EFFECTS OF MIGRATION ON MUNICIPAL PLANNING: A CASE OF GREATER TUBATSE LOCAL MUNICIPALITY IN LIMPOPO PROVINCE

by

HLABISHI LEMON PHALA

MINI-DISSERTATION

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of

MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

in the

FACULTY OF MANAGEMENT & LAW

(TURFLOOP GRADUATE SCHOOL OF LEADERSHIP)

at the

UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO

SUPERVISOR: PROFESSOR KG PHAGO

2017

DECLARATION

I declare that EFFECTS OF MIGRATION ON MUNICIPAL PLANNING: A CASE STUDY OF THE GREATER TUBATSE LOCAL MUNICIPALITY IN THE LIMPOPO PROVINCE is my own work and that all the resources that I have used and quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

_____   _____

SIGNATURE   DATE

(MR HL PHALA)

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this qualitative research was to investigate the effects of migration on municipal planning using the case of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in the Limpopo Province. The research derives its origin from the notion that municipal planning, which does not consider population dynamics, is incomplete. Municipalities in South Africa are mandated to provide services to community members within their jurisdiction with limited available resources. To achieve this municipalities are expected to develop plans, referred to as Integrated Development Plans (IDPs). The IDPs are informed by various aspects for their completeness, namely: alignment with the national development perspective and consideration of population dynamics. The research was designed to explore the experience and understanding of municipal officials who are responsible for planning activities in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and the manner in which migration affects such municipal planning. This qualitative research employed a phenomenological method as the most appropriate to capture the perspective, understanding and experiences of individuals who were differently involved in migration and municipal planning processes.

The research revealed how migration affects planning within municipal invironment in South Africa by using the experiences of municipal officials who are involved in planning activities in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Among others,the research revealed the following findings, namely; (1) Migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is caused by several factors such job opportunities in the mines, better services in towns and townships among others,(2) the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not consider migration during community consultation processes, needs prioritisation and resource allocation, (3) the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have effectivemigration data management system, (4) there is a lack of co-operation between the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality with otherspheres of government which are responsible for migration management, (5) Powers and functions delegated to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality inhibit migration management and municipal planning and (6)there is sufficient legislative framework regulating migration management and inter-governmental relations in South Africa, however there is no implementation of such legislative framework by government officials.

The overall experience of participants with regard to migration and municipal planning generally confirms findings of previous researches (Blase & Landau, 2014; Hofisi, 2014; Netswera & Phago, 2011) who for example, argue that migration is not taken into consideration during municipal decision making processes, need prioritisation and resource allocation. However, unlike the findings in previous researches (Friedementle & Misago, 2014; Mpehle, 2014) which highlight that municipal officials have negative attitudes towards migration this research revealed that municipal officials in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality appreciate migrants. Municipal officials interviewed in this research appreciate migration and the challenges it poses to the municipality. Furthermore, contrary to what some reports highlight, participants in this research did not experience xenophobic attacks in the area despite the high prevalence of migration. Participants recommended that more powers and functions such as provision of water, electricity, migration management and others should be devolved to local municipalities as the sphere closest to the people. Participants further recommended that a dedicated research unit be institutionalised within municipalities to collect data which will supplement those of Statistics South Africa, and that other spheres of government should co-operate and capacitate local municipalities.

This qualitative research is significant because the data gathered were analysed to develop themes which provide insight into how migration affects municipal planning, which planners in municipal environment can learn from and apply. It also contributes to a growing body of scholarly work and provides a conduit for future studies concerning the central phenomena - migration and municipal planning. This is vital, given the increasing pressure exerted by migration on municipalities and their limited resources.

KEY WORDS

- Migration
- Integrated municipal planning
- Influx
- Informal settlements

ACKNOWDGEMENTS

Greatest honour is given to my living God who bestowed me life and protection while guiding my path throughout of this research. This was one unique encounter in my life compounded by the life challenges I went through at the time. Although those challenges could be regarded as a whetstone I used to sharpen my mind, it was obvious that if it was not for the Lord being on my side, I would not have been able to accomplish this goal.

My deepest appreciation goes to Professor Phago who was not only my supervisor and advisor but my motivator. He was really a blessing which came at an opportune moment: *When ships were down.* He provided real leadership, an epitome of professorship everyone should envy and emulate. He was strict but still considerate. No amount of words can express my gratitude to you Prof. Keep it up and God bless you.

To my family and friends who were always around me and giving the support, encouragement and advice I required: thank you million times! I know my wife Mologadi and kids, Marumo, Bauba, Mahlako and Napogadi missed me a lot while I was with them in the same house. Thank you for your love and patience with me. Your rewards are with our living God.

I also would like to thank the wonderful research participants who took time out of their busy schedules to participate in my studies. Without their candid and honest responses this research would not have been accomplished. My last words go to my colleagues (student-mates) who shared their views and encouraged me throughout and to UL assistant staff, in particular programme assistant Ms Pauline Sebanki and librarian, Ms Gloria Ramaboea thank you very much for your patience with me. You were a real marvel to work with. God bless you.

"Let him who would move the world first move himself. Prefer knowledge to wealth, for the one is transitory, the other perpetual. We cannot live better than in seeking to become better" (Socrates).

DEDICATION

I dedicate this dissertation to my parents, Malehu Mahlako and Sekgame Bauba Phala - all you, who ensured that I was raised with love and taught me that life is all about love, respect and humility. Mom remained inspirational to me. Despite the fact that I regard myself as independent, you kept on making some calls checking on me and giving some advice which at some stage I thought was unnecessary until I realised that it was your duty and responsibility as a mother. Further dedications go to my lovely and beautiful wife, Tinny Ranapo Phala and kids, Innocent, Christopher, Annastacia and Dorcus who stood on my side through thick and thin. Your love is immeasurable.

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

COGTA= Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs

IDP = Integrated Development Plan

GTLM= Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

MEC= Member of Executive Committee

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTORY CHAPTER

1.1 INTRODUCTION

Migration poses a challenge to municipal planning in South Africa. As one of the critical population dynamics, migration must be considered by municipalities when they develop their municipal plans. Municipal planning without consideration of migration needs is considered to be incomplete. This research investigates the effects of migration on planning within a South African municipal environment.

This chapter introduces the research by providing the full background and the reasons it is carried out. The chapter also captures the motivation of the study, the problem statement which indicates why the study is carried out, the aim and objectives of the study and research questions the study attempts to answer. Furthermore the chapter highlights the significance of the study and explicates research design and methodology adopted in the study. Since scholars use and interpret terms, concepts and phrases differently to develop meanings and purposes from time to time, this chapter endeavoures to narrow down some of those differences by providing definition of concepts and the context in which they are used in this study. Lastly the chapter provides an overview of chapters constituting the rest of the study.

1.2 BAKGROUND OF THE RESEARCH

Municipalities are mandated to provide sustainable services to their communities within the constraints of available resources. To achieve their mandates municipalities must develop and adopt Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) which in terms of section 25 of the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000) aligns the resources and capacities of a municipality with the implementation of the plan and forms the policy framework and general basis on which annual budgets must be based. Section 35(1) of the Act refers to IDPs as municipalities' principal strategic planning instrument. Municipal plans are informed by a number of factors *inter alia;* national policy frameworks, their physical demography and population dynamics.

With the fall of apartheid and the coming into being of the new democratic dispensation in 1994, many municipalities in urban areas experienced the highest level of migration.Section A(Current Reality) of The White Paper on Local Government, 1998, indicates that in spite of the end of apartheid,the removal of legal restrictions to movement, the demarcation of new boundaries and the migration trends within the Southern African sub-region,there has not yet been a fundamental change in national population distribution. Urbanisation and migration research, however, reveals that profound changes may be under way in migration trends and settlement patterns which will have a major impact on local government in the years to come. Phago (2010:3) posits that under the Apartheid system, normal long-term urbanisation processes were prevented by controls over migration and urban residency rights for blacks. This scholarfurther argues that unlike the Apartheid system which restricted migration, the new democratic government ushered freedom of migration and no restrictions to people's mobility. The fall of apartheid freed the bulk of the rural population who were restricted to the homelands and propelled them into cities to search for work and better services. According to this scholar, South Africa has since then begun to contend with the explosion of urban sprawl.According to Jackson (1986), who wrote about migration patterns, migrantswho usually return back to their places of origin seasonally are called circular migrants, while others prefer to build new homes in cities and stay permanently and are referred to as permanent migrants or to have homes both at their places of origin and in cities, referred to as bi-local residents.

Though scholars, such as Bakewell (2007), highlight that migrants are commonly perceived as a threat competing for access to already limited resources, the Human Development Report (2009) reveals that those fears are generally wrong and argues that both migrants and countries of destination have mutual benefit from migration processes. According to Koser (2007:10) migrants are often the most entrepreneurial and dynamic members of society. The author further highlights that historically migration has underpinned economic growth and nation building but it also presents significant challenges. In line with the Human Development Report (2009), migrants in South

Africa - like natural citizens of the country - are bestowed upon rights and entitlements like any natural citizen of the country except political rights like voting and standing for political office. According to the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996 those rights include, among others, right to human dignity, basic services and others. This means that municipalities must ensure that their services are extended to both internal and foreign migrants. In executing their constitutional mandates of providing services to their communities, municipalities are further enjoined by section 153 of the 1996 Constitution to consult within communities regarding their needs and the levels at which municipal services are provided. As already indicatedabove, migrants should be given equal treatment as natural citizens of South Africa, counted as part of communities with jurisdiction of different municipalities and also included in community consultation processes of those municipalities. Migration is therefore one critical element of population dynamics that has a great influence on the municipalities' planning and resource allocation.

According to Landau, Segatti and Misago (2011:8), Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) of municipalitiesoften disregard migration considerations. This is corroborated by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Development Plan (2008-2011), which indicates that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality finds it difficult to cope with expenditure pressures of migration. In part a disregard of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's IDP is due to the fact that this phenomenon is consideredto be exacerbating pressure on available municipal engineering infrastructure and social services. The exclusion of migration patterns and issues in municipal planning does not only result in misalignment and stretching of the meagre resources municipalities have, but could further perpetuate historical skewed development patterns, unsustainable provision of services, proliferation of informal settlements, conflicts among community members over resources and violent protests. Furthermore the exclusion of migration patterns in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Devepment Planning progresses is also an antithesis to the new democratic South Africa and what the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality claims it stands for. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Intergrated Development Plan (2011-16:5), for example,states that the

Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's vision is, "*a developed platinum city for the benefit of all*" while the mission of the municipality in terms of the Integrtaed Development Plan (2008-2011:11)among others is to promote (1) *local, accountable democracy through active community participation, (2) accessible, need satisfying service rendered in a sustainable, affordable manner and (3) environmental management to ensure a balance between safe human settlement and the economic base of the municipality.*

This research investigates the effects of migration on municipal planning, using the case of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in the Limpopo Province. According to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Development Plan (2008-2011:47) the municipality experiences a high level of migration due to the mining developments in the area. The research assumes that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality - similar to other urban municipalities in South Afric a - is confronted with effects of migration and municipal planning challenges. That assumption is strengthened by widespread service delivery protests and xenophobic attacks across the country. Though it was not the intension of the researcher to delve on xenophobic attacks it was worth mentionng that such attacks were often blamed on service delivery challenges. According to Matlou and Mutanga (2010) and Hammerstad (2012) foreigners are attacked by locals on the pretext that they "steal'' their jobs and other basic municipal services. Proper planning by municipalities which take into consideration population dynamics, for example the extent and patterns of migration, could minimise xenophobic attacks.

The research was also a response to the suggestion by scholars such as Cross, Gelderboom, Roux and Mafukidze (2006) and Landau *et al.* (2011:11) that ongoing research on migration should be conducted to enhance deeper understanding of this phenomenon as it affects societies and how it can be best managed. The research was therefore necessary to unpack challenges as posed by exclusion of migration in municipal planning.

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT FOR THE RESEARCH

According to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Development Plan (2008-2011:46) the municipality has limited information about migration. A proper municipal planning needs to consider the population dynamics of its locality. Municipal officials, councillors and other key stakeholders in municipalities must understand such population dynamics within their municipalities, their needs and how they affect the allocation of limited resources. The importance of factoring migration as part of population dynamics in municipal planning cannot be emphasised enough. Bakewell (2009:15), for example, highlights that across the world, it is clear that migration has played a fundamental role in shaping modern human society over centuries. Failure of municipalities to proactively address migration issues and other forms of human mobility could yield undesired consequences like social fragmentation, economic exclusion, poor planning and violent protests.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), hereafter referred as the Constitution, mandates municipalities to provide services to their communities in a sustainable manner, to promote social and economic development and to ensure that their budgeting and planning prioritise basic services of the community. The White Paper on Local Government (1998) defines municipalities as arsenals of developmental local government, whose responsibilities are to find sustainable ways to meet community needs, improve the quality of their lives and to address the ills of apartheid which promoted separate developments.

Since the advent of democracy in 1994, municipalities in South Africa experienced significant levels of migration which put more pressure on municipal services which municipalities must respond to. They must include human mobility in their Integrated Development Plans and budgets if they are to fulfil their mandate as part of a developmental local government. Landau *et al.* (2011), however, show that

municipalities disregard migration in their planning processes and/or find it difficult to cope with expenditure pressure of migration.

The research argues that migration is a global phenomenon which also affects municipalities in South Africa. Migration must be factored into municipal policy, planning and budget processes. Without such information, the planning and budgeting of municipalities will not adequately reflect the needs of this important section of the community. This research therefore undertakes to investigate the research problem as stated: How does migration affect planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

1.4 RATIONALE FOR THE RESEARCH

 Landau *et al.* (2011) argue that municipalities' Integrated Development Plans do not consider migration patterns.The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality like many other municipalities across the country has a challenge with regard to its migration issues. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Development Plans of 2008-2011 and 2013/14 indentify inward migration as one of its general challenges. The Greater Tubatses Local Municipality acknowledges that it usually does not possess sufficient information regarding to migration patterns. According to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Development Plan (2013/14:142) one of the strategies adopted by the municipality was to conduct a research which would ensure that accurate and reliable population data for proper planning was developed. This confirms that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning and decision making was not informed by accurate and reliable population dynamics data.

The research further responds to recommendations made by researchers such as Cross *et al.* (2006:288) and Landau *et al.* (2011:51) that an ongoing research to enhance the understanding and management of migration issues and problems as experienced by municipalities should be conducted. This research was therefore undertaken to envestigate effects of migration on municipal planning it the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

1.5 AIM OF THE RESEARCH

The aim of the research was to investigate the effects ofmigration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

1.6 OBJECTIVES OF THE RESEARCH

From the problem statement of the research stated above (see Section 1.2) objectives of the research can be formulated which are closely interlinked with the research topic and which constitute the chapters of the research. In order to address the stated problem statement and the aim of the study as defined in section 1.5 above the objectives of this research are to:

Objective 1: Examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Objective 2: Analyse how priorities and decisons are made with regard to resource allocation in Greater Tubatse Local Municipal planning.

Objective 3: Describe the effects of migration on municipalplanning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality**.**
Objective 4: Recommend effective ways in which the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality can factor in the migration in its planning processes.

1.7 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Theproblem statement clearly shows that the failure of municipalities to proactively address migration and other forms of human mobility couldyield undesired consequences. This shows the need to investigate the influence of migration on municipal planning so as to address those challenges. The following were identified research questions as raised in this research to address the above problem statement:

(1) What are the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

(2) How are priorities and decisions made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipal planning?

(3) How does migration affect planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

(4) How can migration be effectively factored in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning processes?

1.8 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH

The research investigates the inclusion of migration in the municipal Integrated Development Plans in order to ensure that municipal services are provided in an effective, efficient and sustainable manner. Chapter 5 of the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000) enjoins municipalities to undertake developmenatally-oriented plannining that strives to achieve the objects of local government set out in section 152 of the Constitution of 1996, gives effects to their developmental duties as required by section 153 of the Constitution of 1996 and together with other organs of state contributes to the realisation of the fundamental rights contained in sections 24,25,26,27 and 29 of the Constitution. The rights, as alluded to in the Constitution, are for every citizen of the country and are extended to migrants.Similarly The White Paper on Local Government (1998) requires municipalities to develop strategies for spatial integration, while managing the continuing consequences of rapid urbanisation and service backlogs. This is intended to ensure that the past imbalances of resource allocation and skewed development as experienced during the Apartheid era are redressed. Poor or lacking consideration of migrants flocking into the Greater Tubatse Local Municipalitycan often result in overstretching of municipal resources and serve as a point where service problems such as protests and crime may be on the increase. In a case where these migration plans are not considered within the municipal planning process, anarchy could prevail.

1.9 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH

For researchers to realise aim and objectives of their researches they must choose research designs depending on the nature of their research problems.Equally research methodologies to be employed in those researches must be relevant to the chosen research designs.

1.9.1 Research design

As with all research endeavours, choosing the method that is best suited to the line of enquiry is vital to obtaining the desired results. A judicious choice of method guides the researcher toward the intended aims and helps ensure that its products are useful and well received (Starks & Trinidad, 2007:1372). The research is therefore carried through a qualitative research method. Authors (Creswell, 2007, 2009, 2013; Edmonds & Kennedy, 2013; Grbich, 2013; Leedy,1993; Starks &Trinidad, 2007) generally agree that a qualitative research method is best suited for studies in which researchers want to understand and interpret how various participants in a social setting construct the world around them, to explore the "how" and "why" of systems and human behaviour patterns and what governs such human behaviour, to delve into questions of meaning and to examine institutional and social practices and processes, to identify barriers and facilitators to change, to discover the reasons for the success or failure of interventions and to assess the impact of policies on a population and evaluate service provision.

This research was primarily intended to be a descriptive investigation on the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Municipality. In this regard a phenomenological approach, which is one of the approaches of qualitative research, is used. According to Patton (2002), Morse and Richards (2002) and Creswell (2007, 2009, 2013) data in phenomenological research are collected from persons who have experience with phenomena under study so as to develop a composite description of what they experienced about the phenomena and how. Wilding and Whiteford (2005: 100) posit that phenomenological study has an essentially critical orientation. Critical

theory is interested in the ways people think and act and how social circumstances influence those thoughts and actions. It critiques the status quo with an intention to transform it. A phenomenological approach suited this research because it was primarily intended to critique the current posture of municipal planning as it excludes migration issues and patterns. Data collection methods employed in the research include semi-structured in-depth personal interviews and documentary analysis. A purposive sampling method was utilised in the selection of participants while data analysis was carried out following the steps espoused by Creswell (2013) which included bracketing of the researcher, transcribing and summarising of participant interviews, developing and coding meaningful units, developing themes and writing a composite description of the understanding of participants regarding to migration and municipal planning.

By using a phenomenological approach to examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and to analyse how priorities are set and how decisions are made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, the research explores the effects of migration on municipal planning. The insight developed from experiences of participants in the research will assist policy makers to develop practices and policies that will transform the *status quo* in which population dynamics is not considered in municipal planning and also help Public Administration scholars to develop a deeper understanding of municipal planning and migration management.

A comprehensive justification of the research design and methodology, data collection and data analysis are undertaken in chapter three of the research.

1.9.2 Study area

The study is on the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in the Limpopo Province which is located 150 km East of Polokwane City and forms part of the Bushveld Igneous Complex from Potgietersrus to Lydenburg. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has a huge mining development which makes it a major attraction for migrants.It is a

category B municipality under the Sekhukhune District Municipality in the Limpopo Province. It was established in 2000 through the amalgamation of the former Transitional Local Councils of Dilokong, Tubatse Steelpoort, Eastern Tubatse and the former peri-urban local councils of Steelpoort, Ohrigstad and Burgersfort.

It is characterised by dispersed, small and numerous rural settlements that are spread across the northern and the north-westernareas, which are historically part of the former Lebowa homelands where the African population was allowed to settle on a permanent basis. These settlements function as hinterlands or back-waters of Burgersfort, Steelpoort and Ohrigstad towns where there are employment opportunities and high order retail facilities. Burgersfort town has a strong pull on migrants because of its size and diverse activities; thus there is a link to a disproportionately high number of settlements in GTLM. Burgersfort town forms a focal point for traffic as various regional access roads converge at Burgersfort. Route 37 (between Polokwane and Nelspruit) and Provincial Route 555 (between Middelburg and Ohrigstad) intersect in Burgersfort (Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's 2007 Spatial Development Framework).

The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is endowed with mineral resources such as platinum, chrome, vanadium and andalusite and others. In the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality there are 30 mines, 15 of which are operational, 3 are in a project phase while the remaining ones are at a prospecting stage. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is identified as the economic growth point of both the Sekhukhune District Municipality and the Limpopo Province. This makes the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality a major attraction for job seekers leading to increasing immigration and urbanisation in this municipality.

The Greater Tubatse Local Muncipality's 2008-2011 IDP indicates that there are a number of housing developments that are planned on the northeast side of Burgersfort town which are a response to the recent growth of the mining sector. Burgersfort town is also starting to experience problems characteristic of growing urban areas, namely the growth of informal settlements, traffic congestion on certain road sections, rising land prices, declining capacity of bulk engineering infrastructure and others. It also seems

that the recent housing development is not matched by the required social facilities, such as schools and halls. Burgersfort town is among the fastest growing small towns in and around the Limpopo Province.

The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's 2013/14 Intergrated Development Plan indicates that the municipality comprises of 31 wards and approximately 343000 people. Itsgrowth points of projected population growth will be more than doubledover the period of 2005 to 2015. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's 2013/14 Intergrated Development Plan also identifies migration and immigration as general challenges affecting economic development in this municipality.

1.10   TERMINOLOGY

Authors and scholars use and interpret certain concepts differently to denote different meanings and purposes in Public Administration. There is no common agreement about the meaning of some words and phrases used in the research. It is therefore not the purpose of this research to anlyse concepts used in the domain of migration and municipal planning in Public Administraion. For the purpose of this research key concepts and terms used are defined to avoid uncertainty and ambiguity in their interpretation.

1.10.1Migration

Different researchers define and interpret migration differently. The different definitions and interpretations are informed by the message a particular researcher wants to deliver at a particular stage in relation to their research purpose. Different definitions and interpretation of migration by various researchers are given below.

By and largeDaw (2012), Segatti and Landau (2011), Pearce (2010) and Boyle, Robinson and Halfacree (1998) agree on the definition, the causes, the patterns and the impact of migration to the destination and sending areas. Boyle et al. (1998:34) define

migration as the movement of a person (a migrant) between two places for a certain period of time. Furthermore migration is usually defined spatially as a movement across the boundary of an areal unit; where a boundary within a country is crossed, it is described as internal migration. Polzer (2010) argues that migration includes a movement between and within provinces and municipalities.

According to Daw (2012:92), migration is best defined in general terms as the crossing of a spatial boundary by one or more persons involved in a change of residence. Migration is defined as the movement of persons who changed their usual place of residence from one country to another (international migration) or from one magisterial district to another. International migration consists of immigration, which involves a move into a country, and emigration, which indicates migratory moves out of a country to another. Internal migration can entail either in-migration, which refers to moves into a specific part of the country from another part of the same country, or out-migration which indicates moves from a particular place to another. Reeds (2012) identifies types of migration as rural-rural migration, rural-urban migration, urban-rural migration and urban-urban migration.

From the definitions above it can be concluded that migration is defined in both temporal and spatial terms. The latter are regardless of the distance travelled and the area of origin. Those who move either in- or outside the borders of a particular country are referred to as international migrants. The movement of people out of a country is considered to be emigration and that into a country is immigration. Though Boyle *et al.*(1998) only indicated the issue of period of time without expanding on that period, it is assumed that a migrant will be different from a visitor or a tourist who may come to a particular place or country for a shorter period that will often be less than a month.

According to Jackson (1986), migration implies movement of individuals and groups between two societies: the one, which they have left and the one to which they have come. The process is usually achieved by physical movement and consequent change of residence and other circumstances. Migration is the movement, temporarily or

permanently, from one physical location to another of a population. Temporary migration implies that the place of permanent residence is maintained while the migrant is away for a period of time to work in another country or another part of the country. Such migration may occur on a regular or seasonal basis as with transhumance or harvest migration or migration with flocks or herds of reindeer. Permanent migration implies a clear change of residence based on a decision to move. Clearly there may be some indeterminacy between these two categories and in many instances temporary migrants may end up as permanent. Internal migration involves moves within a country or prescribed area. Normally it does not involve formal controls at border points but it does imply a move across administrative boundaries.International migration is a movement that involves individuals or families moving across national boundaries to establish themselves in a different country.

Stillwell and Congdon (1991) say that migration involves a change of usual residence by a person, family or household. The concept of migration is inherently geographical because a change of residence necessitates movement from one location to another. The geographical interaction may occur over a veryshort distance (for example, to a different residence in the same apartment block) or across much longer distances (for example, between continents).There are, however, situations in which it becomes difficult to decide what constitutes a migration. These circumstances are commonly associated with vagrants or persons of no fixed abode, temporary workers, employed perhaps on a seasonal basis or short-term contracts, or students of higher education who move back and forth between parental home and college or university three or four times a year. Another anomaly is presented by those who own more than one property and who move from one home to another on a regular or random basis. These examples demonstrate that in order to measure migration it may be necessary to sharpen the definition by including a temporal dimension to distinguish permanent changes of dwelling place from temporary changes of address.

The two researchers agree that migration is a physical movement which involves change of residence by an individual and groups like a family or household. They also

agree that migration may be temporary or permanent, regular or seasonal and internal or international. Smit (1998) adds another terminology to migration by defining the movement of people from rural to urban and back to rural areas as *circular* migration.

The essence of this research is to define the meaning ofmigration in the context of its effects on municipal planning. Therefore, for the sake of this research, migration is defined as a movement of people either individually or as group from a particular place to another, either within or without the borders of a country for a particular period, either permanently or temporarily. The definition includes people who move regularly or seasonally to and fro their places of origin and also the caseof circular migrants and those who have two or more residential places referred to as bi-local migrants.

1.10.2 Municipal planning

According to de Visser (2011:15), municipal planning refers to integrated development planning, the spatial development framework and the control and regulation of land use if the nature, scale and intensity (sic) of the land do not affect the provincial planning mandate of the provincial government or the national interest. This author also says that - amongst other things - the municipality must include in its planning, its population growth estimates, housing demands estimates and engineering infrastructure requirements for existing and future development needs.

1.10.3 Integrated Development Plan

The Integrated Development Plan is defined as a single, inclusive and strategic plan for the development of the municipality, which, amongst others, links, integrates, co-ordinates, plans and aligns the resources and capacity of the municipality with the implementation of the plan and informs the policy framework and general basis on which annual budget must be based (Local Government: Municipal Systems Act, No 32 of 2000).

1.11   ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The researcher ensured that permission was obtained from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipal officials before the research has beenconducted (Refer to ANNEXURE E: Permission letter from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality). Participants' consent to participate in the interviews was also sought after they were thoroughly and truthfully informed about the purpose of the research, that they had the rights to withdraw from the interview at any time and that they were protected against any manipulation (Refer to ANNEXURE F: Interview Consent Form).They were equally informed that their identity would remain anonymous as pseudonyms would be used instead. They were also informed that the interviews would be tape recorded only with their permission. The participants were made to sign a consent form to confirm their consent to the interviews.

1.12   OVERVIEW OF CHAPTERS

The findings in this research are presented as a research report in a research dissertation format as follows:

Chapter 1: Introduction and Background

This chapter introduces to and gives background of the research; it exposes the research problem statement, the aim and objectives of the study, research question and definition of concepts and outlines chapters of the research.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

This chapter presents a review of literature which is done to identify key theories and concepts regarding the topic and the major issues and problems relating to the effects of migration on municipal planning. The literature review is intended to convince readers that this research is original, well formulated and grounded in an existing body of knowledge. The chapter considered two key focus areas namely understanding a

literature review concpt as well as consideration of ideas and discussions as advanced by scholars in the field of migration (population studies) and municipal planning.

Chapter 3: Research Methodology and Design

The chapter presents a discussion of the methodology utilised in the research and an overall definition of research design and research methodology and how the two inter-relate. A detailed description of methods as well as the researcher's justification for employing such methods is also included in this chapter. Specific attention is also given to the role of the researcher, sampling procedures, data collection and data analysis.

Chapter 4: Findings, Analysis and Interpretation of Data

The chapter presentsthe full account of how data were analysed. It outlinesthe steps followed in data analyisis and itindicates how the researcher bracketed himself. It also describeshow the transcription of interviews was done, how data was broken down into smaller meaningful units, how the units were combined into themes that address the research questions and finally how a synthesis of meaning and essences of the experiences of the participants regarding the phenomena under investigation was provided.

Chapter 5: Conclusion and Recommendations

The chapter summarises the research, indicates how the findings of the research agree or differ from those in the literature review, assesses how the aim and objectives of the research have been realised, identifies the limitations of the research, provides recommendations on the basis of the findings and suggests future research areas that can be explored.

1.13 CONCLUSION

Municipal planning is not complete if it fails to consider migration as one of the critical phenomena of population dynamics. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996 and other pieces of legislation enjoin municipalities to include migration in their Integrated Development Plans. As highlighted in the background and problem statement for the research above (refer to sections 1.2 and 1.3 respectively) the exclusion of migration in municipal planning results in many challenges in municipalities,*inter alia* misalignment and stretching of municipal resources, skewed development, unsustainable service delivery, community conflicts, proliferation of informal settlements and violent protests. This chapter sought to introduce the discussion of the research in order to investigate the effects of migration on municipal planning.

Chapter two of the research will consider a literature review.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

In chapter one, the focus was on introducing the background of the research. In that regard, chapter one undertook to provide an overview of the manner in which this research has conceptualised the problem of migration and municipal planning. In this chapter, a literature review is done to help to identify key theories and concepts regarding the topic and the major issues and problems relating to the effects of migration on municipal planning. Literature review helps to critique and integrate ideas and theories from multiple sources. It is intended to convince readers that this work is original, well formulated and grounded in a body of knowledge. Below is the composite literature review of the study. Though this chapter is dedicated to a literature review, it must be indicated that this is a roundabout processes; hence every chapter in this research deals with the literature to confirm or disprove certain sentiments or conclusions. Two key focus areas are considered in this chapter, namely, understanding a literature review concept as well as the actual consideration of ideas and discussions as advanced by scholars in the field of migration (population studies) and municipal planning.

2.2 UNDERSTANDING LITERATURE REVIEW

According to Fink (2014), a literature review is a systematic, explicit, and a reproducible method for identifying, evaluating and synthesizing the existing body of completed and recorded work produced by researchers, scholars, and practitioners. It synthesizes past knowledge on a topic or domain of interest, identifies important biases and knowledge gaps in the literature and proposes corresponding future research directions (Rowe, 2014).

Booth, Papaioannou and Sutton (2012:7) highlight atleast seven purposes for a literature review as follows: (1) to place each work in the context of how it contributes to an understanding of the subject under review, (2) to describe how each work relates to the others under consideration, (3) to identify new ways, (4) to interpret, and set light on

gaps in previous research, (5) to identify what has been covered by scholars previously to prevent the researcher from needlessly duplicating their effort, (6) to signpost the way forward for further research, and (7) to locate the researcher's original work within the existing literature.

2.3 LITERATURE REVIEW ON MIGRATION AND MUNICIPAL PLANNING

The literature review in this research sought to establish whether previous research has been undertaken with regard to the research problem in this research; it also reflects on the consistency of findings, the agreement - or lack of it - with different researchers and the existing gaps or flaws in previous studies which could be addressed in this research. According to Atkinson and Marais (in Tomlinson & Pillay, 2006) there is a need for studies of migration in Public Administration because changing migration flows and patterns of population settlements have become matters of interest to most of the nations in the world. These researchers further argue that these concerns translate into a series of broad empirical as well as policy questions that must be addressed through research.

Though Polzer (2010) argues that there has been very little academic study of the impact of local government policies on migration or of the effect of migration on public service provision at local level, he concedes that this is changing as several metropolitan municipalities have been developing independent municipal policies related to migration and refugees recently. Studies by Blaser and Landau (2014) and Mathoho (2012) in investigating a similar research problem show that several gaps in knowledge exist; hence they recommend further studies to close those gaps. Amongst the limitations identified in those studies are limited time in conducting their studies; also, the identified participants could not conclusively be the only ones affected by their studies; they also mention access and cooperation challenges with participants, the type of study areas (which may not conclusively represent all municipalities) and the research methods they employed (which may not be the only ones to study the research problem). Polzer (2010) concedes that because of limitations, most studies cannot provide empirical analysis of the concrete resource implications of different kinds

of migration. More in-depth follow-on studies analysing municipal budgets, municipal and line agency staff practices and the level of community service provision are needed. Some researchers (Landau *et al.*, 2011:51; Cross *et al.*, 2006:288) also argue that ongoing research of migration and its management should be undertakento enhance its understanding.This is because migration is a dynamic phenomenon and therefore no single study can be all-conclusive about it. Furthermore, empirical evidence as supported by a number of migration conferences and roundtable debates for example, the 37th Southern African Development Countries Parliamentarry Conference roundtable discussions about migration and development held on the 06th July 2015 in Durban, Ethekwini Metropolitan Municipality, Kwazulu Natal province, confirms that continuous research still needs to be undertaken with regard to migration.

The aforementioned studies and the literature review below confirm that this research is part of the broader scholarly inquiry. The research investigates the effects of migration on municipal planning.

2.4 MIGRATION AND MUNICIPAL PLANNING IN SOUTH AFRICA

The state of migration and its management in South Africa cannot be understood outside its historical context. Though migration is as old as the human race itself, for the purposes of this research the review of literature will be limited to migration trends since the apartheid era in South Africa. The historical background is important to give the basis on which the current state of migration is formed and to compare and to contrast migration management systems in South Africa as it happened under apartheid and in the post-apartheid era. A comparative analysis between the state of migration during the aparthied era and in the new democratic depensation is important for this research. This will help to assess whether there are improvements with regard to migration management policies and strategies, the attitude of both members of community and government officials towards migrants and the extent to which migration is considered in municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

2.4.1 Migration and municipal planning prior 1994

Bekker (2006) and Klotz (2013) indicate that even before the apartheid system was introduced in 1948, South Africa was a divided nation based on racial lines and that policy makers had wrestled with persistent issues of labour supply, urbanization, and social unrest. These authors also show that the fear of the growing Indian population led to regulation of population flows across internal provincial borders, discriminatory municipal regulations that kept Asians within urban locations and efforts to control the physical and social mobility of Africans. The authors furthermore indicate that the government passed discriminatory laws like Mines and Works Act (Act No. 12 of 1911) which propagated job reservations protecting white labour or theNatives Land Act (Act no. 27 of 1913) which restricted Africans to communal land tenure and legal residence only in the reserves, turning them into migrants.

The apartheid government that came into being in 1948 aggravated the level of segregation that was already there. The Apartheid policies and legislative measures which were enacted were not only anti-migration but anti-social integration and also perpetuated differentiated services in terms of racial lines. Included were the Prohibition of Mixed Marriages Act (Act 55 of 1949) forbidding marriages between white and non-whites, the Population Registration Act (Act No. 30 of 1950), which separated the population of South Africa into different races, the Reservation of Separation of Amenities Act (Act No 49 of 1953) which legalised racial segregation of public premises, vehicles and services (excluding only public roads and streets) and implied that facilities for different races did not need to be equal, the Group Areas Act (Act No.41 of 1950), which divided the urban areas according to racial groups and criminalised ownership of land in an area designated for a particular racial group, leading to differential spatial planning. These policies resulted in communities and their diverse culture being torn apart, differential spatial planning, widening the development gap between whites and non-whites, and trampling people's dignity by not allowing the most basic human rights.The Group Areas Act restricted the permanent presence of Africans in urban areas through the pass system, and reserved a viable municipal

revenue base for white areas by separating townships and industrial and commercial development (The White Paper on Local Government, 1998: section A.1).

Mathoho (2012) indicates that the Native (Black) Urban Areas Act (Act. No.21 of 1923) and the Group Areas Act (Act. No 41 of 1950) were vehicles to severely restrict mobility of the Black South African population and resulted in skewed development which is today the source of internal migration (urbanisation). Klotz (2013) adds that regulations and procedures were put in place to manage movement of blacks in South Africa; it was called *influx control*, which controlled internal migration.

The author, however, argues that theapartheid government policy of migration control was not without challenges,among others due to the following reasons: (1) money was needed to implement theapartheid migration control policy which led to expansion of bureaucracy, (2) the expansion of industrialisation in the 1930s brought a demand for additional mine workers which forced the government to relax its migration policy by allowing male workers to bring their families into urban areas which led to expanding and reinforcing permanent urban settlement, (3) the central government, which was responsible for manageing migrants and for providingtemporary housing for Africans, faced the challenge of a lack of funds and administrative capacity; so it transferred functions to municipalities which were not equipped with urban administration and lacked in resources and migration data.

During the apartheid era both international and internal migration wasstrictly controlled. The policy of apartheid entrenched separate development, which was maintained through the introduction of various policies that limited social integration, perpetuated economic exclusion and un-equal distribution of government resources and which was biased towards white residents while scant regard was given to the needs of the rural majority (The White Paper on Local Government, 1998). The White Paper further shows thatapartheid resulted in differential spatial development, skewed development, a politically instable society, a weaker state (politically and morally in the eyes of citizens and of the international world). This document further states that theapartheid system was not sustainable, because it needed a lot of financial and administrative capacity to control both internal and cross border migrants and endemic protests, which both the

23

central government and local authorities did not have. This led to the demise of apartheid goevenment in 1994 and the coming into being of the new democratic dispensation. Cross (in Kok, Gelderblom, Oucho & Van Zyl, 2006) argues that the attempts by the apartheid government to put legal and administrative barriers to stop migration from rural to urban areas failed and the government was forced to abolish such barriers in 1986.

Bekker (2006) argues that during the entire second half of the twentieth century, the South African society has been conceptualised spatially in dualistic terms. Communities were classified as either urban (implying densely settled, and until very recently falling under the jurisdiction of urban municipal authorities) or rural (implying sparsely settled, and until very recently falling under the jurisdiction of other local authorities, higher state authorities or traditional authorities)

2.4.2 Migration and municipal planning post 1994

The state of migration and municipal planning in South Africa since the new dispensation in 1994 and in particular from 2000 when the new local government system was established has changed significantly. Bekker (2006) posits that since the shedding of apartheid ideology in 1994 and the establishment of a new democratic South Africa which heralded freedom of movement within the country for all citizens, migration flows have become more complicated. According to Cross (in Kok *et al.*, 2006), since the democratic elections of 1994, planning efforts to deliver housing and services to the arriving poor have been stepped up, and have become one of the central projects of the new government. This was basically because since 1994 new legislative frameworks governing migration and municipal planning have been introduced. The new legislative frameworks which include the Constitution of 1996 bestow rights and entitlements to migrants and explain how migrants should be protected and integrated in the South African society. This is also in keeping with the agreements of international organisations, protocols, conventions and treaties which South Africa has signed and has become a member of since her acceptance to the world after the fall of Apartheid. The researcher further emphasises that the vision was one of a successful urban transformation in South Africa which would result in a socio-demographic transformation

in which cities would be able to provide successfully for all the country's citizens, including migrants. Turok (2012) however has a different view. This scholar argues that the post-1994 government adopted an even-handed approach in treating migration in that it did not have an explicit policy either to support or to discourage migration because of its sensivity and perceived negative effects to both sending and receiving areas and therefore little has been done positively to overcome the legacy of segreagation within urban areas. The scholar furthermore argues that the South African pursuit of economic investment in cities is not as vigorous as in many other countries.The ambiguity of the South African government towards urbanisation translates into a reactive, indifferent and sometimes hostile approach towards informal settlements and backyard shacks that come as the result of migration and that there is no consistent national policy in the country for planning and managing the present and significant process of urbanisation.

The new dispensation heralded an influx of immigrants (international or cross border migrants) into South Africa and opened a floodgate for internal migration (rural-urban migration or what is called urbanisation. According to Crush, Peberdy and Williams (2005), the end of Apartheid produced new opportunities for internal and cross-border mobilityand new incentives for moving, subsequently bringing a major increase in legal and undocumented cross-border flows and new forms of mobility. Similarly, Lokogo (in Cross, Gelderblom, Mafukidze & Roux, 2006:207) agrees and argues that since the end of apartheid in South Africa in 1994 and the country's re-entry into the international scene, characterised by the opening up of its borders, the number of immigrants from the rest of the continent has increased. Bekker (2006) also argues that rural households in South Africa, since the beginning of democracy, have been forced to abandon the collapsing land economy, in which they live and move on toward the developed cash economy and that the people who remain in the rural areas are typically the old and the poor, those whose rural assets are important to them or those who do not have the urban experience and contacts or resources needed to mobilise a move to a more advantaged area. Furthermore, this scholar argues that though there is rural-urban migration, it appears that shifts from rural areas to other rural areas are even more

massive. One result of this process is the intense competition over land in areas that are densifying.

The 2014 Habitat III National Report of the Republic of South Africa supports the arguments above by indicating that since the end of apartheid, there have been significant shifts in South Africa's space economy, with corresponding flows of households and individual migration between urban centres as people have looked for new opportunities and access to urban services. Accordingly, there have been high growth rates of population in the country's major towns and cities as a result of rural-urban migration, household splitting and natural population growth.There is, however, another emerging trend which is the growth taking place in smaller towns, at times putting a strain on the provision of housing, sanitation and other services, due to insufficient resources to plan for, and accommodate this growth. This reality makes overcoming the services backlog in urbanising areas a 'moving target'.

Mathoho (2012) compliments the above mentioned researchers and indicates that in contrast to the apartheid influx control policies, today internal mobility is not monitored and regulated and authorities are not obliged to register the movement of people.

According to Kok and Collinson (2006), the legacy of apartheid in South Africa will linger on for some decades in that the inequalities of the past, which advocated discriminatory migration and urbanisation controls, will not be driven out with the wave of a magic wand. Similarly Bekker (2006) indicates that the introduction of the constitutional provision of cooperative government in 1996 and of back-to-back local municipalities does not appear to have changed the basic spatial dualism in popular and planning discourses in South Africa. Atkinson and Marias (in Tomlinson & Pillay 2006) posit that a number of research reports have noted the lack of a post-apartheid framework for regional development at the provincial and the national levels and within line departments. According to these scholars, municipal IDPs, which were supposed to deal with discriminatory spatial issues, have neglected this in many instances and concentrated only on issues of infrastructure, poverty and job creation.

Some researchers discussed below argue that there is a lack of clarity about the role of municipalities in the South African migration legislative framework. Polzer (2010) and Mathoho (2012), for example, argue that migration is generally considered a competency ofthe national and provincial spheres of government; however, the local government sphere has a crucial role to play in migration management especially in ensuring effective provision of basic services. These scholars furthermore indicate that nothing much has been done at local government level to equip municipalities on how to deal with migration challenges. According to Atkinson and Marias (in Tomlinson & Pillay, 2006) many municipalities have little experience of issues related to rural-urban linkages and how todeal with macro-issues of urbanisation and migration.Furthermore, Crush *et al.* (2005), Landau *et al.* (2011) and Mpehle (2014) argue that there are challenges relating to interfacing and synchronising the migration pieces of legislation in different government spheres so as to develop an integrated approach to policy development and migration management. These scholars further argue that these migration policy gaps create confusion over the local government's role with regard to migration management, planning and provision of services. Similarly Atkinson and Marias (2006) add that government policies are important determinants of population distribution, and therefore affect migration and urban growth; however, they are not synchronised.The scholars argue that different spheres of government in South Africa develop priorities, strategies, rules and allocate resources which do not talk to one another though they all impact on spatial growth and migration.

Landau *et al.* (2011) posit that the aforementioned migration and spatial development policy gaps identified can be addressed as follows:

- Improved co-ordination of the three spheres of government towards a more effective management of migration.
- A national migration policy that promotes the country's goals for regional integration and countering poverty, for social justice and human rights.
- Clarifying the local government's mandate in relations to migration.

Mpehle (2014) recommends that the government should develop local government by-laws that specifically talk to accessing of basic services by migrants and refugees.

Kalitany and Visser (2010) also argue that the South African migration policy should be changed and that consideration should be given to the allocation of financial support to migrant entrepreneurs because they contribute positively to South Africa in employing and transfering skills to South Africans.

In support of these scholars (Crush *et al.*, 2005; Polzer, 2010; Kalitany & Visser, 2010; Landau*et al.*, 2011; Mathoho, 2012) who argue for more clarity with regard to migration policy andassigning additional responsibilitiesto municipalities in relation to migration management issues, Fau (2015) posits that the principle of institutional subsidiarity allows national and provincial governments to assign additional or new responsibilities to municipalities.According to this scholar the range of services provided by municipalities is not confined to the lists contained in Schedules 4B and 5B of the Constitution of 1996.There are, however, views that municipalities are already strangulated or overregulated and therefore they no longer need any further legislation or additional responsibilities. Steytler (2008), for example, argues that the local government has experienced a deluge of laws from the national government which stifles initiative on part of municipalities and affects delivering of services. This scholar further argues that complying with an elaborate legal framework carries a considerable price tag not affordable by all municipalities. Similarly,the late former Minister in the Presidency responsible for performance, monitoring and evaluation, Collins Chabane,reports that mayors and municipal managers raised among others the following in their meeting with President Jacob Zuma:(1) that onerous legal, regulatory and reporting requirements undermine council efficiency and do not necessarily improve service delivery and accountability and (2) imposition of further laws and regulations will make it difficult for municipalities to execute their functions (The Presidency, 2009). Furthermore, scholars such as Mpehle (2014) also posit that municipalities are already facing resources and capacity constraints and if they were to be given additional functions through legislation that would mean that the government would have to provide them with more resources and capacity building programmes. According to this scholar this will further aggravate the situation of this ailing sphere of government.

The requirement and legislative imperatives regarding co-operative governance within the three spheres of government in South Africa can reconcile the divergent suggestions of the researchers mentioned above. Landau *et al.*(2011) posit that local governments have been constitutionally empowered to be a leading force for development. Fau (2015) also indicates that the 2005 court judgement in the case of the*City of Cape Town & Others vs. Robertson & Others*has confirmed that the local government as the sphere closest to communities has been given extensive legicslative and executive powers and functions by the Constitution of 1996. As such municipalities can adopt and implement any measures that foster their their developmental mandate, provided such measures do not violate the Constitution and constitutionally-compliant legislation. Furthermore, the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 closes the gaps identified by scholars above regarding the lack of clarity and synergy on migration management policies and programmes between the three spheres of government in the sense that it obliges all spheres of government 1) to co-operate, assist and support one another, 2) to consult one another on matters of common interest and 3) to co-ordinate their actions and legislation with one another. If the three spheres of government comply with the requirements of the Constitution of 1996 and co-ordinate their actions, *in mutual trust, good faith and through fostering friendly relations,* the legislative conundrum regarding migration management will be managed.

2.4.3 Causes of migration

One of the objectives as indicated in chapter one (see Section 1.6) of this research report is to examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.Kaya (2015:71) argues that migration has always drawn the attention of scholars and in the centre of this attention lie the factors causing migration and the outcomes of this phenomenon. This scholar (and others who are discussed below) confirms that migration is a world-wide multi-causal phenomenon which has both social and historical dimensions. Pearce (2010:197), for example, posits that the people of the world are on the move.In this sense this scholar confirms the two migrationreports, namely The Human Development Report of 2009 and The International Migration Report of 2011. According to the Human Development Report (2009), the overwhelming

29

majority of people who move, do so inside their own country. This report further estimates that 740 million people are internal migrants, which is four times as many as international migration. According to United Nations, Department of Economics and Social Welfare, Population Division (2011) international migration is a growing phenomenon both in scope and in complexity affecting virtually all countries of the world. This organisation estimates the number of international migrants to be 214 million, representing 3.1% of the world population and an increase of 58 million since 1990.

According to Kok and Collinson (2006), causes of migration are theoretically complex, multilevel in nature, difficult to determine and not easily generalisable. People move from their areas of origin to areas of destination for different reasons. Though researchers differ on areas of emphasis for particular reasons for migration, they agree that migration is due to either 'push' or 'pull' factors. Push factors are those reasons in the areas of origin that compel people to leave their places of origin while pull factors are the conditions in the destination areas that entice people to move into those areas. Lokogo (in Cross *et al.*, 2006) says the following with regard to 'pull' and 'push' factors:

> *With regard to push factors, the reasons for migrating are linked to the political, economic and social characteristics obtaining in the country of origin. The situations in those countries are that the state is weak and unable to provide social needs like health care, education, public infrastructure like roads. The country suffers from constrains such as ethnic or religious conflicts, economic factors like inflation, unemployment, corruption, environmental disasters such as floods and earthquakes. With regard to pull factors, migrants choose areas of destinations because of their strong and diversified economy, strong social infrastructure like education and health, their political standing as a democratic states and strong political personalities like Nelson Mandela, Desmond Tutu and others.*

According to Crush *et al.* (2005), while people migrate as a result of civil strife in their countries, the growing rural and urban poverty as well as unemployment have pushed more people out of households in search of a livelihood. Kok, Gelderblom, Oucho and Van Zyl (2006:188) agree that employment opportunity is the reason most frequently

cited by internal migrants for choosing a specific destination in South Africa. They further state that while housing played a major role, education and training opportunities together with fastest growing economy feature as reasons for moving to a specific destination. According to Kaya (2015), one of the leading causes of migration is unemployment, followed by economic insufficiency, socio-cultural factors where people move due to marriages, looking for better education and health facilities.

Mabogunje (1970) argues that rural-urban migration is due to greater integration of rural economy into national economy, improvement in transportation and communication links, a wide range of governmental legislations or official policies, greater social and cultural integration of rural and urban areas such that levels of expectations in both areas begin to converge towards a recognizable national norm of what 'the good life' is. Accordingly, Bekker (2006) indicates that rural-urban migration is primarily in search of income and jobs while at secondary level households move in search of superior infrastructure, land and improved housing, water and sanitation, electricity, and better transport as well as better school and health facilities. Miheretu (2011:15), who studied causes and consequences of rural-urban migration in Woldiya town in North Ethiopia,similarly highlights that there are many factors that cause rural-urban migration, such as urban job opportunities, housing conditions and better income opportunities, among others. The researcher further argues that urban areas also offer a chance to enjoy a better lifestyle. The provision of services such as electricity, piped water supply, an improved transport system and public services makes urban areas attractive. Furthermore rural inhabitants see and hear success stories about people that leave their community and move to cities, which also act as incentives for out-migration.

Migration is often seen as the consequence of ruptures of environmental disaster, economic exploitation or political or civil tensions and violence (Kok & Collinson, 2006). Wentzel, Viljoen and Kok (2006) indicate that causes of migration include economic factors like poor economic conditions in their areas, which result in unemployment, low wages, expensive consumer goods, low value of local currencies, political factors like wars, marginalisation of minority ethnic groups and environmental factors like drought. Koser (2007) adds and indicates that migration is inextricably linked with other important

global issues, including development, poverty and human rights. Pendleton (2008) posits that the decision to migrate is often influenced by multiple factors namely, economy, family concerns, living conditions and access to schooling, amongst others. In case of rural-rural migration the scholar highlights that most of those moves are influenced by family issues such as marriage, divorce and access to schooling while rural-urban migration is often due to economic reasons like employment, better living conditions, access to schooling, health care facilities and security and to environmental issues. In relation to migration in the South African context the scholarargues that internal migration in the form of rural-urban (urbanisation) will continue and increase as will cross-border migration.

Pearce (2010) argues that most migrants today are not fleeing poverty so much as seeking wealth. This view is supported bythe Human Development Report (2009) which highlights that apart from forced migration, studies show that migrants move on their own volition to better-off places. According to Pearce (2010) and Segatti and Landau (2011), multiple factors influence the decision to migrate, namelyenvironmental factors (where refugees are fleeing local overpopulation or environmental degradation), economic factors (where migrants are looking to better themselves and their families' future) and socio-cultural factors (where migration is due marriage reasons, people looking for better living conditions and services like housing, education and health facilties, among others). Tlabela, Viljoen and Adams (1995) write about the importance and implications of historical factors causing and inhibiting past migration in South Africa; they also posit that when investigating the history of migration in South Africa, political, economic and social issues in particular stand out. They say, for example, that among others, migration in South Africa has been due to government-induced resettlements and farm evictions resulting from racial segregation based policies, to mining and industrialisation, which continue to be significant factors driving internal and international migration trends and to social networks. Most illegal immigrants in South Africa are running away from perilous political and economic conditions with the hope of improving their situation across the borders (Masiloane, 2010). Similarly,Chidi (2010) higlights that the majority of people, who relocate to urban areas, leave their areas as the result of rural poverty, unemployment, isolation and lack of services in rural areas,

and that people move to urban areas with high hopes and expectations that their lives would get better because they are close to socio-economic opportunities and social services.

A study by Mpehle (2014) also agrees to the arguments discussed above that the inflow of asylum seekers from neighbouring countries and other African countries in South Africa is mainly caused by civil wars, unemployment, political and economic instability and life threatening situations also known as push factors. The National Planning Commission (2012) says that South Africa needs to adopt a much more progressive migration policy in relation to skilled as well as unskilled migrants, and should plan better for rapid urbanisation. This can be done if there is sufficient data on the movement of people within the country and those entering the country. In addition to the causes of migration discussed above, Bakewell (2009:21) posits that technological development also enhances migration. This scholar, for example, highlights that because of the improved forms of transport like air travel and the decreased rail travel costs, a wider range of people move to more destinatinations over longer distances. Furthermore, the development of information technology means migrants can view the beaming images of their area of destination and can - through mobile phones - link easily with others and share information about various areas of interest.

The studies discussed above agree that there are a multitude of potential reasons for both internal and foreign migration. Amongst others, migration is due to economic, political, socio-cultural and environmental factors. Furthermore, the studies above highlight that migration can be forced, in the sense that it is a result of reasons beyond the migrants' control or volition (in a sense that migrants just decide on their own to move to better–off places).

2.4.4 Effects of migration on planning within municipal environment

Subsequent to causes of migration, studies further confirm that migration affects planning within the municipal environment. Studies (Cohen, 2006; Mvuyana, 2010; Polzer, 2010) show that migration poses potential burdens and significant opportunities to municipalities. This is because with growing migration, municipalities (cities) are

confronted with a greater demand for services, which must be provided for in municipal planning. Cities get increasingly crowded by the intensive waves of internal migration, urban planningfalls behind internal migration and a nonstandard structuring is formed (Kaya, 2015:75). In this respect Daw (2012) argues that policy makers should take into consideration additional demands due to migration when allocating resources for the provision of infrastructure and social services, so as to maintain and improve the standard of living of residents and avoid social unrest.

In investigating the effects of migration on municipal planning as a research problem for this research, several studies were considered. Blaser and Landau (2014), for example, consider tools which could be used to evaluate municipalities' responsiveness with regard to migration management. They outline the following as indicators to measure success of municipalities in responding to migration patterns:

- Perceptions and attitudes among municipal officials regarding human mobility (migration) and their ability and responsibility for addressing its varied forms.
- Data collection and management systems of population dymanics within municipal localities.
- Municipalities' budgeting system's responsiveness to demographic change
- Popular engagement and participatory mechanisms used by municipalities during community needs identification, prioritisation and decision making.
- The inclusion of 'migrant interest' in political and bureaucratic accountability and incentives
- The degree to which approaches to human security and social cohesion appropriately consider human mobility.

According to Crush *et al.* (2005), indicators of effective and efficient migration policy making include municipal programmes and strategies to alleviate poverty and reduce inequalities.Also, Pearce's (2010) work is useful in this research because he considers migration in the context of how people's perceptions, attitudes, convictions and beliefs inform their conduct and decision making.The scholar argues that mistaken ideas create mistaken policies. Accordingly, the way migration is addressed in municipal

planning is informed by the perceptions, attitudes, convictions and beliefs of decision makers and planners.

Some researchers (Bakewell, 2009; Freementle & Misago, 2014; Landau *et al.,* 2011; Mpehle 2014) agree that migrants are commonly perceived as a threat competing for access to already limited resources. Within the South African context these researchers agree that the wide-spread anti-immigrant sentiment is shared by community members, municipal officials and politicians alike.These researchers furthermore argue that many people in South Africa, including some government officials, regard migrants as economic threat, who"steal" their jobs and women and they are the reasons behind social problems like crime and the spread of diseases like HIV/Aids. Migrants are viewed as a burden whose presence in South Africa is undesirable, illegitimate andneeds to be curbed. Researchers (Landau *et al.*, 2011; Mphehle, 2014), for example, argue that the internal socio-economic challenges heighten the perceptions that migrants place an immense burden on already scarce resources in South Africa and that since South Africa is struggling to meet the needs of its own people, it will struggle to allocate resources to foreigners in the country. The study of the socio-economic impact of illegal migrants (Zimbabweans) in the city of Polokwane by Sebola (2011) also reveals that many of respondents in the study argue that illegal immigrants are an economic burden to countries and are responsible for their failure to address their country's domestic problems. Furthermore, Sebola posits that the locals and the immigrants have negative attitudes towards each other and conflicts occur between them at various levels.The scholar highlights that competition for scarce resources features highly in such conflict agendas. Over the last decade, African immigrants have been met with and exposed to severe manifestations of hostility to their presence in South Africa (Kalitany & Visser, 2010). According to these researchers the hostile attitudes towards migrants strengthen and legitimise popular practises of xenophobic violence and help to explain the government's lack of action to address anti-foreign sentiments. These researchers argue that this position is in keeping with international studies that reveal that migration poses substantial economic costs and strains to the infrastructure in housing, education, transportation and on welfare providing institutions.

Daw (2012:92) highlights the following with regard to migration in South Africa: (1) migration often leads to increased demand for housing and education as well as health, sanitation, water, electricity, safety and security services at the point of destination, (2) migration may exacerbate pressure on available infrastructure and social services, especially in urban areas, (3) increased rural-urban migration encroaches on the natural environment, squatter settlements at the fringes of urban centres may deplete non-renewable resources and accelerate environmental degration, (4) policy makers should therefore take into consideration additional demands due to migration when allocating resources for the provision of infrastructure and social services so as to maintain and improve the standard of living of residents and avoid social unrests. Similarly Dastile (2013) argues that migrants, both legal and illegal are treated as criminals in South Africa and exposed to continuous abuse and sometimes violent treatment. In the same vein, Mvuyana (2010) posits that migration of people from rural to urban areas has not only created the need for urban social services such as education and health but has put pressure on the physical infrastructure such as housing, water and other social services. The large and rapid influx to urban areas in developing counties has not only created a new demand for urban social services, such as health and education, but has also placed greater strain on the physical infrastructure including housing, water and sanitation facilities, electricity and transportation systems. The more people move into an area the higher the need for accommodation which is often unavailable or expensive. People will later invade municipal land and build shacks, regardless of what of land was initially demarcated for. This results in the mushrooming of informal settlements and unending backlogs, which as a result, undermine municipal performance. Miheretu (2011) argues that an increasing number of people (due to rural-urban migration) certainly puts pressure on available and stagnant public utilities; for example health and education services have been particularly burdened with a huge demand by therise in squatter settlement in main urban centres, among others. Turok (2012:49-50) states the following as examples of the negative effects of migration:

The destination for many incoming migrants has been unauthorised or informal settlements, often on the outskirts of cities, which are, in most cases, overcrowded and lack essential services such as water, sanitation, electricity, refuse removal, schools and health clinics.

Shacks, in which migrants live, are often prone to environmental and health hazards such as fire, floods, diseases and water sources pollution and others.

Migration put excessive pressure on the government infrastructure, which results in water scarcity, energy shortages and overloaded sewage treatment facilities.

Migrants in most cases connect electricity and water illegally which results in failure of regional infrastructure networks.

It is clear from the studies discussed above that migrants are viewed negatively by some communities and authorities in the areas of destinations and that migration has effects on those areas. The distastefor migrants is indicative of how priorities are set and decisions are made with regard to resource allocation within the South African municipal planning environment.Landau *et al.* (2011), for example, state that while local officials have begun to recognise the benefits and risks of migration, many municipalities struggle to design innovative responses, partly because ofa belief held by many locals and national policy makers that migration is exclusively a matter of national policy concern.Opposed to the studies above,the Human Development Report (2009) reveals that fears about migrants taking the jobs or lowering the wages of local people, placing an unwelocome burden on local services or costing the tax payer money are generally exaggerated. According to this report migrants equally bring a benefit to communities they move to, for example in the form of rising levels of technical innovations. Though James, Romine and Zwanzig (1998), who studied the effects of immigration on urban communinities in US, warned that generalisation on migration isssues are dangerous because both immigrants and cities are extremely diserve,they also support that there is no convincing evidence to suggest that migration hurts locals by reducing job opportunities. These researchers argue that migrants rather create jobs,

stimulate manufacturing, construction and other industries, indirectly provide support services for office industries and foster entrepreuneurial activity through small-business ownership and development.Similarly Hammerstad (2012: 3) also argues that there is little doubt that migrants are adding to South Africa's economic vitality in many ways, including infusing the labour market with much needed skilled and motivated workers.

To plan, drive and monitor progress towards the integrated equitable development envisaged by the government, municipalities require readily available, accurate and up-to-date demographic data (Landau *et al*., 2011:15). Atkinson and Marias (in Tomlinson & Pillay, 2006:38), however, indicate that the paucity of government information about different types of migration becomes a real constraint in the design of policy. The researchers argue that the government does not know enough about the push and pull factors which characterise urbanisation, how many people are moving to different kinds of destinations, from where, for what reasons and what skills they have.Bakewell (2009) highlights the following with regard to migration data; (1) while there are relatively good data, both quantitative and qualitative, available on migration into many high income countries of the north, that is not the case with those of the south, (2) migration data are not collected in poorer countries, and when it is collected it can be of very poor quality, (3) even where reliable data are routinely collected,they are likely to significantly understate the scale of migration and (4) many of the cross-border movements within the south are undocumented.This supports the National Planning Commission (2012:102-103) which indicates that data on migration into and within South Africa is poorly collected, weakly analysed and often misleading. Data collection is difficult because many migrants live below the radar and move regularly between South Africa and their country of origin. At best, there are indicators for growth in international migration. Landau *et al.* (2011:7) argue that few municipalities can distinguish between domestic and foreign migration, permanent rural-urban migration and seasonal migration, or intra-city movements. Similarly Mathoho (2012) agrees with this argument and indicates that though municipalities have records of population within their jurisdictional areas, they do not have records for people who move in and out of their territories and for those who move from one place to the other within their territories.Because of the evident weaknesses in migration data collection, the Human

Development Report (2009) recommends that governments shouldset up or strengthen relevant institutions and mechanisms for data collection, data analysis, elaboration of policies, programmes and projects and their monitoring and evaluation.To achieve this, governments are called upon to improve skills and increase resources with a view to providing timely, reliable and disaggregated information on migration.

Planning and budgets do intersect (Huddleston, 2005). According to Sikrweqe (2013) the allocation of resources to implement the IDPs occurs through budgeting processes, because almost all resources have financial implications. The budget of the municipality, therefore, has to be informed by the strategies contained in the IDP. According to scholars such as Huddleston (2005) and Mpehle (2014), municipalities depend on limited resources to provide competing needs and services to the public. These scholars posit that policy makers and planners must therefore plan where such resources should be allocated so as to bring maximum benefits to their communities.These scholars futhermore argue that failure by governments to budget properly results in wastage of resource, service delivery challenges and dissatisfaction among citizens of the country.

According to the National Planning Commission (2012:14) movement into and within municipalities has got significant implication for planning, budgeting and provision of services to communities within those municipalities.Landau *et al.* (2011:1) argue that budgeting and municipal planning exercises have largely excluded extended population projections and insights into the relationships between mobility, livelihoods and community development- even as people continue to move into, out of and between cities. Furthermore, these scholars argue that population dynamics is rarely factored into the distribution of national resources by the National Treasury. Mpehle (2014) also argues that South Africa cannot cope with influx of refugees due to a lack of financial resources. Blaser and Landau (2014) claim that one reason municipalities fail to include migration in their budgets is because municipalities across the southern region have limited revenue raising mandate and depend on inter-governmental transfers. Furthermore, these scholars argue that municipalities struggle to mobilise resources needed to fulfil their service delivery, security and infrastructure development mandates.

The scholars also indicate that effective budgeting for human mobility requires strong assessment of economic and population trends, spatialised analysis of the implications of these trends for public expenditures and incentives and mechanisms for allocating national and local resources to meet current needs while preparing future residential patterns and economic strategies. Similarly Landau *et al.* (2011:92) argue that municipalities find it difficult to cope with the expenditure pressure of migration. The scholars further argue that migration should be factored in municipal policy planning and budget process as the exclusion of migration in those processes results in misalignment and stretching of the little resources municipalities. However, Landau (in Gelderboom, Mafukidze & Roux, 2006:226) indicates that budgetary and planning cycles make it difficult for municipalities to prepare for populations that might arrive (or disappear) and that, due to political expediency, politicians will unlikely dedicate resources to something that does not show short term gains. The National Planning Commission (2012:98), however, indicates that if policy interventions are informed by current and projected demographic profiles then programmes to improve health, education and skills can be properly targeted, and the appropriate services and infrastructure can be provided. According to this Commission, ignorance of demographic trends can result in a serious misallocation of resources and inappropriate interventions. The commission further argues that planning for demographic changes is important, especially in the face of growing pressure on food, energy and water supplies, greater population mobility, additional demands for jobs and social support and the uncertain effects of climate change.

2.4.5 Migration and public participation within municipal environment

Scholars (Blaser & Landau, 2014; Guwa, 2008; Hofisi, 2014; Khobe, 2012; Landau et al.,2011; Mpehle, 2010, Netswera & Phago, 2013; Phago, 2008; Sikrweqe, 2013) agree that participation of community members in governance matters and decision making is a right and constitutional imperative that must be observed by all organs of state. Phago (2008), for example, argues that community members in democratic countries such as South Africa must participate in government matters because the government is elected to improve the general wellbeing of the peopleand, therefore, is required to ensure that

the most pressing needs of the people are prioritised. When it comes to participatory instruments in a South African context, history suggests that previously communities were able to mobilise themselves much more vigorously for purposes of influencing the public discourse and agenda (Netswera & Phago, 2013:28).Furthermore Netswera and Phago (2013) argue that the fact that public participation is prescribed and legislated in terms of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) and subsequent governmental policies, such as the Municipal Structures Act (Act117 of 1998) and the Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000), among others, is an indication that public participation is regarded to be of critical importance in the contemporary South Africa.

Drawing experience from the 2006 Constitutional court rulingin the case of Matatiele Municipality and Others vs the President of the Republic of South Africa and Others,which declared the removal of the Matatiele Municipality from the KwaZulu-Natal Province unconstitutional and invalid because the Province failed to conduct public participation as required by the Constitution before taking such decision, de Visser (2011) highlights that this Constitutional Court ruling signifies that courts in South Africa can review municipal decisions, policies and by-laws and render them invalid and unconstitutional if municipalities failed to comply with public participation requirements.Similarly, from the Port Elizabeth High Court judgement in theBorbet South Africa (Pty) Ltd & Others vs Nelson Mandela Bay Municipalitycase,which drew its interpretation from section 27(4) of the Municipal Finance Management Act (Act 156 of 2003), Fau (2015) among others makes the following observations onhow South African courts interpret the nature and extent of the duty to facilitate public participation, namely; (1) The obligations imposed on municipalities to facilitate public participation in local governance are extensive and that the municipal council is obliged to take stepsto extend and deepen its democratic processes, (2) municipalities are obliged to create conditions, build capacity and most importantly allocate resources to comply with their obligations regarding public participation. Municipal councils are required to take these steps in order to encourage public participation in the preparation and implementation of their Intergrated Development Plans and their budgets, (3) municipal councils are required to communicate information concerning the available mechanisms, processes and procedures to encourage and facilitate community participation, (4)Extensive

quarantee for public participation in local government law suggest that municipal councils are to function as the primary sphere of active engagement with its members of the community and as the basis upon which participarory democracy is to be founded, (5)the obligation to encourage public participation in the local government goes beyond a mere formalism in which public meetings are convened and information is shared. It also requires meaningful opportunities for participation and that municipalities must take steps to ensure that people have the ability and capacity to take advantage of those opportunities, (6)due to their proximity to local communities, municipalities carry a higher degree of responsibility in ensuring that community residents participate in the designing and implementation of policies and programmes that affect their lives and (7) alldecisions taken by municipal councils must be informed by concerns raised by communities.

In the background of this research (see Section 1.2) an indication was made that municipalities are mandated to provide sustainable services to their communities within the constraints of available resources. To achieve their mandates, municipalities must develop and adopt IDPs in terms of Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000).Chapter four of this act provides for the development of a culture of community participation in municipal governance.In reference to this, scholars, such as Khobe (2012), argue that public participation is at the core of local government, and that municipalities should provide opportunities and make a meaningful effort to facilitate public participation by providing an enabling environment that includes, among others, making resources available. In the South African context, public participation is central to the success of the IDP process (Sikrweqe, 2013). Phago (2008:245) argues that the culture of community participation should be enhanced in all municipalities to ensure that the participation process is localised. Similarly, Netswera and Phago (2011:135) confirm the argument above by highlighting that the logical emphasis in the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000) is that municipal decisions should preferably be made from the bottom upwards through the use of consultative forums such as ward committee structures and that the functionality of these structures is therefore critical. In the context of integrated development planning, participation is crucial for needs assessment, project design, implementation and evaluation of the

programmes and projects meant for the poor (Hofisi 2014).Khobe (2012) argues that public participation should not only be about providing information and building awareness in communities, but must also involve partnering with communities in decision making and implementation. In considering the effect of legislated participation in terms of participative public discourse, Netswera and Phago (2013:31) also highlight that without the meaningful involvement in government activities, civil society may resort to the historical modus operandi of engagement like protests, riots and civil disobedience, including the non-payment of municipal services. Adding to this, Mpehle (2012) argues that since municipalities will not have sufficient resources to address all community needs, the involvement of local communities in prioritising and allocating those resources will ensure ownership of such decisions and therefore reduce any possible conflicts.Scholars cited above argue that the way consultative processes are currently conducted does not allow meaningful structured citizen participation.

According to Landau *et al.* (2011), the bias against planning for migration issues is cemented by the *de facto* exclusion of migrants, both domestic and international, from public consultations. They report that in the areas they visited for their study, outsiders were generally not invited to participate in Community Policing Forums, Stakeholders' Forums, Residents' Associations, or meetings held by local ward councillors.Section B (1.3 Democratising development, empowering and redistributing) of The White Paper on Local Government (1998) states that municipal councillors should promote the involvement of citizens and community groups in the design and delivery of municipal programmes. Municipalities must adopt inclusive approaches to fostering community participation, including strategies aimed at removing obstacles to, and actively encouraging, the participation of marginalised and excluded groups in the local community. Though the White Paper does not identity migrants as a marginalised and vulnerable group, it can be argued that by international standards migrants form part of vulnerable groups. Hofisi (2014:1134) argues that participation by the community in the integrated development planning should promote efficiency, effectiveness and empowerment while effectively improving the standard of living of vulnerable or beneficiaries.

The Integrated Development Plan Guide Tool (2001) states that stakeholders in the IDP process ofmunicipalities include councillors, local communities and the national and provincial sector departments. The Municipal Systems Act 2000 (Act 32 of 2000) defines the local community to include, *inter alia,* residents of the municipality, ratepayers, visitors and other people residing outside the municipality, who, because of their presence in the municipality, make use of services or facilities provided by the municipality. This, therefore, includes migrants. According to this Act, municipalities are expected to develop public participation strategies as to involve the stakeholders in the IDP processes. The involvement of migrants or lack thereof in planning processes determines the extent to which migration influences municipal planning and resource allocation.

In the briefing document on a meeting with the Select Committee in Local Government, the South African Local Government Association (Salga) argues that being a developmental government means municipalities must shift from treating communities as passive recipients of services to treating them as active agents and partners in their own development (COGTA, 2003). The document further argues that developmental government involves an honest and constant commitment to building the knowledge and skills of communities and the general public – particularly women, youth and other historically disadvantaged groups to enable them to actively participate in and influence municipal affairs as well as those of internal stakeholders who have a crucial role to play as the agents and implementers of change. Mpehle (2014: 218) also adds that citizens should not be perceived as mere consumers or recipients of services, but as integral part of governance and therefore need to be involved in decision making process on services that affect them.

Contrary to the arguments above, the study by Landau *et al.* (2011) reveals that participatory planning in municipalities is not conducive to outsiders' participation and that intergovernmental cooperation is lacking among government sectors with regard to foreigners and their access to certain rights and mandates over service delivery. Blaser and Landau (2014:17) add and indicate that migrants are excluded from popular participation and planning processes due to a number of

reasons,namelythatcircular migrants may be absent when meetings are convened, lack of technical knowledge by participants on public service needs and personal reasons, among others. Non-participation of migrants in decision making processes results in the municipal plans and budgets reflecting the needs only of those who managed to participate in those consultation forums and which were then further articulated in terms of the political interests and priorities of public office bearers. These arguments, furthermore, confirm one of personal factors influencing community participation considered by Phago (2008:344), that is*:* community participation as a function of social position which results from personal status such as age, sex, education, race, and residence, among others. Since it is based on social status, some people feel more confident and qualified than others to get involved and participate. Poor are rendered powerless by their poverty and they tend to perceive themselves 'unqualified' for participation in the making of decisions affecting their lives (Hofisi: 2014:1136). Similarly, migrants, due to their social status, like the poor may not get involved and participate in municipal planning activities.

As indicated above community participation in decision making forms the bedrock of municipal planning and budgetary processes. Any planning that excludes participation by key stakeholders is unconstitutional and bound to fail since it will lack a sense of ownership. Exclusion of migrants from municipal planning means that their needs will not be identified and considered to form part of municipalities' key development priorities and budgets. Such exclusion of migration from IDPs and budgets subsequently leads to fighting over the limited services, violent protests and perpetuates skewed development which is the antithesis of democracy the new South Africa stands for.

Some officials fear that migration will impact on planning and meeting performance targets. (Landau *et al.,* 2011:6). According to Blaser and Landau (2014) resources in municipalities are allocated not because of need, but according to political expediency, which results in white elephants or contributing less to human development. Political contestation and party infightings leads to paralysis of municipalities and affect effective planning. Since migrants are regarded as a nuisance to the communities, politicians do not consider them, when they allocate resources (Landau *et al.,* 2011).

They will not enhance their political careers because the majority of them do not have the right to vote.

2.4.6 Migration and social integration in municipal Integrated Development Plans

The World Report (2009) indicates that member states underlined the need for concerted efforts by governments to combat xenophobia, discrimination, racism and social exclusion of migrant populations, and that social integration of migrants must be given prominent attention, combating all types of intolerance. Illegal immigrants need protection against the violation of their constitution rights (Masiloane 2010). Despite this, Bakewell (2009:46) highlights that there is a policy vacuum with respect to the integration of non-citizens in many African countries. According to the scholar, evidence seems to indicate that certain migrant groups face substanatial problems even after their arrival, and they often face xenophobia in countries as diverse as Cote d' Ivoire, Lybia and South Africa.

Municipal planning (IDPs) must include various plans and strategies, including how to deal with social cohesion and provision of human security. Social integration strategies and plans may include spatial planning that integrates settlements, provision of affordable services and reduction of transport costs. Human security strategies should include environmental sustainability strategies like disaster management plans and strategies to combat crime and provide social justice. The extent to which migration is included in municipal plans regarding social cohesion and human security will be indicative of how it affects municipal planning. Scholars such as Landau *et al*. (2011), Desille (2014) and Mpehle (2014) emphasis critical roles that municipalities can play in social integration policymaking, policy implementation and protection of migrants. Some of those roles for example are contained in the White Paper on Local Government (1998) and the Local Goverment: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000) as to pioneer social integration and eradicate skewed development as perpetuated by the Apartheid government. According to these scholars migrants form part of municipal communities

and according to legislative framework such as the White Paper on Local Government (1998) and the Local Government: Municipal Syastems Act (Act 32 of 2000) they should not be discriminated against in municipal planning.

Desille (2014) highlights that countries such as the United States, Canada and Australia consider migration as constitutional part of their nations. This scholar therefore argues that migration is a fundamental aspect of nation building. Similarly in the South Africa, migration forms part of the constitutional imperatives of the country. The Constitution of the Republic South Africa (1996) and legislative frameworks such as Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000) already discussed above, provide migrants with equal rights to the citizens of this country except political rights like voting or standing for public office.

The success of endeavours to protect and integrate migrants in the communities depends on how policies are integrated within different government levels, by how implementers understand and interpret them and also on their commitment towards implementation. Desille (2014) supports this argument by indicating that integration policies and their implementation depend on the politics of belonging at the national level, how the discourse is interpreted or redefined at local level (mostly by mayors and councillors), how it is translated into a programme by the directors of the department in charge of immigration and absorption, and finally, how it is implemented in the field by municipal agents.

Some researchers as indicated below, question South Africa's commitment towards providing security and integrating migrants in the society. They also argue that municipalities do not have plans for social integration with regard to migrants. Freemantle and Misago (2004) argue that the 2008 xenophobic attacks brutally exposed failures of South Africa's approach to nation-building, social cohesion and immigration. Agreeing to this, Mvuyana (2010) argues that while some municipalities accept asylum seekers and refugees as part of the community, the communities and some municipal officials do not take the presence of foreigners kindly, and therefore make their stay amongst them uncomfortable by pretending they do not exist and

excluding them from local development plans. Migrants are not only discriminated against by communities but they are also harassed time and again.

Landau *et al.* (2011:141) argue that despite ongoing anti-outsider sentiments and repeated occurrences of attacks on foreign nationals, research conducted on municipal government shows that even at the local level, there are no long term, sustained initiatives to work towards social cohesion and to respond to and/or prevent future outbreaks. Blaser and Landau (2014) add that municipal officials understand that since migration is something associated with international movements, therefore social cohesion is a national competence. Hence municipalities do little to manage tensions and insecurity associated with population mobility. These researchers, however, agree with Hammerstad (2012) that immigration should be dealt with at all levels of planning, whether schooling, health care, labour,agriculture,urban planning or foreign policy.The researchers further argue that efforts to eliminate social polarisation and build a cohesive nation rely on government policies, public education, provision of service delivery and decisive leadership. Though some services with regard to international migration are the responsibilities of the national and provincial government, municipalities play a critical role in social integration. Social integration depends on interactions that occur among communities, stakeholders, social groups and institutions that exist locally. Municipalities, therefore, have responsibilities to develop local policies, plans and programmes that manage diversity and protect and integrate newcomers in their new settlements. Municipalities must take a lead in mitigating practices of social exclusion, segregation and xenophobia that take place within their areas of jurisdiction. Those initiatives should be reflected in their IDPs and budgets. Social cohesion cannot happen organically. Government and civil society have to enter into partnership and dialogue to develop ways on how best to enhance social cohesion.

In the introduction of this research (see section1.1) the researcher argues that migration must be considered by municipalities when they develop their municipal palns. In the same breath, the researcher indicated that any municipal planning which does not consider population dynamics is incomplete. The meaning of migration and municipal planning, as applied in the context of this research, were discussed in chapter one (see

sections 1.10.2 and 1.10.3). Phago (2009) posits that it is important to define Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) as the result of a comprehensive municipal planning process. This scholar also claims that IDPs are mandated by the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 which promulgates laws governing IDPs including the White Paper of Local Government, 1998, White Paper on Municipal Services Partnerships of 2000, the Local Government: Municipal Structures Act, 1998 (Act 117 of 1998) and the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act, (Act 32 of 2000). Every municipality is required to develop an Integrated Development Plan, which is a future and central municipal tool to develop all local communities within the municipal jurisdiction (Mathoho 2012). The White Paper on Local Government, 1998 indicates that an Integrated Development Plan is a strategy planning instrument that guides and informs all planning, budgeting, management and decision making processes, that it is a new approach to local government that aims at overcoming the poor planning of the past where some communities were discriminated against when resources were allocated, resulting in skewed development, social disintegration and inequalities. According to this document IDP is therefore a super-plan of the municipality which co-ordinates the work of local and other spheres of government in a coherent plan to improve the lives of people in the area. IDPs direct municipal budgets (resource allocation) and the plans of other government departments working in the area and requires involvement of the entire municipality and its citizens to find the best solutions to achieve good long-term development.

According to Mokale and Scheepers (2011:140), the development plans of a municipality are contained in the Integrated Development Plan. The IDP is the core component of the municipal planning system and once approved by the MEC, has the status of a law. The authors further argue that one of the core principles of modern day municipal planning is that all planning must be developmentally oriented and that municipalities must - together with other organs of state - contribute to the progressive realisation of the fundamental rights contained in sections 24, 25, 26 and 27 of the Constitution. According to Landau *et al.* (2011), migration in all its forms, is an important component of a local government's mandate within South Africa.

This discussion above locates the Integrated Development Plan, as the municipal planning tool, within its proper context. It can be concluded that the IDP is a super-municipal planning document that is informed by the Constitution and legislative imperatives and has a legal status immediately once approved by the MEC. It is a product of a consultative process including the municipality, its communities as defined by the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act of 2000 (Act No. 32 of 2000) and other government departments from both the national and provincial spheres of government. It directs how municipalities allocate their resources (budgeting), forms the bedrock on which government departments and private bodies bringing development in municipalities are based.

One of the research questions in this study is: How does migration affect municipal planning? In assisting to answer this question, Crush *et al.* (2005) argue that because migration is a cross-cutting phenomenon, it needs to be integrated into all facets of state policy-making and planning, including programmes and strategies to alleviate poverty and redress inequality. Hammerstad (2012) also argues that the seriousness of migration challenges is dependent on the policies and perceptions of host governments and populations. This scholar maintains that well managed migrants will benefit host countries as they will pay taxes and contribute freely and without fear to the societies they live. Despite availability of various policy options in respect of migration, and a number of potential planning responses to governments, be it internationally, nationally or locally, no universally viable policy response has so far been found (Kok & Collins 2006). Accordingly, Mathoho (2012) argues that migration left local municipalities baffled with planning processes, budgeting and service issue.

COGTA (2003) highlights that in a briefing document on meeting with the Select Committee on Local Government, the South African Local Government Assocition argues that the challenge over the past five years at local government has been how to close the gap between policy, budgeting and planning processes, that IDPs are produced mechanistically to meet deadlines rather than working as a strategic planning tool and that IDPs do not reflect an understanding of the implications of rural or urban economic trends whilst vital baseline information is not available or are either inaccurate

or inconsistent. The document further says that the planning of IDPs is simply outsourced to consultants rather than being imbedded in the municipal planning processes while community participation in IDPs is often not sufficiently targeted or goal directed.

To add to the above, Landau *et al.* (2011)and Mpehle (2014) argue that many of the social and economic concerns associated with movement are not explicitly within local government's mandate. They say that the primary needs of migrants like shelter, access to health care, education, economic opportunities and administrative justice, safety, security and proper treatment are formally the responsibility of the national or provincial government, although it is often municipalities that bear the responsibility and suffer consequences when service delivery mechanisms do not function appropriately. Landau et al. (2011:5) further calls for lateral and vertical collaboration and cooperation within the spheres of government to ensure that departments share information, co-ordinate responses and appropriately allocate resources.

Studies, as discussed below, agree that decisions and priorities about resource allocation in municipal planning must include all people residing within the municipal area of jurisdiction regardless of their place of origin. This, therefore, includes migrants, whether they are international or internal. Decisions and priorities with regard to municipal planning must be constitutional, legal and ensure positive financial implications to the municipality. Furthermore they must include and be informed by the needs of the migrants as collated through municipal consultative forums. Decisions and priorities in municipal planning which exclude migration are unconstitutional, illegal and may pose negative financial implications to municipalities as they will have to deal will ramifications resulting from such exclusions.

Polzer (2010:3) indicates that chapter 2 of the Constitution of South Africa grants all people in South Africa- citizens and both documented and undocumented non-citizens - right to life, dignity equality before law, and basic services. This confirms that migrants should be included in the decisions and priorities regarding service provision. In addition to this, Daw (2012:104) argues that metropolitan municipalities' policy–makers should take into consideration additional demands due to migration when allocating resources

for the provision of infrastructure and social services, so as to maintain and improve the standard of living of residents and avoid social unrest. Mpehle (2014:256-257) claims that decisions and priorities in municipal planning must ensure positive financial implications and states the following:

To deny refugees access to facilities could prove to be detrimental not only to refugees but to local communities in that the spread of diseases that would have been prevented would be faster. This can be costly to government as it will have to spendmore money curing that which could have been prevented. If the same denial happens in education then the number of illiterates will grow and this accelerating high rate of unemployment which may subsequently lead to more crime.

Despite the arguments stated above, some studies (Landau *et al.* 2011, Olago 2011, Segatti & Landau 2011, and Mathoho 2012) find that municipalities do not consider migration in their municipal planning resulting in dire consequences. Studies further confirm that municipalities either have little understanding or poor attitude about migrants. Hence their planning and resource allocation do not provide for migrants and future population expansion.

According to Olago (2011) data used for planning are scarce, incomplete, inaccurate, outdated, de-contextualised and difficult for decision makers to understand. The planning processes largely represent the pre-defined needs of the sections of the current poor population who can access consultation forums and miss out on newly urbanised and more vulnerable other groups. Negative attitudes towards migrants further make it unlikely for officials to insist that resources must be dedicated to these 'unwanted' residents, especially because they are equipped with only limited knowledge of migration dynamics. According to Atkinson and Marais (in Tomlinson & Pillay, 2006) paucity of government information about different types of migration becomes a real constraint in the design of policy. The goverment does not know how many people are moving to different kinds of destinations, from where, for what reasons and what skills they have.

Segatti and Landau (2011:100) confirm that migration is generally not considered in municipal planning and implementation. They argue that there is a limited understanding of migration dynamics among municipal officials and a range of negative stereotypes associated with transience and international migration. Authorities perceive migration and mobility as a challenge to efficient planning and they prefer permanent residents over migrants justifying their anti-squatter policies. Decisions around resource allocation are further hampered by the fact that migration policy development is a national competence and municipalities play only a limited role. Landau *et al.* (2011) and Polzer (2010) agree that migration management is currently considered a national competency though it impacts on provincial and municipal functions, especially planning. These scholars further state that the national government's resource allocation to municipalities does not cater for migration and this affects municipalities' decisions and priorities about resource allocation in their planning. According to Segatti and Landau (2011:100), the equitable share system discourages the incorporation of the poor and transient because municipalities receive no additional support from the national government for populations that are not captured in the national census. This is further confirmed by Olago (2011) who contends that planning by municipalities is more oriented towards the permanent residents even if new needs are expressed by newcomers. Accordingly this is because the national treasury fails to factor in mobility in the allocation of national resources.

While the researchers above agree that migration should be included in the decisions and priorities regarding service provision in municipalities, they also argue that there are inhibiting challenges within municipalities to realise that. *Inter alia* they are: (1) in-availability of reliable population dynamics data, (2) lack of knowledge, (3) negative attitudes and stereotypes of municipal officials on migration, (4) the perception that migration is a national competence and, (5) the non-inclusion of migration in the intergovernmental transfers. Olago (2011) argues that the data used for planning are scarce, incomplete, inaccurate, outdated, de-contextualised and difficult for decision makers to understand.

One of the key problems seems to come from the fact that the National Treasury fails to factor in mobility in the allocation of national resources.

The planning processes largely represent the pre-defined needs of the sections of the current poor population who can access consultation forums and miss out on newly urbanised and more vulnerable other groups. Olago (2011) confirms this by saying that planning is more oriented towards the permanent residents even if new needs are expressed by newcomers. As discussed above negative attitudes towards migrants make it unlikely for officials to insist that resources have to be dedicated to these 'unwanted' residents, especially because they are equipped with only limited knowledge of migration dynamics. Segatti and Landau (2011) state that municipal authorities perceive migration and mobility as challenge to efficient planning and that they prefer permanent residents over migrants justifying their anti-squatter policies.

Some scholars, as consulted in this chapter, argue that a lack of resources in municipalities is also a major cause for the exclusion of migration in their plans. Mpehle (2014), for example, states that the local sphere of government cannot deal with the influx of refugees when it comes to service delivery because of its limited resources. Furthermore, as stated in the preceding paragraphs, scholars argue that the national government's resource allocation to municipalities does not cater for migration and this affects municipalities' decisions and priorities about resource allocation in their planning. Scholars such as Segatti and Landau (2011:100) claim that the equitable share system discourages the incorporation of the poor and transient because municipalities receive no additional support from the national government for populations that are not captured in the national census.

2.5 CONCLUSION

The literature review in this chapter confirms that migration is a world-wide phenomenon as old as the human race itself and it is affecting planning in every country. The studies mentioned above confirm that people are on the move. People either move across borders or within borders, they move permanently or temporarily. People leave their places of origin due to various reasons, either due to push or pull factors. In the South

African context migration was shaped by discriminatory laws during the Apartheid era. The apartheid laws resulted in skewed developments and inequalities that still characterise the South African society today. This literature review shows that despite the ushering in of the new democratic dispensation cities in South Africa are not yet fully inclusive and equal. There are collaborative efforts and synergy with regard to migration management within the three spheres of government. Government legislative frameworks, priorities, strategies and programmes which impact on migration are not yet synchronised. Municipalities, which were expected to embrace migration and spatial issues and assist in building a cohesive society, do not consider population dynamics resulting in perpetual skewed developments and violent service delivery protests and infightings among communities over limited resources. Migration further impacts on municipal resources as migrants need basic services like water, housing, electricity, sanitation social security, put pressure on municipal infrastructure like roads and distort municipal settlement patterns because they are not planned for. Researchers in this literature review agree that migration is a dynamic phenomenon which cannot be addressed by a single study. Hence recommendations for further studies using different study methods, study areas and units are needed. This confirms the relevance and significance of this research to the body of knowledge.

Methodology and research design employed in this research are discussed in chapter three.

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The preceding chapter considered a detailed discussion on the existing scholarship around municipal planning and migration.This chapter presents a discussion of the methodology utilised in this research. A rather detailed description of methods, as well as the researcher's justification for employing such methods is also included in this chapter. Specific attention was given to the role of the researcher, sampling procedures, data collection and data analysis as well as trustworthiness and verification procedures. In conclusion the researcher explaines the study's feasibility, advantages and disadvantages.

3.2UNDERSTANDING RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHOLODOLOGY

According to Babbie & Mouton (2003) research design is a structured framework on how one intends conducting the research process in order to solve a research problem. Similarly Mouton (2001) defines research design as a plan or blue print on how one plan to conduct the research, while   Phago (2010) defines research design as a set of guidelines and procedures to be followed in addressing the research problem. Research design therefore articulates what data is required, methods the researcher employs to collect and anlyse data to answer the research question. Research design starts by defining the research type that is being carried out for example whether the research is historical, descriptive, exploratory, explanatory, correlation, comparative and so forth and the kind of results the research aimed at. According to Creswell (2003:5) the three questions central to the research design are:

- *What knowledge claims are being made by the researcher, including a theoretical perspective?*
- *What strategies of inquiry will inform the procedures?*
- *What methods of data collection and analysis will be used?*

This author maintains that the choice of which research design to apply depends on the nature of the problems posed by the research aims and that the type of research design has a range of research methods that are commonly used to collect and analyse the type of data that is generated by the investigations. This research was primarily a descriptive investigation to obtain the views of municipal officials evolved in the municipal planning activitieson how of migration affects planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. This was in accordance with Burns and Grove (2003) who show that descriptive research is designed to provide a picture of a situation as it naturally happens and it (descriptive research) may be used to justify current practices and make judgement and also to develop theories.

Munzhedzi (2011) provides a distinction between research design and research methodology in that a research design is the scientific approach used in searching for facts and answers to questions to reach valid and reliable conclusions while research methodology is concerned with steps, procedures, techniques and specific tasks to be followed by the researcher to implement research design. According to Phago (2010) the approach or methodology answers the questions:

- *How should the research be planned?*
- *How can the structure of the research be?*
- *How should it be executed to fulfil the demands of science in Public Administration?*

Put simply, research methodology focuses on the research process and the kind of tools and procedures to be used for example document analysis, survey methods, interviews, focus groups among others while research design focuses on the kind of research planned and the kind of results aimed at, for example historical research, comparative, exploratory research and descriptive research among others.

According to Creswell (2003) in deciding which research approach is relevant to the research, a researcher is informed by the philosophical assumptions about knowledge claim, procedures of inquiry (research designs) and the specific research methods and the nature of the research problem. This author defines research approaches as plans

and procedures for research that span the steps from broad assumptions to detailed methods of data collection, analysis and interpretation.

According to scholars such as Kothari (2004), Wilmont (2005) and Phago (2010) the commonly used approaches in research design are quantitative and the qualitative. These scholars differentiate the two research approaches by stating among others thatquantitative approach implies a measurement or numerical approach which is based on the testing of hypothesis deduced from theory by using statistical inference the results of which may be generalised to the population while qualitative approach is concerned with subjective assessment of attitudes, opinions and behaviour of participants with regard to a particular phenomenon with an aim for example, to inform policy.A relevant approach to this descriptive research was qualitaitive approach because the researcherundertookto understand and interpret the common or shared experiences of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's official involved in planning activities in the municipality on how migration affects planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

3.3 QUALITATIVE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Leedy (1993:106) defines qualitative research as the process of getting to understand and interpret how various participants in a social setting construct the world around them. Qualitative research is an inquiry process of understanding based on distinct methodological traditions of inquiry that explore a social or human problem. The researcher builds a complex, holistic picture, analyses words, reports detailed views of informants and conducts the study in a natural setting (Creswell, 1998:15). According to Babbie and Mouton (2001: 270) qualitative researchers attempt always to study human action from the perspective of the social actors themselves. Qualitative research methods enable researchers to delve into questions of meaning, examine institutional and social practices and processes, identify barriers and facilitators to change, and discover the reasons for the success or failure of intervention (Starks & Trinidad, 2007).

According to Creswell (2009:4), qualitative research is a means of exploring and understanding the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem.

Brink and Wood (1992:246) and Burns and Grove (2003:357) argue that qualitative research seeks to understand phenomena. It derives meaning from the participants' perspective, aims to understand the meaning that people attach to everyday life, presents data in the form of words, quotes from documents and transcripts and uses words as the basis for analysing rather than numerical data. It also considers that whole is always more than the sum of its parts. According to Wilmot (2005), qualitative research aims at providing an in-depth understanding of the world as seen through the eyes of the people being studied. She further argues that qualitative research aims not to impose preordained concepts. Hypotheses and theory are generated during the course of conducting the research as the meaning emerges from data.

A qualitative method is used to explore the "how" and "why" of systems and human behaviour and what governs behaviours. It is a method for examining phenomena using words for data, and its aim is to understand or interpret phenomena within the context of the meaning that people express without attempting to infer causation or generalise the results to other individuals or populations (Edmonds & Kennedy, 2013:112). Denzin and Lincoln (1998) assert that qualitative research emphasises the process of discovering how social meaning is constructed. According to Babbie and Mouton (2001) and Snape and Spencer (2003 in Maruster & Gijsenber, 2013), the primary aim of qualitative research is in-depth descriptions and understanding of the social world of research participants by learning about their social and material circumstances, their experiences, their perspectives and histories. The main concern of qualitative research is to understand social action in terms of its specific context (idiographic motive) rather than attempting to generalise to some theoretical purposes.

According to Leedy and Ormrod (2013:140) qualitative research serves one or more of the following purposes:

- Description: to reveal the multifaceted nature of certain situations, settings, processes, relationships, systems or people

- Interpretation: Enable the researcher to gain new insight into a particular phenomenon, to develop new concepts or theoretical perspectives about the phenomenon and/or discover problems that exist within the phenomenon
- Verification: to allow the researcher to test the validity of certain assumptions, claims, theories or generalisations within real world contexts.
- Evaluation: provide a means through which a researcher can judge the effectiveness of particular policies, practices or innovations

Leedy and Ormrod (2013) further add that qualitative research focuses on phenomena that occur in natural settings (real world) and involves capturing and studying the complexity of those phenomena. Qualitative research investigates *why* and *how* decisions are made, not only the *what*, *where* and *when*. Furthermore, qualitative research often uses observation, interviews, focus groups, content analysis and historical comparison as means of collecting data. These characteristics show that qualitative research is an appropriate design for this research which aims to investigate the effects of migration on municipal planning. This has been achieved by exploring the understanding, views, perceptions and opinions of municipal officials who have experience with regard to planning activities in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

3.4 PHENOMENOLOGY AS A QUALITATIVE RESEARCH APPROACH

Phenomenology is a qualitative research approach (Lin, 2013:469). Englander (2012:14) argues that it is a mistake to assume that qualitative research is one method. This is supported byother authors (Barsanti, 2014; Creswell, 2007; Leedy, 2001; Snape & Spencer in Maruster & Gijsenberg, 2013) who argue that qualitative research is used as an overarching category, covering a wide range of approaches and methods found within different research disciplines. To confirm this statement Creswell (2007) highlights the different qualitative research approaches as: grounded theory, ethnography, case study, phenomenology and biographical life history. Leedy (2001:133) argues that though several qualitative research approaches are in some respect quite different from one another, they all have two things in common, namely that they focus on phenomena that occur in a natural setting, being the real world and

they involve studying those phenomena in all their complexities. Adding another dimension to this, Barsanti (2014) argues that qualitative approaches to research employ words to answer a specificresearch question.It is, however, important to bear in mind that most qualitative research projects are phenomenological in nature (Guest, Namely & Mitchel, 2013). Similarly, this research adopted a phenomenological research approach to realise the set aim and objectives.

According to Lester (1999) the purpose of the phenomenological approach is to illuminate the specific, to identify phenomena though how they are perceived by the actors in a situation. This researcher further highlights that this phenomenological approach is about gathering deep information and perceptions through inductive, qualitative methods such as interviews, discussions and participant observation, and representing it from the perspective of the research participant(s). This researcher emphasises that phenomenological approach is powerful for understanding subjective experience, gaining insights into people's motivations and actions and cutting through the clutter of taken-for-granted assumptions and conventional wisdom. Phenomenology is interested in understanding a social phenomenon from the actors' own perspectives, describing the world as experienced by the subjects, and with the assumption that the important reality is what people perceive it to be (Kvale, 1996:52).

Phenomenology is a qualitative research methodology inspired by the branch of philosophy which concerns the phenomenon of human consciousness (Lin, 2013).Creswell (2013) and Morse and Richards (2002) agree that phenomenology is an approach to qualitative research which studies a phenomenon by collecting data from persons who have experienced that phenomenon. I t then develops a composite description of what those persons experienced and how they experienced it.Phenomenology focuses on individual experiences, beliefs and perceptions. The goal of phenomenology is to understand human interactions with a phenomenon under study. Phenomenological studies consider 'how' and 'why' people do what they do, or how they feel or interact with a phenomenon. It is more broadly used to denote the study of individual's perceptions, feelings and lived experiences (Smit, Flowers & Larkin, 2009).

Sanders (1982:354) defines phenomenology as the study of conscious phenomena: that is, an analysis of the way in which things or experiences show themselves. In addition Sanders (1982) states that phenomenology seeks to make explicit the implicit structure and meaning of human experience. Starks and Trinidad (2007) argue that in phenomenology reality is comprehended through embodied experience. In phenomenological study the researcher has an idea of what the phenomenon is all about beforehand or a general sense of expected paramaters of the phenomenon and is interested in getting deeper understanding (from objective vintage) of it (Englander, 2012). In order to understand the meaning of the phenomenon, the researcher needs to be able to suspend or bracket any preconceived ideas for defining the phenomenon's basic elements and essential structure (Creswell 2009).

Harrison (2008) indicates that the flaws in this research approach are that it will not aid prediction, that it is expensive and requires a lot of time and commitment. He also argues that though the researcher's personal perceptions can be bracketed there is a possibility that the interpretive work may be biased towards the researcher's knowledge and not the participants' lived experience and that the researcher may lose the context of the original text when interpreting data. Merriam (2009) argues that phenomenological researchers are interested in how people interpret their experiences, how people construct their worlds and what meaning they attribute to their experiences. The overall purpose is to understand how people make sense of their lives and their experiences. Phenomenological studies concern peoples' subjective experiences of their circumstances and how they interpret those circumstances (Magoro, 2010:34).

According to Usher and Jackson (2014:181) phenomenology is the careful and systematic reflective study of the lived experience. It differs with other methodologies in qualitative research because it focuses on human experience. It reflects on the lived experience of human existence. Similarly phenomenology must be thoughtful, free from theoretical, prejudicial and suppositional intoxications. He further argues that in phenomenology the researchers shut out all that they know about a phenomenon so that they can come to a deeper understanding of that phenomenon, free from any preconceived taken-for-granted notions of it. Phenomenology emphasises the attempt

to get to the truth of matters, to describe phenomena, in the broadest sense as whatever appears in the manner in which it appears, that is as it manifests itself to consciousness, to the experiencer. As such, phenomenology's first step is to seek to avoid all misconstructions and impositions placed on experience in advance, whether these are drawn from religious or cultural traditions, from everyday common sense, or, indeed, from science itself. Explanations are not to be imposed before the phenomena have been understood from within (Moran, 2000).

Patton (2002:104-106) says the following about phenomenology:

"*The fundamental question asked by this approach is: What is the meaning, structure, and essence of the lived experience of this phenomenon for this person or group? Phenomenology approach focuses on the exploring how human beings make sense of experience and transform experience into consciousness individually and as shared meaning.*

This requires methodologically, carefully and thoroughly capturing and describing how people experience some phenomenon- how they perceive it, describe it, feel about it and talk about it, judge it, remember it, make sense of it and talk about it with others".

Morse and Richards (2002) and Creswell (2013) agree that phenomenology is an approach to qualitative research which studies a phenomenon by collecting data from persons who have experienced it, and develops a composite description of what those persons experienced and how they experienced it. The composite description of what those persons experienced will help in developing practices or policies or a deeper understanding about the features of the phenomenon.

Finlay (2012:175) gives another perspective of phenomenology as follows:

"*Phenomenology research starts with the researcher who has a curiosity or passion that is turned into a research question. They want to better understand a particular phenomenon (be it a lived experience, event or situation) and they forge a strong relation. The immediate challenge for the researcher having this passion or curiosity is to remain open to new understanding- to be open to the phenomenon- in order to go beyond what they already know from experience or through established knowledge...*

63

the starting point in phenomenology is usually to ask participants to describe what the experience of X is like to them. Phenomenology seeks down-to-earth, richly detailed description of the lived rather than abstract, intellectualisation or empirical generalities that try to analyse, explain or theorise".

Phenomenological researchers generally agree that the phenomenological research approach interprets experience or fact by listening to different stories of participants. It is a method that examines phenomena through the subjective eye of the participants. Phenomenology intends to understand how humans view themselves and the world around them. Phenomenology offers the researcher the ability to examine the different perspectives of participants on a certain phenomenon. Furthermore phenomenological researchers argue that the intention of phenomenology is not to investigate a particular phenomenon, but the experience of the participants as they participate in that phenomenon, which in turn allows a deeper understanding of the phenomenon through examination of those experiences. Phenomenology constructs data by eliciting in-depth individual storytelling, thereby garnering the cumulative essence of the experience.

Phenomenology assists researchers to understand how individuals come to know their own experience of a phenomenon which allows them to identify the essential qualities of that experience. Phenomenology can be used when studying people's experiences, how people make meaning of their lives, studying relationships between what happened and how people have come to understand these events, exploring how people experience the essence of a particular phenomenon and lastly examining the commonalities across individuals.

3.4.1 The origin of phenomenology

Phenomenology is rooted in the philosophical tradition developed by Husserl (1859-1938) and Heidegger (1881-1976). Harrison (2008) indicates that phenomenology emerges from the philosophy of Emanuel Kant (1724-1804), an enlightenment thinker. Kant held the view that interpretation and imagination play an important role in the organization of perceptions in the social sciences. He argued that people have

concepts, constructs and taken for granted assumptions about everything, that make perceptions and experiences intelligible and produce knowledge and that our phenomenal world is a product of our experiences.

According to Kvale (1996), Husserl emphasised that phenomenology studied how human phenomena are experienced in our consciousness and sought to understand how people construct meaning.Researcher like Kvale (1996), Smith (1998), Morcol (2005) and Usher and Jackson (2014) indicate that the phenomenological movement arose in Germany before 1914 led by Husserl, Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty as a way of thinking about the world, maintaining that anything can be studied as hard facts and relationships between facts can be established as scientific law. These researchers maintain that there are differences between Husserlian and Heideggerrian phenomenology, with the former being descriptive and the latter being interpretive and also agree that Husserl, Heidegger and Marleau-Ponty were responsible for developing phenomenology further.

3.4.1.1   Husserl (1859-1938)

Husserl presented his phenomenological study as "pure phenomenology" as opposed to that of other philosophers. The subject matter of phenomenology began with consciousness and experience. Husserl offered his phenomenology as the basis of an alternative science. The aim of "pure phenomenology" would be to identify and describe the universal structures of human consciousness by reducing the acts of consciousness to their essence. The method of pure phenomenology would be "bracketing" which refers to the processes of suspending judgement about the existence of the world around us by placing in abeyance or parentheses our commonsensical presuppositions about the perceiving consciousness and objects in external reality. Husserl developed descriptive phenomenology as a philosophical method for the investigation of structures of consciousness, or essences. Phenomenology is participant centred. According to Husserl phenomenology captures the reflections of people's perceptions of physical and mental phenomena. He further argues that different people experience the same phenomena in different ways and attach different meanings and interpretations to these,

and phenomenology highlights these different meanings and interpretations, using constant comparison. These facts can be empirically verified and observed.

3.4.1.2   Heidegger (1881-1976)

Heidegger, like Husserl, sees the roots of all forms of knowledge, including scientific knowledge, in man's primordial, existential understanding, which is shaped by being in the world, referred to as "Dasien". Being and knowing are one and the same, therefore according to Heidegger's philosophy knowledge is inseparable from the context, situation and existence of the knower. Knowledge requires presuppositions that are shaped by the context of a particular knowledge process. Science is interpretation, and interpretation requires a ''fore-having''- something we have in advance, a presupposition. Heidegger also posits that we experience ourselves in the company of others, therefore we are ''core-beings''. We share our co-beings and understand each other through communication.

3.4.1.3   Marleau-Ponty

Kvale (1996) argues that Marleau-Ponty developed phenomenology in an existential and dialectical direction. According to Morcol (2005), Marleau-Ponty sees human beings as biologically interactive and interdependent of their environments. He favours a notion of human awareness rooted in the corporeal dimension of existence that is always situated in concrete lived experience. According to Marleau-Ponty there is constant interaction and interdependency between our bodies and our biological and social environments, our language and perceptions are interdependent (Morcol, 2005).

3.4.2 Aim of phenomenology

Phenomenological research aims to facilitate understanding of another person's subjective experience and social meanings are discovered. It aims to uncover the essential nature of a phenomenon and the significance experience. Phenomenology aims to elucidate lived experience and to reveal meaning through a process of

66

understanding and interpretation (Wilcke, 2002). According to Harrison (2008) phenomenology can lead to anticipation of future events and aid in understanding the significance a person gives to these events. Similarly, Guest *et al.* (2013) add that qualitative research that follows a phenomenological approach attempts to understand individuals' lived experiences and the behavioural, enactive and social meanings that these experience have for them.

According to Reeves, Albert, Kuper and Hoges (2008) the role of phenomenology is toexplore the essence of consciousness as experienced from the first person point of views. Furthermore, they argue that phenomenology was originally developed to explain how individuals give meaning to social phenomena in their everyday lives and that the role of phenomenology is to explore the essence of consciousness as experienced from the first person point of view. Studies that draw upon this theoretical perspective concentrate on exploring how individuals make sense of the world in terms of the meanings and classifications they employ and as such, phenomenology aims to provide accounts that offer an insight into the subjective "lived" experience of individuals. Phenomenological studies do not attempt to generate wider explanations; rather their focus is on providing research accounts for individuals in a specific setting. Barsanti (2014) confirms this argument and states that the purpose of phenomenology is to illuminate the specific, as well as to identify phenomena through how they are perceived by the participants in particular or meaning someone gives to it. Phenomenology is an approach which analyses the life experiences of people and places emphasis on the description of the human situation. Merriam (2009) indicates that phenomenology aims for radical investigation and comprehension of the world, not just to accept dogma.

Leedy and Ormrod (2013:145) argue that phenomenological study attempts to understand people's perceptions, perspectives and understandings of a particular situation. The researcher may have personal experience related to the phenomenon but wants to gain a better understanding of the experiences of others. The researcher can then make some generalisations of what something is like from an insider's perspective by looking at multiple perspectives.

3.4.3 Relevance of qualitative design and phenomenological approach to the research

Different qualitative research approaches have different strategies or techniques in terms of participant sampling, data collection and data analysis. Several researchers (Bekker, 2006; Blaser & Landau,2014; Crush *et al.*, 2005; Kok et al., 2006; Mathoho, 2012;Polzer, 2010) have done qualitative research on migration without indicating which of the five qualitative approaches explained by Creswell (2007) above they applied. They, however, indicated gaps within their studies and recommended further studies using different study areas, populations, samples and data collection methods. Furthermore they argued that migration is a dynamic phenomenon which cannot be conclusively studies with a single research. Polzer (2010) captures this in his study by indicating that since his report cannot provide an empirical analysis of the concrete resource implications of different kinds of migration therefore a more in-depth follow-on study analysing municipal budgets and line agency staff practices and community level service evaluation should be done. This research responds to those recommendations and uses phenomenological qualitative research to investigate the influence of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality by exploring the experience and understanding of municipal officials involved in municipal planning activities.

A phenomenological qualitative research approach was used in this research in order to realise the its aim and objectives and close the gaps identified in the previous studies mentioned above. It was indicated in chapter 1 (see Section 1.9.1) that phenomenology has essentially a critical orientation. Critical theory critiques the stutas quo with an intention to transform it. This research was primarily intended to challenge the current posture of municipal planning as it excludes migration issues and patterns. The researcher was therefore convinced that a phenomenological approach is relevant to this research. This is in line with Lester (1999), who argues that phenomenological methods are particularly effective at bringing to the fore the experiences and perceptions of individuals from their own perspectives, and therefore at challenging structural or normative assumptions. The researcher furthermore posits that phenomenological approach can be used as the basis for pratical theory to inform,

support or challenge policy and action. Borkert, Perez, Scott and De Tona (2006) argue that since the study of contemporary migration has become complex, scholars have criticised the limited perspective of quantitative-positivistic accounts of migration and therefore proposed qualitative methodologies to address migration and more broadly bring out the complexities of migrants' lives.

Thani (2012) also argues that the other methods like questionnaires and structured interviews which are generally used in Public Administration do not allow people to define their experiences and how they affected their real world, as they have to select their experiences from a given list.

This research uses phenomenology because it follows in-depth interviews which provide a very rich and detailed description of the human experience. The results in phenomenological research emerge from the data instead of being imposed by a structured statistical analysis. Lester (1999:4) posits that phenomenological approaches are good at surfacing deep issues and making voices heard. Wilcke (2002) also chose phenomenology in his research because he intended to address some gaps he had identified in previous studies. This scholar argues that the choice of phenomenology allowed the experiences of the respondents to be presented in a direct and evocative manner, encouraging the reader to enter imaginatively into the experience described. Furthermore, this scholar posits that the open-ended and exploratory nature of the phenomenological method provided him with a vehicle for deepening the understanding of participants' experience of the phenomena and allowed the uncovering of participants' own interpretations of their own experiences. According to Grbich (2013:3) qualitative research provides detailed information, can process knowledge in a variety of areas, can help assess the impacts of policies on a population, give insight into people's individual experiences, can help evaluate service provision and lastly can support the exploration of little known behaviours, attitudes and values. This research is undertaken to gain insight on how migration affects municipal planning. In this regard, the research seeks to understand stories from the participants on their experiences with regard to migration and municipal planning activities (Finlay 2012).

Though authors such as Patton (2002), Kvale (1996) and Creswell (1998) show that phenomenology was primarily used in philosophical studies, in psychology, nursing and education. Morcol (2005), Auriacombe (2006), Auriacombe and Mouton (2007), Schurink (2009), Thani (2012), Lin (2013) and Barsanti (2014) advocate for the utilisation of phenomenology in Public Administration and other different study fields because they think it will greatly benefit the qualitative community. According to Giorgi (2006) phenomenological approach can be applied in other disciplines as long as a disciplinary attitude is adopted with the context of phenomenological attitude. For example, if one is a nurse, then a nursing attitude should be used. Thani (2012), for example, claims that phenomenology is most appropriate in Public Administration becauseof the following reasons:

- Public Administration researchers evaluate programmes and policies as part of their research.

- Public Administration deals with human knowledge that derives from studies of human behaviour, which implies understanding human perceptions which can only best be studied through phenomenology

- The ushering of the new democratic South Africa in 1994 encouraged people to participate in policy making processes and therefore phenomenology can best suit that purpose because it allows people to narrate about their experiences.

A phenomenological approach has already been successfully applied in Public Administration related topics by researchers such as Magoro (2010) in public policy analysis, Benson (2011) in change management, Davis (2012) in leadership development and Stewart (2014) in service delivery mechanisms. Creswell (2013:81) argues that the research problem best suited for phenomenology is the one in which it is important to understand several individuals' common or shared experiences of a phenomenon whose importance will assist to develop practices or policies, or to develop a deeper understanding about the features of the phenomenon. This research uses the experience and the understanding of the municipal officials involved in municipal planning activities to gain deeper insight regarding planning in the municipal

environment and how migration patterns and issues affect such planning. Based on the above elaborate discussion on what the phenomenological approach is, its purpose and how it is already successfully applied in Public Administration related topics by some researchers cited above, the researcher was convinced that a phenomenological approach is most appropriate for this research.

3.5 POPULATION AND SAMPLING OF PARTICIPANTS

Mouton (1996) states that population refers to the entire, complete or aggregate sets, objects, individuals, cases, events which are the focus of the research and about which the researcher wants to determine some characteristics. This is confirmed by Yount (2006) who indicates that a population consists of all the subjects the researcher wants to study. The population of this research is made up of the entire 233 municipal officials of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as per The Greater Tubatse Local Municipal IDP: 2013/14. Participants in this study are sampled from this population.

The selection of participants is the initial step in the data gathering process (Englander, 2012:17). Sampling refers to a process of selecting objects, a group of subjects or phenomena for a study in such a way that they represent the larger group from which they are selected (Moutoun, 2006:133; Yount, 2006). Accordingly, Phago (2010) argues that sampling allows researchers in Public Administration to facilitate a systematic selection of objects from the total population. Wilmot (2005) cites questions that researchers should ask themselves in determining the design of their sampling strategies: Amongst the others are the following:

- What are the research objectives?
- What is the target population?
- Who should be included in the sample and who should be excluded?
- What sampling technique(s) should be employed?
- What are the sample criteria?
- What size should the sample be?
- What should be used as the sampling frame?

- How should potential respondents/participants be recruited?

From the description above it follows that in sampling a researcher must firstly decide who will be included in the sample based on the type of information which is needed and who is likely to have it, secondly determine the number of participants to participate in the research which will be critical for the reliability of results and lastly address the question how the sample should be chosen. To realise this, Willmot (2005) argues that a decision will be required as to the sample selection criteria, informed by the characteristics that needto be reflected in the sample population to address the research question.

Englander (2012) posits that the question to be asked when sampling the participants in a phenomenological research is whether the participants have the experience that the researcher is looking for. Furthermore authors such as Creswell (1997:62) and Leedy and Ormrod (2014)agree that participants in a phenomenological study need to be individuals who have all experienced the phenomenon being explored, be of similar demographics (so as to give a researcher a better ability to understand the general nature of the experiences) and who can articulate their experiences. Groenewald (2004) states that phenomenology determines not only the research method, but also the types of research subjects as well. The participants in phenomenology are those with lived experience with regard to the phenomenon under study and who will be able to share insight about the phenomenon. In sampling participants for phenomenological research the question to ask is: *Do you have the experience that I am looking for* (Giorgi, 2009)?

According to researcherssuch as Englander (2012), in qualitative study a number of participants to be sampled is irrelevant. The phenomenological researcher is not primarily interested in knowing how many or how often one has had a particular experience but what it is like to experience that phenomenon (Willmont, 2005). The size of the sample in qualitative research is small because a phenomenon only needs to appear once to be of value. This is because phenomenology is not meant to result in generalisations but in transferability. This researcher further argues that using a larger number will not necessarily produce more insight into the experience of a phenomenon, but may rather create challenges during data analysis as the transcript will be large.

Qualitative research aims for depth as well as breadth, the analysis of large numbers of in-depth interviews would be unmanageable. Similarly, Molapisi (2009:33) who used phenomenological approach in her study on challenges and coping mechanisms associated with the transition from high school to university argues that the goal of qualitative research is enriching understanding of an experience and not how data were gathered or from how many sources.

An individual person can generate hundreds or thousands of concepts in phenomenological research. Large samples are therefore not needed because data from only a few individuals who experienced the phenomenon- and who can provide a detailed account of their experience - might suffice to uncover its core elements (Starks & Trinidad, 2007).Englander (2012), Leedy and Ormrod (2014) and Creswell (2013) indicate that a typical sample size for phenomenological studies ranges from 1 to 10 persons who have direct experience with the phenomena being studied. Starks and Trinidad (2007) recommend a typical size of 5 to 25 individuals, Morse (1994) recommends a minimum of 6 while Groenewald (2004) recommends 2 to 10 participants. In this research five (5) participants (senior municipal officials) who have had direct experience with planning activities in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality were sampled.

Sampling methods and their relevance to a particular study are critical to any scientific inquiry. Wilmot (2005) states that qualitative research uses non-probability sampling as it does not aim to produce a statistically representative sample or draw statistical inferences. Ritchie, Lewis, Elam, Tennant and Rahim (2014:113) posit that the selection of participants in purposive sampling is criterion-based or purposive. Members of a sample are chosen with a 'purpose'- to represent a type in relation to a key criterion. They further indicate that a key feature of purposive sampling is that sample criteria are prescribed based on known characteristics like socio-demographic or factors such as experience, behaviour, roles amongst the others related to the research problem.This was also a case in the sampling for this research where respondents were required to possess knowledge on municipal strategic planning processes and reporting or experience on how a municipal council processes issues relating to community needs

identification, prioritisation, budgeting and adoption of IDPs and related policies. Creswell (2007:125) explains that in purposive sampling the researcher selects individuals and sites of the study because they "can purposefully inform an understanding of the research problem and central phenomenon in the study". Purposive sampling is a selection of a sample on the basis of knowledge of the population and the purpose of the study. This sampling method is based on the judgement of the researcher regarding the characteristics of a representative sample (Phago, 2010). Molapisi (2009) agrees that purposive sampling is the appropriate sampling method for phenomenological studies. It is a non-random sampling method that selects respondents based on particular knowledge already held about a certain population, and attempts to ensure that certain types of individuals or persons displaying certain attributes are included in the study (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006; Molapisi, 2009; Wilmot, 2005).

This research employed "criterion purposive sampling" to select participants. Creswell (1998:118) posits that this works well when all individuals studied represent people who have experienced the phenomenon.This is supported by Palinkas, Horwitz, Green, Wisdom, Duan and Hoagwood (2013), who highlight that in "criterion purposive sampling" research participants are drawn from agencies, organisation or systems involved in the implementation process of the phenomenon under study, the researcher sets criteria for participants to meet so that they become part of the sample, for example, playing a specific role in the organisation or implementing process. Participants are selected based on the assumption that they possess knowledge and experience with the phenomenon of interest and they will be able to provide information that is both detailed (depth) and generalisable (breadth). Criterion purposive sampling suited this research because it assisted the researcher to select participants from within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipal officials (population) who have experience with regard to municipal planning activities, for example those who have atleast five years at senior management level and were exposed to municipal council processes of developing and adopting IDPs and budgets.

As explained above participants in criterion purposive sampling must be drawn from agencies or organisations or systems involved in the implementation of the processes of the phenomenon under study and they have to meet set criteria. In this research the participants were drawn from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipal officials who are involved in municipal planning activities (Integrated Development Plan activities). They had to be senior officials who were responsible for planning and reporting, who participated in municipal strategic planning sessions where municipal goals and priorities are developed and also in council meetings were such goals, priorities, programmes and policies are adopted. Since the Integrated Development Plan is a five year plan it was expected that such officials should have had five years and more in such a position to acquire the knowledge and experience. Participants were expected to have knowledge and experience of the following critical IDP aspects so that they could give insight with regard to the research problem in this study: (1) stake-holders co-ordination in IDP processes, (2) municipal budgeting, (3) public participation processes, (4) spatial planning, (5) local economic development,(6) strategies and policy development, (7) inter-governmental relations, (8) policy implementation, monitoring, evaluation and reporting,(9) migration management, (10) social cohesion and (11) social security programmes which include disaster management, crime prevention and provision of social justice. Based on these criteria the following officials were selected for interviews:

3.5.1 Chief Finance officer

The Chief Finance Officer is central to municipal planning. The Chief Finance Officer is in charge of the budget and treasury office of the municipality, advises the accounting officer and other senior officials on the exercise of powers and duties assigned to them and assists and in the preparation and implementation of the municipality's budget.This is precisely in accordancewith section 81 of the Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act (Act 56 of 2003) as well as other relevant legislative prescripts. Since planning and local budgets intersect (Huddleston, 2005), the Chief Finance Officer was therefore relevant to this research in the sense that he possessed the required experience and knowledge with regard to the municipality's finance plan that is, the total

municipal budget (revenue sources), how it is allocated and the knowledge of national legislative imperatives directing and regulating national priorities and the municipal finance plan.The CFO would be critical in aligning the municipal budgets with IDP thereby ensuring that prioritised community needs are allocated necessary funding.

3.5.2 Manager responsible for Integrated Development Planning

The Manager is responsible for the overall municipal planning process, including developing process plans, information collation with regard to IDP, co-ordinating and facilitating IDP consultative forums and developing draft IDP submissions to council for adoption. The Manager serves as a link between the municipality and other stakeholders relating to municipal planning issues. The Manager must have knowledge with regard to national legislative frameworks and government's development priorities. Participation of the IDP Manager in this research was critical because this research relates to the manager's day-to-day activities in relation to developing a proper municipal IDP which, amongst others, considers population dynamicsof its locality and prioritises basic service needs of the community.

3.5.3 Manager responsible for Municipal Performance Management System

This Manager has the responsibility to monitor and oversee the implementation of the IDP and to generate the municipality's annual reports. These are critical reports that reflect the manner in which municipalities are discharging their constitutional mandates. They form the basis on which municipalities account to their residents and to other spheres of government (that is provincial and national legislatures and other organs of state that empower democracy). The Manager was also very critical to this research because his knowledge and experience would assist in understanding how the municipality implements its plans and accounts to various stakeholders including community members and other spheres of government. His knowledge of national legislative frameworks with regard to municipal planning was important to this research because it assisted in bringing insight on how different pieces of legislation impact on municipalities especially with regard to planning.

3.5.4 Economic and Land Development Director

The Director is responsible for formulation, implementation and maintenance of a comprehensive local economic development plan and for spatial planning for land development in the municipality. The manager is, therefore, in the centre of issues relating to migration, like employment opportunities, settlements, housing and liveable environment, amongst others. The participation of the Economic and Land Development Director in this research was important, because his knowledge and experience provided a deeper understanding with regard to how migration influences planning in the municipality.

3.5.5 Community Services Director

The researcher identified that this Director was also critical to the study as she is responsible for issues related to community services like sports and recreation, disaster management, protection services, health and education and environmental management. The responsibilities assigned to this position were also central to the research topic because they shed light on how the municipality deals with issues of social integration and security which are pertinent to migration management.

3.6 DATA COLLECTION

Creswell (2013:146) defines data collection as a series of interrelated activities aimed at gathering good information to answer research question for the study. Glesne and Peskin (1992:24) indicate that a researcher should make sure that s/he chooses techniques that are likely to elicit the data needed to gain understanding of the phenomenon in question, contribute different perspectives on the issue and make effective use of time available for data collection.

Sanders (1982:356) cites three types of data collection in phenomenological research, namely: 1) In-depth, semi-structured oral history interview with the subjects that are tape recorded; later the recordings are transcribed; 2) A documentary study, in which the writings of the subjects are reviewed to derive 'meanings' from them. This technique

often is used in conjunction with the first and 3) participants' observation techniques, that is, observing the subjects in an actual situation in which they engage in behaviours related to the phenomena under investigation to explore particular behaviours in greater depth. Creswell (1998:120) further highlights that there are four basic types of data collection: observation, interviews, documents and audio-visual materials. Guest *et al.* (2013) argue that the most commonly used data collection methods in qualitative inquiry are participant observation, in-depth interview and focus group. Snape and Spencer (in Maruster & Gijsenberg, 2013:7) indicate that data collection methods in qualitative research involve close interactive and developmental contact between the researcher and the researched participants, to allow for emergent issues to be explored and that such data are very detailed, information rich and extensive. Similarly,Lester (1999) posits that data collection in phenomenology is through gathering deep information and perceptions through inductive, qualitative methods such as interviews, discussions, participant observation, action research, focus meetings and analysis of personal texts and then representing it from the perspective of the research participant(s).

Researchers such as Adjai and Lazaridis (2013) who studied migration, xenophobia and racism in post-Apartheid South Africa used interviews and literature review (documentary analysis) which included official reports, documentation,speeches and policy initiatives made by migrant-non-governmental organisations on their websites, in press releases and newspaper articles in their studies. Similarly, this research employed two data collection methods, namely semi-structured, in-depth interviews as primary data collection method and official institutional document analysis to enhance and corroborate information collected from semi-structured interviews.

3.6.1 Semi-structured, in-depth interviews

Kvale (1996:2) defines interview as an interchange of views between two persons conversing about a theme of mutual interest. Interviews are particularly suited for studying people's understandings of the meanings in their lived world, describing their experiences and self-understanding, and clarifying and elaborating their own perspectiveson their lived world. Schuh and Upcraft (2001) state that interviewing is a valuable assesment tool because it allows the participants to share their experiences,

attitudes and believes in their own words. The use of direct quotations in the assessment findings helps the researcher to present an accurate depiction of what is being evalusted. The authors further indicate that interviews can either be structured, semi-structured or unstructured.

According to Phago (2010:305) in Public Administration Studies interviews are more popular than many other methods of data collection. Qualitative interviews are differentiated as unstructured, semi-structured and structured (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). The most common form of data collection in qualitative research is the audio-taped phenomenological interview with a person who has lived through the experience under investigation and other forms such as diaries (Usher & Jackson in Birks & Mills 2014:188). Morse and Richards (2002), Chan, Fung and Chien (2013), Creswell (2013) and Leedy and Ormrod (2014) agree that the data collection method in phenomenological study depends almost exclusively on lengthy, in-depth semi-structured or unstructured interviews. Since it is not the objective of this research to discuss different qualitative research interviews, only semi-structured in-depth interviews which are used as the primary data collection in this research is discussed.

DiCicco-Bloom and Crabtree (2006) argue that semi-structured in-depth interviews are the most widely used interviewing format for qualitative research and that they can occur either with an individual or in groups. According to Usher andJackson (in Birks & Mills, 2014), phenomenological interviews are in-depth interviews, most often semi-structured in nature, and featuring open-ended questions carefully chosen to elicit the desired information. Kvale (1996: 5-6) describes a semi-structured life-world interview as one whose purpose is to obtain descriptions of the life-world of the interviewee with respect to interpreting the meaning of the described phenomena. Semi-structured interviews allow interaction between the researcher and the respondents (Phago, 2010). Adding to this, Schuh and Upcraft (2001) state that semi-structured interviews involve some planning, but there is freedom to vary the course of the interview based on the participant's reseponses.

Technically, the qualitative research interview is semi-structured: it is neither an open conversation nor a highly structured questionnaire. It is conducted according to an

interview guide that focuses on certain themes and that may include suggested questions (Kvale, 1996:27). Seidman (1998) also confirms that in in-depth phenomenological based interviewing the interviewers use primarily open-ended questions to have the participants reconstruct their experiences within the topic under study. However Snape and Spencer (2013:156) argue that a good interview may require closed questions to understand the interviewees' perspectives in depth and to focus their attention to the topic. Yeo, Legard, Ritchie, Lewis, Elam, Tennant and Rahim (in Ritchie, Lewis, Nicholls & Ormston, 2014) confirm that closed questions are also important in the research to manage the interview process subtly, where the researcher would like the participant to focus on a particular topic.

Authors and researchers have different views on how long phenomenological interviews should be. Usher and Jackson (2014) for example posit that phenomenological interviews are usually long ranging for 45 to 90 minutes whileMorse and Richards (2002), Chan *et al.* (2013) Creswell (2013), Snape and Spencer (2013) and Leedy and Ormrod (2014) agree that phenomenological interviews last almost 40 to 120 minutes.

At the rootof in-depth interviewing is an interest in understanding the experience of other people and the meaning they make of that experience (Seidman, 1998). Yeo *et al.* (2014:190) indicate that the aim of the in-depth interview is to achieve both *breadth* of coverage across key issues, and *depth* of content within each.

DiCicco-Bloom and Crabtree (2006) indicate that the first question in a semi-structured in-depth interview should be broad and open-ended, should reflect the nature of the research and be non-threatening. Yeo *et al.* (in Ritchie *et al.,* 2014:190) support this by saying open questions are the standard tool of in-depth interviewing. During the interview the researcher will use broad and open questions which will be followed by a series of questions in response to the answer given. According to Phago (2010) semi-structured interviews allow follow up questions to be posed to respondents. Similarly Guest *et al.* (2013) agree that interviews in qualitative research use open-ended questions which allow research participants to talk about a topic in their own worlds, free of the constraints imposed by fixed response questions that are generally used in quantitative studies. Another advantage of using open-ended questions is that

researchers can get information not anticipated by them. Similarly, someauthors (Chan *et al.,* 2013; Creswell 2013; Kvale, 1996; Leedy & Ormrod, 2014; Morse & Richards, 2002; Snape & Spencer, 2014) state that in most cases interviews in phenomenological studies are face-to-face using open-ended questions which are followed by probes and prompts which are carefully chosen to elicit the desired information. These authors argue that semi-structured interview guides with a sequence of themes as well as set of suggested questions are developed in advance to steer and guide the interview. The interviewer will be guided by the schedule rather than dictated by it; the interviewer is free to probe interesting areas that arise from participants' interests or concerns.

Yeo *et al.* (in Ritchie *et al.*, 2014:194-195) posit that during interviews a researcher uses probes, which are responsive, follow-up questions which elicit more information, description or explanation. According to these authors probes are important to assist the participants to elaborate further on something they have said (provide a more in-depth description of the phenomenon or their experiences of it), to find out why people act, think, feel or react in the way they do, to explore impacts, effects and consequences, to understand underlying values, views or experiences which help to illuminate the meaning that experiences hold for interviewees or motivations behind their actions, to clarify the participants' perspectives fully especially of the terms they use so that researchers understand them fully and lastly to challenge inconsistencies that may emerge in a participant's account during interviews. DiCicco-Bloom and Crabtree (2006) indicate that prompts are used when the researcher introduces ideas into the interview and seeks the participants' views on them or when there are aspects that the researcher would like to know about but that the participants have not raised spontaneously.Furthermore these authors indicate that prompts can also help to clarify a question or stimulate a response if the researcher senses the participant is struggling, to allow clarification of interesting and relevant issues raised by participants and to allow the interviewer to explore and clarify inconsistencies within the participants' narratives.In addition Leedy and Ormrod (2014:148) and Stark and Trinidad (2007:1376) mention that the researcher in phenomenological interviews listens closely as participants describe their everyday experiences related to the phenomenon, and that the

researcher must be alert for subtle yet meaningful clues in the participants' expressions, pauses, questions, and occasional sidetracks.

This research employed face-to-face semi-structured in-depth interviews with the selected Greater Tubatse Local Municipality officials to collect primary data. Researchers such as Barsanti (2014) Harrison (2008) Mahomed-Patel (2002) and Osman (2009) also used face-to-face semi-structured in-depth interviews in their phenomenological studies and found that they are effective. Just as Barsanti (2014), the researcher also used open-ended questions to assist participants to reflect openly on their experiences. In-depth interviews were necessary in this study to allow the researcher to delve deeply into the participants' understanding of municipal planning and their understanding on how migration influences such planning. In addition the choice of this technique was important to this research to fill a gap in knowledge that other studies which used different methods could not bridge. This was also to help understand the behaviour and motivation of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planners and decision makers (councillors) towards migration and municipal planning. Furthermore, the data collection technique was important to collect diversity of meaning, opinion and experiences from municipal officials involved in planning with regarding migration, municipal planning and legislative frameworks governing migration management. The technique gave the researcher an opportunity to evaluate the validity of the participants' responses by observing their non-verbal cues (indicators) during the interview which are lacking in other methods. Face-to-face interviews also made it possible for the researcher to explain and clarify questions that the participants did not understand and at the same time giving the researcher the opportunity to confirm the understanding of the participants' responses through probes and prompts.

Following Creswell (2007) and Leedy and Ormrod (2014) the researcher started the interview processes by identifying, recording and bracketing his preconceived notions, personal experiences (epoche) and expectation with regard to phenomenon under study (Appendix A: Researcher's Bracketing). *Bracketing means that all scientific, philosophical, cultural, and everyday assumptions had to be put aside* (Moran, 2000:7). The author further argues that in genuine phenomenological research, researchers are

not permitted any scientific or philosophical hypotheses and they should attend only to the phenomena in the manner of their being given to them, in their modes of givenness. Bracketing in this research was essential to limiting researcher's biased conclusion to research data and to ensure that only the perspectives of the participants were considered. In line with semi-structured interviewing technique a topic guide identifying key topics and issues that would be covered during the interview including open-ended questions, probes and prompts was developed (Kvale, 1996). (See Appendix B: Topic Guide). The topic guide was developed only to guide the interview process and it was not followed rigidly.

Interviews started with broad, general and open-ended questions. That was meant to encourage participants to talk freely and also to set the parameters of the topic without them being channelled. Responses from the participants determined subsequent questions and next interventions. The responses were followed by probes (verbal and non-verbal, like gestures) and prompts (items to which the researcher explicitly directs the participant's attention rather than ones raised by the participant). That encouraged participants to open up, expand and provide more detail to their responses. Closed questions were also used in this research to maintain fluidity and to intrigue the attention of participants in the interview. Throughout the interview participants were directed to thoughts which they had not explored before and were invited to put forward ideas and suggestions on particular topics and propose solutions for problems raised during interview. Interviews were recorded using an audio recorder and interviewer's note book. Interviews lasted between 40 minutes to 1hour and 40 minutes.

3.6.2 Document analysis

Bowen (2009) defines document analysis as a systematic procedure for reviewing or evaluating documents both printed and electronic. This author further indicates that documents are analysed to elicit meaning, gain understanding and develop empirical knowledge relevant to the research problem. Documents contain text (words) and images that have been recorded without a researcher's interventions and can be used to supplement and contextualise data collected through interviews. Furthermore, the author indicates that document analysis yields data, excerpts, quotations or entire

passages that are then organised into major themes, categories and case examples through content analysis.

In this research official institutional documents of the Graeter Tubatse Local Municipality were reviewed as a means of triangulation (which is the combination of methodologies in the study of the same phenomena). Triangulation was used in this research to seek convergence and corroboration of information obtained from interviewing respondents. This was to provide a confluence of evidence that breeds credibility and to reduce impact of biases that could arise if a single study method was used. The advantage of using document review in this research is that documents are unobtrusive and non-reactive and therefore unaffected by the research process. Documents were also important in this research because they are stable and could not be altered by the researcher's presence.

The number of documents is not important, what is important is the quality of the documents and the evidence they contain in relations to the purpose and design of the study (Bowen, 2009). This author further indicates that the relevance of documents, their authenticity, credibility, accuracy and representativeness of selected documents must be determined based on the original purpose of the document, the reason it was produced and the target audience. In this research the following documents were selected based on their relevance to the research purpose: (1) Two Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Integrated Development Plans for 2008-2011and 2013/2014, (2) Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Annual Reports for the financial years 2008/2009 and 2011/2012 and (3) the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Turn-around Strategy Report for 2011. These documents show activities undertaken by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in its municipal planning processes and how implementation of the municipal plans was done. The researcher ensured that documents reviewed were official documents of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, produced through official processes such as adoption by the Greater Tubatse Municipal Council or by officials who had beendelegated the powers to do so. The documents were selected to corroborate information collected from interviews with municipal officials to help explore how migration influences planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

3.7 DATA ANALYSIS

Phago (2010) posits that in order to ensure that a research problem of any research is properly understood, primary data need to be collected. The collection of primary data is usually followed by the need to analyse and interpret data to ensure that their use is maximised and properly understood. As indicated in sections 3.6.1 and 3.6.2 above, semi-structured in-depth personal interviews and documentary analysis were used to collect primary data in this research.The aim of conducting research is to produce findings. Data analysis is the process of bringing order, structure and meaning to the mass of collected data (Osman, 2009). Boeijie (2010:75) defines data analysis as the processing of data in order to answer the research question which consists of segmenting (unfolding, unravelling, breaking up, separating or disassembling) and re-assembling of data with the aim of transforming the data into findings. Pieces of data are compared in order to determine their similarities and differences and whether they should be grouped together into categories or not.

Some authors such as Sanders (1982), Kvale (1996), Boeijie (2010),Snape and Spencer (in Maruster & Gijsenberg, 2013), Blanche, Durrheim and Kelly (2012) Cresswell (2007, 2009,2013), Usher and Jackson (2014) and Leedy and Ormrod (2014) agree on the following principles with regard to data analysis in qualitative research and phenomenology in particular:

1. There is no clear point at which data collection stops and analysis begins. Hence qualitative data analysis is considered as an ongoing process over the life cycle of a research project.
2. Phenomenological data analysis is a process which begins with a close and repeated engagement with data.
3. The central task of data analysis is to identify commonalities and differences and contexts raised by participants in descriptions of their experiences of a particular phenomenon so as to develop an overall meaning of that phenomenon. This is because different people experience the same phenomenon in different ways and attach different meanings and

interpretations. Their concerns and common meanings are acknowledged by treating all their statement with equal worth, what is called horizonalisation.This is a process where interview transcripts are reviewed and combed for significant or meaningful statements or "horizons" according to similarities of the experiences described by the participants (Barsanti, 2014:109).

4. Data analysis in qualitative research is open to emergent concepts and ideas and it may produce detailed description and classification, identify patterns of association or develop typologies and explanations.

5. Steps in data analysis are interconnected and form a spiral activity related to the analysis and representation of the data.

6. During analysis, phenomenological reduction is practised, which involves bracketing, eidetic reduction and epoche. Bracketing means suspending or setting aside the researcher's biases, his/her everyday understandings, theories, beliefs and habitual modes of thoughts or judgements. According to Creswell (2007: 59-60) the bias of the researcher regarding the phenomenon being studied in any research method could lead to a misinterpretation of the data and erroneous conclusions regardless of the detail and thoroughness which could taint the results. This author indicates that it is a sound practice in phemonenological research to identify and attempt to limit researcher's point of view and areas that could create bias and thereby nullify the researcher's conclusions. Furthermore this author emphasises that a researcher must approach the phenomenon with an open mind and attempt to remain faithful to the description of experiences of the participants. Similarly Giorgi (2006:357) posits that for proper application of phenomenological reduction a researcher has to list all the assumptions he or she has with regard to the phenomenon being studied in order to avoid them having a role in analysis.

7. Data analysis involves organising the data by transcribing the recorded interviews, conducting a preliminary read-through of database, organising text (statements) into meaning units, coding the units, transforming units into meanings represented as phenomenological concepts or themes, themes are

then linked to form a detailed deep description of the experience or constructing a composite essence.

Data analysis in this research was conducted in accordance with the research objectives, using questions in the interview schedule in a manner aspiring to establish thematic meaning of the research. The aim was to search for underlying statements and relationships in the data gathered. The researcher followed the examples of other phenomenological researchers (Harrison, 2008; Mahomed-Patel, 2002; Osmans, 2009) who successfully applied the principles discussed by authors in the preceding paragraph in their studies. The researcher followed the following steps in the data analysis:

1. The researcher's personal experiences, perceptions and biases with the phenomena under study were described and set aside so that the focus could be directed to the participants in the research, while ensuring that the researcher's views did not influence the analysis. This was done during the data collection stage (see Appendix A: Researcher's bracketing). That was to ensure that the researcher works inductively with the new data to generate new descriptions and conceptualisations.

2. The recorded interviews were transcribed verbatim and summarised together with documents analysed.

3. The transcripts were read in their entirety several times.

4. The bulky and diverse data from the interviews and documents analysed were then separated into meaningful parts by listing significant statements on how participants understand or experienced the municipal planning activities, which was further corroborated by the documents studied. All statements were treated equally. Creswell (2007, 2013) refers to this process as *horizontalisation*.

5. The separated parts were then coded or given summarising labels. The documents were read again and coded until no new fragments/units emerged. That is called *saturation*.

6. The separated parts that were believed to belong together were combined into broader categories or groups (themes), called *thematisation* (Creswell 2013). Firstly that was done based on the descriptive themes as agreed upon by the researcher and his supervisor as an expert in the field of research. Secondly, it was done by establishing the relevance of the remaining categories to the research, eliminating the irrelevant ones, listing and translating those relevant into Public Administration terms and then categorising them as emergent themes (Mahomed-Patel 2002).

7. A description of what the participants in the study experienced with the phenomena was given and further corroborated by document analysis, including verbatim examples.

8. The essence of the experience or the composite description of the phenomena, which is the culmination of a phenomenological study, was written. It is typically a long paragraph that tells the reader what the participants experienced with the phenomena and how they experienced it.

A full extent of data analysis and interpretation with regard to this research is undertaken in chapter four of the research report.

3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Before the data collection processes commenced, the following ethical issues were addressed:

3.8.1 Gaining access and making rapport

Before data collection processes could start, permission to conduct the study was sought from the Greater Tubatse Municipality. The researcher sent a letter of request (see Appendix C: Permission Letter to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality) accompanied by a support letter from the University of Limpopo (see Appendix D: Support Letter from Limpopo University) to the municipality, requesting permission to research on the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.Permission was granted by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to conduct the research (see Appendix E: Permission Letter from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality).

3.8.2 Communication with participants and protection of their information.

To show the researcher's respect for participants all identified participants were telephonically contacted to request for their permission to participate in the research and to agree on date, time and venue where the interview would be held. Though an effective site with minimal obstruction was the requirement for the interview, sites were identified based on the convenience of individual participant. The purpose of the research and its procedures were explained to them to enable them to take an informed decision. A consent form was sent to each participant explaining their right to voluntarily choose to participate or not to participate in the research (see Appendix F: Interview Consent Form). Participants were also informed about their rights to discontinue their participation at any stage without exposing themselves to any risks. They were equally informed that their identity would remain anonymous and pseudonyms would be used and their departments not mentioned. The researcher confirmed to them that they would not be manipulated and that their individual rights would be respected. They were requested to sign a consent form which explained the above.

The interviews were audio-recorded with the permission of participants.

3.9 CONCLUSION

Qualitative research is an intense process that uses a variety of approaches to research a problem. This research used a phenomenological approach to study how migration influences municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. The use of phenomenology enabled the researcher to interact with research participants who have lived experience about municipal planning processes through semi-structured interviews to explore their understanding, views, feelings and experience in relation to the research topic. Document review was also done to enhance and corroborate the narratives by the research participants. Throughout the data collection process the researcher was

conscious of his subjective knowledge about the topic which was espoused and bracketed.

The findings, analysis and interpretation of data are discussed in chapter four.

CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF DATA

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Chapter three undertook an elaboration regarding the research design and methodology to justify the manner in which the data were handled in this research. In-depth semi-structured interviewed and document analysis were used as the main data collection methods and supplemented with a literature review in chapter two. An attempt was made to keep the semi-structured personal interviews and document analysis in line with the study objectives of this research. It should, however, be indicated that in phenomenological studies new themes do emerge from time to time as the nature of the methodology is based on the experience of the interviewees. Hence the interview guide only serves to guide the interviews. In fact the formulation of the interview guide was done using the study objectives in chapter one. A summary of the responses of interviewees and document analysis is provided in line with each of the study objectives and the themes as espoused in the interview guide. The primary focus of this chapter is to present the findings and also to analyse data obtained. Data analysis and interpretation of the results are discussed below. Extracts and examples of participants' responses and statements from official documents analysed are quoted to justify the researcher's findings.

4.2 DATA ANALSIS AND INTERPRETATION

Phago (2010:310) argues that in order to ensure that a research problem of any research is properly understood, primary data need to be collected. This is usually followed by the analysis and interpretation of the data to ensure that their use is maximised and properly understood. According to Barsanti (2014: 99), a phenomenological approach to data analysis differs in several ways from other traditional qualitative approaches, such as case study, ethnography and grounded theory. Data analysis and interpretation of this research is undertaken below, following the steps outlined in Section 3.7 of chapter three discussed above.

4.2.1 Bracketing of the researcher

As indicated in chapter three (see Section 3.7) of this researchreport, the first step within the phenomenological approach to data analysis involves full disclosure and suspending or setting aside of the researcher's own experiences, perceptions, beliefs and interpretations of events with regard to the phenomena under investigation, referred to as "bracketing". Chan *et al.* (2013) state that bracketing is a method of demonstrating the validity of the findings after initiating a phenomenological research in that it demonstrates that researchers attempted not to influence the data collection and analysis processes. These scholars argue that the researchers' foreknowledge and suppositions limit their understanding of participants' perspectives because they already know a great deal about the phenomena under investigation. Hence the need for bracketing arises. According to Giorgi (2006:357) if one does not employ eidetic reduction (bracketing) and arrive at the essence or some type of eidetic invariant concerning the concrete, detailed description of an experienced phenomenon by one or several participapants, then the proper phenomenological procedures have not been followed. As indicated in chapter three, Section 3.7, a researcher's bracketing was done during data collection stage wherein the researcher's experience in municipal planning activities was disclosed (see APPENDIX A: Researcher's bracketing).

4.2.2 Transcription of tape recorded interviews and summary of the transcripts and documentsanalysed

In the second step the researcher transcribed the recorded semi-structured in-depth interviews verbatim and summarised the official documents which were analysed in this research. The transcripts were e-mailed to participants as a sign of reciprocity and so that they coule correct errors of facts and make changes to their responses where they deemed fit. According to Chan *et al.* (2013), soliciting participants' views regarding the

way their responses are captured is important in a phenomenological research as it serves to ensure that the researcher does not misinterpret them. According to these scholars, this exercise is also important in phenomenological research because it demonstratesvalidation of research findings. All participants confirmed telephonically that the transcriptions represented their views. The researcher then read the transcriptsagain in their entirety several times to acquaint himself with the concepts used by participants in the interviews and those used in the official documents.

4.2.3Separating and coding of data from interviews and documentary analysisinto meaningful parts

In the third step the researcher separated a list of statements deriving from the semi-structured in-depth interviews and official documents into meaningful parts or horizons according to how participants experienced or understood municipal planning activities. Creswell (2007, 2013) refers to this process as "horizontalisation".In this process, the researcher treated each statement by attributing equal worth. The separated parts or horizons were coded or given labels. The researcher used abbreviations to code the statements from participants and official documents (see APPENDIX G: Horizontalisation and coding of semi-structured interviews and official documents). Phago (2010: 323) says that coding assists the researcher to interrogate the data to ensure that the respondents have been understood properly by the researcher. Boeijie (2010) argues that it is impossible to state the number of codes one research should have, as that depends on the individual research project, but at the same time suggests that 50 codes may be sufficient for a small scale study while as many as 100 to 200 codes could be used for a large scale investigation. In this research 50 codes were identified. The researcher read the transcripts and the summarised versions of the documents again to find out new codes. Coding ended when no more new codes emerged from interviews and document analysis; this is referred to as *saturation.*Horizontalisation highlighted the different ways in which municipal officials, who were interviewed in the research, experienced and understood municipal planning activities and migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. It also showed the

number of participants and number of statements they made within a particular code. Since phenomenological research is not interested in the frequency of statements but their relevance to the topic under investigation, horizontalisation in the research was therefore not intended to present frequency of participants' statements *per se* but to identify commonalities, differences and the contexts in which participants raised those statements in describing their experiences and understanding on how migration influences municipal planning.

4.2.4 Development of themes

In the fourth step the separated parts that were believed to belong together were combined into broader categoies or themes (see APPENDIX H: Categorisation of statements into themes). Firstly, that was done based on the three focus areas which the researcher identified in chapter one (see Section 1.6) as the objective of the research, namely (1) causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, (2) prioritisation and decisions regarding resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and (3) the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Secondly, this was done by identifying new themes that emerged from the participants' responses which are relevant to the topic on top of those identified by the researcher at the begining of the research. Some authors (Sanders, 1982; Kvale, 1996; Boeijie, 2010, Durrheim & Painter, 2012; Creswell 2007, 2009, 2013, Leedy & Ormorod) agree data analysis in qualitative research is open to emergent concepts and ideas. Similarly in Mahomed-Patel (2002), Harrison (2008) and Osmans (2009), who have used phenomenological approach in their studies, new themes emerged from the interviews on top of those identified by researchers beforehand and agreed upon with their supervisors. Finlay (2012) and Leedy and Ormrod (2013) emphasise the importance of considering emergent themes by researchers using a phenomenological approach in their studies, because the aim of using such an approach is to gain a better understanding of the experiences of others, apart from personal experiences which researchers have, related to phenomena under investigation.These authors argue that researchers should be open to a new

understanding- to be open to the phenomenon in order to go beyond what they already know from experience or through established knowledge. Similarly, in this research, apart from the three themes identified by the researcher at the beginning of the research to be relevant in responding to the research problem, four new themes which are also relevant to the research topic emerged from the remaining categories. This happened after irrelevant categories were eliminatedfrom the participants' responses. Thethemes emergingfrom the semi-structured in-depth interviews in this research are, (1) the effects of legislative framework on migration and municipal planning, (2) the influence of inter-governmental relations on migration and municipal planning, (3) the impact of migration data on municipal planning and (4) the influence of powers and functions of municipalities on the consideration of migration in municipal planning.

The seven themes from the semi-structured in-depth interviewsare justified and discussed in greater detail in relation to the literature review as detailed in chapter three of the research. In some cases these themes overlap, but for the sake of clarity and understanding they were discussed separately.As indicated in chapter three of this research report (see Section 3.6.2), an analysis of the Greater Tubatse Local Muncipality's official documents was undertaken to corroborate the experiences and understanding of municipal officials who were interviewed in the research on the effects migration on municipal planning. The analysis of these documents is also reflected in the overall discussion of the seven themes below.

4.2.4.1 Causes of migration

In this theme participants shared with the researcher what they know to be the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local municipality. Participants started by indicating that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is a mining area. The municipality experiences a huge amount of migration. Document analysis also corroborated this view.Participants used words like '*influx*' and '*flocking'* in their statements to express that people move in large numbers to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Words like ''influx'' are commonly usedby Public Adminitration scholars (Polzer, 2010; Mvuyana, 2010; Phago, 2010), especially in population dynamics studies to express the

entry or inflow of a large number of people in a particular area. Crush *et al.* (2005), who studied migration in Southern Africaalso used the word "influx'' to describe the fact thatpeople migrate in South Africa inlarge numbers.

Participant onefor example used the word "influx'' to indicate the many people from outside migratinginto the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.He said:"*There is an influx of people into the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as people are looking for work in the mines".*In the same token,participant three used the word "flocking" to denote the same view. Participant three for example said*: "We are facing a situation of people are flocking into Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and those who move out."*Similarly, these statements agree with those of other participants in the research and confirm what was already stated in the backgroung of the sudy area in the research (see chapter one, section 1.9.2.), namely that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is endowed with mineral resources and already there are 30 mines which influence migration patterns of this area. Participant four, for example,says that there is this boom of mines in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, where there are around 26 mines that have been developed. These mines will obviously need labour. This labour is not confined to the residents of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, because there is a need of differentiated skills in the mines which locals cannot supply. The analysis of official docments also indicates the experiences shared by municipal officials that migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is due to miningactivities in the area. Page 10 of the Annual Report of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality of 2008/2009 states that there are about 30 mines in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, of which 15 are currently in the processes of being opened while others have been in existence since as far back as 1920s.There is, therefore, a growing population in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality due to these increasing mining activities.

When asked about the patterns of migration that feed into the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, participants generally agree that there are different forms of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. People are coming from different places, namelyfrom outside the country, from other provinces and municipalities and those who move internally for examplefrom rural to urban areas. Participant one, for example,

remarked that even people from outside South Africa come here. In his response to the question, participant two responded as follows: "*We have different movements of people in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. People are coming from places like Rustenburg, Lesotho and Eastern Cape to the GTLM because of mining activities.*" In the same token, participant three and four indicted that they come to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality from various provinces like North-West, Gauteng, Mpumalanga and Eastern Cape, while others come from neighbouring countries such as Zimbabwe and Mozambique. Participant four indicated that there is also internal migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. His remarksare asfollows: "*There is what we call internal migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. A number of people are moving from the deep rural areas of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and come closer to towns such as Burgersfort.*" The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's IDP (2013/14:46) corroborates the statements from the participants and indicates that there is a voluntary movement of young people from the rural settlements to towns like Steelpoort and Burgersfort.

Participants furthermore indicate that there aredifferent reasons for the migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Firstly, migration is due to economic factors where migrants are looking for jobs, higher positions and business opportunities. They want to be closer to workplaces or they want to acquire land, which is easily available in townships like Praktiseer or they are attracted by free provision of services in those townships, among others. Secondly, people migrate because of social factors like better developed social and engineering infrastructure such as schools, health services, water and sanitation, transportation and others in urban areas. Reasons for migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are well elucidated by the participants' statement when responding to the researcher's question: *In your opinion what makes people to migrate/ to move from one place to another especially as experienced in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?* Participant one, for example, remarked as follows: "*People, who come to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality from other areas,are looking for work, while those with experience and educated are looking for high posts. People also leave the rural areas because they want to be closer to town.*" These sentiments were also echoed by participant two, who indicated that the reasons for movement of people

97

to the Graeter Tubatse Loacal Municipality are for economic benefit; these are social reasons, as they are looking for well developed social amenities. According to participant four, people who work in mines prefer to live in towns, rather than in rural areas because of the reliable transport in towns.Some move to towns, because towns are well developed in terms of infrastructure and they provide better services. Furthermore, this participant indicated that people from the rural areas move to township like Praktiseer, because land is easily accessible and people do not pay for services in that area. The participant also indicated that there is a tendency in South Africa of people getting things for free. Therefore people always flock to areas where they think services are provided for free.

Participant two suggested that the conducts of government officials also perpetuate migration. This participant for example, said: "*The other factor that lead to migration is corruption by government officials. In most cases you find that identity documents are given to outsiders illegally, officials fiddle with beneficiary lists for provision of social housing or sell such houses to people who do not qualify. Because of corruption, people migrate to areas where they think they will get resources with ease.*"

The other migration pattern that is found in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is that of emigration. According to participants in this research, there are some people, especially the educated ones, who move out of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to other places looking for developed and advanced social facilities which are not available in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. The following extracts serve as examples:

Participant two
Mining houses also built their houses in areas like Lydenburg outside the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality because there is no water infrastructure and other amenities in Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, therefore people just come to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality for work but stay in other areas.

People who are moving outside the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are those educated like teachers and are going to places which are developed like Lebowakgomo.

98

<u>Participant three</u>

Most professionals move out Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to other cities because the GreaterTubatse Local Municipality is under-developed and rural in nature. There is a lack of infrastructure like water, roads, electricity, sanitation, poor education system, no universities, technicons, few hospitals and clinics which provide inferior services.

In most cases even people who come to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to work, do not take time in the municipality because their kids need private schools, developed infrastructure like water which are not present in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Analysis of the official municipal documents corroborate the sentiments expressed by the municipal officials (participants) interviewed in the research that migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is a result of many factors. These documents - like participants in this research - indicate that migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is due to mining activities in the area. The documents further indicate that people from rural areas move to towns like Burgersfort and Steelpoort, because they are better developed and have more diversified and advanced social and engineering services. People move closer to transport routes and others move because they are searching for employment opportunities. The documents further corroborate the statements made by participants and indicate that there is circular migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in the sense that household members, who leave their original settlements, often return to them on continuous basis, meaning that their source settlement is retained.

A new dimension that is not mentioned by any of the participants in the interviews, which is revealed by the official docments, relates to the voluntary movement of young people away from rural areas to towns and cities.

The table below illustrates the statements from official documents with regard to causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Table 1: Causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Document	Period	Statements on causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	Page
IDP	2008-2011	*Steelpoort and Burgersfort in the South have grown as a result of in-migration. All social and engineering services reveal that the southern part (Burgersfort and Steelpoort areas or urban) is better developed, more diversified and more advanced than the northern part. As a result of the rural nature of the northern area, this area has inferior social and engineering infrastructure, which impacts on the stability of the economy.* *There is a permanent shift in settlement pattern by the people in search for new residences closer to transport routes and higher levels of services.* *Even in the event of some household members moving, perhaps generated by the emergence of new employment opportunities within the district, it seems that most of the dependent family remain in the original settlement. Household members, who leave in response to employment opportunities return to the original settlement on continuous basis, meaning that the source settlement is retained.*	34 46
IDP	2013/14	*There is a voluntary movement of young people away from rural settlements*	
ANNUAL REPORT	2008/2009	*There is a population growth in the municipality due to increasing mining activities*	

4.2.4.2 Needsprioritisation and decision making regarding resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

In this theme participants gave insight into how the decisions are made and prioritisation regarding resource allocation is done in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. A central message from all participants, which is corroborated by the documentary analysis is that the municipality has public participation strategies in which different stakeholders and members of communities are engaged, before decisions are made and prioritisation of resource allocation is done. The experience of the participants is that other stakeholders, such as sector departments and business communities, like mines, are also consulted. Two participants elaborated on this by stating that communities and wards are clustered during the Intergrated Development Plan public participation processes to provide communities the opportunity for input on municipal plans. When asked about his experience with regard to needs prioritisation processes in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, participant two, for example, says: "*We firstly start by developing a desktop analysis to determine what we have in the municipality. We then call a meeting with social partners like mines and sector departments to present their plans so that they are incorporated in the broader municipal plan, called IDP. This forms what is called a status quo analysis of the municipality. The status quo analysis is then taken to communities for consultation. Before 2012/13 IDPs our communities were grouped in six clusters made up of wards which are next to one another. With the IDP processes of 2013/14 we went to every ward to give people chance to input in the plan.*" In responding to the same question, participant 3 says: "*After adopting a draft Intergrated Development Plan we go and consult with communities where we present the IDP for scrutiny by various sectors and members of community for inputs and comments.*"

Several scholars (Guwa, 2008; Phago, 2008; Mpehle, 2010; Landau et al., 2011; Netswera & Phago, 2011, 2013; Khobe, 2012; Blase & Landau, 2014; Hofisi, 2014) consulted in chapter two (in the literature review) indicate that public participation in decision making forms the bedrock of municipal planning and budgetary processes. It is central to the success of the Intergrated Development Planning in municipalities. These scholars agree that participation of community members in governance matters and decision making is a right and constitutional imperative that must be observed by all organs of state. According to these scholars involment of communities in prioritising

their needs and allocating resources will ensure ownership of such decisions and therefore reduce the likelihood of any possible protests. Similarly, when responding to the question about processes followed by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in community needs prioritisation and decision making with regard to resource allocation, participant four agrees with scholars above and highlights the centrality of community consultation in needs prioritisation, decision making and resource allocation. Participant four says: *"Central to municipal planning is the participation of communities. That is a key issue. There is no way in which you can plan without community participation, because it is the members of community that determine the programme of the municipality in terms of their needs. The consultation with the community will then inform the municipality in terms of resource allocation and the type of development that must take place in the communities that we are serving.Key to prioritisation of the needs is consultation with community.There is no way we can give services to the communities without knowing what communities want."*

Although the statements by participant fourabove show that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality consults with communities in decision making processes, it is clear from the statements made by other participants cited below that there is no evidence that migrants are considers in such decision making processes and resource allocation. All participants in the research show that there is no special consideration given to migrantsduring decision making processes in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipailty. According to the understanding of theseparticipants migrants are part of communities and they are assumed to be automatically forming part of community meetings. The views of participants are that the needs of migrants are automatically those of the communities. Scholars such as Phago (2009) and Hofisi (2014) however argue that community participation if a function of social position based on personal status such as age, sex, education, race or residence, among others, and as suchsome people feel more confident and qualified than others to get involved and participate. According to these scholars, poor people and those who lack of technical knowledge, for example, are rendered powerless, and tend to perceive themselves unqualified for participation in community consultation processes. They further argue that if such poor and less technically empowerd people are not identified and have special mechanisms

developed to accommodate them during public participation processes, their needs will not be known. Migrants are such people,because they are in most cases viewed or treated negatively by locals; they experience language barriers, while some come in the country illegally and will not want to be known for this and other reasons.

When asked to expand on how the needs prioritisation process in terms of the IDP takes into account inputs from migrant communities or whether there is any way to ensure that migrants are involved in the needs prioritisation processes in the Greater Tubatse Local Municiapality, participant two responded as follows: "*When we go to communities we do not separate who are migrants and those who are locals, unless there are new settlements where we assume that those people are from outside the municipality".*Participant three confirms this in his response and says "*During our public participation processes we do not separate people as locals or migrants. We only call communities to come and participate without separating members.The migrants form part of the meetings, because when they stay in the municipality they are residents and therefore no more migrants.***"**Similarly, participant four also highlights that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not consider migration when allocating resources. When asked, whether needs prioritisation and resource allocations take into account migration, this participant says: *"This is one issue that we (the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality) we overlook because when we do community participation we do not say today we are consulting this particular community and the following day we are going to consult migrants. We simply consult the community. It will be problematic if we can say today we are dealing with migrants and the following day a particular community. We just consult everybody. In terms of consulting migrants per se it will be difficult because we do not have a register. What you must understand is that migrants are not staying at isolated places but they are intergrated in the communities. My experience is that migrants do not have special needs unless where they need safety because they are treated as aliens and are attacked. Even in that case we do not provide safety as a municipality we only communicate such need to relevant sector department."*

Among other reasons givenby participants on why the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality fails to consider migration in prioritisation and resource allocation are the following:

- Certain needs are not within the powers and functions of the municipality.

  To extrapolate this fact participant two, for example, states the following: "*The other challenge is in Tubatse is with regard to powers and functions with regard to provision of services.... Basic services like water, electricity and sanitation are not within the municipality. Those needs are supplied to the district to plan for.*"

- Migrants stay in informal settlements which do not comply with spatial development requirements.

  In explaining this fact participant one highlighted that since some of the areas where migrants live are not formalised, the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality therefore does not include them in its plans as those areas are not suitable for the municipality to put services in. This participant further indicatesthat since those areas are informal it is difficult to put them in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's financial plans. This view is further supported by participant two who indicates that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality only budgets for people who stay in the proclaimed areas and nothing is done for those outside the proclaimed areas.

The analysis of official documents of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality (GTLM) reveals that the municipality applies several community participation mechanisms to consult its communities in needs identification, prioritisation and decision making with regard to resource allocation. As it is the case with participants in this research, there is no evidence in the documents to show thatmigrants are taken on board during these processes. This is despite the fact that some groups such as local kings and chiefs, youth, people living with disability and the elderly have specially designed programmes and meetings dedicated for them so that their views are included in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Intergrated Development Plans. As it has beenindicated before, Phago (2009) and Hofisi (2014) argue that community participation is a function of

social positions based on personal status; so it was expected that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's official documents would show that migrants are given special attention during community consultation processes. This is because migrants are defined as vulnerable groups in terms of UNDP (2009). The White Paper on Local Government (1998:49) gives a clear perspective on this by highlighting that municipalities need to be aware of the divisions within local communities and seek to promote the participation of marginalised and excluded groups in community processes. In this case municipalities must adopt inclusive approaches to fostering community participation, including strategies aimed at removing obstacles to and activelty encouraging the participation of marginalised groups in the local community.However, in the official documents analysed in this research, migration is not even mentioned in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's strategic planning forums. These are important forums, where relevant authorities responsible for migration management such as sector deparments and social partners, who are major contributors to migration, like mines, participate. The analysis of official documents on how priorities and decisions are made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is given in the table below.

Table 2: Documentary analysis on how priorities and decisions are made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Document	Period	Statements on how priorities and decisions are made with regard to resource allocation	Page
IDP	2008-2011	*The document list the following as decision-making structures for the IDP processes in the GTM:* • *Council* • *Executive committee* • *IDP Representative Forum* • *IDP Steering Committee (Municipal Manager/ IDP Manager)* *Needs are obtained during a range of workshops held with different role-players of the IDP process, namely the wards, the IDP steering Committee, Executive*	77

		committee and the IDP Representative Forum (Stakeholder organisations). The needs are identified by ward committees.	
		The municipality has developed and adopted communication strategy which is normally used as a tool during the IDP and Budget consultative processes.	78 A
			29
Turn-around strategy report	2011	*The municipality has a process plan which guides development of IDP, it adheres to the process plan, the programmes for service delivery are in line with the priorities identified by the people in the wards.*	
ANNUAL REPORT	2008/2009	*Communication strategy is in place, there are ward management committees, and a customer satisfaction survey was conducted by the Department of Local Government on behalf of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. However there is no indication of the effectiveness of the strategies or how migrants are involved in those strategies*	
ANNUAL REPORT	2011/2012	*The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has established a number of public participation forums through which it accounts to the community, namely; outreach/ imbizos(which are forums for policy discussions or report back meetings) by executive committee members, ward management committees, IDP/budget/Performance Management System forum, the state of local municipal address (SOLMA) and public dialogue on radio stations.*	43
		The municipality ran the following special programmes: meetings with traditional leaders, youth council, children programme and programme for people living with	44

		disabilities and elderly. The programmes are done as national mandate to empower the abovementioned groups. *The IDP/PMS forum comprises the municipality representatives, sector departments, business and mining houses, ward management committees and Non-governmental organisations. In the period under review (2011/2012) the forum met twice.* *Public consultation meetings were conducted at ward levels led by members of executive committee members to present draft IDP and collate inputs from communities. The approach was effective as every ward was able to present needs but attendance in some wards was not satisfactory.* *Ward management committee is a progressive structure created to represent interests of different communities' structures in their local government and assist ward councillors to carry out their duties. It is a communication channel between the residents of the ward and the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.*	

4.2.4.3 The effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

In general participants agree that migration influences municipal planning. Participant four, for example, states the following: "*This migration affects planning of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Once people migrate to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality it is this municipality that must cater for the needs of these people regardless of the province they come from. The Bill of Rights as enshrined in the 1996 Constitution gives these people right to basic services.*"

Based on the narration of participants it is clear that migration has both negative and positive effects on municipal planning. Participant 2, for example, stated: "*Migration is both good and bad.In some instances migrants bring benefits to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipalityin the form of skills that are not available in the municipality, growing the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's revenue base through payment of taxes, among others. On the negative side migrants increase the spread of diseases like HIV/Aids.*"

When asked to describe from their knowledge and experience with regard to planning activities in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality on how migration influences municipal planning in general, participants indicted that migration has both positive and negative effects on municipal planning. Responses of the participants on the positive effects of migration on municipal planning are as follow:

Participant one
Migration has some economic spin-off to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality; for example migrants who work in the mines consume some services in the area and pay for them. That enhances the growth of the revenue base of the Greater Tubatse Local Municiplaity. Furthermore, migrants bring skills that are not available in the GreaterTubatse Local Municipality. Some of those skills are used in the Local Economic Development Programmes of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to grow the municipality's economy.

<u>Participant two</u>

The only migrants who will have positive impact on the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are the skilled ones. Mines will build houses for them and they will improve the revenue base of the municipality as they pay for municipal taxes.

<u>Participant three</u>

Migration is bringing a lot of civilisation in the area. People coming from areas like Gauteng bring in different perspective of life, hereby improving the lives of the people in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

<u>Participant four</u>

On a positive side when migrants come to the Graeter Tubatse Local Municipality, those who are rich go to the urban and economically viable areas such as Aloe Ridge, where they buy properties and pay for taxes. Today, areas like Aloe Ridge are welldeveloped because of these migrants. Furthermore mines put their people there and pay taxes for property rates and services. This, therefore, expands revenue generation of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.''

The statements of participants as cited above confirm the views of scholars such as James, Romine and Zwanzig (1998) consulted in chapter two (literature review, see Section 2.3), who posit that migration has positive spin-offs to municipal planning. Both these scholars and participants in this research agree that migrationprovides specialised skills and grows the economy and the revenue base of the municipalities they settle in. A sound revenue base and strong economy are cardinal factors for sound municipal planning. Huddleston (2005) has provided a perspective on this aspect thatplanning and municipal budget do intersect. He argues that planning activities can affect in significant ways the revenue and expenditures of various municipalities. Accordingly,if a municipality has an un-sound revenue base and weak economy,its planning will be reduced to a pipe-dream, as projects and programmes will not be funded. This scholar, therefore, confirms the views of participants in this research that migration is of significant importance to the growth of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's revenue base and econmomy, which are important aspects for municipal planning.

Participants in the research furthermore confirm the findings by scholars (Daw, 2012; Dastile, 2013; Kalitany & Visser, 2010; Miheretu, 2011; Mpehle, 2014; Mvuyana, 2010; Sebola, 2012) consulted in the research (see chapter two, section 2.3) that there are perceptions among some members of the local communities, government officials and public representatives that migration has negative impacts in their areas. According to these participants, migration has the following negative effects with regard to planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality:

- Migrants put pressure on limitedsocial and engineering infrastructure such as schools, health services, housing, transportation, water and sanitation, electricity, safety and security, amongst others.
- This poses substantial economic costs.
- Migrants invade land and erectshacks all over the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.
- Migrantscompete for limited resources such as job opportunitieswith locals resulting in conflicts and fights.
- Migrantsbring social problems like crime and spread of communicable diseases such as HIV/Aids. This results in investors moving out of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to other areas where they think there are no such social ills.
- Some migrants stay in informal settlements where they do not pay for taxes and services, as they connect such services illegally.
- Some migrants have dual residences and are therefore counted twice when services are planned and provided resulting in wastage of resources.
- Migration affects the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality'sdevelopment priority focus because planning and resource allocations are directed to places where people migrate. This means that prioritisation of community needs inGreater Tubatse Local Municipality's Intergrated Development Plans is ever changing.

The views of participants are espoused in their statements below:

Participant one

People, who are supposed to pay, are staying in informal settlements enjoying free services though they are not categorised as indigents.The more you have migration, the

lesser the resources, meaning the plan will change every year. The municipality will resort to short-term interventions.

Participant two

Migrants without skills will increase informal settlements like 'Shlal'ngingane' and consume municipal services.They will increase the spread of diseases like Aids. Furthermore migrants put strain on municipal resources like water and other resources. Immediately you add a number of consumers without increasing the services, this will mean there will be an imbalance between resources and the demand.Outsiders will take over the little resources that are meant for the locals, especially indigents. You will even find that our hospitals are full of outsiders.It is clear that locals compete for everything with outsiders.

Participant three

Our sewerage systems run to full capacity due to the influx of people in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.They put a burden on infrastructure and services the municipality provide to the communities. With this influx the municipality is forced to increase the volume of services that it is providing to the people, like water supply, electricity and transportation.Because these people usually do not have money they resort to illegal connection of water and electricity, which cause shortages of supply of services and break downs.Because of migration our schools get over-populated. Migrants also cause social ills like crime, diseases and others.*We have people coming from neighbouring countries like Zimbabwe and Mozambique, who are, in most cases, illegal migrants and are the ones who are posing serious threats to the municipality, especially in terms of service provision, crime and the scourge of HIV/Aids.*

Participant four

Migration puts stress on resources. The more the population increases the more the resources are needed to provide services.In South Africa we have a very serious challenge of 'dual demand'. People move from one place to the other and in each place they need services. For example, I am here now here, but I have a house at another place. In each case, when services are given, I am also counted resulting in strain to resources. I am also a migrant. When the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality plans and

allocate resources I am counted twice. This is what I mean by dual demand.Migration has an impact on the level of crime which makes people to run away from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.The mushrooming of new settlements, which are sometimes unplanned, has impact on our spatial plan.

Some of the views and experiences shared by participants on the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are corroborated by the analysis of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipalit's official documents as espoused by the statements in the table below.

Table 3: Effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Document	Period	Statements on effects of migration on municipal planning	Page
IDP	2008-2012	*The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality identified the following challenges related to migration which have effect on municipal planning and which it does not have obvious solutions to deal with, namely: (1) provision of basic services, (2) sustainable housing delivery, (3) managing urbanisation, (4) transportation and (5) economic development.* *With rapid expansion of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, the maintenance and possibly the expansion of the sewerage plants is very critical.* *According to statistics issued by Statistics South Africa of 2001 with regard to population demography in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality there are approximately 296 077 people living in the GTLM. The Limpopo Growth and Development Strategy revealed that by 2005,the population in the growth points identified in the GTM was 18 717 which will grow up to*	9

		42 466 by 2015 which will be more than doubled. This will have more serious implication for the provision of basic services in the municipal area.	
		In its SWOT analysis the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality identified the following threats which are related to migration and municipal planning:	
		(1) influx of people and illegal land invasion in town,	77
		(2) lack of bulk services and infrastructure,	
		(3) traditional leaderswho are important stakeholders in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipalityhave significant influence with regard to municipal planning and migration management in that they have powers to allocate land in their areas of jurisdiction which form part of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality,	
		(4) lack of support from sector departments,	
		(5) HIV/aids prevalence in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality,	
		(6) high level of unemployment and	
		(7) the rising costs of maintenance of infrastructure.	
		The following weaknesses were also identified in the SWOT analysis: (1) Poor town planning, (2) lack of resources and capacity, (3) Lack of policies and by-laws, (4) no monitoring system,(5) high rate of illiteracy and (6) Lack of infrastructure plan.	38
		Burgersfort town is also starting to experience problem characteristic of growing urban area, namely; the growth of informal settlements, traffic congestion on certain road sections, rising land prices, declining capacity of bulk engineering infrastructure among others. It also seems the recent housing development is not match by the required social facilities, such as	

		schools and halls.	
IDP	2013/14	*The voluntary movement of young people away from rural settlements will reduce water demand at these places in future and will increase demand at the concentration points where the people are moving, and it is important to prioritize planning of large and denser settlement where people are migrating towards for service delivery to ensure greater impact.*	29
		Increased urbanisation within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality will invariably require substantial investment in bulk sanitation infrastructure.	38
		Migration and immigration is one of the challenges impacting on electricity provision.The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is not an electricity provider.The municipality will not be able to meet the millennium development goals in 2014 due to insufficient funding, electricity capacity problems and migration of new settlements.	41
		The Graeter Tubatse Local Municipalityhas also identified immigration, migration, influx and social ills as some of the problems regarding the creation of environment that promotes the development of the local economy and facilitation of job creation.	

Turn-around strategy report	2011	*Informal settlement is part of challenges facing the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as a result of migration.*	
		Though the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has plans which are aligned to the Sekhukhune District Municipality, the Limpopo Provincial and National priorities, such plans are not executed. However there are no reasons provided for this non-execution of plans.	
ANNUAL REPORT	2008/2009	*Key challenges in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are:*	
		• *Population growth due to increasing mining industries*	
		• *Lack of land for development purposes*	
		• *Only small portion of the land in GTLM belongs the municipality. That is often an important factor for development backlog in the municipality.*	
		Due to the increasing mining industries in the GTLM, the need for houses has also increased.	
		Challenge with Planning: Department of Land Affairs had appointed a service provider to develop ward – based IDP for GTM, but the project is moving in the slow pace (Challenge-Outsourcing of the planning which is a critical municipal function, as a result of lack of skills in the municipality).	
		Despite the credible IDP, the municipality is unable to address all needs raised by public during the IDP public consultation processes because of insufficient resourcs and lack of skills	52
		The GTLM invites all sector departments and other	

		stakeholders to attend the IDP/PMS forum meetings whose main activity is for the stakeholders to report their performance and indicate their future plans. There are other stakeholders who attend the Forum not prepared.	
ANNUAL REPORT	2011/2012	*Due to mining and property development in the municipality, Burgersfort town experienced a high demand on waste collection as more people are attracted to stay at Burgersfort due to the standard of services that are provided.* *The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is intending to run waste management through a public private partnership. (NB: Consequences of migration leads to demand for more services, which the municipality must provide, therefore informing the municipality's budget. That in itself means the municipality's plans must change to consider such developments. Furthermore new funding mechanisms/ service delivery mechanisms should be developed to respond to those demands, for example the Public Private prtnership in the Greater Tubatse Local municipality). Land ownership and land invasion pose developmental challenges in municipality. In order to improve the situation, the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality must engage different land owners such as traditional leaders and sector departments that are responsible for land to release it to the municipality for development. This is another drawback for effective migration management.*	51

Unlike participants who are interviewed and scholars consulted in this research, analysis of official documents does not reveal any positive effect migration has on the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. However, these documents bring some interesting

aspects about the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality which are not raised by any of the participants.

The documents agree with participants about the following:

- Migration affects provision of services like housing, electricity, water and sanitation and requirement of social facilities like schools and halls.
- Because of migration there will be a need for maintenance and expansion of infrastructure services in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. This will come at a high cost.
- Increase on urbanisation within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality will invariably require substantial investment on bulk infrastructure which would be a challenge for the municipality. The Graeter Tubatse Local Municipality does not have sufficient funding for such substantial investment.
- Because of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, there is a development of informal settlements all over the municipality, traffic congestion, declining capacity of bulk engineering infrastructure and rising land prices in towns such as Burgersfort and Steelpoort.

Interesting dimensions raised by the documents are:

- That internal migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality will result in reduced demands for services in rural areas, while it increases the same at concentration points where people are moving.
- The focus of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning and prioritisation will change and will be directed to denser settlements where people are migrating.
- Because of migration the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality will be required to change its service delivery approaches; for example, the municipality now intends to run waste management through a public-private partnership.
- Because of migration the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality was unable to meet its millennium development targets in 2014.

4.2.4.4 Effects of legislative framework on migration and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

It was clear from the interview with participants that legislative pieces governing issues of migration and municipal planning processes underscore how migration influences municipal planning. This is also corroborated by documentary analysis. Some scholars and authors such as Kok and Collinson (2006), Atkinson and Marias (2006), Polzer (2010), Mathoho (2012) and Mpehle (2014) consulted in chapter two (literature analysis, see Section 2.3) are critical about the legislative framework on migration because it only considers migration as national and provincial competency. According to the scholars and authors there is no clarity within the legislative framework on the role of municipalities with regard to migration management and regional development. This is despite the fact that the 1996 Constitution enjoins municipalities to provide services to communities within their jurisdiction which include migrants. These scholars and authors further argue that municipalities in most cases have limited capacity to deal with macro-issues of urbanisation and migration and are not given sufficient assistance by both the national and the provincial spheres of government.Hence they recommend that more pieces of legislation should be enacted to close the gaps identified. Participants in this research, however, have a different view on this aspect. In their view there is sufficient legislative provision with regard to migration and municipal planning processes. The participants generally agree that what is required is only the implementation of these pieces of legislation.

When asked about the participation of other spheres of government in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning processes and the effectiveness of legislative frameworks and inputs coming from those spheres of government in relation to migration and municipal planning, participants for example responded as follows:

Participant one

Framework is there, but implementation is lacking.

Participant two

Section 151 or 152 of the Constitution says the municipality must participate in the provincial and national planning forums. There is intergovernmental relations act which says municipalities and other spheres of government must not plan in isolation. There must be communication among the spheres of government. To me the problem is not with pieces of legislation but with people who must implement them.

Participant three

Pieces of legislation that we are using when we plan include the Constitution which is the foundation of all planning activities, the White Paper on Local Government, Spatial Development Framework, Municipal Structures Act, Division of Revenue Act, Municipal Finance Management Act, Municipal Systems Act among others. When you plan, those are pieces of legislation guiding you and you have to comply with them. They are not specific to migration issues, but when you implement them you will [be], on your way, addressing migration issues.

Participant four

With legislation there is nothing wrong. It is us as people who must make the legislation effective.

4.2.4.5 Effects of intergovernmental relations on migration management and municipal planning in the Graeter Tubatse Local Municipality

Section 4 of the Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act (Act 13 of 2005) states: "The object of this Act is to provide, within the principle of a co-operative government set out in Chapter 3 of the Constitution, a framework for the national government, provincial government and local governments, and all organs of state within those governments, to facilitate co-ordination in the implementation of policy and legislation, including- (a) coherent government; (b) effective provision of services; (c) monitoring implementation of policy and legislation; and (d) realisation of national priorities. In South African context, municipal planning must take into consideration national policy directives, provincial development plans and the district framework for intergrated development planning."

Hammerstad (2012) and Desille (2014) have provided a perspective on this aspect that migration should be considered at all levels of government planning, for example by those who are dealing with education, health, labour, agriculture, urban planning and foreign policy, among others. According to these scholars the success of endeavours to protect and integrate migrants in the communities depends on how policies are integrated within government levels, by how implementers understand and interpret them, how they are translated into programmesand also the commitment of implementers towards their implementation.Participants in this research have different views on how the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality relatesto other spheres of government with regard to issues of planning and migration management. They, however, agree that various sector departments both the national one and the ones in the Limpopo Province and the Sekhukhune District Municipality have direct responsibilities with regard to migration management and municipal planning issues in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.They are, therefore, expected to be part of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality planning processes and to present their plans that must be consolidated in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's Intergrated Development Plans. This is also, because there are some services that migrants require which are not the function of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality such as disaster management, water and sanitation, electricity, provision of identity documents etcetera. In such cases the role of the Greater Tubatse Municipality is to liaise with responsible authorities. The experience of participants one, two and four agree that inter-governmental relation between the three spheres of government was not effective, while participant three indicates that there is co-operation between the Greater Tubatse Local Municiplaity and the Sekhukhune District Municipality and the Limpopo Province which results in good co-ordination of plans. The three participants who argued that the relationship between the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and other spheres of government is not sound indicate that the role of provinces should be to capacitate municipalities by bringing requisite skills to municipalities instead of letting them be concentrated in provinces where they are not effectively utilised. This was, because they have identified a lack of skills within the municipality as a challenge affecting migration management and municipal planning. Their experiences were that other

spheres of government take time to respond to issues they raised with them and in some cases the plans of those spheres of governments were not informed by the needs of the people. One participant, for example, indicated that the provincial and national governments were viewed as big brothers, who only come to the municipalities to whip them.

The following extracts substantiate the experiences of participants on how other spheres of government participate in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning processes and the effectiveness of inputs coming from those spheres of government in relation to migration and municipal planning.

Participant one

Other spheres of government and other sectors like mines which are major contributors of migrants participate in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality planning processes and make their inputs but their responses to challenges brought by migration take time. They have good inputs as they on paper but implementation thereof takes time. We have engagements with relevant sector departments on how to control these migrants so that when allocation of resources is done relevant processes are followed but this is taking time because sector departments are not experiencing the challenges directly as compared to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Participant two

Other spheres of government participate in municipal planning through IDP forums and LED forums where they present their plans and programmes like Social Labour Plans from mines. Participation of other sector departments is not satisfactory and in most cases the plans from provincial and national sectors are top-down. They are just prepared without consulting the municipality and the communities.

Participant three

At the level of the Sekhukhune District Municipality we have a District Planners Forum which meets monthly to share challenges and good practices on how to address challenges relating to migration and planning. We also have the Limpopo Development Planners Forum which meets quarterly to exchange views and experiences relating to planning issues. This has produced the Limpopo Development Plan that we are proud of and no consultants were used. These forums help to capacitate one another and assist in sharing understanding of national sector plans.

Participant four

There is no good working relation with other spheres of government when we deal with migration. They will report about it but there is nothing that they are doing. To my knowledge I have not seen anything practical. They only come when something drastic happened, but when dealing with planning they are slow. Integration of plans is theoretical and not practical.Personally, I used to view the National and Provincial government as a big brother with a big whip. When they come to [a] municipality they do not come to help us but to find fault and whip us.My view is that the provincial government must support municipalities when it comes to the issue of planning. They must support us with skills. Provincial government does not have boundaries as boundaries are with municipalities therefore they must come down to municipalities in relation to planning processes. Their personnel should come to support municipalities.

The analysis of official documents also highlights the importance of co-operation between spheres of government, so that their programmes can be aligned and a common understanding of planning and migration issues is developed. However, these documents like participants in this research show that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not get such support from other spheres. A new interesting dimension from these Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's official documents in this case is that there is also a lack of co-operation with traditional leaders. In this municipality, traditional leaders play a critical role in migration management as they are responsible for allocating land. The table below show the statements from the Greater Tubatse

Local Municipality's official documents on effects of intergovernmental relations on migration and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Table 5: Effects of intergovernmental relations on migration management and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Document	Period	Statements on how intergovernmental relations affect migration management and municipal planning	Page
IDP	2008-2012	*While cities and municipalities are grappling with their own issues, they also have to ensure that they are aligned to national and provincial priorities and strategies. Developmental state is to be implemented and realised through a developmental local government agenda. It requires efficient co-ordination amongst all spheres of government and a common understanding of the issues to be addressed as well as the various policies and strategies that are developed for implementation.* *One threat facing the GTLM in terms of its SWOT analysis is lack of co-operation from traditional leaders.*	77
Turn-around Strategy Report	2011	*The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not often recieve support from the National Treasury and it is not included in the National Upgrading Programme though it has migration challenges associated to mining activities and the fact that formalisation of informal settlement is identified in its plan.*	

4.2.4.6 Effects of poor migration data on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

As indicated in chapter two (see Section 2.4), the National Development Commission (2012) confirms the findings of scholars such as Bakewell (2009), Olaga (2011) and Mathoho (2012) that data on migration within South Africa is poorly collected, weakly analysed and often misleading. These scholars posit that municipalities often do not have records of migration in their territories hence their planning is based on incomplete, inaccurate and outdated data. The understanding shared by participants in this research supports the findings of these scholars and the National Development Commission (2012).When asked a question on what systems are in place to inform managers in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality about migration patterns within the municipality and whether such systems are effective or not, participants raised an issue of lack of data integrity in dealing with migrants within the GTLM.They state that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality relies on systems that do not provide accurate population dynamics statistics and as such the municipality does not know how big migration is in the area, cannot monitor the movement of people as they come and go out of the municipality and plan properly for service provisions. The participants indicated that the municipality uses the following mechanisms to collect data:

- Census from Statistics South Africa.
- Information from developers
- Satisfaction surveys

The statements of participants with regard to the availability and effectiveness of migration data management system in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are as follow:

Participant two

There is no specific system in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to manage migration. It is only when we meet with social partners that they indicate in terms of movement of people, or when we provide services it will show whether people are

increasing or reducing, or when we provide sites for settlement you can see whether the demand is growing or declining. We also get information from ward councillors, but the development of informal settlements and shacks around the mining areas and along the roads are indications of the influx. We rely on statistics from Statistics South Africa which is released after five or ten years. Because of this, we do not know how many people are moving in and out of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and even how to plan for them. I therefore think that to improve this situation we need to establish our own research unit in the Greater Tubatse Municipality which will help us to have reliable information about the number and categories of people moving in or out of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Participant three

We do not have a system that is developed by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to manage migration. However, we rely on the information from Stats South Africa which is not assisting in the great deal, because it is collected after a period of ten years. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality therefore relies on old information because it is the only recognised information for planningwe have.

Participant four

To my knowledge I do not necessarily remember us having any system. The public participation and client satisfaction survey are the two tools that are able to inform us about the movement of the people. These systems do not help us in terms of migration information and planning. As long as we do not have the register of the number of migrants it will be difficult for us to assess the impact of the increase of population on our resources.It is difficult to differentiate who is a migrant or not when you go to a particular settlement without a population register.The issue of not knowing the number of people who are coming in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and those who are moving within the municipality is a very serious challenge. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have the expertise to do that research. Because of the lack of information, that affects our planning. We may think that we have planned to find that

we have under-planned or over-planned. Because of this situation the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality must develop its own population register in between censuses which come in a period of five years so as to inform the municipality's population dynamics.

Participnats are of the view that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality should establish a dedicated research unit to conduct a thorough population dynamics research in order to address this lack of migration information in the municipality. Participants also think that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality should be empowered to collect data related to population dymanics in between the national census to update that of the Statistics South Africa. Such data should be sanctioned and certified by Statistics South Africa so that it is recognised by other government agencies such National Treasury when allocating of grants such as equitable shares to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Official documents analysed in this research corroborate what participants raised in the interviews and indicate that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has limited data with regard to migration as part of population dynamics. There are proposals made in these documents that scientific research should be conducted to address migration data paucity in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Table 5: Effects of poor migration data on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Document	Period	Statement on poor migration data	Page
IDP	2008-2011	*There is limited information on migration pattern at the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality relies broadly on the Greater Sekhukhune District Municipality trends for population dynamics status quo analysis.* *Scientific research is necessary to confirm the extent of in-migration in the GTLM.*	34

			46
IDP	2013/14	*The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have reliable migration information. Because of this the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality identified a need to conduct a research for reliable data development as part its Strategic Objective to create an environment that promotes local economic development and job creation.*	

4.2.4.7 Effects of division of powers and functions on migration and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Participants indicated that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has the responsibility to provide communities within its jurisdiction, including migrants, with services.This is according to section 152 of the 1996 Constitution, which states that the objects of local governments, among others, are to ensure the provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner, to promote social and economic development and to promote a safe and healthy environment. Furthermore, section 153 of the 1996 Constitution states that a municipality must structure and manage its administration and budgeting and planning processes to give priority to the basic needs of the community and to promote the social and economic developmentof the community.The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is, however, constrained by the limited powers and functions allocated to it to execute those constitutional mandates.

According to participants in this research, certain powers and functions that are critical to migration and municipal planning are allocated to other authorities.These are, for example, water and sanitation (which is the responsibility of Sekhukhune District Municipality), electrity (which is provided by the Department of Energy through Eskom), housing (which is the responsibility of the Limpopo Province Department of Cooperative

Governance, Housing and Traditional Affairs) and ownership of some pieces of land (which is under the control ofthe Department of Agriculture, traditional leaders and private individuals). The responsibility of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in this regard is only to co-ordination in the form ofcollating communityneeds and submitting them to relevant authorities so that they can act on them. The experience of these participants, however, is that those relevant authorities in most cases do not plan for those needs; and if they mange to plan for them, they are often slow to implement them and in some instances they did not deliver on themat all; also, they take time to respond to them. Failure by those authorities to deliver on those services related to their powers and functions, in most cases affect the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as the authority closest to the people in that communities usually resort to violent protests in demand for those services.

Participants repeatedly indicated how these limited powers and functions have effects on migration management and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in different questions posed to themduring the interviews. For example, when asked about the effectiveness of systems that are in place to inform the Greater Tubatse Local Municipal managers about migration patterns in the municipality, participant one indicated that the systems are not effective because in some cases portions of land that migrants occupy do not belong to the Greater Tubatse Municipality; hence the municipality does not have control over them. Some of those portions of lands belong to sector departments such as the Department of Agriculture or to traditional leaders, who are allocating sites to migrants without duly considering the processes of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Furthermore, when asked how the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality manages the issue of xenophobia and violent community protests, which is discussed in the media and academic discourse in South Africa, this participant responded as follows: *"As a local municipality, the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has a responsibility to deliver services to the people. Community protests that take place in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are in most cases on issues that are not related to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's powers and functions, for example issues of jobs in the mines and electricity which is not provided by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality but provided by the Department*

of energy through Eskom. Though relevant authorities usually collect memoranda the protesters submitted, they however do not respond to them. In instances where the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality identifies migrant needs that are not within its powers and function, the municipality refers such migrant needs to relevant sector department for consideration and inclusion in their departmental plans."

Other participants had the following to say with regard to the effects of powers and functions on migration and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality:

Participant two

The other challenge facing the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is with regard to powers and functions allocated to this municipality, especially with regard to provision of services which migrants usually need. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is given limited functions; for example, the municipality is responsible to collect waste, which is not central to people's needs. Critical functions like water, electricity and others are allocated to the Sekhukhune District Municipality which does not deal directly with people on daily basis.

Participant three

The Constitution section 152 mandates municipalities to render services to its local communities. In the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality water is the function of the Sekhukhune District Municipality while electricity is provided for by the Department of Energy through Eskom.

Participant four

Once people migrate to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, it is the municipality that must cater for the needs of these people regardless of the province they come from because the Bill of Rights says these people have the right to services.
Obviously when people come here they must be provided with shelter because the Constitution says everyone has a right to shelter. On services that migrants need we are not providing, they are not our function, for example disaster management, water

and sanitation, electricity, and liquid waste. Indirectly we are involved in those services by liaising with responsible departments

For example when [a] disaster happens in a particular area we will be the ones to first go there but we will not provide them with anything until the Sekhukhune District Municipality comes in. We only go there and assess the situation and report to the Sekhukhune District Municipality.

The feeling of participants is that some powers and functions such as water and sanitation, disaster management, electricity, housing among others should be devolved to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.Participant two, for example, says: "*If those services could be given to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality they will assist in revenue generation which will help to develop the communities.*" Participant four says: "*The local government is the sphere of government that is closer to the people, knows their needs and interact with them on daily basis. Because of that I believe there are some functions that must be devolved to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality like water, electricity, liquid waste, disaster management.*"

Official documents analysed in this research also indicate that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is not the provider of certain services such as housing, water and sanitation and electricity which form part of migration needs. According to these documents the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have control on certain pieces of land, as they fall under private ownership, sector departments and traditional leaders. In such cases the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality cannot develop such lands. Traditional leaders often do not co-operate with the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality when coming to allocation of such lands to members of community. In many cases this results in land being allocated even to migrants without the knowledge of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, who will in turn require services from the municipality. The table below illustrates statements from official documents with regard to the effects ofallocation of powers and functions on migration management and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Table 6: Effects of powers and functions on migration and municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Document	Period	Statements on allocate ion of powers and functions to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	Page
Turn-around Strategy Report	2011	*Section 156 of the Constitution of 1996 impedes service delivery in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as it does not empower the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to provide certain basic needs to its community members*	
Annual Report	2008/9	*80% of service delivery backlogs within the Greater Tubatse Local Municity fall outside the allocated powers and functions of this municipality.* *Housing is the competency of the Limpopo Provincial Government and the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality only assists in identification of beneficiaries*	210
Annual Report	2011/12	*The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have powers to provide most of the basic service needs that are a priority to most of its communities such as social housing, electricity, andwater and sanitation.* *Social housing is not the competence of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality but that of the Limpopo Department of Co-operative Governance, Housing and Traditional Affairs. Municipalities play facilitation role.* *Due to high number of complaints on the allocation of houses, the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality set itself [a] turnaround time of 14 days to respond to queries raised on housing matters. That was not achieved because as [the] majority of issues raised are not within the control of the Greater Tubatse*	51 74

		Local Municipality.	
		Many pieces of land in the GreaterTubatse Local Municipal area are held in trust for the communities by traditional leaders, who have a major influence in the manner in which land is allocated to individuals for settlement as well as for economic development use.	

4.2.5 THE ESSENCE OF HOW MIGRATION AFFECTS MUNICIPAL PLANNING IN THE GREATER TUBATSE LOCAL MUNICIPALITY.

Finally, in the fifth step, the researcher's reflections and descriptions of the collected data from semi-structured in-depth interviews and official documents on the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality were disposed. According to Cresswell (2007:159) this represents the culminating aspect of a phenomenological research. This part highlights to the reader the experiences and understanding of participants on the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. A description of how migration affects municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is chronicled as follows:

1. **Migration is a multi-causal phenomenon**

The participants' experiences as corroborated by documentary analysis largely confirm what was found in the literature review in chapter two, namely that migration is a multi-casual phenomenon. In the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in particular migration occurs because of mining activities taking place in the area. According to the narratives of participants, migrants in the municipality include people comingfrom outside South Africa, namely from Lesotho and Zimbabwe, among others, from other provinces like the Eastern Cape, Gauteng and North-West, from other municipalities like the Makhuduthamaga Local Municipality, the Polokwane Local Municipality and others.

Furthermore, respondents indicated that there are migrants who move within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipalitythat is, from rural to urban areas and those who move out of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to other areas such as Lebowakgomo, Lydenburg and so on. Respondents indicate that people often migrate because they are looking for jobs, business opportunities, better services and well developed infrastructure, among others. According to respondents migrants from rural parts of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality are attracted to townships like Praktiseer and Mapodile because they have perceptions that land is easily obtained in those townships. In the same token, respondents highlight that there are people, especially the skilled and educated ones, who move out of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality to other areas because they are looking for advanced social facilities like schools, universities, hospitals, proper housing and recreational facilities which are not available in the municipality. Similarly, senior mining officials opt to stay in areas outside the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality like Lydenburg, usually for samilar reasons.

2. Migration is not often taken into consideration during decision making processes, need prioritisation and resources allocation

It is evident from this research that in the participants' understanding, which is corroborated by documentary analysis, community participation in decision making forms the bedrock of municipal planning and of budgetary processes. This essence is also in line with Phago (2008:249), who sates that without the involvement of its community in the local government, community development will never be achieved with maximum results. The experiences of participants are that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has different community participation mechanisms which it employs during municipal planning processes to solicit views from different stakeholders like sector departments, social partners like mines, structures like ward management committees, traditional leaders and the communities themselves. Netswera and Phago (2011) challenge the effectiveness of some of the mechanisms employed by municipalities in community participation such as ward management committees,

because attendance and discourse is propelled by political allegiance in line with the ideas of the ward committee chairperson that is the ward councillor. However, the understanding developed from analysing official documents in this research isthat a ward management committee is expected to be a progressive structure created to represent interests of different communities' structures in their local government and assist ward councillors to carry out their duties. It is a communication channel between the residents of the ward and the municipality.

Participants' narratives and documentary evidence indicate that migrants were not given special attention in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's consultative processes, because they were consideredto be part of the general community and therefore there was no need for them to be accorded special attention. The assumption of participants is that migrants do participate in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's community consultative programmes. Participants however could not provide concrete evidence to confirm their assumption that migrants really participate in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's cosultitive programmes.As highlighted in chapter two (in the literature review),some scholars(Blase & Landau, 2014; Hofisi, 2014;Netswera & Phago, 2011; Phago, 2008) agree that public participationis central to municipal planning but their observations are that often factors like stimuli, personal reasons, social status and environmental variables affect community participation. These scholars argue thatthe government must identify such factors, so that effective methods for enhancing effective participation of community members in government decision making processes are designed. Without considering those factors, vulnerable groups such as women, migrants and others would not participate in community consultative forums and their needs would not be considered in the municipality's plans (IDPs) and therefore no resources would be allocated to cater for them. As already indicated, participants who claimed that migration is considered in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's financial plans could not demonstrate how that was done. In the first instance these participants confirmed that the Greater Tubatse Local Mucipality does not give migrants special attention. This is despite the revelation by the official documents of the Graeter Tubatse Local Municipality that other vulnerable groups like children, people living with disabilities and youth have special programmes designed for them so that their special

needs can be addressesd through municipal planning. Even partcipants who indicated that migration is not considered in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's municipal planning and resource allocation stated that reasons behind such migrant exclusion are that some of them stay in informal settlements, which are not legally compliant with spatial development frameworks of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and also because of the municipality's limited powers and functions on some services. From the stories presented by participants it was clear that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not consider migration in decision making processes, needs prioritisation and resource allocation. According to Fau (2015) and de Visser (2011), South African courts will not hesitate to declare decisions and plans of municipalities invalid and unconstitutional in cases where municipalities failed to consult communities within their jurisdiction, including migrants, because they are bestowed equal rights with natural citizens in terms of the 1996 Constitution. Based on the argument of these scholars the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's decisions and resource alloction are found legally wanting, as they do not consider migration. There is no evidence from the interview with participants and from the official documents consulted that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality puts resources aside to ensure that migrants as a vulnerable group are encouraged to participate in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in its public consultation processes.

3. Migration has both positive and negative influence on municipal planning

The participants' perspective is that migration influences municipal planning in both positive and negative ways. Some researchers (Landau et al. 2011; Mathoho, 2012; Mpehle, 2014; Mvuyana, 2010) -as reported in chapter two of this research report - also share the same understanding where they also concur with the National Planning Commission (2012:14), which states that movement into and within municipalities has got significant planning, budgeting and provisioning of services. The participants indicate that migration has both positive and negative influence on municipal planning. On the positive side is that migrants bring along skills that are not available in the municipality. Those who stay in formalised areas consume municipal services and pay

taxes which boost the growth of municipal revenue. Availability of revenue is critical in municipal planning. Without revenue the municipality cannot plan for services. Participant 3, for example, indicated as follows when unpacking processes followed in municipal planning: *"... you go to project phase, where you identify and prioritise projects to address the challenges you face. Then you look into whether you have resources in monetary form as to whether you will have enough money to implement those projects."* This confirms that planning and budgeting are interlinked: budgeting is informed by planning, and the success of plans depends on the availability of resources. The experience of some participants furthermore is that migration influences municipal planning in the sense that it grows the municipal population which helps in accessing more funds from the national fiscus as the formula for grant allocation is based on population size. The bigger the population size the bigger is also the grant's share.

On the other hand, the participants' experience is that migration has negative influence on municipal planning. They indicate that migrants put pressure on municipal resources, they invade land and erect shacks all over the municipality; and those who stay in informal settlements usually do not pay for municipal services. They highlight that instead migrants engage in illegal connections of those services. According to the participants migrants lead to over-crowding of schools, while those with dual residences are counted twice when services are planned and provided for. Furthermore, they posit that migrants perpetuate social ills like crime and diseases which expel investors from the municipality. Migrants cause discontent within the local communities and defocus the municipality plans of service provision (priority list) in that planning of resources is redirected to where many people migrate. Furthermore, the fact that migration is an impromptu phenomenon (people move without indication) usually affects municipal planning, because the municipality plans to provide services based on estimated number of people and such impromptu movements in or out of the municipality result in a situation, where the municipality planned high but the number of consumers reduce drastically, or, alternatively the municipality plans low only to find that the number increase radically. This affects budgeting, because instead of the money beingused for another service, that is needed, it is spend on something that will not be used resulting

in projects becoming"white elephants", especially in rural areas where people move to town. Participants also maintain that migration is a serious challenge to municipal planning, because migrants often stay in informal settlements and their households are not included in the calculation of the national fiscus. Participant one made this statement: "*The more you have migration, the lesser the resources, meaning the plan will change every year. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality will therefore resort to short-term interventions.*" The experience of the participants, which is subsequently corroborated by the analysis of official documents, that migration affects municipal planning negatively is also shared by researchers such as Crush et al. (2005), Bakewell (2009) and Mpehle (2014), among others, who were consulted in chapter two of thisresearch report.

An interesting lesson from participants in this research is that they, as municipal officials, appreciate migrants and the positive and negative contribution they bring to the municipality. In fact one of the participants is a migrant and he kept on giving examples about himself during the interviews. This is opposed to what researchers (Friedementle & Misago, 2014; Landau *et al.*, 2011; Mpehle 2014) in chapter two of this work find and also to the empirical evidence that says there is a wide-spread anti-immigrant sentiment in South Africa, shared by community members and municipal officials. Participants also indicated that there were no xenophobic attacks in the Geater Tubatse Local Municipality, in contrast to the observations of other researchers (Kalitany & Visser, 2010; Landau *et al.*, 2011) that there is a general popular practice of xenophobia in South Africa in areas where there is migration.

4. Municipalities rely on inaccurate population dynamics to plan

Participants shared their experiences that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have an effective data management system to track the migration dynamic. The participants' experiences confirm, what other researchers (Atkinson & Marias, 2006; Olago, Landau *et al.*, 2011; Olago, 2011) and documentary evidence (Nationl Planning Commission, 2011) indicate in chapter two of this research: that the lack of systems to

manage migration information is the biggest challenge that affects planning and resource allocation in municipalities. The data used for planning in municipalities is scarce, incomplete, inaccurate, outdated, de-contextualised and difficult for decision makers to understand. Municipalities rely on the national census that is collected in ten year periods. This does not consider migrant movement in between those periods and the plans of municipalities are based on dissolute (old) information. Since the National Treasury also depends on such information to allocate resources to municipalities, this means that some municipalities lose possible grant funding because of this. Participants feel that a research unit should be institutionalised in the municipality so as to close that gap and that municipalities should be allowed to collect population statistics in between national censuses.This should be approved by Statistics South Africa and be used for municipal planning and accessing grant allocation from the National Treasury. This view is in line with the UNDP report of 2009 cited in chapter two which invites governments to set up or strengthen relevant institutions and mechanisms for data collection in order to provide timely, reliable and disaggregated information on migration.

5. Powers and functions allocated to local municipalities inhibit effective migration management and municipal planning

From the interviews with the participants it emerged that powers and functions allocated to local municipalities have influence on how municipalities address migration in their planning. For example in chapter two of this thesis it was indicated that Landau et al. (2011) and Mpehle (2014) argue that many of the social and economic needs of migrants like shelter, access to health care, education, economic opportunities, administrative justice, safety and security, amongst others, are not explicitly within the local government's mandate but the responsibility of the provincial or the national government. Municipalities, however, bear the responsibility and suffer consequences when service delivery mechanisms do not function appropriately. Equally, the understanding of the participants is that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has the responsibility y in terms of the Constitution to provide services to members of community within its jurisdiction without discriminating them in terms of their places of

origin. Their experience, which is confirmed by the researchers above and documentary analysis, is that many of the basic service delivery needs of the migrants like water, electricity, disaster management, ownership of land, public housing or sanitation do not fall within the powers and functions of the municipality. Phago (2010: 259), for example, argues that although the legislation requires of the municipalies public services including housing, municipalities in South Africa have not been practically and largely involved in public housing provision, since this is largely the competence of provinces. Despite documenting the accrediting of municipalities, since 1997 little has been done to capacitate municipalities in the provision of public housing. This inhibits proper planning on the part of the municipality as it is difficult for it to plan for the services it does not have authority over. The experience of participants is that those who are assigned such powers and functions do fulfil this mandate or are slow in attending to it. Their feeling is that such powers and functions should be devolved to the local municipalities, because they are closer to the people and they are the ones which feel the brunt, when such services are not provided. With this claim the participants essencially corroborate Phago (2009: 485), who also indicates that physically, local government is the sphere closest to the community: therefore it is expected that opportunities to facilitate development and engage directly with local people in a local sphere should be created by municipalities rather than by other spheres of government.

6. Inter-governmental relations have effects on migration management and municipal planning

The participants in this research indicated that there is effective legislation with regard to migration management and inter-governmental relations in South Africa which is vital to migration management and municipal planning. Their experience, however, is that it is not implemented and this affects migration management and sound municipal planning. Their experience differs from that of some researchers mentioned in chapter two of the research report such as Kalitany and Visser (2010), Mathoho (2012) and Mpehle (2014) who suggest that there should be a review of the legislative framework with regard to migration management. Even though participants agree that there are

effective legislative provisions regarding migration management and municipal planning, one participant went to an extent of explaining that such pieces of legislation, specificly with regard to migration, arelacking. This observation is interesting, because Phago (2009:489) cautions that a lack of specificity of the law may hamper municipal planning in that policymakers within the municipality could make assumptions in trying to understand the applicability of the legislative framework.

7. **Poor co-operation between spheres of government impacts on migration management and municipal planning**

The experiences of participants are that the relationship between municipalities and other spheres of government is not sound. Without sound working relationship between the spheres of government, migration management and municipal planning is adversely affected. One participant, for example, has indicated that the national government sometimes does not consult with the municipality and local communities when developing its plans. The Inter-Governmental Relations Act of 2005 guides how the three spheres of government can co-operate with regard to their operations in order to efficiently deliver services to communities. The experience of participants is that implementation is the only area that is lacking.At the same time some participants feel that some spheres of government see themselves as big brothers and instead of co-operating with municipalities they are "*whipping*" them**.** This is in agreement with Phago (2010), who indicates that the spirit of the sphere of government disappears. One participant, however, indicated that there is a good working relationship with other sphere of government in that there is a District Planners Forum in the Sekhukhune District Municipality, where local municipalities in the district meet monthly to share challenges and examples of good practice and there is the Limpopo Development Planners Forum, which is a provincial forum attended by all municipalities in the province who meet onceevery quarter. Though the participant indicated that the provincial forum managed to produce the Limpopo Development Plan, the fact that other key officials from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality interviewed in this

research are not aware of such interventions means there is still a need to close the communication gaps within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning system.

4.3. CONCLUSION

This chapter presented a detailed analysis of data collected through semi-structured in-depth interviews and analysis of official documents of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Statements from participants relevant to the research topic were identified, coded and categorised into themes identified following research questions. Since phenomenological research is about eliciting themes from the participants' experience and views regarding a particular phenomenon and additional pertinent themes relevant to the topic, providing deeper understanding of the influence of migration on municipal planning, these were elicited and discussed. Finally the description of the participants' experiences with regard to the effects of migration in municipal planning was presented. This description of how migration affects municipal planning is the epicentre of this research. As it was the case in the study of Barsanti (2014): "*Concernining shared leadership development: A phenomenological study of administrator experiences within Public-Private Partnerships*" every step within the period of the data analysis process in this research was conducted by hand without the assistance of a myriad of data analysis software such as Nvivo that currently exist on the market today. The researcher, however, remained confident that the themes developed from this research accurately depicted the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as each of the participants interviewed in this research uniquely experienced and understood it.

Chapter five will discuss the conclusions that were drawn from the findings of the study followed by recommendations for further investigations.

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

5.1. INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter undertook to present a detailed analysis of data collected through in-depth, semi-structured interviews and through the analysis of official documents of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. The chapter also interpreted the results of the data collected.This chapter provides discussions on the realisation of the study aims and objectives, gives conclusions based on the data collected and suggests recommendations and further research areas. This chapter also intends to indicate whether the research has addressed its main problem in accordance with the stated objectives of the research raised in chapter one. The limitations indicate how external factors contribute a limiting influence to the study. The recommendations and future research areas are identified in an attempt to respond to the possible areas which have emerged during the data collection stage.

5.2. REALISATION OF THE RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES

A reflection on the realisation of the study objectives is necessary so that measurement and observations regarding whether the study has or has not achieved its objectives can be made (Phago 2010:412). In this research the main research problem was: *How does migration affect planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?*

In addressing the stated research problem, the study objectives were identified. These research objectives were:

Objective 1: Examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Objective 2: Analyse priorities and decisions are made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

Objective 3: Describe the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Objective 4: Recommend effective ways in which the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality can factor in migration in its planning processes.

In this regard each research objective as alluded to above is considered, to assess whether it has been addressed. Chapter two (Literature Review) undertook to identify key theories and concepts regarding the research topic and the major issues and problems relating to the effects of migration on municipal planning. The literature reviewed in this chapter has confirmed that migration is a world-wide phenomenon as old as the human race itself and it affects planning in every country. It showed the following, among others: (1) Migration is multicausal, which means that people move from places leaving their own original areas to other areas due to various push or pull factors. (2) In the South African context migration was shaped by discriminatory laws during the Apartheid era which intended to control migration and then resulted in skewed developments and inequalities. The new democratic dispensation promulgated laws including the Constitution of 1996, which allow free movement of the people and bestows rights and entitlements on the citizens of the country and on migrants. (3) Despite the progressive laws of the country members of community and government officials have negative perception about migrants. (4) Though the laws of the country enjoin the government to involve communities in decisions making processes such is not adequate done and the stumbling blocks that hinder efficient public participation of vulnerable groups like migrants are not addressed. (5) There are no collaborative and synchronised efforts and strategies with regard to migration management. (6) Municipalities which have a constitutional mandate to build cohesive, democratic and prosperous society do not consider population dymanics, including migration patterns, in their IDPs and budgets.

The discussion in chapter four undertook to respond to the research problem by analysing and interpreting data collected using the data collection tools discussed in chapter three. A phenomenological approach was adopted in the research using in-depth semi-structured interviews to get deeper understanding on how migration affects municipal planning as told in words by municipal officials who are involved in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning activities. Seven themes emerged from

interviews which were corroborated by the analysis of official planning documents of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality in an attempt to answer research questions emanating from the research questions highlighted above. Research questions are discussed below to establish whether the aim and objectives of the research were realised.

Objective 1: To examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Research question: What are the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

The research objective was realised as data collected from municipal officials and the research corresponded to the research question by analysing and interpretaing data collected from the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality municipal officials and the municipality's official documents. The data collected and analysed confirm what was discussed in chapter two, highlighting as the causes of migration.

According to this research, migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is a result of huge mining activities taking place in the municipality. People come to the municipality to look for jobs, higher positions and business opportunities. Those from rural areas move to urban areas attracted by a diversified, advanced and well developed social and engineering infrastructure, free of charge services in the township and the ease at which they can access land. However, there are people who move out of the municipality to other areas looking for advanced social facilities like health facilities and schools, which the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality cannot provide.

Objective 2: To analyse how priorities are set and how decisions are made with regard to the resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipal planning.

Research question: How are decisions made and priorities set with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

The achievement of this objective is gained by a discussion of the sysyems and structures available in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality used during the

IDP/Budget processes. A thorough analysis was made as to whether migration was considered in allocation of resources in the municipality. As indicated in chapter two, scholars argue that municipalities must involve community members in decision making and municipal governance in general as enjoined by the Constitution of the country of 1996 and other pieces of legislation so that their needs could be identified and thenincluded in the IDPs and budgets. Since migrant rights are recognised by the Constitution of the country of 1996 and recognised as part of community members in terms of Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act 32 of 2000) they should also be involved in public participation processes so that their needs can be identified and therefore included in municipal IDPs and budgets.

The research reveals that migration is not considered in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's public participation mechanisms and resource allocation. Migrants are assumed to be part of the municipal population; hence no special consideration is given to them. The municipality does not have efficient data management systems and relies on the census which comes after five to ten years. The municipality is assigned limited powers and functions which make it difficult for it to effectively plan for migration. Furthermore, the municipality has poor working relations with other spheres of government and important authorities like traditional leaders which has negative impact on its planning.

Objective 3: To describe the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

Reserach question: How does migration affect municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

The discussion in chapter four undertook to respond to this question in that primary data is analysed and interpreted. Data analysis and interpraetaion are done primarily on how migration affects planning in the Graeter Tubatse Local Municipality. As indicated with objective 1 above, the participants' experiences as told in their own words and corroborated by documentary analysis and described in seven themes in chapter four were used in answering the research question

The research shows that on the positive side migration enhances municipal revenue as migrants, who stay in proclaimed areas pay for property rates and services. Migrants also bring civilisation to locals and provide skills which are not available in the municipality.

However, on the negative side migration brings pressure on municipal services, affects the municipality's planning focus as the municipality's plans will diverted to areas where migrants go. Migration brings social ills like crime and diseases which chase investors away and also strain municipal resources which are trying to address them.

In the opinion of the researcher, this research has sufficiently provided a deeper description of the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. All the objectives of the study as discussed in chapter one have been adequately addressed. The researcher is of the opinion that the application of a phenomenological research method in this research made it possible for it to address the the problem statement for this research and the research topic: "*the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipalit*y" in that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's officials who are involved in planning were able to share their experiences and views regarding migration and planning activities within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Triangulation used in this research was also critical for realising the aims and objectives of the research. Analysis of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's official documents did not only bring convergence and corroboration of information obtained from the interviews with municipal officials but further revealed new issues that are salient with regard to how migration influences municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Triangulation provided a confluence of evidence thatgave credibility and reduced impact of biases that could have arisen, if only a single method was used because documents are unobtrusive, stable and non-reactive and therefore could not be affected by the research process or altered by the researcher's presence.

Furthermore,the primary data collected through in-depth semi-structured interviews and documentary analysis in this research did not only provide deeper insight on how migration affects municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, but also

suggested how weakness indentified within municipal planning and migration management could be addressed.

5.3. IMPLICATION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS

By analysing the knowledge and experiences of the officials who are responsible for municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality and the documents this research has:

- Provided insight on how municipal officials know and understand migration and municipal planning
- Provided insight into the causes and patterns of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local municipality
- Provided understanding of how decisions are made and how priorities are set with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality
- Provided insight on how migration influences municipal planning.

The results of this qualitative phenomenological research are significant for the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, provide significant insight into the planning aspect of municipalities and contribute to the body of literature of Public Administration. The significances are elaborated as follow:

- Implications of research findings for the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

  The municipality will now have a better understanding on the influence of migration on its planning processes and thereby develop mechanisms to consider population dynamics in its planning. The municipality will be able to know the effects of lack of population data on planning and how to address that. Furthermore, the municipality will be in a better position to engage relevant authorities to apply for devolution of certain powers and functions and how relations with other spheres of government can be improved.

- Insight into the planning aspect of municipalities

A clear understanding of how migration influences municipal planning and resource offers information useful to municipalities to include migration in their Integrated Development Plans in order to ensure that municipal services are provided in an effective, efficient and sustainable manner. This will further ensure that the past imbalances of resource allocation and skewed development as experienced during the Apartheid era are addressed.

- Contribution to the body of literature of Public Administration

This research used in-depth semi-structured interviews supplemented by documentary analysis which allowed participants to talk about their knowledge and experiences on how migration influences municipal planning. The findings of the research help to fill the gap in the literature concerning migration, municipal planning, intergovernmental relations and resource allocation. The valuable information produced by this research on how migration influences municipal planning will contribute immensely to Public Administration as a discipline. This is because Public Administration evaluates programmes and policies and requires its researchers to consider units of obsearvations like policy makers and members of the general public who are affected by the policy as well as perusing policy documents relevant for the problem under investigation.

Few researchers in this discipline have used a phenomenological research design in their studies relating to migration and municipal planning. The success of this research in realising its aim and objectives adds to the researchers who have applied phenomenology in their studies and proves that phenomenology is a relevant research design for Public Administration. This supports Thani's (2012) articulation to Public Administration researchers to apply research designs that are aligned to the constitution which encourages consultative approaches and public participation by the government.

5.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

In every research there are factors which contribute to limiting the study which should be taken into consideration to clearly understand its context. The following limitations are encountered in this research:

- Though the researcher attempted to reduce any biases in the analysis of data in the research by exposing and bracketing personal knowledge and views with regard to municipal planning processesthat cannot ensure that, thishas actuallybeen achieved. The researcher's personl knowledge and views could have limited his understanding of participants' perspective about the phenomena under investigation thereby influencing the findings in this research to some extent. Scholars such as Harrison (2008) and Zenobia et al. (2013) alsoattest to this fact and highlight that it is ageneral limitation in all phenomenological studiesbecause researchers often are unable to escape their taken-for-granted background with the phenomena under study.

- The researcher used purposive sampling to identify a small size of homogeneous participants, namely senior officials who are involved in planning activities in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. This might have limited the maximisation of the collected data which would have produced broader perspectives. A wider sample comprising of participants with diverse backgrounds could have been used, for example including front desk officials, who engage with different municipal consumers of services, traditional leaders, who allocate residential sites to members of the community or community development workers, who engage different community members on a daily basis among others. Palinkas, Horwitz, Green, Wisdom, Duan and Hoagwood (2013) also argue that by selecting only individuals who meet a specific criterion defined on the basis of theirspecific experiences ortheir role in the implementation process of certain activities one may fail to capture the experiences or activities of other groups playing other roles in the process.

- The results of the research only provide information for a more in-depth understanding of the effects of migration on municipal planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality from municipal officials responsible for planning. These results therefore may only help people who want to understand these phenomena from the perspective of officials who are responsible for municipal planning.

- Furthermore, another limitation in this research was with regard to verification of the findings, that is their validity and reliability. Though two strategies for the verification of the findings were available for the researcher, namely to use of expert judges in the field or presenting the findings to the participants, the researcher could not use experts, due to limited time and financial resources.The findings were therefore presented for verification to the participants, who confirmed telephonically that they agree with the findings. The analysis of the findings by participants was, however, from their everyday life perspective as they engage in municipal planning (phenomenological perspective), while the analysis of the findings in the research should be from both the phenomenological and disciplinary (Public Administration) perspectives.

5.5 RECOMMENDATIONS

Objective 4 of the research required the researcher to recommend effective ways in which the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality can factor in migration in its planning processes (see Section 1.6).Based on the literature review and the findings of this research the researcher makes the following recommendations:

- The capacity and knowledge within the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's workforce should be enhanced to deal with matters of municipal planning.

- More powers and functions should be devolved to the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality as it is the one closest to the people so that migration needs and those of the community in general can be adequately addressed through municipal planning.

- The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality should institutionalise the collection of data by establishing a dedicated research unit which will be able to generate up to date population dynamics data which will supplement the censuses.

- Sector departments, other authorities like traditional leaders, social partners like mines and civil organisation which play an active role in issues of migration should be encouraged to participate effectively in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning processes.

- The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality must identify migrants as one of the special groups within its community members that need to be given special attention in the municipality's public participation mechanism so that resources can be aligned to their needs.

- To maximise benefits derivable from human mobility, the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality must invest in projects and programmes and areas with high potential return on investments so that it can quickly grow its revenue base which will help address some community needs and subsidise other areas that cannot generate income on their own. The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality should, for example, speed up proclamation of informal settlements so that people in those settlements can start paying for services.

- Since the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality may not have sufficient resources to address community needs and those of migrants, the municipality should join hands with private sector in the form of Public Private Partnerships as a way of enhancing limited resources and to speed up the development.

5.6. FURTHER RESEARCH AREAS

The following possible future research areas are recommended:
- Possible devolution of powers and function to local municipalities
- Innovative measures for informal settlement regulation and land management methods in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.
- The role of traditional leaders in municipal planning.

- How can business enhance migration management and municipal planning through social corporate investments?

- Further revenue enhancement strategies available for municipalities to augment available resources.

- Migration integration systems and strategies in the bigger municipal communities.

5.7 CONCLUSION

This research was undertaken to investigate how migration affects municipal planning by exploring the knowledge, experience and perceptions of municipal officials who deal with issues of planning on a daily basis. Their experiences were complemented by official municipal documents which were analysed. In the interviews with the officials and documentary analysis the exclusion of migration in municipal planning processes was evident. It was also clear from the research that migration affectsmunicipal planning both positively and negatively.

Notwithstanding potential methodological and sampling limitations, this research made important advances in the deeper understanding of the influence of migration on municipal planning which could benefit municipal planners and Public Administration scholars. The research has also highlighted gaps that municipalities have to close so as to realise the spirit of the 1996 Constitution and the White Paper on Local Government, 1998 and other pieces of legislation which are critical for them to realise their mandates of providing services to their communities and redressing the past imbalances. Municipal planning, that does not consider population dynamics should be considered incomplete.

REFERENCES

Adjai, C. & Lazaridis, G. 2013. Migration, xenophobia and new racism in post-Apartheid South Africa. *International Journal of Social Science Studies*. (1)1: 192-205. Redfame Publishing. (http://ijsss.redfame.com. Accessed on 21 May 2014)

Auriacombe, C. J. 2006. Understanding and planning measurement. *Journal of Public Administration,* (41) 3. 631-64.

Auriacombe, C. & Mouton, J. 2007. Qualitative field research. *Journal of Public Administration:* Special issue. (42)6: 441-457. Sabinet Online.

Atkinson, D. & Marais, L. 2006. Urbanisation and the future urban agenda in South Africa. In R. Tomlinson, & U. Pillay, *Democracy and Delivery: Urban policy in South Africa.* 2006. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council.

Babbie, E. & Mouton J. 2001*. The Practice of social research.*New York: Oxford University.

Bakewell, O. 2009. *South-South Migration and Human Development: Reflections on African Experiences.* United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Research Paper 2009/7. Online at http://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/19185/ (Accessed on 04/09/2015).

Barsanti, J. B. 2014. *Concerning shared leadership development: A phenomenological study of administrator experiences with public-private partnerships.* Birmingam: University of Alabana. (Unpublished Dissertation)

Bekker, S. 2006. Migration from South Africa's rural sending areas: changing policies and changing destinations. In Gallo-Masala, S. (ed.*). Migration to South Africa within international migration trends. Immigrazione in Sudafrica e trend migratori internazionali.* Cape Town: The Scalabrini Centre.

Benson, R.2011. *A Phenomenological Study Exploring Change Management in Public General Aviation Airports.* (Unpublished Research Report). Minneapolis: Walden University.

Blanche, M. T., Durrheim, K., & Painter, D. 2012. Research in *Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press (Pty) Ltd.

Blaser, C. & Landau, B. L. 2014. *Managing Migration in Southern Africa: Tools for Evaluating Local Government Responsiveness.*

Boeije, H. (2010)*. Analysis in Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Ltd.

Booth, A., Papaioannou, D. & Sutton, A. 2012. *Systematic Approaches to a Successful Literature Review.* London: SAGE Publications, Inc.

Borkert, M., Perez, A. M., Scott, S., & De Tona, C. 2006. Introduction: Understanding Migration Research (Across National and Academic Boundaries) in Europe*. Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/ Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, (7)3, Art 3: http://www.qualitative-research.net/fqs-texte/3-06/06-3-3-e.htm.

Bowen, G. 2009*.* Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal.* 9(2): 27-40. RMT Publishing.

Boyle, P., Halfacree, K. & Robinson, V. 1998. *Exploring contemporary migration*. United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis.

Burns, N. & Grove, S.K. 2003: *The practice of nursing research: Conduct, critique and utilization. Toronto. WB Saunders or Understanding nursing research*, (3rdEd.). Philadelphia: WB Saunders Company.

Chan, Z. C.Y., Fung, Y. & Chien, W. 2013. Bracketing in Phenomenology: Only Undertaken in the Data Collection and Analysis Process? *The Qualitative Report* 2013. 18(59): 1-9.Hong Kong. The Hong Kong: Polytechnic University. http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR18/chan59.pdf (accessed on 23 September 2015)

Chidi, S. C. 2010. *An evaluation of rural-urban migration and its links to informal settlement patterns: A case study of Disteneng area in Polokwane Municipality in the Limpopo Province.* Polokwane: University of Limpopo. (Unpublished dissertation).

Cohen, B.2006. *Urbanisation in developing countries: Current trends, future projections and key challenges for Sustainability.*Technology in Society. 28: 63-80.

Creswell, J.W. 1998. *Qualitative inquiry and research design*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Creswell, J. W. 2007. *Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches*. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publication Inc.

Crewell, J. W. 2009. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approaches*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

Creswell, J. W. 2013. *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. California: SAGE Publications.

Creswell, J. W. 2014. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approaches*. 4th ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

Cross, C. 2006. Migration motivations and capacities in relation to key migration streams.In Kok, P., Gelderblom, D., Oucho, J.O. & Van Zyl, J. (eds).*Migration in South and Southern Africa: Dynamics and determinants.* Cape Town: HRSC Press.

Cross, C., Gelderboom, D., Roux, N. & Mafukidze, J. 2006. Views on Migration in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Proceedings of the 2006 African Migration Alliance Workshop*. Cape Town: HRCS Press.

Crush, J., Williams, V. & Peberdy, S. 2005. Migration in Southern Africa: Geneva: Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM).

Dastile, N.P. 2013. Omalayitsha bayasithwala: stories of women caught in the web of illegal cross-border migration. *Indilinga Africa Journal of Indigenous Knowledge Systems.* 12(2): 277-289. The Sabinet African ePublications (https://journals.co.za/content/publishers . Accessed on 28 August 2015)

Davis, D. R. 2012. *A phenomenological study on leadership development of African women executives in academia and business.* Las Vegas: University of Nevada. (Unpublished Research Report)

Daw, O. D. 2012. Population in South Africa: Challenges and opportunities for metropolitan municipalities. *The Journal of Africa and Asian Local Government Studies*, 1(3):92-105.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincon, Y.S.1998. The *landscape of qualitative research: Theories and issues.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publishers.

Desille, A. 2014. Integration and exclusion logics for immigration policies: a case of Israel*. Integrim Online Papers* 6/2014. University of Poitiers. (http:// www.integrim.eu/online-papers. Accessed on 25 Novemeber 2015)

De Visser, J. 2011. Draft Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Bill. *Local Government Bulletin.* 13(2): 15-17. Cape Town: Community Law Centre.

DiCicco-Bloom, B. & Crabtree, B. 2006*.* Making sense of qualitative research: The qualitative research interview. *Medical Education.* 40(4):314-321. US: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.

Edmonds, W. A. & Kennedy, T. D. 2013. *An Applied Reference Guide to Research Designs: Quantitative, Qualitative, and Mixed Methods.* Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, Inc.

Englander. M. 2012. The Interview: Data Collection in Descriptive Phenomenological Human Science Research*. Journal of Phenomenological Psychology.* 43(1): 13-35. Malmo: Malmo University. (http:// www.researchgate.net. Accessed on 12 July 2015)

Fua, O. N. 2015. Public participation in decentralized governments in Africa: Making ambitious constitutional guarantees more responsive. *African Human Rights Law Journal,* 15(1): 167-191 (online http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/1996-2096/2015/v15n1a8).

Fink, A. 2014. *Conducting Research Literature Reviews: From the Internet to Paper*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publishers.

Finlay, L. 2012. Debating phenomenological research methods, Friesen, N., Saevi, T., & Henriksson, C. (eds.), *Hermeneneutic Phenomenology in Education: Method and Practice.* Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Freemantle, I. & Misango, J.P. 2014. The social construction of (non) and its effects: Government discourse on xenophobia, immigration and social cohesion in South Africa. In A. Lindley (eds.). *Crisis and Migration: Critical Perspectives* (pp.136-157). New York: Routledge.

Guest, G., Namely, E.N., & Mitchel, M.L. 2013. Collecting Qualitative Data: *A Field Manual for Applied Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.

Giorgi, A. 2006. Difficulties encountered in the application of the phenomenological method in the social sciences. *Análise Psicológica.* 24(3): 353-36. (https://www.researchgate.net. Accessed on13 August 2015).

Glesne, C., & Peskin, A. 1992. *Becoming Qualitative Researchers: An Introduction*. New York: Longman Publishers.

Grbich, C. 2013. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Introduction*. California: SAGE Publications Inc.

Groenewald, T. 2004. A phenomenological research design illustrated. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods,* 3(1). Article 4. Retrieved 13 March 2015 from http://www.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/3_1/html/groenewald.html.

Guwa, N. 2008. Public participation in local government budgeting process still wanting. *Local Government Transformer* 10. 14(2). East London: Afesis-Corplan.

Hammerstad, A. 2012. Making The Best Out Of Immigration: SAIIA Policy Briefing 58. Johannesburg: South African Institute of International Affairs.

Harrison, J. 2008. *Living with Schizophrenia, a phenomenological study of people with schizophrenia living in the community. Volume 1. England: UoB.* University of Bradford. (Unpublished thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy).

Hofisi, C. 2014. Making participation real in Integrated Development Planning in South Africa. *Journal of Public Administration*. 49(4): 1126-1138.

Huddleston, J.R. 2005. *The intersection between planning and the municipal budget. Workshop on Curriculum for Graduate Planning Programs: The Nuts and Bolts of Development Finance.* USA: University of Wisconsin-Madison.

Jackson, J. A. 1986*. Migration*. New York: Longman Publishers.

James, F.J., Romine, J.A. & Zwanzig, P.E. 1998. The Effects of Immigration on Urban Communities. Cityscape: *A Journal of Policy Development and Research*. 3(3): 171-192. U.S: Department of Housing and Urban Development.

Kalitany, V. & Visser, K. 2010. African immigrants in South Africa: job takers or job creators*? South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*. 13(4): 376-390. SA ePublications.

Kaya, G. 2015. International Migration and its effects in one of the underdeveloped Regions of Turkey (The Sample of Adiyaman). *International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences:* 5(3). 71-80. https://www.ijhssnet.com/journals/Vol_5_No_3_March 2015/9.pdf. Accessed on 28 September 2015).

Khobe, O. W. 2012*. Devolution of Government in Kenya as a means of engendering Public Participation in Governance.* Pretoria. University of Pretoria. (Unpublished Research Project).

Klotz A. 2013. *Migration and National Identity in South Africa, 1860-2010*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Kok, P. & Collinson, M. 2006. *Migration and Urbanisation in South Africa.* Pretoria: Statistics South Africa. Report 03-04-02.

Kok, P., Gelderblom, O., Oucha, J. & Van Zyl, J. 2006. *Migration in South and Southern Africa: Dynamics and Determinants*. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Koser, K. 2007. *International Migration: A very short introduction*. USA: Oxford University Press.

Kothari, C. R. 2004. *Research Methodology: Methods & Techniques.* New Delhi: New Age International (P) Ltd.

Kvale, S. 1996. *Interviews: An introduction to qualitative research interviewing.* Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, Inc.

Landau, L. B. 2006. Myth and rationality in Southern African responses to migration, displacement and humanitarianism. In C. Cross, D. Gelderblom, N. Roux,&J. Mafukidze, (eds). *Views on migration in Sub-Saharan Africa: Proceedings of an African Migration Alliance Workshop.* Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Landau, B., Segatti, A. & Misago, J. 2011. *Governing Migration and Urbanisation in South African Municipalities: Developing Approaches to counter Poverty and Social Fragmentation.* Pretoria: Shereno Printers.

Leedy, P. D.1993. *Practical Research, Planning and Design.* 5[th]ed. New York: MacMillian.

Leedy, P.D. & Ormrod, J.E.2013. *Practical Research Planning and Design.10[th]ed.* New York: Pearson Education Inc.

Lester, S. 1999. An introduction to phenomenological research. Taunton UK: Stan Lester Developments. (https://www.devmts.org.uk/resmethy.pdf. Accessed on 26/05/2015).

Lin, C. 2013. Revealing the "essence" of things: using phenomenology in LIS Research. *Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in Libraries (QQML) 4*: 469-478. Taiwan: National Taiwan University.

Lokogo, R. 2006. Francophone Africans in Cape Town: A failed migration. In Cross, C., Gelderblom, D., Roux, N. & Mafukidze, J. (eds.). *Views on migration in Sub-Saharan Africa: Proceedings of an African Migration Alliance Workshop.* Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Mabogunje, A. L. 1970. Systems Approach to the Theory of Rural-Urban migration. *Geographic Analysis* 2(1): 1-18. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1538-4632.1970.tb00140.x/abstract>.

Magoro, M. J. 2010. *The implementation of the procurement policy with reference to the Reconstruction and Development Housing Programme in Limpopo Province*. Pretoria: University of Pretoria. (Unpublished research report).

Mahomed-Patel, R. 2002. *Phenomenology: History, Its Methodological Assumptions and Application.* Johannesburg. Rand Afrikaans University. (Unpublished dissertation).

Masiloane, D. 2010. Dealing with an economic crisis: The difficulty of policing illegal immigrants in South Africa. *South Africa Journal of Criminal Justice.* 23(1): 39-54.

Mathoho, M. 2012. Critical analysis of human mobility as a constraint to municipal planning and service delivery. *Local Government Transformer*. East London: AfesisCorplan.

Matlou, M. P. & Mutanga, S.S. 2010. The impact of migration flows: *African Insight.* 40(1): 128-148.

Merriam, S. B. 2009. *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.

Miheretu, B. A. 2011. *Causes and Consequences of Rural-Urban Migration: The Case of Woldiya Town, North Ethiopia.* Pretoria: University of South Africa. (Unpublished research report).

Mokale, T. & Scheepers, T. 2011. *A practical guidance to achieving excellence in municipal governance in South Africa.* Helderkruin: Proverto Education Publishers.

Molapisi, T. A. 2009. *A phenomenological investigation of challenges and coping mechanisms associated with the transition from high school to university.* Kwazulu-Natal: University of Zululand. (Unpublished research report).

Moran, D. 2000. *Introduction to phenomenology*. London: Routledge.

Morcol, G. 2005. Phenomenology of Complexity Theory and Cognitive Science: Implications for Developing an Embodied Knowledge of Public Administration and Policy.*Administrative Theory and Praxis*. 27 (1) 1-25. ABI? INFORM Global, Pennsylvania State- Harrisburg.

Morse, J. M. & Richards, L. 2002*. Readme First for a User's: Guide to Qualitative Methods.* California: SAGE Publications Inc.

Mouton, J.1996*. Understanding Social Research*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Mouton, J. 2011. *How to succeed in your Master's & Doctoral Studies: A South African Guide and Resource Book.* Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Mpehle, Z. 2012. Are service delivery protests justifiable in the democratic South Africa?. *Journal of Public Administration*. (47)1: 213-227.

Mpehle, Z. 2014. Theoretical perspective on refugee movements and service delivery in South Africa. *Journal of Public Administration*. (49)1: 247-260.

Munzhedzi, P. H. 2011. *Performance management system and improved productivity: A case of the Department of Local Government and Housing in the Limpopo Province.* Pretoria: University of South Africa. (Research report).

Mvuyana, B.Y.C. 2010. *A Study of the Relationship between Rural-Urban Migration and Housing Delivery: A case of Clermont Township in the Province of Kwazulu Natal.* Port Elizabeth: Nelson Mandela Metropilitan University. (Unpublished research report).

National Planning Commission. 2012. *Our Future – Make it work: National Development Plan 2030.* Pretoria: Shereno Printers.

(COGTA) Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. 2003. *Governance in Municipalities; Intergovernmental Relations, Legislative processes & Role in Provinces: briefing by SALGA.* Cape Town: Parliamentary Monitoring Group.

Netswera, F. G. & Phago, K. 2011.Perceptions about municipal governance in the post-1996 Era: The case of Thulamela local municipality. *Africa Insight.* 1(2): 130-141.

Netswera, F.G. & Phago, K. G. 2013. How popular protests influence public discourse and public accountability- revisiting the theory of public spheres in South Africa.*Politeia*. 32(1) Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Olago, S. M. 2011. *Responding to Human Mobility: is local government set up for failure?* ACMS Policy Brief. 6. Johannesburg: Wits University.

Osman, R. 2009. *The phenomenon of xenophobia as experienced by immigrants learning in inner city schools of Johannesburg.* Pretoria: University of South Africa. (Unpublished research report)

Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J.P., Duan, N. & Hoagwood, K. 2013. Purposeful Sampling for Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis in Mixed Method Implementation Research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research.* 42(5): 533-544. New York: Springer Science and Business Media.

Patton, M. Q. 2002. *Qualitative research and evaluation methods.* 3rded. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Pearce, F. 2010. *Mass Migration, Ageing Nations and the Coming Population Crash.* United Kingdom Eden: Project Books.

Pendleton, W. 2008. Migration and xenophobia in Southern Africa. *Adult education and development, 2008.* The German Adult Education.

Phago, K. G. 2008. Community participation during the 21st century South Africa: Modes, attitudes and trends. *Journal of Public Administration.* 43(1): 238-252.

Phago, K. G. 2009. The Integrated Development Plan (IDP) in South African Local Government: The case of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. *Journal of Public Administration.* 44(3): 483-491.

Phago, K.G. 2010. *Effects of the development and implementation of the national public housing policy in South Africa with specific reference to Gauteng Province.* Pretoria: University of South Africa (PhD-thesis).

Polzer, T. 2010. Population movements in and to South Africa. *Migration Fact Sheet 1.* Wits University: Forced Migration Studies Programme.

Reeds, H. E. 2013*. Moving Across Boundaries: migration in South Africa, 1950-2000. Demography.* 50(1):71-95.

Reeves, S., Albert, M., Kuper, A. & Hodges, B. D. 2008 *Qualitative Research; Qualitative Researchin qualitative research?* BMJ 2008; 337:a949. (<https://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.a949>. accessed on 16 July 2015).

Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., Elam, G., Tennant, G. & Rahim, N. Designing and Selecting Samples. In J., Ritchie, J., Lewis, C. M., Nicholis & R. Ormston (Eds.), 2014. *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers.* Los Angels: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Rogers, R. 2013. Critical Discourse Analysis. In Trainor, A. & Graue, E. 2013. *Reviewing qualitative research in the social sciences.* USA: Edward Brothers Inc.

Roulston, K. 2011. *Reflective Interviewing: A Guide to Theory and Practice.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.

Schuh, J. H. & Upcraft, M. L. 2001. Assessment Practice in Student Affairs: An Applications Manual. Jossey-Bass: San Francisco.

Schurink, E. 2009. Qualitative research design as tool for trustworthy research. *Journal of Public Administration.* 44(4.2): 803-823.

Sebola, M. 2011. The socio-economic impact of illegal immigrants: a case of Zimbabweans in the city of Polokwane. *Journal of Public Administration.* 46(3):1055-1072.

Segatti, A. & Landau, L. 2011. *Contemporary Migration to South Africa: A regional development issue.* USA: The World Bank.

Seidman, I. 1998*. Interviewing as Qualitative Research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences.* New York: Teachers College Press.

163

Sikrweqe, N.P. 2013. *Integrated Development Planning as poverty reduction strategy in the King Sabata Dalindyebo Municipality, Eastern Cape Province*. Pretoria: University of South Africa (Unpublished research report).

Smith, J. A., Flowers, P. & Larkin, M. 2009. *Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: Theory, Research,* Practice. London: Sage Publications.

Smit, W.1998. *Rural Linkages of Urban households in Durban, South Africa: Environment and Urbanisation.* Third World Planning Review, 10(1): 77-87 Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.

Smith, J. A. & Osborn, M. 2003. Interpretive phonological analysis, in J. A. Smith (Ed), *Qualitative psychology: A practical guide to research methods* (pp.55-80) London: Sage Publications.

Snape, D. & Spencer, L. 2003. The foundations of qualitative research, in J. Ritchie & J. Lewis (Eds), *Qualitative Research Practice*. London: SAGE Publications.

South Africa. 2013. *Local Government: Municipal Systems Act, No. 32 of 2000 and Regulations.* South Africa: LexisNexis (Pty) Ltd.

South Africa. 1996. *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*. Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa 1998. *Local Government: Municipal Structures Act,* 1998 (Act 117 of 1998). Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa. 2005. Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act, 2005 (Act 13 of 2005). Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa. 2014. Habitat III National Report: South Africa's Report to the Third United Nations Conference on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development. https://www.ihs.nl/fileadmin/ASSETS/ihs/Library/Habitat_III/HABITAT_III_SOUTH AFRICA NATIONAL REPORT-final.pdf. Accessed on 12 February 2016

South Africa. 1998. *The White Paper on Local Government.* Pretoria: Government Printer.

Starks, H. & Trinidad, S. 2007. Choose Your Method: A Comparison of Phenomenlogy, Discourse Analysis, and Grounded Theory. *Qualitative Health Research.* 17(10): 1372-1380. London: Sage Publications.

Sterwart, C. 2014. *Toilets at last-Perceptions of the users of 'porta potty' toilets in Jim Se Bos informal settlement in Phillipi, Cape Town.* Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand. (Unpublished research report).

Steytler, N. 2008. The Strangulation of Local Government. *Tydskrif vir die Suid-Afrikaanse Reg.* 3: 518-535.

Stillwell, J. & Congdon, P. 1991. *Migration Models: Macro and Micro Approaches.* London: Belhaven Press.

Thani, X. 2012. Phenomenology as a research design in Public Administration: fitness for purpose. *Administration Publica.* 20(3): 26-39. Available at: https://hdl.handle.net/10500/13732.   [24 March 2014].

The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Final 2008-2011 Integrated Development Plan-Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Available at:
https://www.tubatse.gov.za/docs/idp/IDP%20Final%202008.pdf. Accessed on 28 August 2015.

The Geater Tubatse Local Municipality. Final 2013/14 Final Intergrated Development Plan-Greater Tubatse Municipality. Available at:
http://www.tubatse.gov.za/docs/idp/GTM%20FINAL%202013-14%20IDP.pdf>.Accessed on 28 August 2015

The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Final 2011/2016 Integrated Development Plan-Greater Tubatse Municipality. Available at: www.tubatse.gov.za>docs>idp. Accessed on 28   August 2015.

The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. Turn-around Strategy Report 2011. Burgersfort: The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

The Greater Tubatse Local Municipality. 2011/2012. Annual Report- Greater Tubatse Municipality. Available at: http://www.tubatse.gov.za/docs/reports/2011-12%20Annual%20Report.pdf. Accessed on 29 August 2015

The Presidency. 2009. Media briefing by the Minister in the The Presidency responsible for Performance Monitoring and Evaluation, Collins Chabane, 20 October 2009. Cape Town. Tuynhuys. Avaialable at:

http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/pebble.asp?relid=1969.(Accessed on 26 July 2015)

Tlabela, K., Viljoen, J. & Adams, W. 1995. *The importance and implications of historical factors causing and inhibiting past migration in South Africa.* HSRC Migration Workshop (18 March 1995).

Turok, I. 2012. *Urbanistion and Development in South Africa: Economic Imperatives, Spatial Distortions and Strategic Responses.* Urbanisation and Emerging Population Issues Working Paper 8. International Institute for Environment and Development. http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/10621IIED.pdf. Accessed on 22 March 2016

United Nations, Department of Economics and Social Affairs, Population Division. 2011. *International Migration Report 2009: A Global Assessment* (United Nations, ST/ESA/SER.A/316). New York: United Nations.

UNDP (United Nations Development Programme), Human Development Report. 2009. Overcoming Barriers. Human mobility and development. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Usher, K. & Jackson, D. 2014. Phenomenolgy. In J. Mills, & M. Birks, (eds).*Qualitative Methodology: A Practical Guide.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publishers.

Wentzel, M., Viljoen, J. & Kok, P. 2006. *Contemporary South African migration patterns and intentions.*In Kok, P., Gelderblom, D., Oucho, J.O. & Van Zyl, J.*Migration in South and Southern Africa: Dynamics and determinants*. Cape Town. HRSC Pr.

Wilcke, M. M. 2002. Hermeneutic phenomenology as a research method in social work. *Currents: New Scholarship in the Human Services*. 1(1) New York: University of Calgary Press.

Wilding, C. & Whiteford, G. 2005*. Phenomenological Research: An Exploration of Conceptual, Theoretical, and Practical Issues.* 25(3):98-104.

Wilmot, A. 2005. Designing sampling strategies for qualitative social research: with particular reference to the Office for National Statistics' Qualitative Respondent Register*. Survey Methodology Bulletin.* 56(9): 53-65. United Kingdom: Office for National Statistics.

Yeo, A., Legard, R., Keegan, J., Ward, K., Nicholls, C. & Lewis, J. 2014. In-depth interviews. In Richie, J., Lewis, J., Nicholls, C.M. & Ormston, R. (eds.). 2014. *Qualitative Research Practice: A guide for social science students & researchers.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Yount, R. 2006. *Research Design and statistical analysis for Christian Ministry.* Fort Worth, Tex: W.R. Yount.

Zanetti, l. & Carr, A. 1997. Putting Critical theory to work: Giving the public administrator the critical edge. *Administrative Theory and Praxis*, 19(2); 208-224.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: RESEARCHER'S BRACKETING.

Researcher's personal knowledge and views about migration and municipal planning

The researcher is a former municipal official and has work withinthe local government for almost fifteen years. In that period the researcher also served as a municipal councillor for ten years where he served as a member of the executive committee which had the followingresponsibilities (among others): to develop municipal IDPs and budgets, to receive and address complaints from communities of the municipality, to oversee performance of municipal officials with regard to the municipality's development strategies and to attend and participate in IGR and other consultative forums where issues of governance were discussed. In this regard the researcher was afforded opportunity to learn more about municipal planning processes and understand legislative imperatives governing those processes. In particular the researcher had an opportunity to participate in the consultative processes in developing the Municipal Finance Management Act (Act 156 of 2003), which is a critical document relating to municipal financial planning and management.The researcher furthermore served as a senior municipal official for 5 years and was afforded the opportunity to sit in forums where government and other structures like the South African Local Government Association debated migration issues as they relate to planning. Furthermore, during this research, the researcher consulted a variety of documents relating to municipal planning which opened him to different interpretations and views of different authors and scholars. All these engagements certainly influenced the researcher's perspective on how municipal planning should be conducted and what the effects of migration in municipal planning are. The following were the views of the researcher before the interviews with the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's officials and analysis of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's official documents.

- Migration is a global phenomenon as old as the human race itself. It is a living phenomenon that will stay with the human race and cannot be wished away.

- Migration is about geography. It takes place within geographical boundaries, within and across country borders.

- Migration can be costly or beneficial to both areas of origin and areas of destination.

- Migration leads to change of demographics. Some areas become depopulated while others are over-populated in terms of settlement.

- Migrants to South Africa mostly come from other African countries because they view South Africa as a country with a lot of opportunities like jobs, business, peace and stability with limited environmental disasters experienced in other countries.

- People move from rural areas to urban areas looking for advanced and developed infrastructure, social services and job and business opportunities.

- Migrants from other African states feel they deserve equal treatment like South African citizens as a way of paying back their gestures during the time of liberation struggle as they also accommodated South African political activists.

- Municipalities do not consider migration in their planning and resource allocation.

- Municipal IDPs are - in most cases - done for the purpose of compliance. This is, because municipal officials do not have the required skills and rely on consultants to do planning for them. Priority lists in the majority of municipal IDPs are purely wish lists. In most cases they do not reflect the needs of the people on the ground as consultations with community members are rarely done. Priorities developed by municipalities in their IDPs are often not followed during implementation mostly because municipalities do not have the required skills especially in areas of planning, engineering and financial management. Furthermore many municipalities do not have required resources, they depend on grants from the National Treasury which are not enough and many municipalities cannot generate their own revenue. In most cases there is no proper synchronisation of development plans and resourcesbetween spheres of government. Furthermore, many municipalities have not tapped into opportunities

of social corporate investments from social partners within their municipalities. Such social partners are not invited to participate in many of the municipalities planning activities.

- Municipalities are rarely involved when strategies to deal with migration management are discussed at national level. This results in strategies imposed on them, which are also not accompanied by resources and capacity building.

- Xenophobic attacks experienced in South Africa are as a result of negative perceptions held by many South Africans about migration. There is no willpower from political leaders to address migrationchallenges within South Africa as the majority of these leaders also view migration as nuisance to South Africa's development.

- There are enough pieces of legislation in South Africa with regard to migration management and municipal planning. This avalanche of pieces of legislations inhibits flexibility and innovation on part of municipalities to execute their constitutional mandates of providing services to their communities as they are required to comply with such legislation pieces and regulations. Municipalities focus on compliance issues rather than service delivery.

- Many municipalities do not have clear strategies to integrate migrants in their communities.

- To minimise migration governments should develop industrialisation strategies that will result in job creation and invest in rural areas. At regional level governments should harmonise migration policy frameworks and to counteract the effects of geography by encouraging regional interactions, improve transportnetworks, encourage partnerships of institutions like health and universities.

- To curb xenophobia governments and municipalities must develop intergration strategies which, amogst others, talk to revive history and ideology where people are educated about rights of foreigners and advocating philosophy of *one Africa one nation.*Mobilisation of civil society and non-governmental organisation to work together with governments in dealing with displacements and migration.

- Municipalities should consider migration in the plans and resource allocation. Inputs should be solicited from all affected stakeholders on how best migration can be managed through municipal planning.

APPENDIX B: TOPIC GUIDE

This interview guide is developed to provide a flexible guide to the data collection process (interview process) as an essential aspect of the research. The interview process seeks to identify common threads on relevant topics and themes to explore in relation to the research problem. This process ensures that relevant issues are covered systematically and with some uniformity while still allowing flexibility to pursue the details salient to each individual participant. Respondents are advised to ensure that they are free and flexible during the interviews as their information will be treated with confidentiality and strict anonymity. Data collected will be used mainly for the research purpose.

Time of interview   :

Date   :

Place   :

Interviewer   :

Interviewee   :

Position of interviewee   :

Brief description of the topic

Municipalities are mandated to provide sustainable services to their communities within the constraints of available resources. To achieve this, municipalities are expected to develop plans (IDPs) which are informed by several factors, *inter alia* the national policy frameworks, their physical demography and population dynamics. Since the new democratic dispensation in 1994, many municipalities in urban areas experienced significant levels of migration, as the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is a case in point attributed to huge mining activities in the area. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, gives both citizens and non-citizens rights and entitlements, including rights to basic services. Migration, therefore, should be included in municipal

planning. This research asserts that municipal planning as in the case of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality should be considered incomplete if it does not take into consideration population dynamics. This research is undertaken to investigate the influence of migration in municipal planning.

Themes/Objectives and Questions

Objective 1: To examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse Local municipality.

1.1.   Can you to tell me about yourself, your involvement, experiences and understanding of municipal planning and migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

1.2.   In your opinion what makes people to migrate/ to move from one place to another especially as experienced in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

1.3.   In terms of your knowledge what are the patterns of migration that feed into Greater Tubatse Local Municipality areas (i.e. from which places to which ones do these movements take place)

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

1.4.   What systems are in place to inform managers about migration patterns within the municipality? Can you say such systems are effective or not? Expand on your response.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Objective 2:   To analyse how priorities and decisions are made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

2.1.   Tell me about your experience with regard to the needs prioritisation process in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

2.2.   How is the needs prioritisation process (especially during the IDP stages) taking into account inputs from migrants communities?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

2.3.   Based on your experience with Greater Tubatse Local Municipal financial plan, can you say that issues of population dynamics are considered? How is the financial plan considered in the migration plan of the municipality? Can you expand on this? If it does not, what do you think are (will be) the effects of such exclusions?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Objective 3:   To describe how migration influences planning in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.

3.1. Based on your knowledge and experience with regard to planning activities in Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, please describe how migration influences municipal planning in general? (How does migration enhance or inhibit municipal planning and resource allocation in the municipality?)

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

3.2. Does the municipality have strategies and programmes to integrate migrants in the society? Can you tell us more about those strategies and programmes if they are available? Please indicate whether they are effective or not and how they can be improved.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

3.3. There is a lot of discussions in the media and academic discourses about xenophobia and violent community protests in South Africa. Do you see migration as having a link to municipal planning, community protests and xenophobic tendencies as being relevant here? Please expand and also explain how you think these problems could be addressed.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

3.4. How do other spheres of government participate in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality's planning processes? How effective are the legislative frameworks and inputs coming from those spheres of government in relation to migration and municipal planning?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

3.5. What can you say are the challenges that you face with regard to planning in the municipality especially with regard to influx caused by the migration? How can the issue of migration be addressed through municipal planning?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Closing remarks

- From what we have been discussing so far what can you say is your view/ understanding / comment on how migration relates to municipal planning?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

- Is there anything else you want to add or ask from me?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Thank you for your participation in this interview and the insight you shared with me with regard to this topic.

APPENDIX C: PERMISSION LETTER TO THE GREATER TUBATSE LOCAL MUNICIPALITY

 ENQ: Phala H.L   P O BOX 195
Contact: 0827764021   DRIEKOP
                                                                       1129
                                                                       30 March 2015

The Municipal Manager
The Greater Tubatse Municipality
P O BOX 206
BURGERSFORT
1150

Dear Sir/Madam

REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT A RESEARCH ON YOUR MUNICIPALITY

I am a Masters of Public Administration Student with the Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership, Limpopo University. My student number is 201221861

The research topic for my mini dissertation is:The influence of Migration on Municipal Planning, Case of the Greater Tubatse Municipality, Limpopo Province. My choice of this topic stems from my experience in municipal environment, where Irealised possible challenges regarding migration and municipal Planning (IDPs).

Since I participated in a number of conferences and commissions where migration issues with relations to municipal planning were discussed, I therefore developed a serious interest in furthering my understanding in by exploring the understanding of other role-players who have lived experience with these phenomena. The objectives of the study are:

- To examine the causes of migration in the Greater Tubatse municipality.
- To analyse how decisions and priorities are made with regard to resource allocation in the Greater Tubatse municipal planning.
- To investigate how migration influences planning in the Greater Tubatse municipality

Though research is for academic purposes, I hope the findings will assist the Greater Tubatse municipality and other government structures with regard to migration management. My choice of The Greater Tubatse Municipality is informed by the fact that it is the fastest growing municipality due to the mining activities, and will therefore attract migrants which may pose a serious challenge if not well managed. I feel the study will uncover the real facts about migration and its influence on municipal planning and resource allocation and will contribute immensely towards the development of strategies and policies in the municipality.

I therefore request the municipality to allow me conduct this study. As part of the research, the researcher will have to interview senior municipal officials who have lived experience with municipal planning (ie Chief Financial Officer or Deputy Chief Financial Officer, IDP Manager, PMS Manager, Director for Community Services and Manager for Spatial Planning), Traditional leaders serving in council and migrants themselves. The researcher will also analyse documentation related to municipal planning. I therefore request you to give the permission to interview those officials and use your documents for this study. Should the study require that I consult additional people, I will inform the municipality.

It is the ethical requirement that the researcher give some form of commitment with regard to this study. I therefore confirm that this study is for only academic purposes. The researcher will not divulge/share any classified or confidential information obtained during the study with any person. Interviewees will participate in the research volitionally and have a right to withdraw from the study at any stage. Their identification will be concealed.

Attached please find a copy of a permission letter to collect data from the university.

Kind regards,

PhalaHlabishi Lemon

Student

APPENDIX D: SUPPORT LETTER FROM LIMPOPO UNIVERSITY

<div align="center">

University of Limpopo
Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership
Master of Public Administration
P.O. Box 756, Fauna Park, 0787, South Africa
Tel: (015) 290 2842/25, Fax: (015) 290 2852, Email:pauline.moeketsi@ul.ac.za

</div>

To   :   Whom it may Concern

From :   Pauline Moeketsi

            MPA: Programme Assistant

Date   :   18/02/2015

Subject: Permission Letter to Collect Data

_____

Dear Sir/Madam,

This is to confirm that**Mr. Phala HL (201221861)**is a registered Public Administration Masters student with the Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership needs to collect data as part of the requirement to complete his mini-dissertation. The topic of his research is **"The Influence of Migration on Municipal Planning: A Case of Greater Tubatse Municipality, Limpopo Province"**. We therefore request permission from your institution for him to collect data.

Hope you will find this well.

Best Regards

Pauline Moeketsi

APPENDIX E: PERMISSION LETTER FROM THE GREATER TUBATSE LOCAL MUNICIPALITY

Mr Phala
P. O Box 195
Driekop
1129

Sir

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT A RESEARCH ON THE MUNICIPALITY

Your letter dated 30th March 2015 refers:

Please note that the Municipality does not have any objection to your studies and or research to be conducted on the Tubatse Municipality.

Permission is hereby granted to you for the purpose of conducting your research.

Wishing you all the best in your studies

_____

MOJA MM
ACTING MUNICIPAL MANAGER

2/4/2015

DATE

Address:

Corner Kort and Eddie Sedibe Streets
P O Box 206, Burgersfort, 1150
Tel: (013) 231 7815
Fax: (013) 231 7467
Website: www.tubatse.co.za

APPENDIX F: INTERVIEW CONSENT FORM

Hello, I am Phala Hlabishi Lemon, a Masters of Public Administration student at the University of Limpopo, (Turfloop School of Leadership) I have requested your institution to allow me to research on the municipality. I am asking people from your municipality who are responsible for planning in the municipality to participate in the interviews. My research topic is: *The influence of migration in municipal planning: a case of the Greater Tubatse Municipality, Limpopo Province.* The study intends to gain a deeper understanding on how migration influences municipal planning.

I have chosen you because you are one of the officials responsible for planning in the municipality therefore has experience on planning issues in the municipality. Though the study is for academic purposes, I hope your contribution will help make conclusions and recommendations with regard to migration and municipal planning which will help other scholars studying this subject and planners and decision makers regarding in policy development.

Please understand that your participation is voluntary and you are not being forced to take part in this study. The choice of whether to participate or not are yours alone. However, I would really appreciate it if you share your experience with us. If you choose not to take part your will not be affected in any way whatsoever. If you agree to participate, you may stop at any time and discontinue your participation and there will be no penalties and you will not be prejudiced in any way.

I will not record your name during interviews and no one will be able to link you to answers you give. Only the researcher and the university will have access to unlinked information. All your information will remain confidential.

The interview will last around 60 minutes. I will be asking you a few questions and request that you are as open and honest as possible in answering these questions. Some questions maybe of a personal and/or sensitive nature. You may choose not to answer these questions. I know that you cannot be absolutely certain about the answers

to all questions. When it comes to answering these questions, there are no right and wrong answers. If I ask you a question which makes you feel sad or upset, we can stop and talk about it. My supervisor Professor Phago KG is available to talk with you or assist you with those things that upset you. If possible I will come back to confirm what we shall have discussed, and/ or to inform you of what the results are and discuss our findings.

If you have any other questions about this study, you may contact Pauline Mooketsi (Student Support) at **moeketsip@edupark.ac.za.** If you have any complaint about any aspect of this study, you may contact my supervisor at **phago@ul.ac.za**

CONSENT

I hereby agree to participate in research regarding *the influence of migration on municipal planning: a case of Greater Tubatse municipality, Limpopo Province.* I understand that I am participating freely and without being forced in any way to do so. I also understand that I can stop this interview at any point should I not want to continue and that this decision will not in any way affect me negatively.

I confirm that the purpose of the study has been explained to me, and I understand what is expected of my participation. I understand that this is a research project whose purpose is not necessarily to benefit me personally.

I understand that that this consent form will not be linked to the interview and that my answer will remain confidential.

_____   _____

Signature of Participant   DATE

APPENDIXG: HORIZONTALISATION AND CODING OF SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS

1. **HORIZONTALIZATION AND CODING**

CODE	IN T 1	IN T 2	IN T 3	IN T 4	TOTAL PARTICIPANTS	FREQUENCY OF STATEMENTS
Agr	X	0	0	0	01	01
Crim	X	X X	X	X	04	05
Co. Iss	X	0	0	0	01	01
CT	X	0	0	0	01	01
Ed. HP	X	0	X	0	02	02
Exp.oth	X	0	0	0	01	01
FC	X	X	X	0	03	03
IDP/prog	X	X X X X	X X	X	04	08
Inf.Sett	X	X	X X	0	03	04
Influx	X	X	0	0	02	02
ILL/min	X	0	0	0	01	01
Leg.av	X	X X X	X	X X X	04	08
Leg. Neff	X	X	X	0	03	03
MGW	X	0	0	0	01	01
MIG/int	X	0	0	0	01	01
MIG/int/not	X	X	0	X	03	03
MIG/Not	X	X	X	X	04	10

		X		X		
		X				
		X				
		X				
		X				
MIG/pos	X	X	X XX	X X	04	07
MIN.Con	X	X X X X X X	X	0	03	08
MIP	X	X X	X X X X	X X	04	09
MIR	X	X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X	X X X X X X X X X X	X X X X X X X X X	04	36

186

Mun. Fun	*X*	*X* *X*	*0*	*0*	*02*	*02*
Mun.L	*X*	*0*	*0*		*01*	*01*
No Sys	*X*	*X* *X* *X* *X*	*X* *X* *X* *X* *X* *X* *X*	*X* *X*	*04*	*14*
N/Xen	*X*	*0*	*X*	*X* *X*	*03*	*04*
Own R	*X*	*X*	*0*	*0*	*02*	*02*
Res /Av	*X*	*X* *X* *X*	*0*	*X*	*03*	*05*
Res/P	*X*	*0*	*0*	*0*	*01*	*01*
Sect Auth	*X*	*X* *X* *X* *X*	*X* *X*	*X* *X*	*04*	*09*
Sect Del	*X*	*0*	*X* *X* *X* *X*	*X*	*03*	*06*
Sect Eng	*X*	*X*	*0*	*0*	*02*	*02*
Stat/Ion	*X*	*X*	*X* *X*	*X*	*04*	*05*
Tserv	*X*	*0*	*0*	*0*	*01*	*01*
W	*X*	*0*	*X*	*0*	*02*	*02*
WC	*X*	*X*	*0*	*0*	*02*	*02*
W/M	*X*	*0*	*0*	*0*	*01*	*01*

N/Xen	*X*	*0*	*X*	*0*	*02*	*02*
ERM	*0*	*X*	*X* *X*	*X*	*03*	*04*
Mun/Go	*0*	*X*	*0*	*0*	*01*	*01*
STAT/Q	*0*	*X* *X*	*0*	*X*	*02*	*03*
P. STAT	*0*	*X* *X* *X*	*X*	*0*	*02*	*04*
TM	*0*	*X* *X*	*X*	*X*	*03*	*04*
PR	*0*	*X*	*0*	*0*	*01*	*01*
MSER	*0*	*X*	*X* *X* *X* *X* *X*	*X* *X* *X* *X*	*03*	*10*
PC	*0*	*X* *X* *X*	*X* *X* *X* *X* *X*	*X* *X*	*03*	*10*
WP	*0*	*X*	*0*	*X*	*02*	*02*
Xen	*0*	*X* *X*	*X*	*0*	*02*	*03*
LSKO	*0*	*X* *X*	*X*	*0*	*02*	*03*
CPM	*0*	*X* *X* *X*	*0*	*0*	*01*	*03*
NAT/PERS	*0*	*0*	*X*	*X*	*02*	*02*
P/LEG/IMP	*0*	*0*	*X* *X*	*X* *X*	*02*	*08*

		X X X X				
P/IMP/STRA T	*0*	*0*	*X X X X X X X X*	*X X*	*02*		*09*

2. ABBREVIATIONS USED FOR CODING

CODES/STATEMENT	ABBREVIATION
1. Influx	Influx
2. Work in the mines	W/M.
3. Foreigners or outsiders come to Tubatse	FC.
4. Migration has impact on resources	MIR.
5. Greater Tubatse Local Municipality has responsibility to deliver services to people	TServ
6. Illiterate / unskilled people look for general work in the mines	Ill/min
7. Work as reason for migration	W.
8. Mines offer general work	MGW.
9. Those with experience come from areas/ provinces where there have been mines	Exp. Oth
10. The educated or skilled are looking for higher or better positions	Ed.HP.
11. People want to be closer to town	CT.
12. Migrants create shacks in the GTLM or live in informal settlements	Inf/sett.

13. Agricultural land not suitable for settlement	Agr
14. Migration impacts on planning	MIP.
15. Municipality does not have migration data system or the system is not effective	No Sys.
16. Municipality does not have authority over some land occupied by migrants	Mun L.
17. Sector Departments delay to respond to issues or implement their plans	Sect. Del.
18. Some services are offered by sector departments or other spheres of government	Sect. Auth.
19. Mines contribute towards migration proliferation and challenges	Min. Con
20. Resources /Funds from National Government are allocated based on population statistics from census	Pes/ P. Stat..
21. Statistics South Africa collects statistics in a period of ten years	Stat/Ion..
22. Municipality collects its own revenue based on household /people living on rateable or formalised areas	Own R..
23. Municipality provides certain service delivery functions	Mun.Fun
24. Communities or wards are clustered during IDP public participation processes	WC
25. Some areas where migrants live are not suitable for residential purposes as they do not comply with environmental requirements hence the municipality does not put them in its plan	Co. Iss

26. Migration is not considered in GTLM municipal planning processes and financial plans (as a separate item)	MIG. Not
27. The municipality engages sector departments responsible for migrants on migration needs and planning issues	Sec. Eng
28. Migration has positive impacts on the development of the municipality	MIG/Pos
29. Migrants perpetuate crime in the municipality	Crim...
30. There are migration integration programmes or strategies in the municipality	MiG/ INT
31. Migration integration is not existent or is not effective	MIG/INT/NOT
32. There is xenophobia in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	Y/Xen
33. Xenophobia is not or less prevalent in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	N/Xen
34. Resource availability affects migration management or resources are needed to manage migration	Res. Av
35. Legislative framework is available to manage migration and deal with inter-governmental relations	Leg.av..
36. Legislative framework to manage migration and inter-governmental relations is not effective	Leg.Neff.
37. The first step in planning is status quo or situational analysis	STAT/Q.
38. Other spheres of government and sectors like mines participate in the GTM planning processes and make inputs	IDP/Prog.

39. Corruption perpetuates migration and planning challenge	CPM
40. Lack of skills and knowledge on the part of officials has effects on planning and migration management	LSKO..
41. Planning should focus on population and population dynamics is a driving force in planning	P/STAT
42. Educated and rich people are the ones who migrate looking for better opportunities and services	ERM.
43. People want to be closer to their workplace	WP
44. Public consultation takes place	PC..
45. The poor remain in their places or do not migrate	PR..
46. Migration is as a result of socio and economic reasons like the social services and amenities	MSER
47. Municipalities are directed by what they want to achieve when they play or their goals	W/A.
48. Greater Tubatse is a mining area	TM.
49. Planning is informed by National perspective or National or Provincial programmes	NAT/ PERS
50. Planning is informed by legislative imperatives	P/LEG/IMP

APPENDIX H: CATEGORISATION OF STATEMENTS INTO THEMES

Theme 1 Causes of migration	Theme 2 Decisions and prioritisation regarding resource allocation	Theme 3 Influence of migration on planning	Emergent themes	Participants' statements irrelevant to the research topic
3 statements from 3 participants indicate that the migrants in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality come from other countries.	10 statements from 3 participants show that public consultation takes place in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	36 statements from all 4 participants indicae that migration has impact on municipal resources	3 statements from 2 participants show that lack of skills and knowledge on the part of officials has effects on planning and migration management	
1statement from 1 participant shows that illiterate or unskilled people look for general work in the mines in the Graeter Tubatse	8 statements from 4 participants indicate that other spheres of governments and other sectors like mines participate in the GTLM	4 statements from 2 partipants to justify that planning should focus on population and that population dynamics is	3 statements from 3 participants show that legislative framework to manage migration and inter-governmental relations is not	2 statements from 2 participants show that planning is informed by National perspective or Provincial programmes

193

Local Municipality	planning processes and make inputs	a driving force in planning	effectively implemented	
2 statements from 2 participants indicate employment as a reason for migration in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	3 statements from 3 participants show that migration is not considered in the Greater Tubatse Municipal planning and financial plans.	4 statements from 3 participants indicate that xenophobia is not or is less prevalent in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality	8 statements from 4 participants shoe that legislative framework to manage migration and deal with inter-governmental relations is available	8 statements from 2 participants that legislative imperatives inform planning processes in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.
4 statements from 3 participants show that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality is a mining area.	1 statement from 1 participants indicates that some areas where migrants live are not suitable for residential purposes as they do not comply with environmental requirements hence the municipality	5 statements from 3 participants indicate that resource availability affects migration management in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality.	2 statements from 2 participants indicate that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality engages sector departments responsible for migrants on migration needs and planning issues	3 statements from 2 participants show that the first step in planning is status quo or situational analysis

	does not put them in its plans			
10 statements from 3 participants show that migration in the GTLM is as a result of socio-economic reasons like the need for social services and amenities	2 statements from 2 participants show that the GTLM use community meetings by clustering for IDP public participation consultation processes	3 statements from 2 participants indicate there there are no elements of xenophobia in the Greater Tubatse Local municipality	5 statements from 4 participants show that the GTLM uses data collected by Statistics South Africa between a period of ten years to plan	3 statements from 3 participants show that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have effective programmes to intergrate migrants
2 statements from 2 show that people want to be closer to the work places		5 statements from 4 participants indicate that migrants perpetuate crime in the municipality	4 statements from 3 participants show that migrants create shacks all over the GTLM and live in informal settlements	Only 1 participant issued 1 statement indicating that there are migration integration programmes or strategies in the municipality
4 statements from 3 participants		7 statements from 4 participants show that	9 statements from 4 participants show that	2 statements from 2 participants indicate that there is influx of people in GT LM

195

indicate that educated people move out of the GTLM ones searching for better opportunities and advanced services		migration has positive impacts on the development of the municipality.	some services in GTLM are offered by sector departments and the Sekhukhune District Municipality	
3 statements from 1 participant indicate that corruption perpetuates migration and planning challenges in the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality		2 statements were raised by 2 participants that municipality collects its own revenue based on household/ people living on rateable and formalised areas	6 statements from3 participants indicate that sector departments delay to respond to issues by the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality or do not implement their plans	1 statement from 1 participant show that agricultural land is not suitable for settlement
8 statements from 3 participants show that mines contribute towards		1 statement from 1 participant states that the Greater Tubatse Local	1 statement raised by 1participant show that the Greater Tubatse Local	1 participant issued 1 statement indicating that mines offer general work

migration proliferation and challenges		Municipality has responsibility to deliver services to the people	Municipality does not have authority over some land occupied by migrants	
2 statements were raised by 2 participants indicating that the educated or skilled people are looking for higher or better positions		9 statements from 4 participants indicate that migration impacts on municipal planning in the GTLM	14 statements from 4 participants indicate that the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality does not have effective migration data system	1 participant indicated through 1 statement that migrants work in the mines
1 participant indicated in 1 statement those migrants with experience come from areas/ provinces where there have been mines			2 statements were raised by 2 participants indicating that the municipality provides certain service delivery functions	

before.			
1 statement from 1 participant show that poor people remain in their places or do not migrate			
1 participant raised a statement to the effect that people want to be closer to town			

CERTIFICATE FROM LANGUAGE EDITOR