that the newly established municipality should deliver according to the needs and expectations of the Malamulele residents, since the residents cannot afford to suffer after a long battle that they fought to obtain a municipality of their own. The new municipality is expected to interact with the residents in terms of possible delay in the

delivery of services as systems and business processes are being established since the municipality is still new.

### **5.2.2: Business opportunities and development in the new municipality**

Some of the responses quoted from the participants include the following, among others:

*“The municipality will support legal businesses of citizens at various scales”.*

*“Development will be channelled towards some of the rural communities around Malamulele”.*

*“There will be business opportunities that will open further opportunities for the poor”.*

Sub-category 5.2.2 focuses on expectation of business opportunities and development in Malamulele. As argued by the residents that development and businesses were channelled towards the Thohoyandou area, residents feel that the time for their development has come. They expect the new municipality to empower entrepreneurs, small and large scale businesses. Both formal and informal trading activities which are the backbone of the socio-economic well-being in rural, urban-poor, and peri-urban areas will be supported by the new municipality.

Citizens have genuine expectations that they hope the new municipality will fulfil. The researcher's view is that citizens should be patient with the new municipality since not all expectations would be met all at once. The municipality might first want to establish systems and business processes that would enable it to run smoothly before addressing some of the citizens' expectations. The process of putting systems in place might even take over a Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) period which is three years and even more. Thus they might need to exercise patience a little longer.

### **3.5.3.6 Theme 6: Relationship between Tsonga-Speaking and Venda-Speaking People**

With regards to theme 6 which is about the relationship between vha-Venda and va-Tsonga ethnic groups, respondents raised their views on the relationship. The views raised were consolidated into one sub-theme which developed two categories. The sub-theme that emerged is herewith unpacked:

## **Sub-theme 6.1: Views on the relationship between the two ethnic groups**

While studying the participants' responses regarding their views on the relationship between the two ethnic groups, the researcher considered that there should be radical reconciliation between the two groups to diffuse anger and resentment between them. The country has a background of a reconciliation mechanism that seemed to have worked to a certain extent between whites and blacks as championed by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission led by Arch-Bishop Desmond Tutu during the ushering in of a democratic order. Wale (2013) argues that radical reconciliation was proposed in order to transit South Africa to improve in ways which foreground economic injustice but not at the expense of continuing work to bridge the relationships of division and exclusion at a psychological level. Although not entirely, reconciliation seemed to have worked in order to get the country moving and different racial groups to work together in taking the country forward. As such, the same kind of reconciliation is needed to mediate between the two groups.

The analysis process of the responses provided under sub-theme 6.1 classified responses into two categories. The categories are as follows:

### **6.1.1: The relationship is bad**

The respondents raised the following as their views on the relationship between the Tshivenda-speaking and Xitsonga-speaking citizens:

*“The relationship is bad, rather worse...the Vendas have a tendency of looking down upon us”.*

*“The relationship is that of a cat and a rat since the VhaVendas do not want to interact with the VaTsongas.”*

*“The relationship is very bad because the Vendas undermine Tsongas”.*

The respondents under Category 6.1.1 expressed the dominant view regarding the relationship between the two groups. According to the respondents, the relationship between the two groups is bad. In the case of a genocide that happened in Rwanda between April and July 1994, the Hutu killed more than 800,000 people most of which were Tutsis. The Rwandan genocide spread throughout the country where

ordinary citizens were incited by local officials and the Hutu Power government to kill (Jean, 2006). Literature on nation-building and peace-making provides that ethnic acrimony is the bane of attempts to build a cohesive nation (Allouche, 2014). The responses by the participants quoted below provide as sense of how much the country has to strategise towards coming up with reconciliation mechanisms between the two groups.

### **6.1.2: The relationship is good**

The following are views raised under this category:

*“They are relatives and friends, only the Thulamela Municipality wanted to destroy the relationship”.*

*“The relationship is good...we have been relating long time ago before the current government came into existence”.*

*“The relationship is good since the two ethnic groups have been staying together side by side with each other historically”.*

These are some of the responses that show that the relationship is not good. The argument that the relationship is bad came out as the dominant view that more than three (3) quarters of the total number of respondents emphasised. The researcher assumes a neutral position regarding the relationship between the two ethnic groups considering that some Tshivenda-speaking people do not like some Xitsonga-speakers and vice-versa. This might apply in other municipalities with multi-ethnic citizens where, for example, some Zulu-speaking people might not like Xhosa-speaking people. As it currently stands, regardless of how some people tried to be subtle and covert about the bad relationship, based on the dominant views noted from the participants, it appears that the two ethnic groups are less accommodating of each other. This is the reason why the researcher suggests a form of reconciliation that will see the two ethnic groups welcoming, and being able to accept each other in future.

Category 6.1.2 raises arguments that are contrary to the dominant view, claiming that the relationship between the two ethnic groups is good. The view appeared more optimistic than realistic, according to the researcher’s view. It is important to note the less dominant view, and to consider how the less dominant view features

into the whole debate. It was noted that the view that the relationship is good was noted from three respondents. The three respondents formed a category that argued that the relationship is good.

The proponents of nation-building and peace-making would strongly affirm the views in the category since the views are optimistic and in line with nation-building. However, while good relationship would be beneficial for nation-building and ensuring a cohesive society, it is important to be realistic and not to be oblivious of the prevailing conditions that require government attention in order to address issues between the two ethnic groups. The researcher maintains that the government should intervene in instances of ethnic hostilities and attempts to bring peace in the interest of building a cohesive nation.

### **3.6 Discussion of the Empirical Findings**

This section presents the interpretation of findings as analysed in the preceding section (sub-heading 3.6). Themes, sub-themes and categories in the analysis of data were identified, and they gave clearer meaning to the data gathered. As a way of providing a historical context of the current *status quo* between Venda (Thohoyandou-Sibasa) and Gazankulu (Giyani-Malamulele) areas, the section also discusses the apartheid ideology with specific reference to differences between self-governing states and independent states. The section further locates the research problem at hand within the continental context by discussing the challenges of social unrests, poor governance and poor service delivery in Africa, looking at post-conflict states.

#### **3.6.1 Summary of the findings as analysed**

Based on the analysis above, it can be inferred that the following statements give an interpretation of the findings of the study:

- Residents know their Constitutional rights and they are aware that municipalities are legislatively mandated to deliver services. As such, they expected service delivery by the municipality. Poor service delivery was viewed as a violation of Constitutional rights of the citizens.



- Malamulele residents were dissatisfied with poor service delivery and poor governance from Thulamela LM.
- The violent protests in Malamulele were due to poor service delivery, anger and frustration for being excluded in governance and developmental issues in the municipality, and a fervent demand for their own municipality in order to end the misery that the residents of Malamulele have found themselves in for more than fifteen (15) years.
- Thulamela LM, as predominantly led by Tshi-Venda speaking people, was tribalistic and biased towards serving the interest of their own people. This affected service delivery negatively in Malamulele area, and the residents felt excluded and deprived on issues of service delivery and development.
- The extent of poor service delivery was such that residents no longer wanted to be under Thulamela LM, having been frustrated by poor service delivery for more than fifteen (15) years.
- The extent of the desire for residents to get their own municipality was so dire such that protests were viewed as giving them hope towards the establishment of the municipality in Malamulele.
- The damaging of infrastructure and facilities was a form of desperate measure that brought government's attention. The residents were aware of their Constitutional rights to freedom of expression, picketing, demonstration of dissatisfaction and presentation of petitions.
- Malamulele residents have positive expectations from the new municipality, including improved service delivery, good governance and socio-economic development for the citizens.
- There is ethnic acrimony between the Venda-speaking people and the Tsonga-speaking people in Thulamela LM, whose address require the government to take a leading role.

The next chapter will make recommendations and conclusions from the findings of the study. It is anticipated that the recommendations will assist policy makers in government and interested parties to draw lessons from the incidents that happened in Malamulele in order to avoid similar occurrences and to proactively deal with them before they can occur in other places.

### **3.6.2 Apartheid Effect on the Research Problem - Drawing of Data Obtained**

Beinart and Dubow (1995) argue that the concept segregation was a buzz word in twentieth-century South Africa for the set of government policies and social practices whose intention was to regulate the relationship between races, colonisers and colonised. As part of this arrangement, apartheid policies were adopted to segregate groups of people who lived in South Africa. Amusa and Mabugu (2016:5) argue that during apartheid, the geographical configuration of South Africa created a system of fiscal and administrative decentralisation organised along racial lines and in three tiers. The first tier was the central/national government and the second tier had three categories of government which were four (4) provinces (Transvaal, Cape, Orange Free State and Natal) and ten (10) “Bantustans” that consisted of six (6) Self-Governing Territories (SGTs) and four (4) black independent homelands that were referred to as “TVBC” states, which were Transkei, Venda, Bophuthatswana and Ciskei. The six (6) non-independent homelands included KwaZulu, Lebowa, Kangwane, QwaQwa, KwaNdebele and Gazankulu. The last tier of government consisted of two main categories which were White Local Authorities (WLAs) and Black Local Authorities (BLAs). The WLAs represented the earliest example of fiscal decentralization in South Africa. Compared to WLAs, the inability of BLAs to raise revenue through fees on traded services was further compounded by the central government’s provision of free housing and unmetered water services as well as little or no electrification of black townships (Amusa and Mabugu, 2016).

Under the Transvaal Colony were homelands such as Venda, Lebowa and Gazankulu which were created on the basis of the language and culture of ethnic groups that occupied various parts of the Colony (Khunou, 2009:82). As part of the apartheid arrangement, the Venda homeland was an independent state whereas Gazankulu was a self-governing state. The Nelson Mandela Foundation (Sa) indicates that under apartheid, the central government channelled funds and resources to independent states such as Venda and Bophuthatswana in order to sustain their independent status. However, the same was not done to self-governing states such as Gazankulu, Lebowa, Kwa-Zulu, among others.

Capitals in Independent states such as Bisho, Mthatha, Thohoyandou and Mafikeng have always had good infrastructure dating back to the days of apartheid. With the end of Apartheid, infrastructures and facilities such as universities, shopping centres, private schools, roads, police stations, traffic testing grounds, hotels and stadia are used as engines for economic development, especially in independent states. As such, the former independent states are better off compared to the former self-governing states economically (King and McCusker, 2007; Amusa and Mabugu, 2016).

Politically, historical Venda leaders have been linked to the ANC since its independence in 1979. This was emphasised by Fokwang (2003), who argued that one military coup leader around 1989, called Brigadier Gabriel Ramushwana and Kennedy Tshivhase, who was installed by King Thovhele Patrick Mphephu Ramabulana as the King of Tshivhasa area in 1970, were associated with the ANC. When the ANC took over, they channelled resources to their friends in Venda because they had an ally. Besides, because of the existence of this political party in Venda, ANC branches were stronger and Venda representation was stronger; and that is how vhaVenda eventually dominated the Shangaans. This background provides accounts for contexts that socio-economically differentiate areas occupied by Venda-Speaking people and Xitsonga-speaking people in Thulamela LM.

As noted under sub-theme 6.1, which is about the relationship between VaTsonga and vhaVenda people, there is anger and resentment between them. It is, therefore, important to consider some of the possible causes thereof. Apartheid contributed to this through forced removals and resettlement of people, which negatively affected the vhaTsonga's possession (Abel, 2015). The vhaVenda people believe that vaTsonga do not have land since they originate in Mozambique as descendants of Soshangane who was Shaka Zulu's general and who fled during the *Mfecane* wars (Wright, 2006; Tafira, 2011). As such, the vhaVenda holds a notion that the land occupied by vaTsonga in some parts of Malamulele and Giyani belongs to them. This may probably account as some of the reasons for the resentment that exists between the two ethnic groups. This resentment appears to go on unabated, especially when considering social unrests in Vuwani, which emphasise the tribal tension between the ethnic groups (SowetanLive, 2016). It would have been

important for government to institute some form of reconciliation between the two ethnic groups before they could be merged into Thulamela LM. Perhaps a scientific study is necessary in order to explore issues relating to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) among the vaTsonga and the vhaVenda people.

### **3.6.3 Contextualisation of governance and service delivery challenges in the African space**

The challenges that occur in South Africa around governance, service delivery, loss of life, ethnic conflicts, socio-economic problems, battle against the legacies of colonial and imperial rule, and social and political (power) unrests are not unique to South Africa. The same kind of challenges occurs in all continents, particularly in Africa where they are prevalent. Ngwenya (2014) and Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe (1997) discuss the *Gukurahundi* operation that took place in the early 1980s in Zimbabwe (Matebeleland and Midlands areas) where more than 20 000 civilians lost their lives, property, and were displaced from their homes. The effects of operation has continued to negatively affect the country on the grounds of ethnicity and tribalism (Mhlanga, 2012). The genocide in Rwanda (Jean, 20016), Sudan ethnic wars (Ottaway and El-Sadany, 2012), post-liberation challenges in Libya (Chatham House, 2011), governance conflicts in Algeria (Strachan, 2014), crisis in the Central African Republic (Arieff and Husted, 2015), and other continuing social problems in other African countries bear reference that South Africa is not impervious to such problems.

While it is commonly acknowledged that colonialism and imperialism have created enormous problems in Africa, among other continents, post-independent literature by Mbeki (2005), Wild and Harries (2012) and Tshukudu (2014), among others, provides that most of the problems that are currently experienced in Africa are caused by the ruling political elites that are running African states with poor leadership and ineffective governance. He goes on to maintain that when African political elites took over the reins in the 1960s, they considered governments as a sources of self-enrichment and exploitation of people through poll taxes and forced labour, among other means (Mbeki, 2005). Fanon (1963) concurs, arguing that elites filled privileged positions that were occupied by colonial rulers and, in the process, abandon the responsibility of leading their countries towards development. In the

process, they secure profits, government concessions, and enjoy being in control. He adds that this is unbecoming for African countries because these African elites cannot be compared to their European counterparts who they are trying to imitate since their countries are already developed (Fanon, 1963).

The political elites extended their control over the private sector in African countries through legislations and policies. As such, they stifle economic growth and make it difficult for some African countries to provide welfare social services. As part of the solution, Mbeki (2005) proposes that new financial institutions that are independent from political elites should be established to address the economic needs of peasants and small-medium scale producers. He adds that foreign donors should come in and support such institutions to ensure that they are secured from predation by African political elites, who continue to affect the African states negatively.

Tshukudu (2014) argues that since independence in 1966, Botswana public service has been faced with service delivery challenges. The Botswana government tried to decentralise power in local government in order to deliver social services. Decentralisation is also used in many African countries. However, poor capacity in local government remains a challenge under decentralisation. For example, decentralisation is not working well in Malawi due to poor capacity in local government. The Malawian government had resorted to utilising scorecard mechanism to monitor governance and service delivery which proved to be problematic over the years. Scorecards are used to reinforce mechanisms for accountability and performance in service delivery (Wild and Harries, 2012).

In conclusion, it is important to emphasise that improvement on governance and service delivery is required in South Africa, especially in the local government sphere. Citizens should form part of the process of improving governance and service delivery through their involvement in the IDP processes and public participation exercises in order to bridge the gap between them and the government as expected in any democratic context where two parties should hold each other accountable. In a democratic context where citizens know and understand their rights, protests are common when government falters. In instances where government is self-enriching on the part of those who are in power, and service

delivery occurs based on ethnic preferences, citizens develop hostility towards governments. As seen in the theoretical framework in chapter 2, feelings of discontent, social exclusion and relative deprivation begin to brew among citizens when their expectations of social services from governments are not met. Chapter 2 focused on the details of what happens when citizens develop such feelings, including outbreak of social unrests. The same thing happened in Malamulele, leading to the need for a study of this nature.

Looking at the data collected, Malamulele residents argued that there was corruption in government, adding that service delivery was biased towards areas occupied by Venda-speaking people, while the Malamulele area was neglected. Because of this, the residents of Malamulele felt socially excluded and deprived, leading to anger, which resulted in violent protests that captured the attention of the government, the media and opposition parties, among others. From the data collected, the respondents argued unequivocally that the protests in Malamulele were a way of practising their Constitutional democratic rights to demonstrate their dissatisfaction with service delivery from Thulamela LM.

## CHAPTER 4: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### 4.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses on summary, conclusion and recommendations. The chapter also presents a synopsis of the preceding chapters. It also demonstrates the manner in which the aim and the objectives of the study were met.

### 4.2 Synopsis of chapters

As a way of concluding the study, it is important to take note of some of the key highlights that summarise the content of the chapters of this study.

- **Chapter 1** provided the general introduction and orientation of the study. The chapter introduced the research problem, rationale, aim and objectives of the study. The chapter also provided a preliminary literature review and a high-level focus of the theoretical framework that underpinned the study. The methodology that outlined the overall approach on how the study would be conducted and who would be selected to participate in the study was discussed. Issues such as ethical considerations, limitations of the study, and the tentative chapter outline of the dissertation were also discussed in chapter 1.
- **Chapter 2** focused on the literature review and the theoretical framework of the study. With regards to the literature review, a number of issues were discussed. These include, among others, the following: the 'South African Welfare State', legislative and policy frameworks for service delivery and governance, challenges on governance and service delivery as well as possible ways of addressing these challenges and analysis of literature.
- **Chapter 3** dealt with the presentation, analysis and interpretation of empirical findings. The chapter began by demonstrating the manner in

which the methodology as outlined in chapter 1, was implemented, where a detailed description of the sample, data collection and methods of analysis were discussed. The chapter also provided the findings of the study conducted, and demonstrated how data was analysed through the development of themes and categories. Each theme was discussed in relation to the literature review, the theoretical framework and the objectives of the study. Interpretation of the empirical data from the analysis made was provided as a way concluding the chapter.

- **Chapter 4** summarises the study and presents the conclusion and recommendations of the study. This is where the findings are discussed against the objectives of the study in order to determine its success. The success of the study in this regard is understood as the manner in which the findings obtained adequately address the research problem. The chapter also provides policy recommendations, stimulate further debates and discussion and analyses issues relating to the citizens' dissatisfaction, governance and service delivery.

### **4.3 Summary of the study**

The study investigated Malamulele residents' dissatisfaction with service delivery. The theoretical approach of the study was social exclusion and relative deprivation. A qualitative approach was adopted. A case study design was followed. A sample of 20 participants was selected. An interview was used to collect the data and thematic analysis was used to interpret the findings.

As noted in chapter 1, the objectives of the study were:

- to describe the extent of poor service delivery in Malamulele;
- to identify the causes of poor service delivery and to find solutions of the problem;
- to ascertain a need for a municipality for Malamulele residents;
- to provide recommendations that will assist in policy enhancements; and the reconfiguration of institutional arrangements geared at addressing the citizens' dissatisfaction.



#### **4.4 The key findings**

This sub-section seeks to demonstrate the relationship between the objectives and the empirical findings. It is important to realistically note that the data gathered was important to address the research problem that was studied and also to note that the data gathered was limited to addressing the aim and objectives of the study. In what follows, an account of the manner in which the objectives of the study were met is discussed:

##### **4.4.1 Description of the extent of poor service delivery in Malamulele**

The findings of the study suggest that the extent of poor service delivery in Malamulele was such that there was no running water service in many parts of Malamulele; no adequate sanitation systems; no adequate health facilities; poor road maintenance; poor facilities; and poor social amenities. This situation remained the same for more than fifteen (15) years. Thus, the residents could not remain patient any longer.

##### **4.4.2 Identification of causes of poor service delivery and solution to the residents' problem**

Empirical findings suggest that the causes of poor service delivery in Malamulele are varied. This notwithstanding, the most prominent amongst them are that Thulamela LM is biased. Therefore, service provision is skewed in favour of Thohoyandou and surrounding areas, a fact that confirms narratives of ethnicity and tribalism. It was also identified that there was poor governance by the municipality, which affected the manner in which services were delivered. The residents indicated that the solution would be to establish a municipality in Malamulele.

##### **4.4.2 Ascertaining the need for a municipality for Malamulele residents**

The need for a municipality for Malamulele residents was expressed explicitly during the interviews. Associated with this need are the citizens' high and at times

unrealistic expectations that the municipality would improve their misfortunes. The government subsequently acceded to the outcry of the citizens and granted a municipality in Malamulele.

#### **4.4.4 Provision of recommendations that will assist in policy enhancements and reconfiguration of institutional arrangements geared at addressing the dissatisfaction of the citizens**

As can be inferred from the section on recommendations at the end of this report, this objective was also met.

### **4.5 Conclusion**

Based on the literature covered and the strength of the empirical findings, the researcher comes to the conclusion that the causes of service delivery are bias in favour of Thohoyandou area, and that this is brought about by sentiments of ethnicity and tribalism.

The extent of poor service delivery in Malamulele for the period amounting to 15 years raises discomfort regarding the slow progress in the consolidation of democracy in South Africa. The government certainly has to improve on issues of governance and service delivery using available resources.

From the interviews conducted, it became clear that there was a need for a municipality for Malamulele because nearly all respondents argued that the only solution to the challenges faced could be the establishment of a new municipality in Malamulele. Otherwise, citizens were determined to continue with their protest actions until their demand for the establishment of a new municipality in Malamulele was met.

Notwithstanding government's effort to build an integrated and cohesive society, issues of ethnic rivalries are still prevalent in South Africa. This is an area on which the government and civil society still needs to work hard.

The policy recommendations at the end of this report will provide guidelines on what government should consider as a way of dealing with the problem. The recommendations will also provide direction on citizens' knowledge, understanding of their Constitutional rights and desired conduct in demonstrating their dissatisfaction.

#### **4.6 Recommendations**

The following recommendations regarding governance, service delivery and policy discussions were drawn from the outcomes of the study:

- Citizens should improve their knowledge and understanding of Constitutional rights through studying the Constitution and other legislation, and engage in discussions where legislation is discussed.
- The leadership must continually engage the community to manage their unrealistic hopes and expectations from government. The government had acceded to the residents' needs by establishing a municipality in Malamulele. However, citizens have expressed (some) unrealistic expectations. In order to deal effectively with these expectations, the government should work closely with the residents.
- The exercise of Constitutional rights should not result in violence and the subsequent destruction of government property. Whereas the right to protest is a Constitutional right, acts of vandalism and senseless destruction of property is uncalled for. All members of the community must jointly condemn this and renounce violence during protest actions.
- Government should act quickly to restrain citizens from engaging in violent protests while allowing peaceful demonstration of dissatisfaction. The government is thus obliged to use funds to fix buildings, infrastructures, facilities, and to buy new assets as a way of replacing those that were damaged during violent protests. People's lives and health are usually placed at risk because of the violent nature of protests.
- Government should ensure that there is fair and equal treatment of all ethnic groups in municipalities with multi-ethnicities in order to avoid allegations of bias which create ethnic rivalry among citizens. This can be

done by involving all ethnic groups in all governance and service delivery planning issues.

- Citizens should be consulted in policy-making and other government activities that involve them. This is important because consultation and consideration of citizens' views make them feel that the government that they have elected into power considers them and acknowledges them as partners in governance. This is something that was not happening in Malamulele in terms of the empirical findings.
- Future scientific studies should be conducted in order to establish facts on areas where the study did not cover. Such areas include the following:
  - The role of governance and social exclusion in community protest in South Africa.
  - Whether protests are more effective than public participation by citizens;
  - The causes of anger and resentment between vha-Venda and va-Tsonga ethnic groups: Exploration through the TRC;
  - Exploration of financial viability of the new Malamulele/Collins Chabane Local Municipality; and
  - How to manage high/unrealistic Malamulele residents' expectations of the new municipality.

## REFERENCES

- Adelzadeh, A. (1996). *From the RDP to GEAR: The gradual embracing of neoliberalism in economic policy. Occasional paper No. 3.* Johannesburg: National Institute for Economic Policy (NIEP).
- African National Congress. (2000). *Government election manifesto. 2000.* <http://www.anc.org.za/docs/manifesto/2000/ANC%20LOCAL%20GOVERNMENT%20ELECTI...pdf> (Accessed: November 20, 2010).
- African National Congress. (2007). *Policy documents-52<sup>nd</sup> national conference: Adopted strategy and tactics of the ANC.* <http://www.anc.org.za/show/php?include=doc/pol/2007/stratergy-tactics.html>. (Accessed: October 02, 2010).
- African National Congress Youth League. (2010). *NGC 2010: Political report of the President of the ANC, Jacob Zuma.* <http://www.ancyl.org.za/show.php?id=5921> (Accessed: January 06, 2015).
- Alexander, P. (2010). Rebellion of the poor: South Africa's service delivery protests – A preliminary analysis. Research unit in social change. *Review of African Political Economy*, 37(123):25-40.
- Arieff, A. and Husted, TF. (2015). *Crisis in the Central African Republic.* <https://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/row/R43377.pdf> (Accessed: September 05, 2016).
- Babbie, ER. (2008). *The basics of social research. Fourth Edition.* Belmont: Thomson Wadsworth Learning, Inc.
- Baloyi, MP. (2013). *Perceptions on the causes of poverty: Field study at Mavambe Village. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Development in the Faculty of Management and Law at the University of Limpopo.* MA Dissertation. Mankweng: University of Limpopo.
- Baxter, P. and Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. *The Qualitative Report*, 13(4):544-559.
- Beall, J. and Piron, LH. (2004). *DFID social exclusion review.* London: LSE/ODI.
- Berg, LP. (2013). *Inequality, Collective Action, and Democratic Transition. A Refined investigation of the relationship between inequality and democratisation.* Department of Political Science Faculty of Social Sciences. University of Oslo. Oslo: Trykk.
- Bernt, M. and Colini, L. (2013). *Exclusion, marginalisation and peripheralisation. conceptual concerns in the study of urban inequalities.* [www.irs-net.de/download/wp-exclusion-marginalization-peripheralization.pdf](http://www.irs-net.de/download/wp-exclusion-marginalization-peripheralization.pdf) (Accessed: May 02, 2015).
- Beyers, LJE. (2015). Service delivery challenges within Municipalities in the Capricorn District of Limpopo Province. *J Hum Ecol*, 50(2):121-127.

Bhalla, A. and Lapeyre, F. (1997). Social exclusion: Towards an analytical and operational framework. *Development and Change*. *Institute of Social Studies*. 28(1):413-433.

Bikisha Media Collective. (2001). *Class struggles in South Africa: From apartheid to neo-liberalism*. Johannesburg: Zabalaza Books.

Billson, JM. (2005). No owners of soil. Redefining the concept of marginality. In: Dennis, Rutledge M. (ed.): *Marginality, Power and Social Structure: Issues in Race, Class and Gender Analysis*. Oxford: Routledge.

Bloom, A. (1987). *The closing of the American mind*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

Bond, P. (2002). *Elite transition. From apartheid to neoliberalism in South Africa*. Virginia: Pluto Press.

Brinkman, H., Attree, L., and Hezir, S. (2013). *Addressing horizontal inequalities as drivers of conflict in the post-2015 development agenda*. Bogota: University of Columbia and United Nations Peacebuilding Office.

Botes, PS., Brynard, PA., Fourie, DJ. and Roux NL. (1996). *Public administration and management: A guide to central, regional and municipal administration and management. Second Edition*. Retoria: Kagiso Tertiary.

Briggs, J. and Yeboah, IEA. (1999). Structural Adjustment and Contemporary sub-saharan African city. *Royal Geographical Society (with the Institute of British Geographers)*, 33(1)18-26.

Burawoy, M. (2005). 2004 presidential address for public sociology. *American Sociological Review*, 70. (February: 4-28).

Carney, C. (1999). *Approaches to sustainable livelihoods for the rural poor*. *Odi Poverty Briefing*. <https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/3093.pdf> (Accessed: July 05, 2015).

Chen, X. (2015). *Relative deprivation and individual well-being. Low status and a feeling of relative deprivation are detrimental to health and happiness*. Yale: Yale University.

Citizen. (2015). *No new municipality for Malamulele*. <http://citizen.co.za/317957/no-new-municipality-malamulele/> (Accessed: September 28, 2015).

City Press. (2015). *Malamulele residents fail to get municipality*. <http://www.citypress.co.za/news/malamulele-fails-get-municipality>. (Accessed: March 11, 2015).

Dale, R. (2004). *Development planning concepts and tools for planners, managers and facilitators*. London: Zed books Ltd.

Daley, P. (2006). Ethnicity and political violence in Africa: The challenge to the Burundi State. *Political Geography*, 25(6):657-679.

D'Ambrosio, C. and Frick, JR. (2004). *Subjective well-being and relative deprivation: An empirical link. Discussion Paper Series*. IZA DP No. 1351. Berlin: IZA and Bocconi University.

Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. (2000). *Municipal Service Partnership Policy*. <http://www.info.gov.za/view/DownloadFileAction?id=68788> (Accessed: November 30, 2015).

Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. (2010). *2009-2010 Annual Report*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. (2014). *Back to Basics. The Presidential Local Government Summit. Serving Our Communities Better!* Pretoria: Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs.

Department for International Development. (2005). *Reducing poverty by tackling social exclusion: A DFID policy paper*. London: Department for International Development.

Department for International Development. (2009). *Why tax matters or international development and what DFID is doing about it? Briefing Note*. London: Department for International Development.

De Haan, A. (1999) *Social exclusion: Towards a holistic understanding of deprivation*. London: Department for International Development.

De Vos, AS., Strydom, H., Fouche, CB., and Delpont, CLS. (2005). *Research at grass root: For social sciences and human service professions*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Dilger, RJ., Moffett RR., and Struyk, L. (1997). Privatization of municipal services in America's largest cities. *Public Administration Review*. 57(1).

Duffy, B. (2000). *Satisfaction and expectations: Attitudes to public services in deprived areas. CASE Paper 45*. London: Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, School of Economics.

Emmenegger, P., Kvist, J., Marx, P., and Petersen, K. (2015). Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism: The making of a classic. *Journal of European Social Policy*, 25(1):3-10.

Ersikine, A. (2004). The subject of social policy. In: Alcock, P., Erskine, A., and May, M. (Eds.): *The student's companion to social policy. Second Edition*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Flynn, SI. (Sa). *Relative deprivation theory. Sociology reference guide.* <https://wiki.zirve.edu.tr/groups/.../wiki/0edb9/attachments/.../Flynn.pdf> (Accessed: April 30, 2015).

Friedman, S. (2003). *Sending them a message: Culture, tax collection, and governance in South Africa.* Centre for Policy Studies. Policy: Issues and Actor. 16(3).

Gelb, S. (2007). Macroeconomic policy in South Africa: From RDP through GEAR to ASGISA. In Gunnarsen, G., MacManus, P., Nielsen, M., and Stolten, HE. (Eds): *At the end of the rainbow: Social identity and the welfare state in the new South Africa*, (17-28). Copenhagen: Africa Contact.

Gift, RE. and Krislov, J. (1991). Are there classics in Economics? *Journal of Economic Education*, 22(1):27–32.

Grasso, MT. and Giugni, M. (2016). Protest participation and economic crisis: The conditioning role of political opportunities. *European Journal of Political Research* 55: 663–680.

Gurr, TR. (1970). *Why men rebel.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Haarhoff, KJ. (2008). *Public-private partnerships as an alternative service delivery option.* Stellenbosch: University of Stellenbosch.

Haarmann, C. (2000). *Social assistance in South Africa: Its potential impact on poverty. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Development Studies at the Institute for Social Development, University of the Western Cape.* PHD Thesis. Bellville: University of the Western Cape.

Heidhues, F. and Obare, G. (2011). Lessons from structural adjustment programs and their effects in Africa. *Quarterly Journal of International Agriculture*, 50(1):55-64.

Helmsing, AHJ. (2000). *Decentralisation and enablement, Issues in the local government debate. Inaugural address, 27 April 200.* Utrecht: Utrecht University.

Heymans, C. (1995). A lifelong task. The RDP in perspective. *Indicator SA*, 13(1):57-64.

Heywood, A. (1994). *Political ideas and concepts. An introduction.* New York: St. Martin's Press.

Hofmeister, W. and Grabow, K. (2011). *Political parties functions and organisation in democratic societies.* Singapore: National Library Board, Singapore Cataloguing-in-Publication Data.

Human Science Research Council. (2002). *Public attitudes in contemporary South Africa.* Cape Town: HSRC Press.



Ife, J. and Fiske, L. (2003). *Institutional and residual conceptions of human rights*. Activating Human Rights and Diversity Conference. Byron Bay: Curtin University of Technology.

Imenda, S. (2014). Is there a conceptual difference between theoretical and conceptual frameworks? *Journal of Social Sciences*, 38(2):185-195.

Institute for a Democratic Alternative for South Africa. (2010). *The state of local government and service delivery in South Africa: Issues, challenges, and solutions*. Idasa Local Governance Unit (LGU). <http://www.pmg.org.za/files/docs/100204idasa.doc> (Accessed: June 15, 2015).

IOL News. (2015). *Malamulele residents end shutdown*. <http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/limpopo/malamulele-residents-end-shutdown-1819316> (Accessed: April 22, 2015).

Jaeger, M. (2006). Welfare regimes and attitudes to redistribution revisited. *European Sociological Review*, 22(2):157–70.

Joseph, C. (2002). *Improving service delivery*. Johannesburg: The Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, South Africa Office.

Karamoko, J. (2011). *Community protests in South Africa: Trends, analysis, and explanation*. [http://mlgi.org.za/publications/publications-by-theme/local-government-in-south-africa/community-protests/Community\\_Protests\\_SA.pdf/view](http://mlgi.org.za/publications/publications-by-theme/local-government-in-south-africa/community-protests/Community_Protests_SA.pdf/view) (Accessed: March 02, 2015).

Kastning, T. (2013). *Basics on social democracy*. Accra: Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, Ghana Office.

Kgomo, E. (Sa). *An assessment of the progress made to improve citizens' access to government services and governance institutions. Working Draft*. [http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/docs/reports/15year\\_review/governance/dpsa.pdf](http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/docs/reports/15year_review/governance/dpsa.pdf) (Accessed: April 22, 2015).

Khan, S. (2012). *Topic guide on social exclusion*. <http://www.gsdc.org/docs/open/se10.pdf> (Accessed: April 30, 2015).

Kroukamp, H. (2014). *South African local government in a quandary: How to overcome ever-increasing challenges to excellence in service delivery* <http://ir.cut.ac.za/bitstream/handle/11462/654/Kroukamp%2c%20H.%20%20Pages%20103-114.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> (Accessed: May 16, 2017).

Krugell, W., Otto, H., and Van Der Merwe, J. (2009). *Local municipalities and progress with the delivery of basic services in South Africa. Working Paper No. 116*. Mafikeng: University of North West.

Leedy, PD. and Ormrod, JE. (2005). *Practical research planning and design*. Fifth Edition. New Jersey: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.

- Lengyel, P. and Kazancigil, A. (1981). *International social science journal: At the frontiers of sociology*. Paris: Imprimerie des Presses Universitaires.
- Leon, T. (2010). *The state of liberal democracy in Africa, resurgence or Retreat*. Center for Global Liberty and Prosperity. Development Policy Analysis. Cato Institute, No. 12(1-31).
- Lerner, G. (1989). *The creation of patriarchy*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Levitas, R. (2007). *The multi-dimensional analysis of social exclusion*. London: Cabinet Office.
- Liebig, K., Fuesers, L., and Schoenhofen, C. (2007). *Municipal borrowing improves infrastructure service delivery*. Johannesburg: German Development Institute, South Africa.
- Lincoln, YS. and Guba, EG. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Lipton, M. (1997). Poverty - *Are there holes in the consensus: World Development*. 25(7):1003-1007.
- Managa, A. (2012). *Unfulfilled promises and their consequences: A reflection on local government performance and the critical issue of poor service delivery in South Africa*. Africa Institute of South Africa Policy brief Number 76 – May 2012.
- MacEwan, A. (1999). *Neoliberalism or democracy?* London: Zed.
- Maree, J. (2012). COSATU, oligarchy and the consolidation of democracy in an African context. In Buhlungu, S. and M. Tshoedi (eds.). *COSATU's Contested Legacy*. Cape Town: HSRC Press
- Mason, M. (2010). Sample size and saturation in PhD studies using qualitative interviews. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 11(3):8
- Mathieson, J., Popay, J., Enoch, E., Escorel, S., Hernandez, M., Johnston, H., and Rispel, L. (2008). *Social exclusion: Meaning, measurement, and experience and links to health inequalities. A literature review*. [http://www.who.int/social\\_determinants/media/sekn\\_meaning\\_measurement\\_experience\\_2008.pdf.pdf](http://www.who.int/social_determinants/media/sekn_meaning_measurement_experience_2008.pdf.pdf). (Accessed: July 22, 2015).
- Mathoho, M. (2011). Service delivery failures: A threat to local government credibility. <http://www.afesis.org.za/Local-Governance-Articles/service-delivery-filures-a-threat-to-local-government-credibility-by-malachia-mathoho>. (Accessed: May 18, 2017).
- Mayher, N. and McDonald, DA. (2007). The print in South Africa: Paving the way for 'privatisation'. *Review of African Political Economy*, 34:113.

Mdlongwa, ET. (2014). *Local government at the heart of poor service delivery*. [http://www.rjr.ru.ac.za/rjrpdf/rjr\\_no34/local\\_government\\_at\\_heart\\_of\\_poor\\_service\\_delivery.pdf](http://www.rjr.ru.ac.za/rjrpdf/rjr_no34/local_government_at_heart_of_poor_service_delivery.pdf) (Accessed: January 05, 2016).

Merton, RK. (1961). Social problems and sociological theory. In: Merton, R and Nisbet, R. (eds.): *Contemporary Social Problems*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World.

Meyer, MJ. (2000). *Globalisation: An issue of contestation and struggle in South Africa in Mots Pluriel*. <http://www.arts.uwa.edu.au/MotsPluriels/MP1300mm.html> (Accessed: June 15, 2015).

Mgwebi, G. (2010). South African Local Government:10 years later. *Transformer*, 16(1). <http://www.ngopulse.org/article/south-african-local-government-10-years-later> (Accessed: May 18, 2017).

Mhlanga, B. (2012). Ethnicity and tribalism? The discursive construction of Zimbabwean national identity. *African Identities*, 11(1):47-60.

Mhone, G. and Edigheji, O. (2003). *Governance in the new South Africa, the challenges of globalization*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town press.

Miraftab, F. (2004). Neoliberalism and casualisation of public sector services: The case of waste collection services in Cape Town, South Africa. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 28: December 2004.

Mmola, DM. (2012). *An assessment of the role played by Polokwane Local Municipality in service delivery within Manthorwane Community of Limpopo Province. Mini-dissertation Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Masters Degree in Development in the Faculty of Management and Science, Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership at the University of Limpopo*. MA Dissertation. Mankweng: University of Limpopo.

Mohan, G. (2009). Structural adjustment. In: Kitchin, R. and Thrift, N. (Eds). *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, 12(1-9).

Monashane, SC. 2011. *Water supply and sanitation service delivery problems as Praktiseer, Limpopo Province. Mini-dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Master's Degree in Management and Development (Sustainable Development) At North-West University (Potchefstroom Campus)*. MA Dissertation. Potchefstroom: North West University.

Mottiar, S. and Bond, P. (2012). The politics of discontent and social Ppoteest in Durban, Politikon. *South African Journal of Political Studies*, 39(3):309-330.

Municipal Demarcation Board. (2015). *Re-determination of the boundary of the Thulamela Local Municipality by excluding Malamulele area and determining this area as a separate Category B municipality within the Vhembe District Municipality. Feasibility Study*. Pretoria: Municipal Demarcation Board.

Narsiah, S. (2002). Neoliberalism and privatisation in South Africa. *Geo Journal*, 57(1-2):3-13.

Nathan, O. (2013). Municipalities, service delivery and protest. <https://zabalaza.net/2013/02/10/municipalities-service-delivery-and-protest/> (Accessed: May 16, 2017).

National Planning Commission. (2011). *National Development Plan 2030, Our future - Make it work: Executive summary*. <http://www.gov.za/sites/www.gov.za/files/Executive%20Summary-NDP%202030%20-%20Our%20future%20-%20make%20it%20work.pdf> (Accessed: January 13, 2016).

Nduvheni, S. (2009). *Poor service: More protests*. <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Poor-service-More-protests-20090810> (Accessed: July 15, 2015).

Ng'ong'ola, DH. (1996). *Analysis of policy reform and structural adjustment programs in Malawi: With emphasis on agriculture and trade*. Bunda: AMEX International, Inc.

Nengwekhulu, RH. (2009). Public service delivery, challenges facing the South African public service. *Journal of Public Administration*, 44(2).

Newman, D. (2010). *Sociology: Exploring the architecture of everyday life*. London: Sage Publishers, Ltd.

News24. (2015a). *Malamulele: A ghost town fights for its rights*. <http://www.news24.com/Archives/City-Press/Malamulele-A-ghost-town-fights-for-its-rights-20150429> (Accessed: March 13, 2015).

News24. (2015b). *Chabane family wants Malamulele municipality*. <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Chabane-family-wants-Malamulele-municipality-20150322> (Accessed: April 15, 2016).

News24. (2015c). *Malamulele municipality: Tribalism or administrative justice*. <http://www.news24.com/MyNews24/Malamulele-Municipality-Tribalism-or-Administrative-Justice-20150113> (Accessed: September 25, 2015).

News24. (2015d). *No new municipality for Malamulele*. <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/No-new-municipality-for-Malamulele-20150130>. (Accessed: May 25, 2015).

News24. (2016). *Mankweng residents don't want to pay water bills*. <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/mankweng-residents-dont-want-to-pay-water-bills-20160211> (Accessed: March 06, 2016).

Ngubane, MB. (2005). *An evaluation of service delivery at Ndongakusuka Local Municipality. Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Administration in the discipline of Public Administration in the Faculty*

of Commerce, Administration and Law at the University of Zululand. PHD Thesis. Richards Bay: University of Zululand.

Niksic, G. (2004). *Difficult but Not Impossible: The ANC's Decentralization Strategy in South Africa*. Toronto, Canada: York University.

Nleya, N. (2011). Linking service delivery and protest in South Africa: An exploration of evidence from Khayelitsha. *Unisa Press Africanus*, 50(1):3-13.

Nleya, N. and Thompson, L. (2008). Millennium Development Goals and water service delivery strategies: Reflection on the fit between national and local policies on water in the context of global poverty alleviation initiatives. *Journal of Africanus*, 38(2):115-126.

Nnadozie, RC. (2013). Access to basic services in post-apartheid South Africa: What has changed? Measuring on a relative basis. *The African Statistical Journal*, 16:81-103.

Nyalunga, D. (2006). The revitalisation of local government in South Africa. *International NGO*, 1(1):1-9.

Ocholla, DN. and Le Roux, J. (2011). *Conceptions and misconceptions of theoretical frameworks in library and information science research*. <http://www.lis.uzulu.ac.za/2011/Ocholla%20and%20Le%20Roux%20prolissa%20conference%202011%20revised%2016%20March%202011.pdf> (Accessed: June 22, 2015).

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. (2008). *Innovative service delivery: Meeting the challenges of rural regions. OECD rural policy conferences key messages*. Cologne: Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.

Osei-Hwedi, K. (2005). Poverty eradication in Botswana: Towards the realisation of vision 2016. *Journal of African Studies*, 18(1):7-17.

Paglia, P. 2006. *Ethnicity and Tribalism: Are these the Root Causes of the Sudanese Civil Conflicts? African conflicts and the Role of Ethnicity: A Case Study of Sudan*. <http://www.africaeconomicanalysis.org/articles/pdf/sudan0807.pdf> (Accessed: June 12, 2015).

Paradza, G., Mokwena, I., and Richards, R. (2010). *Assessing the role of councillors in service delivery at local government level in South Africa. Research report 125*. Funded by the Open Society. Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies.

Pauw, K. and Mncube, L. (2007). *Expanding the social security net in South Africa: Opportunities, challenges, and constraints. Development Policy Research Unit Working Paper 07/127*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.

Presidency. (2006). *Accelerated shared growth initiative of South Africa*. <http://www.info.gov.za/asgisa/asgisadoc.pdf> (Accessed: July 15, 2015).

Pretorius, D. and Schurink, W. (2007). *Enhancing service delivery in local government: The case of a district municipality*. Johannesburg: University of Johannesburg.

Ramaipadi, MA. (2011). *Implementation of welfare support and free basic services at Mapuve Village in Limpopo Province*. Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree. Masters of Development Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership University of Limpopo. MA Dissertation. Mankweng: University of Limpopo.

Rashe, RZ. (2017). "Ethnicity challenges in African communities, the ghost of the past." *What shall we say to this? – A theological- ethical approach* [http://www.pharosjot.com/uploads/7/1/6/3/7163688/article\\_13\\_vol\\_98\\_2017.pdf](http://www.pharosjot.com/uploads/7/1/6/3/7163688/article_13_vol_98_2017.pdf) (Accessed: May 16, 2017).

Republic of South Africa. (1994). *White Paper on Reconstruction and Development*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (1996). *The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act, 1996 (Act 106 of 1996)*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (1997). *The White Paper on Transforming the Public Service Delivery*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (1998a). *Local Government: Municipal Structures Act, 1998 (Act 117 of 1998)*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (1998b). *White Paper on Local Government*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (2000). *Local Government: Municipal Systems, 2000 (Act 32 of 2000)*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (2003). *Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act, 2003 (Act 56 of 2003)*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa. (2011). *Division of Revenue Act, 2011 (Act No. 6 of 2011)*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Rose-Ackerman, S. (2004). *The challenge of poor governance and corruption, Copenhagen Consensus Challenge Paper*. <http://www.copenhagenconsensus.com/sites/default/files/cp-corruptionfinished.pdf> (Accessed: July 22, 2015).

Runciman, WG. (1966). *Relative deprivation and social justice*. London: Routledge.

Runciman, WG. (1972). *Relative deprivation and social justice: A study of attitudes to social inequality in twentieth century England*. London: Penguin Books.

Russell, W. and Bvuma, G. (2001). Alternative Service Delivery and Public Transformation in South Africa. *International journal of public service transformation in South Africa*, 14(3).

Schmidt, MG. (2001). *The democratic welfare state. Democracy, reality, and responsibility*. Vatican City: Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences.

Segooa, RW. (2006). *The impact of service delivery in Mankweng Township by Polokwane Municipality as a third sphere of government. Mini-dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters in Public Administration in the Faculty of Management Sciences and Law at the University of Limpopo Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership*. MA Dissertation. Mankweng: of Limpopo.

Sen, A. (2000). *Social exclusion: Concept, application, and scrutiny. Social Development Papers No. 1*. Office of Environment and Social Development. Manila: Asian Development Bank.

Shaidi, EW. (2013). *Investigation into causes of service delivery protests in municipalities: A case study of Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality. A thesis presented to the Faculty of Arts at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan Municipality in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree: Doctor Philosophiae*. PHD Thesis. Port Elizabeth: Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University.

Silver, (1994). *Social Exclusion and Social Solidarity: Three Paradigms*. Labour Institutions and Development Programme. Discussion Papers, DP/69/1994. International Labour Office. Geneva: International Institute for Labour Studies

Silver, H. (2007). *The process of social exclusion: The dynamics and an evolving concept. Working paper 95*. Rhode Island: Brown University, Department of Sociology

Singo, TA. (2012). *An assessment of the utilisation of Municipal Infrastructure Grant for sustainable service delivery and improved quality of life: A case study of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, Gauteng Province, RSA. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master of Development (MDEV) in the Faculty of Management Sciences at the University of Limpopo*. MA Dissertation. Mankweng: University of Limpopo.

Sithole, S. and Mathonsi, N. (2015). Local governance service delivery issues during Apartheid and Post-Apartheid South Africa. In: Ijeoma, E. (Chief Ed): *Africa's Public Service Delivery and Performance Review*. 3(3):5-30.

Smith, HJ. and Huo, YJ. (2014). Relative deprivation: How subjective experiences of inequality influence social behaviour and health. Health and well-being. *Policy Insights from the Behavioural and Brain Sciences*, 1(1):231-238.

Social Exclusion Unit. (2003). *Making the connections: Final report on transport and social exclusion*.

<http://www.socialexclusionunit.gov.uk/publications/reports/html/transportfinal/summary> (Accessed: May 01, 2015).

South African Broadcasting Corporation News. (2014). *Malamulele residents stick to their guns over not voting.* <http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/1850fe8043fa69e6a08ab4866b9bf97e/Malamuleleundefinedresidentsundefinedstickundefinedtoundefinedtheirundefinedgunsundefinedoverundefinednotundefinedvoting-20141305> (Accessed: April 19, 2015).

South African Broadcasting Corporation News. (2015a). *Malamulele to become a municipality.* <http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/ee65040048fb4c658f9a8fcd12612d62/Malamulele-to-become-a-municipality> (Accessed: November 19, 2015).

South African Broadcasting Corporation News. (2015b). *Govt has a week to respond to our demand: Malamulele task team.* <http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/324d238047015c5e9b7fbbc6b9a5590a/Govt-has-a-week-to-respond-to-our-demand:-Malamulele-task-team-20152001> (Accessed: April 19, 2015).

South African History Online. (Sa). *Kingdoms of southern Africa: Thulamela.* <http://www.sahistory.org.za/article/kingdoms-southern-africa-thulamela> (Accessed: May 10, 2015).

South African Institute for Race Relations. (2011). *More people living in urban areas than ever before.* [www.sairr.org.za/media/media-releases/Urbanisation%20...pdf/at.../file](http://www.sairr.org.za/media/media-releases/Urbanisation%20...pdf/at.../file) (Accessed: July 15, 2015).

SowetanLive. (2016). *Tribal tension between the Venda and Tsonga groups fuel conflict in Vuwani.* <http://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/2016/05/09/tribal-tension-between-the- Venda-and-tsonga-groups-fuel-conflict-in-vuwani>. (Accessed: July 10, 2016).

Spicker, P. (1988). *Principles of social welfare an introduction to thinking about the welfare state.* California: Routledge.

Spicker, P. (2000). *The welfare state: A general theory.* London: Sage Publishers.

Stanley, E. (2011). Evaluating the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 39(3):525-546.

Stanton, A. (2009). *Decentralisation and municipalities in South Africa: An analysis of the mandate to deliver basic services. Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Policy and Development Studies) in the Faculty of Humanities, Development and Social Sciences at the University of KwaZulu-Natal.* PHD Thesis. Pietermaritzburg: University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Stewart, F., Barron, M., Brown, G., and Hartwell, M. (2006). *Social exclusion and conflict: Analysis and policy implications. CRISE Policy Paper, January 2005*



(Updated April 2006). United Kingdom: Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity.

Strachan, AL. (2014). *Conflict analysis of Algeria*. [http://www.gsdr.org/docs/open/gsdrc\\_conflanal\\_algeria.pdf](http://www.gsdr.org/docs/open/gsdrc_conflanal_algeria.pdf) (Accessed: September 05, 2016).

Tafira, K. (2011). Is xenophobia racism? *Anthropology Southern Africa*, 34(3&4): 114-122.

Terreblanche, SJ. (1999). *The ideological journey of South Africa: From the RDP to the GEAR macro-economic plan in religion in public life*. [http://www.uct.ac.za/depts/ricsa/confer/me99/procs/pro\\_terr.htm](http://www.uct.ac.za/depts/ricsa/confer/me99/procs/pro_terr.htm). (Accessed: June 15, 2015).

Titmuss, RM. (1968). *Commitment to welfare*. London: Allen & Unwin.

United Nations Development Programme. (2000). *Responding to citizens' needs: Local governance and social services for all. Report of the United Nations global forum on local governance and social services for all Stockholm, Sweden*. <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/un/unpan001598.pdf> (Accessed: September 05, 2015).

Uwizeyimana, D. (2012). Democracy and pretend democracies in Africa: Myths of African Democracies. *Law, Democracy, and Development*, 16:139-161.

Van der Waldt, G. and Helmbold, R. (1983). *The constitution and a new public administration*. Kenwyn: Juta & Co. Ltd.

Visser, W. (2004). "Shifting RDP into GEAR". *The ANC Government's dilemma in providing an equitable system of social security for the new South Africa. Paper presented at the 40th ITH Linzer Konferenz, 17 September 2004*. Cape Town: University of Stellenbosch.

Wacquant, L. (2008). *Urban outcasts: A comparative sociology of advanced marginality*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Wale, K. (2013). *Confronting exclusion: Time for radical reconciliation. SA reconciliation Barometer Survey: 2013 Report*. Cape Town: The Institute for Justice and Reconciliation.

Wangwe, S. (Sa). *Foreign aid, accountability and service delivery in Africa*. Dar es Salaam: Daima Associates Limited.

Welman, C., Kruger, F., and Mitchell, B. (2005). *Research methodology: Third Edition*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press Southern Africa.

Wild Card. (2015). *Thulamela and Mapungubwe: Origin and meaning* <http://www.wildcard.co.za/blog.htm?action=view-post&id=4276>. (Accessed: October 08, 2015).

Wilensky, HL. and Lebeaux. (1958). *Industrial society and social welfare*. New York: Free Press.

Williams, R. (1976). *Keywords: A vocabulary of culture and society*. Glasgow: Fontana.

Wolfe, M. (1994). *Some paradoxes of social exclusion. Discussion Paper 63. DP/53/1994*. Geneva: International Labour Organisation.

World Bank. (2003). *Reforming public institutions and strengthening governance: A World Bank strategy implementation update*. Washington DC: Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication.

Wright, J. (2006). *Beyond the "Zulu Aftermath": Rescrambling Southern Africa's Mfecane migrations*. <http://www.kznhas-history.net/files/seminars/Wright2006.pdf> (Accessed: September 05, 2016).

Yin, RK. (Sa). *Case study research design and method. Third Edition*. London: Sage Publications.

Zeitlyn, S. (2004). *Social exclusion in Asia – Some initial ideas*. London: DfID.

## ANNEXURES

### Annexure 1: Interview Guide Questions (English and Xitsonga Versions)

QUESTIONS REGARDING THE DISSATISFACTION OF THE MALAMULELE RESIDENTS REGARDING POOR SERVICE DELIVERY AND GOVERNANCE BY THULAMELA LM			
Section A: Information about the Respondent			
1. Of which gender are you?			
2. Are you a resident of Malamulele? Kindly provide the name of your village/Section..			
3. Of which age category are? Kindly select the appropriate box on the right.	18-35	36-60	61 and above
4. Are you working/employed? Kindly provide details.			
5. Kindly indicate your income category on the boxes to the right. This request is only meant to determine whether or not you are able to take care of your basic, day-to-day household needs.	R0-R 5000, 00	R5001, 00-R15 000, 00	R15 001, 00 and above
6. Are you married?			

7. How many people are staying in your household?			
8. What is your education level?	Between Grade 0-8	Grade 9 - Diploma/Degree.	Post-Graduate Qualification
<b>Section B: Questions Regarding the Municipality, Governance, and Service Delivery</b>			
9. What do you understand by service delivery? / What is service delivery? Provide five (5) examples of services.			
10. What caused the protests that occurred here in Malamulele area?			
11. What can be the solution in such circumstances?			
12. Kindly share your experience with			

governance and service delivery as provided by the Thulamela LM?	
13. What can you comment about the actions of the residents which damaged infrastructure and other facilities?	
14. What positive change will the new Municipality bring to the Malamulele and its surrounding communities?	
15. How is the relationship between the vaTsonga and vhaVenda ethnic groups?	

## SWIVUTISO SWA VULAVISISI (XITSONGA VERSION)

**SWIVUTISO MAYELANA NA VULAVISISI HI TLHELO RA KU NGA ENETISEKI KA VAAKI VAKA MALAMULELE HI VUKORHOKERI KU SUKA EKA MASIPALA WA THULAMELA**

### **Xiyenge Xa A: Vuxokoxoko Bya Muhlamuri**

1. Xana mi wa rimbewu rihi?			
2. Xana mi muaka tiko wa ndhawu leyi ya ka Malamulele? Vito ra muganga/Xiyenge.			
3. Xana mina malembe ya ngani. Hlawulani eka mabokisi lawa ya nga exineneni.	18-35	36-60	61 ku ya ehenhla
4. Mi nga va miri munhu loyi a tirhaka xana? Mikomberiwa ku nyika vuxokoxoko.			
5. Mi komberiwa ku kombisa mpimanyeto wa muholo wa nwina eka mabokisi lawa ya nga exineneni. Vuxokoxoko lebyi byo lavekela ku kombisa loko mi swi kota ku fikelela swidingo swa siku na siku swa munti.	R0-R 5000, 00	R5001, 00-R15 000, 00	R15 001, 00 ku ya ehenhla.
6. Xana mi vutile kumbe ku vutiwa ke?			
7. Xana mi tshama mi ri			

va ngani ekaya?			
8. Xana xiyimo xa dyondzo ya nwina hi xihi?	Ntangha 0-8	Ntangha 9 - Dipiloma/Digiri.	Ehenhla ka Dipiloma/Digiri
<b>Xiyenge Xa B: Swivutiso Mayelana na Masipala, Mafumele, na vukorhekeri</b>			
9. Xana mi twisisa yini hi vukorhokeri?/ I yini vukorhokeri? Nyikani swikombiso swa ntlhanu (5) swa vukorhokeri.			
10. Xana xitereka lexi xi nga humelela laha ka Malamulele a xi vangywa hi yini?			
11. Xana xintshuxo ku nga va xihi eka swiyimo swa muxaka lowu?			
12. Mi komberiwa ku avelana na hina hi ta ntokoto lowu mi nga va na wona hi mafumele xikan'we na vukorhokeri bya Masipala wa Thulamela?			
13. Xana mi nga ku yini mayelana na swiendlo swa vaaka tiko va ka Malamulele mayelana na			

<p>ku onha tinhandu ta mfumo na yinwana miako ke?</p>	
<p>14. Xana ku kuma Masipala wuntshwa eka Malamulele swi nga tisa ku cinca hi ndlela yihi ke?</p>	
<p>15. Xana vuxaka exikarhi ka rixaka ra Vhavenda na ra Vatsonga byi njhani?</p>	



## **Annexure 2: Letter of Consent (English and Xitsonga Versions).**

Enquiries : Mr NS Mathonsi  
Tel : 082 241 3200  
E-Mail Address : buqedaka@gmail.com

Dear Sir/Madam

### **LETTER FOR CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN THE RESEARCH STUDY**

I (the researcher) am Mr NS Mathonsi, (Student Number: [REDACTED]) a post-graduate student in the faculty of Humanities, School of Social Sciences, at the University of Limpopo. This letter serves to request for your consent to participate in this project by answering few questions and sharing your views.

This research is about the strike that the Malamulele community embarked on. The purpose of this study is to understand the grievances of the community and to make interpretations of the outcry, as well as to draw recommendations that will assist other municipalities and areas facing the same challenges as Malamulele.

As a chosen respondent, you are valuable to this project since your contribution will assist to bring solutions to some of the service delivery challenges to the Malamulele Community as well as other areas that face the similar conditions with the one that was faced in Malamulele

Ethical consideration as indicated in the proposal will be adhered to. Respondents are allowed to keep their identity and respond to the questions anonymously. The data requested herewith will only be utilised for the purposes of the study that is being conducted only.

You are requested to confirm your consent to participate in the study by appending your signature below, without writing your name and surname.

---

**Signature of the interviewee**

**Date:**

## **Papila ra Mpfumelelo (Xitsonga Version)**

Vuxokoxoko : Mr NS Mathonsi  
Rinqingho : 082 214 3200  
Kherefu : buqedaka@gmail.com

Eka Muchaviseki

### **PAPILA RO KOMBELA MPFUMELELO WA VULAVISISI**

Mina (Mulavisisi) ndzi Mr NS Mathonsi, (Nambara ya xichudeni: [REDACTED]), xichudeni eka Rhavi ra *Humanities*, eka Xikolo xa *Social Sciences*, eYunivhesithi ya Limpopo. Papila leri i ro kombela mpfumelelo wa leswaku mulavisisi a mi vutisa swivutiso swingari swi ngani leswi swi nga ta nwi pfuna ku kuma mavonelo ya nwina eka vulavisi lebyi.

Vulavisisi lebyi byi mayelana na xitereka xa vaaka tiko va ka Malamulele. Byi endleriwa ku twisisa swirilo swa vaaka tiko xikan'we na ku endla tinhlamuselo hi swirilo swa vona, na ku ta humesa swibumabumelo leswi nga ta pfuna swifundhza-ntsongo leswi nga na swiphigo leswi swi fanaka.

Tani hi muhlawuriwa wa ku hlamula swivutiso eka vulavisisi lebyi, mi wa nkoka eka ntirho lowu hikuva ku hoxa xandla ka nwina ku ta pfuneta ku tisa tinhlamulo eka swin'wana swa swiphigo swa ku nga enetiseki hi vukorhokeri ka vaaki va ka Malamulele xikan'we na le ka tindhawu tin'wana leti ti nga na swiyimo swo yelana ni xiyimo lexi xi nga vanga xitereka eka Malamulele.

Vululami na vusirheleri eka vahlamuri byi ta landzeleriwa hi mulavisisi. Mavito ya vahlamuri a ya nga paluxiwi helo. Vuxokoxoko lebyi byi komberiwaka byi ta tirhisiwa mayelana na vulavisisi lebyi ntsena.

Mi komberiswa ku tiyisisa mpfumelelo lowu mi nyikaka mulavisi hi ku sayina laha hansi ntsena, handle ka ku tsala vito ra nwina.

---

**Nsayino wa Muhlamuri**

**Siku:**