

Analysis of national election manifestos of the African National Congress about service delivery between 1994 and 2014.

by

Mpfareni Norman Ramukosi

Mini-dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Public Administration (MPA)

in the Subject

Public Administration

in the Faculty of

Management and Law

at the University of Limpopo

(Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership)

Supervisor: Dr Mavhungu Musitha

August 2018

Declaration

I, Mpfareni Norman Ramukosi, declare that this study entitled “Analysis of election manifestos of the African National Congress about service delivery between 1994 and 2014” is my original work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been duly acknowledged by means of complete references.

MN Ramukosi

University of Limpopo

29 August 2018

Date

Dedication

To my late father

My guardian angel-

Vho- Nnditsheni John Ramukosi-

Mavunge, wa Nyalitshani, Nyamufhi na Mufhiri wa Gondo.

Acknowledgements

The successful completion of this study would not have been possible without the support, assistance and encouragement of a number of individuals.

- I wish to express my heartfelt thanks to my supervisor, Dr Mavhungu Musitha, for his guidance, motivation, patience and insight throughout the duration of this research project.
- My gratitude also goes to Mr GT Owen for the expertise with which he edited the language on this study.
- I wholeheartedly wish to acknowledge the unwavering support from my family-my mother (Vho-Mukundwa), my beloved wife (Avhashoni) and my sons (Nyalitshani, Orilwela and Mutondwalini).
- I owe my deepest thanks to the participants for finding time to support this thesis.
- Finally, to all those I might not have mentioned above, I say thank you for your support.
- Above all else, I surrender all and give thanks and praise to the Almighty who gave me the strength, wisdom and knowledge to undertake this journey and complete it.

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

ANC	: African National Congress
AGSA	: Auditor-General of South Africa
AsgiSA	: Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa
AZAPO	: Azanian People's Organization
BEC	: Branch Executive Committee
COGHSTA	: Cooperative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs
GEAR	: Growth, Employment and Redistribution
HSRC	: Human Sciences Research Council
IDASA	: Institute for Democratic Alternatives in South Africa
IDP	: Integrated Development Plan
IEC	: Independent Electoral Commission
NDP	: National Development Plan
NP	: National Party
PAC	: Pan Africanist Congress
PR	: Proportional Representation
REC	: Regional Executive Committee
RDP	: Reconstruction and Development Programme
SACP	: South African Communist Party
SANCO	: South African National Civic Organization
STATS SA	: Statistics South Africa

Abstract

This study analyses the national election manifestos of the African National Congress on the subject of service delivery between 1994 and 2014. One of the arguments advanced in this thesis and corroborated in the theory of democratization by elections is that elections play an important role in the struggle for better governance and democracy. The election manifestos, in this regard, serve as instruments of ensuring accountability to the voters as well as gauging the performance of those in government. The party in government must implement its election manifestos; otherwise it must face electoral consequences through a democratic election process. However, there is a view aptly sustained in the study that elections are at times not a reliable or credible measure of a democratic outcome because many voters do not have the necessary knowledge to make rational choices in order to counteract the effects of poor or lack of implementation of election manifestos regarding service delivery. Therefore, as cautioned in the thesis, conscious public participation will remain an empty slogan if the majority of the electorate is left and forgotten languishing in poverty and arrogance. The sustainability of participation by citizens is hugely compromised in an environment infested with rampant corruption and runaway impunity.

The study followed an interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach. ANC members in four villages –Duthuni, Tshisaulu, Ha-Mushavhanamadi and Ha-Ratshiedana (ward 35, Thulamela Municipality) were purposively targeted as the research population for the study. For practical reason, not all members of the ANC in the villages were reached to participate in the study. Ultimately, 42 members of the ANC in the villages formed the research sample. Data collection techniques used were face-to-face interviews, semi-structured questionnaire and document review (data triangulation). The rationale for using data triangulation in the study was to ensure that the weaknesses of a single data collection strategy were minimized and to ensure that the strategies complemented and verified one another. A total of 12 interviews were conducted, 30 questionnaires were administered and five ANC national election manifestos were perused. Three qualitative data analysis strategies were adopted, namely, conversation analysis, discourse analysis and content analysis. Analysis and interpretation of qualitative data consisted of words and observations and not numbers or statistics because the researcher did not want to quantify nor generate numerical data for purposes of statistical analysis.

Keywords: Election manifestos, implementation, democracy, accountability, public participation, corruption, democratic elections, governance, rational choices, service delivery.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Reflection on the research topic	2
1.3 Problem statement	3
1.4 Motivation/rationale for the study	4
1.5 Significance of the study	5
1.6 Aim of the study	5
1.7 Specific objectives of the study	6
1.8 Research questions	6
1.9 Overview of the research design and methodology	6
1.10 Conceptualization	7
1.10.1 Election manifestos	7
1.10.2 Service delivery	8
1.10.3 Democracy and elections	8
1.11 Demarcation of the study	10
1.12 Sequential arrangement of chapters	10
1.13 Reference techniques	11
1.14 Conclusion	11

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 Conceptualization of literature review	12
2.3 Understanding election manifestos	14
2.4 Cross-national Analysis: India and Mexico	15
2.5 Historical background of South African election process	16
2.6 The constitutional and legal framework for electoral democracy in South Africa	18
2.7 Existing theories on democratic election process	19
2.7.1 Definition of theory	20
2.7.2 Definition of an election process	20
2.7.3 The economic theory	21
2.7.4 The rational ignorance theory	23
2.7.5 The participatory democratic theory	24
2.7.5.1 Comparison of citizenship participation with other Southern African states	27
2.8 The Importance of education and information	28
2.9 Electoral consequences	28
2.10 The conundrum of service delivery	29
2.10.1 Service delivery protests	31
2.11 ANC's National Election Manifestos	34
2.11.1 The 1994 National Election Manifesto: "a better life for all"	34

2.11.2 The 1999 National Election Manifesto: change must go on at a faster pace	36
2.11.3 The 2004 National Election Manifesto: a people contract to create work and fight poverty	36
2.11.4 The 2009 National Election Manifesto: working together we can do more	37
2.11.5 The 2014 National Election Manifesto: together we move South Africa forward!	38
2.12 Instruments to gauge the effectiveness of ANC's election manifestos	39
2.12.1 Thulamela Annual Municipal Report	39
2.12.2 Auditor-General Report, 2014-2015 Financial Year (with specific focus on Limpopo municipalities)	41
2.13 Conclusion	42

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction	43
3.2 Research design	43
3.2.1 Qualitative research design: case study	44
3.3 Research methodology	45
3.3.1 Paradigm	45
3.3.1.1 Quantitative approach	46
3.3.1.2 Qualitative approach	46
3.3.1.2.1 Interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach	47
3.3.2 Data collection techniques	48
3.3.2.1 Interview	48
3.3.2.1.1 Face-to-face interview	49
3.3.2.2 Questionnaire	50
3.3.2.2.1 Semi-structured questionnaire	51
3.3.2.3 Documentation review	53
3.4 Qualitative data analysis	53
3.5 Triangulation	55
3.6 Population and sampling methods	56
3.6.1 Population	56
3.6.2 Sampling methods	56

3.7 Quality criteria	59
3.7.1 Trustworthiness	59
3.7.1.1 Credibility	60
3.7.1.2 Dependability	60
3.7.1.3 Confirmability	60
3.7.1.4 Transferability	60
3.8 Ethical considerations	61
3.8.1 Informed consent	61
3.8.2 Harm and risk	61
3.8.3 Honesty and trust	62
3.8.4 Privacy, confidentiality and anonymity	62
3.7.5 Voluntary participation	62
3.9 Conclusion	62

CHAPTER 4

DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

4.1 Introduction	64
4.2 Presentation of data	64
4.3 Interview	65
4.3.1 Analysis of data from the interview	66
4.3.1.1 Participants' responses to warm-up questions	66
4.3.1.2 Participants' understanding of election manifestos	67
4.3.1.3 Poor service delivery and constant voting patterns	69
4.3.1.4 Public (membership) participation	71
4.3.1.5 Disconnection between messages in the manifestos and actual service delivery	72
4.3.1.6 Participants' last comments	74
4.4 Questionnaire	75
4.4.1 Findings from the semi-structured questionnaire, analysis and interpretation	75
4.4.1.1 Participants' understanding of a democratic election process (C)	75
4.4.1.2 Election manifestos (D)	79
4.4.1.3 Service delivery (E)	81
4.4.1.4 Public (general membership) participation (F)	83
4.4.1.5 Challenges facing the ruling party (G)	84
4.4.1.6 Participants' comments (H)	86
4.5 Response rate and demographic information	86
4.6 Document analysis	87
4.7 Conclusion	90

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Introduction	91
5.2 Summary of chapters	91
5.3 Conclusions from the findings of the study	92
5.4 Recommendations about the findings	94
5.5 Critique, limitations and delimitations	95
5.6 Conclusion	96

LIST OF REFERENCES

Annexure A: A letter requesting participation	114
Annexure B: Informed consent form	115
Annexure C: Interview schedule	117
Annexure D: Questionnaire	120
Annexure E: Confirmation of text editing	127

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: South African suffrage timelines	17
Table 2: Purposive sampling procedure	58
Table 3: Election manifesto slogans and presidential strategic frameworks	88

CHAPTER 1

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The study falls within the broad theme of election trends which is one of the main pillars of the discipline of Public Administration. The subject Public Administration studies human beings engaged in administration and management in organs of state aimed at satisfying societal needs (Morenikeji & Oluwafemi, 2014:65). As a discipline, it is researched and practised within a social and political environment. On the other hand, the principal tasks and values of public administration (as an activity) are effectiveness, efficiency and economy. These tasks and values were developed in order to guide efforts to improve the way government implements its policies (Thornhill & van Dijk, 2010:793). Morenikeji & Oluwafemi (2014:65) argue that public administration is “centrally concerned with the organisation of government policies and programmes as well as the behaviour of officials (usually none-elected) formally responsible for their conduct”. However, the study focuses specifically on the question of the election manifestos of the African National Congress (ANC) (1994-2014). This chapter serves as a project plan and a foundation for subsequent chapters. In this chapter the section referred to as reflection on the topic provides the basis of the research and justifies the research topic. The problem statement provides a short description of the issues that need to be addressed. It is a definite expression (statement) about a troubling question that exists within existing practice that point to a need for investigation (Vithal & Jansen in Maree, 2010:25). The rationale/motivation for the study includes the researcher’s personal reason for being involved in the study as well as the significance, aim and objectives of the study. The research questions to be addressed in the study have also been reflected upon. The overview of the research design and methodology has been discussed. The explanations of specific key concepts relevant to the study have been provided, as well as sequential arrangement of the chapters and reference techniques.

1.2 REFLECTION ON THE RESEARCH TOPIC

Election manifestos are some of the instruments employed by political parties before an election to sell their ideas to its mass support base (Mckinley, 2009:1). In South Africa, scholarly articles have been generated and published about the ANC's election campaigns. These include authors such as Twala (2014), De Wet (2004), and Friedman (2009). Authors such as Bojabotshela and Mloi (2014), Lemon (2009) and Maluleka (2009) have painted a very negative and pessimistic view of election manifestos.

Besides the above-mentioned argument, there is a consensus that regular democratic elections are important and necessary in developing a culture of democracy within a country. According to the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act No. 108 of 1996, the key pillar in the exercise of democracy is the holding of free and fair elections at regular intervals and on the basis of universal, equal and secret suffrage.

However, the credibility and validity of the democratic election process and its outcome remain the subject of intense scholarly debate. A host of authors such as Garrentsen, Stoker, Alessie and Lammers (2014), Alvarez, Nagler and Willete (1999), Martinelli (2006) and Achen and Bartels (2002) are critical about the authenticity of the election process. South African scholars, inter alia, Mattes (2002) and Friedman (2009) are also very pessimistic regarding the participatory democratic tradition in the country. Skorpel (2009) and Crenson and Ginsberg (2002) refer to such a poor electoral and political environment as “diminished democracy” and “down-sized democracy” respectively.

Regardless of the preceding discussion, the act of voting gives the citizens the power to elect their own public representatives. It ensures that voters are represented equally throughout the country. Votes have equal value in determining the composition of parliament (Siddiqui, 2012:54).

The year 2017 marks 23 years of South Africa's democracy. Five national elections: 1994, 1999, 2004, 2009 and 2014 have taken place and all of them have been won by the African National Congress. The study analyses all ANC national election manifestos. The study also seeks to make a comparative analysis of the messages and themes projected by the ANC's national election manifestos about service delivery in South Africa.

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

In South Africa, national elections are held at fixed regular intervals of five years. This study will analyse the African National Congress (the South African ruling party) national election manifestos from 1994 to 2014. It is common knowledge in South Africa, according to the Electoral Commission of South Africa (IEC) national election results, that all subsequent election outcomes were in favour of this party: 1994 (62.65%); 1999 (66.35%); 2004 (69.69%); 2009 (65.9%); 2014 (62.15%). Based on the above results, it can be safely assumed that those victories were a result of the best promises the ANC had made in its election manifestos. The expectation from those who voted for the party was that there would be resonance between the promises in the election manifestos and public service delivery. All five manifestos had one thing in common: the notion of a better life for all.

Paradoxically, after and between two set of elections, there were numerous service delivery protests across the country. The country has one of the highest rate of public protests in the world (Netswera and Kgalane, 2014:261). The authors indicated that the frequency of violent service delivery protests worsened from 41.66% in 2007 to 54.08% in 2010. Powell et al. (2007-2016:4) indicated in the Civic Protest Barometer that the police reported 14000 arrests. The authors also showed that in 2014 alone, a total of 218 protests were recorded in the country and 83% of those protests included violence. A total of 43 protesters were reportedly killed. The single most prominent category of grievance cited by protesters related to poor or lack of public service delivery (52%) (Powell et al, 2007-2016:4). Between 2010 and 2013 South Africa witnessed a 96% increase in protest actions (Musitha, 2016:16). According to the South African Institute of Race Relations (in Musitha, 2016:16), the number of protests recorded in South Africa increased from 12651 to 13575 in 2014.

According to Vithal & Jansen (in Maree, 2010:28), it is important for researchers to justify and motivate why they feel their study will contribute something original, new, innovative and significant to the existing knowledge gap. The author refers to this as “a gap in the knowledge base”. There has not been an attempt to fill the research gap that exists in terms of the topic of this study. The media have been providing some information regarding lack of service delivery. However, the literature review has shown that there is a dearth of research particularly on ANC national election manifestos and their impact on service delivery in South Africa. This dearth

suggests that both academic and policy researchers have not held national election manifestos as deserving attention. The study area (Thulamela Municipality, Ward 35) has experienced some sporadic service delivery protests between 1994 and 2014. There has not been any empirical study so far on the underlying causes of these protests. Therefore, owing to limited literature, as well as lack of sufficient information in terms of formalised research on the topic, the need has emerged for research to be conducted in order to help political parties or would-be political parties realise how important it is for them to keep the promises they make in their manifestos. This might help the parties to avoid the likelihood of violent service delivery protests. The study will also help strengthen the public understanding of a democratic election process. The big question is: why, regardless of the mandates given to the ANC by its huge constituency (based on its supposedly best election manifestos), South Africa remains the service delivery protest capital of the world?

1.4 MOTIVATION/RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY

Since the dawn of democracy in 1994, the ANC has continued to struggle towards increasing its electoral membership through the implementation of its policy frameworks which provide detail of its commitments contained in the manifestos. One of these policy frameworks has been the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP). The RDP was a South African socio-economic policy framework implemented by the government of President Nelson Mandela to address the socio-economic problem brought about by the consequences of the struggle against apartheid (ANC, 1994:7). The programme oversaw major advances in dealing with South Africa's most severe social problems such as housing, clean water and electrification. However, President Jacob Zuma at the ANC's policy conference in July 2017 told journalists that the organisation's greatest shortcomings during his term of office had been the failure to implement policy decisions (EWN: Eyewitness News, 3 July 2017). Gumede (cited in Bojabotshena and Moloji, 2014:313) is of the view that the reason for the above is that the ANC has had a difficult transition from liberation movement to a modern governing party.

Available literature shows that little attention has been given to examining political election manifestos. It is evident that a lack of sufficient information exists in terms of credibility and reliability of promises contained in the manifestos of political parties. Based on the preceding

discussion, it seems clear that a need exists in South Africa to critically examine the election manifestos in relation to service delivery.

The rationale of the proposed study arose from the researcher's curiosity about the disjuncture between the ANC's election manifestos from 1994 to 2014 and its policies that are implemented during the same period. The researcher wishes to find out why voter outcome patterns remain generally the same regardless of poor service delivery. Why are voters not changing party political allegiance after the promises made to them have not been kept?

1.5 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

According to Creswell (2003: 149), the significance of a study relates to its importance and implications for researchers in the discipline. Lovitts and Wert (2009:4) concur with the above definition. The authors emphasise that a study is significant if it contributes something that is useful and will have an impact on the lives of people, on research and teaching as well as on the field which this study falls under. This study is significant in a number of respects. Above all is the fact that the findings make a contribution to the existing body of knowledge of the ANC's electoral campaign strategies. The findings might inform the ANC's government on how to improve on its service delivery policy formulation and implementation in line with its manifestos. The study is of great importance to political parties as a whole. They will have to come to terms with the potential ramifications in the event that they do not deliver on promises in their own manifestos. The study will also encourage good governance and accountability of politicians. Finally, owing to the lack of sufficient literature available on the analysis of election manifestos of the ANC, this study might provide a crucial point of reference for researchers through its findings, recommendations as well as proposals for further studies on the topic.

1.6 AIM OF THE STUDY

The research aims to analyse the message that the ANC's national election manifestos convey about service delivery. Guided by this broad aim, specific objectives are highlighted below.

1.7 SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

Auriacombe (2001:49) is of the view that the research objectives are meant to explain how the researcher plans to solve the research problem. The proposed study intends to address the following objectives:

- To analyse the ANC's 1994 to 2014 national election manifestos.
- To explore the reasons for constant voting patterns relative to public service delivery.
- To assess public participation in relation to public service delivery.
- To investigate the reason for lack of resonance between messages in the manifestos and actual service delivery.

1.8 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The proposed research will be guided by the following research questions:

- What messages did the ANC manifestos carry during the period between 1994 and 2014?
- What are the reasons behind the constant voting patterns among the ANC's voters after each election in the light of the party's poor service delivery record?
- What does public participation entail in its application within the domain of public service delivery?
- What are the reasons for lack of resonance between promises in the election manifestos and actual service delivery?

1.9 OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

According to Maree (2010:75), specific methods and techniques which are considered relevant to the study ought to be applied so that a researcher is able to reach valid research findings. The study follows an interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach. A qualitative design has been employed focusing on a case study, namely, the ANC's national election manifestos. Maree (2010:75) also emphasises that this design type is best suited for use as the basis for a study investigating a contemporary phenomenon (ANC's national election manifestos) within its real-life context. The author also argues that the design strives for a comprehensive (holistic) understanding of how participants relate and interact with each other.

Maree (2010:75) argues that one of the advantages of case studies is the fact that a researcher can adopt the use of multiple sources and techniques in the data gathering process. According to Babbie and Mouton (2012:281), one of the key strengths of the case study method is that it offers a multi-perspective analysis in which the researchers consider perspectives from a number of different groups in order to enrich the description of their experiences, views and motivations on the topic.

Data collection was based on feedback from the literature review, interview sessions, semi-structured questionnaires and document review. Face-to-face interviews were conducted to generate qualitative data on detailed views and opinions regarding the ANC's national election manifestos. A questionnaire with open-ended questions was administered for the purpose of gaining primary data from the participants. The ANC's national election manifestos were reviewed. Three data analysis procedures were adopted for this study: conversation analysis (for the interview), discourse analysis (for the questionnaire) and content analysis (for the manifestos).

The non-probability sampling technique (purposive sampling) was used to determine the sample for the data collection. A specific group of ANC's members was targeted purposively.

1.10 CONCEPTUALIZATION

The term "conceptualization" is adopted in this research as a synonym for conceptual analysis or conceptual explication (Mouton, 2001:175). It is imperative that a researcher has a clear understanding of words and terms used in his study in order to prevent the possibility of a conflict arising later regarding the interpretation of these words. The author describes conceptualization as the breaking down and conversion of important research concepts into common meanings. They may therefore be regarded as symbols or instruments of meaning which we employ when we refer to a phenomenon. Clarification of concepts is important in research because they might have different meanings to different people. The key concepts relevant to this study will be clarified below.

1.10.1 Election manifestos

The Oxford South African Concise Dictionary (2010) defines an election manifesto as a public declaration of policy and aims, especially one issued before an election by political parties or

candidates. A break-down of the above definition is important. Election manifestos are political strategies used to know about the policies and programmes of political parties who are fighting the elections. After studying and understanding these manifestos, voters can decide on the party of their choice.

1.10.2 Service delivery

Fox and Meyer (1995:118) define service delivery as the provision of public activities, benefits, and satisfaction to citizens. The World Bank's (2003) mission of poverty alleviation and the achievement of Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) state that a well-functioning public sector that delivers quality public services consistent with citizens' preferences is critical in a country. In South Africa, service delivery is a phrase used to describe the distribution of basic services to citizens, such as water, electricity, sanitation, land, housing, jobs and education (ANC, 1994:7).

Accountability via elected officials and public officials has become the central theme of the debate on service delivery (World Bank, 2003). The world body has identified failures in service delivery as a failure of accountability. This state of affairs could be blamed on the failure of democratic institutions to deliver to the poor. Joshi (2010:2) lists the following as the signs of accountability failures with regard to service delivery:

- Politicians not adopting proper policies.
- Public officials not delivering according to prescribed rules and regulations.
- Service providers not being monitored for appropriate service delivery.

1.10.3 Democracy and elections

The word comes from Greek and it is made up of two words: demos (meaning people) and kratein (meaning to govern, to rule). Literally translated, the word means government of people or government of the majority. As a form of government, democracy should be differentiated from monarchy, aristocracy and dictatorship. Core characteristics of democracy are as indicated in Becker and Raveloson (2008:4):

- Fundamental freedoms and fundamental rights.
- Rule of law.

- Parliamentary sovereignty.
- Democratic pluralism.
- Opposition with vested parliamentary rights.
- Checks and balances.
- Freedom of speech, assembly and protest.
- Religious freedom and tolerance.
- Citizen responsibilities.
- Democratic elections.

The key elements in the exercise of democracy is the holding of free and fair elections at regular intervals (5 years in South Africa) to enable the citizens to express their will. The elections must be held on the basis of universal, equal and secret suffrage. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act no.108 of 1996 requires that elections be conducted within the principles of equality, openness and transparency.

The following are the characteristics of democratic elections (Ngarhodjm, 2007:3):

- They are not symbolic but competitive.
- They are periodic.
- They are inclusive.
- They are definitive.
- They thrive on openness and accountability.
- They depend on the citizens to be successful.

Democracy in relation to electoral systems implies the following fundamental principles (Beetham, 1998:21):

- Political equality which implies that votes must have equal value in determining the composition of parliament.
- Local knowledge of representatives ensures accountability, especially if the electoral system is constituency-based which gives individual representatives autonomy from central leadership as their election hinges on their constituency work and voters ultimately decide their fate.
- Composition of government should be determined by elections.

1.11 DEMARCATION

The study was limited to Vhembe region of Limpopo Province in South Africa. Thohoyandou is the seat of Vhembe District Municipality and Thulamela Local Municipality. Limpopo Province is the 7th province and is found in the northern part of South Africa near the Limpopo River, after which the province is named (<http://www.brandsouthafrica.com>).

1.12 SEQUENTIAL ARRANGEMENT OF CHAPTERS

According to Auriachombe (2001:30), the content of each chapter in the mini-dissertation should be summarised in short paragraphs as a brief presentation of what the reader can expect to find in the study.

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1 provides a general overview of the study, including an introduction, the problem statement, the rationale/motivation, research questions and objectives, definition of concepts and sequential arrangement of chapters.

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

Chapter 2 outlines the conceptual framework for the study by providing an exploration of the literature about the topic of interest and a review of relevant scholarly work on the study.

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Chapter 3 describes the research process in detail, including the research design and methodology to be followed in the research.

CHAPTER 4: DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

Chapter 4 presents the raw data, an analysis of the data and the findings of the study. Results are presented in accordance with the case study design.

CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Chapter 5 summarises the results of the study and presents conclusions drawn from the study. Critiques, limitations and delimitations of the study as well as recommendations for additional research have also been discussed.

1.13 REFERENCE TECHNIQUES

The researcher has adopted the Harvard referencing technique in the study. A list of sources has been provided in alphabetical order using the surname of the author, initials, year, title of publication or article, place of publication and publisher, depending on the source.

1.14 CONCLUSION

The foregoing chapter presented an introductory overview of the research. The chapter serves to identify a problematic situation with regard to the implementation of ANC election manifestos. It also demarcates the field of study, notes the significance of the study and comments briefly on the research design and methodology adopted for the study. The chapter also provides a concise indication of the content of each of the remaining chapters of the thesis. The next chapter presents an exploration of literature relevant to the topic, including assumptions of existing theories of democratic election processes, the conundrum of the service delivery and a discussion of all five ANC national election manifestos.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

A literature review is premised on the assumption that knowledge is dynamic and incremental. Researchers have to learn and build on what others have previously studied and found. Literature reviews should therefore attempt to search and evaluate the state of knowledge of the topic of interest (Katebire, 2007:148). According to Oliver (2004:106), the purpose of a literature review is to establish the academic and research areas that are of relevance to the subject of the research. This chapter contains a review of existing literature of democratic election trends with specific focus on the ANC's election manifestos. A rich body of literature has been reviewed, including books, journals, dissertations, theses and articles to find a theoretical base to support and justify the research. The literature review as a concept will be discussed below.

2.2 CONCEPTUALIZATION OF LITERATURE REVIEW

The most important and underlying rationale for a literature review is that it provides a theoretical justification and enables the researcher to contextualize the findings of his study (Hofstee, 2006:91). Bless et al. (2006:24) define a literature review as a critical evaluation of previous scholarly writings that are relevant to the topic of research. Hart (1995:148) agrees that the literature review is an account of what has been published on the researcher's subject of interest and helps the researcher to be aware of the current state of knowledge on the subject under investigation and its inherent limitations. According to Mouton (1996:120), a literature review serves as a research map the researcher has to follow in order to understand the phenomenon under investigation thoroughly.

The above propositions are reinforced by Ary et al. (1990:68) who view a literature review as an important instrument which defines the frontiers of the researcher's topic and contextualizes his questions. Hofstee (2006:91) argues that a good literature review is able to counter duplication and unnecessary replication. It is through a good literature review that a researcher can find out whether his study is of significance and whether it will contribute to new knowledge or not. Babbie (1998:112) agrees that a literature review also assists in finding out flaws in the body of

existing knowledge that might call for reconsideration. A good literature review also helps in addressing the shortcomings in terms of methodological and contextual weaknesses (Maree, 2010:26).

Leedy and Ormrod (2005:65) propose that the utilization of a literature review can reveal to the researcher new sources of data of which he may not have been aware. The authors agree that the review can show how others have handled methodological and design issues in studies similar to the one the researcher is undertaking and can also reveal to him new measurement tools that the researchers have developed and utilized successfully. McMillan and Schumacher (2000:108) point to the fact that a literature review makes it easier for the researcher to build a body of knowledge on any topic. It also offers new ideas, perspectives and approaches (Leedy and Ormrod, 2005: 64).

The researcher's work can only be considered seriously if the literature review has been conducted and presented broadly and extensively. This would include a comprehensive study of the existing literature for producing new and original ideas (Hofstee, 2006:93).

However, Bless et al. (2006:27) caution the researchers to guard against being influenced by the outcomes of previous research and accepting the results without proper criticism. This implies that a good literature review is critical if it does not merely accept previous researcher's conclusion but weighs them carefully in terms of possible flaws in the literature. Literature can be reviewed by looking at publications such as scholarly and academic books and articles relevant to the subject of the research. Bless et al. (2006:27) cite other sources of acquiring knowledge such as looking into unpublished personal experiences, discussions with people involved in similar issues and direct observation or participation.

Based on the preceding discussion, it seems clear that a literature review should help the researcher understand the literature relevant to his topic. However, the purpose is not only to demonstrate the researcher's grasp of the scholarly work on his chosen topic, but also to identify what is not known and not agreed upon on his topic. A literature review indicates that various authors have attempted to clarify the relevance and significance of election manifestos.

2.3 UNDERSTANDING ELECTION MANIFESTOS

The origin of the word “manifesto” stretches back to the 17th century. It is derived from the Italian word *manifesto*, itself derived from the Latin word *manifestum* which means “make public” (Zalani & Hua, 2016:325). In its literal sense, manifesto means the pamphlet or the booklet issued by political parties that tell people about their programmes and policies. Its legal definition is a solemn declaration by the constitutional authorities of a nation, which contains reasons for its public acts towards another (legal-dictionary, the freedictionary.com>/election manifesto). Loosely paraphrased, the word manifesto means a public declaration of policy and aims, especially one issued before an election by a political party or candidate. It is a reflection of the vision or mission of contestant political parties that stand for upcoming elections. Political parties employ it as a campaign strategy to win voters.

Owusu-Amoah (2012:1) maintains that a manifesto should serve the purpose of gauging the performance of those in government. According to the author, this document is also an instrument of ensuring accountability to the voters based on the plan of action enshrined in it. The author further advises that political parties should ensure that their manifestos reflect the vision of the national strategic framework. In the context of South Africa, this vision would be the National Development Plan (NPD) (Vision 2030) released by the planning commission and adopted by the national parliament. According to the NDP (Vision 2030), South Africa’s main challenge is to eliminate poverty and reduce inequality by 2030. Other salient aims of the plan are: rising living standards, economic growth, employment, social cohesion, active citizenry, effective government and strong leadership. The question that arises is whether political parties in South Africa are incorporating the above ideas into their political election manifestos.

The thesis attempts to interrogate the kind of messages the ANC’s national election manifestos project in terms of service delivery. The ANC’s election manifestos of the period mentioned were based on what Twala (2014:562) refers to as “people-centered and bottom –up approach”. The emphasis was on the development of the people through basic public service delivery. The ANC emerged victorious from all the five elections. Those victories can be attributed to the election manifestos the party had produced. However, there are scholars who dispute this proposition. Friedman (2009:114) argues that South African voters choose political parties and

leaders on the basis of their identity. According to the author, poor political performance and poor service delivery record do not play a major role.

Several definitions and explanations of manifestos have been advanced by different scholars. There is an argument raised by Bojabotsheha and Moloji (2014:313) that views manifestos as nothing but instruments crafted to increase a party's electoral numbers. This view seems to underestimate manifestos as service-delivery orientated. Lemon (2009:9) argues that not many people care about manifestos, let alone read them. Maluleke (2009:1) argues that the manifestos are worthless and not as important as they are made out to be. The author maintains that in a country like South Africa with a large section of population who are illiterate, the documents' worth is questionable. On the other hand, Mckinley (2009:1) is negative about the documents. He calls them propaganda instruments used by political parties to win the electorate. Petlane (2009:1) agrees and refers to them as sloganeering tools which the masses don't even read. The author argues that the ANC's election manifestos are exclusionary as they do not reflect the wishes of the masses. On the contrary, Trapida (2009:2) is more accommodating about party election manifestos. He maintains that they demonstrate that the party in charge of government has been taking the demands of the masses into account. The next section of the chapter is a discussion of the historical background of the South African election process.

2.4 CROSS-NATIONA ANALYSIS: INDIA AND MEXICO

Cross-national analysis has highlighted that the act of casting a vote is one of the cornerstones of democratic systems. For this reason, most democratic constitutions provide that elections be held at fixed regular intervals (Siddiqui, 2012:54). In democracies such as India and Mexico, the primary mechanism through which citizens are supposed to exercise power is by using their votes to reward parties and hold their governments to account when they fail to fulfill their election pledges. In India, elections are held after an interval of five years or whenever parliament is dissolved. When elections are called, politicians attempt to influence policy by competing directly for the voters during the election campaigns. Election manifestos are but one of the campaign strategies meant to win the elections. Candidates travel throughout the country to sell their manifestos which highlight the main issues. While India is hailed as one of the best in the world in terms of its electoral process, the credibility of its electoral system is still not unquestionable. According to Siddiqui (2012:61-63), the role of "money power, muscle power,

misuse of government machinery” in elections has become a serious blemish on the country’s electoral process. The author highlights that funds are collected from companies to sway the voters’ opinions and decisions. As a consequence thereof, it can be argued that election manifestos in India do not always become the most important determinant of the election outcome. Martinelli (2006:225) posits that this kind of election outcome does not reflect the will of the voters. However, the elections of the past two decades have indicated that voters have been exercising the power of their votes quite effectively to hold their government to account when they do not deliver on the promises made before the elections. The voters have, to a large extent, been effective in bringing about a noticeable change in the composition of the Indian governments (Yaddav, 1999:2396).

Diaz-Caycross et al. (in Knoesen, 2009:6) compares South Africa with Mexico in terms of electoral punishment. In both the states, citizens indicate that they are not satisfied with the provision of services delivered by the ruling parties, yet they do not punish them electorally. The author cites four pertinent reasons why such governments remain in power despite poor performance: coercion, strong economy, electoral fraud and creation of punishment regime (patronage politics)- the phenomenon of rewarding your core supporters with projects to their districts.

2.5 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF SOUTH AFRICAN ELECTION PROCESS

Election manifestos were defined above as political parties’ intended programmes and policies issued before elections. As such they do not exist in a vacuum. They exist within an established political environment. They are a significant part of the democratic process. It is therefore important for the researcher to contextualize the election process in South Africa in terms of its historical evolution. The Union of South Africa came into being on the 31st May 1910. JBM Hertzog’s (1924-1939) legislation drastically limited black Africans’ freedom of movement and economic and political participation. In 1936, the Hertzog government enacted the Representation of Native Act, which removed black voters from the common voters’ rolls and placed them on separate “native voters’ rolls”. JC Smuts (1939- 1948) on the other hand rejected the vote for blacks in a common system. He supported a form of inclusion that did not jeopardize white security. After coming to power in 1948, DF Malan’s National Party government removed coloured voters from the voters’ rolls. He was a champion of Afrikaner nationalism based on the

system of apartheid. In 1983, a referendum on constitutional reform was held. The Tricameral Parliament was formed, consisting of three separate houses to represent White, Coloured and Indian South Africans. South Africans of all races took part in the first fully democratic election in 1994. That was when universal suffrage was introduced on a nonracial basis (Southal, 2010:88).

The South African electoral system of the period before 1994 was based on the system of racial segregation and discrimination (apartheid ideology). The majority of the population was systematically excluded from participating in the political decision-making process. The exclusion of the majority of the population led to a coordinated opposition to the apartheid dispensation. The main role players in the opposition were the (ANC), The South African Communist Party (SACP), The Pan Africanist Congress ((PAC) and the Azanian People's Organization (AZAPO). The political stalemate culminated in negotiations between the National Party (NP) government and a range of opposition groups to negotiate on the terms for a constitutional settlement and an electoral system to ensure a universal franchise in 1993. The negotiations were conducted at the Convention for a Democratic South Africa (CODESA) in Kempton Park. The parties at CODESA adopted the Interim Constitution of 1993. The 1994 election took place under the Interim Constitution agreed during CODESA as well as the Independent Commission Act of 1993 which established an Interim Electoral Commission. An election date was set for 27 April 1994. The election was to be run in terms of a list-based proportional representation system (Kadina and Booysen, 2009:399). Below is a table showing the South African suffrage timelines:

Table 1: South African suffrage timelines.

South African suffrage timelines
1. 1910 to 1936: Black African males franchised in Cape colony and in Natal.
2. 19 May 1930: White women and poor whites attain suffrage.
3. 1936: Native's common voters' roll was established.
4. 1948: Black voters' roll was abolished.

5. 1948: Cape “coloureds” on separate voters’ roll and disenfranchised in 1970.
6. 1983: Tricameral Parliament
7. 1994 to 2014: Universal suffrage (all above 18 years).

Source: own creation

It is important to interrogate the constitutional and legal framework within which election manifestos operate.

2.6 THE CONSTITUTIONAL AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR ELECTORAL DEMOCRACY IN SOUTH AFRICA

South Africa is a constitutional democracy. Since manifestos serve as meaningful source of information regarding a party’s position on a wider range of developmental issues, they thus have to comply with the values prescribed in the constitution of the country.

The Constitution of South Africa, Act No 108 of 1996, establishes the country’s constitutional democracy with regular elections as one of the pillars of democracy in the country. Chapter 1 Section (d) of the constitution states that the elections are to be based on universal adult suffrage and a national common voters’ roll. Section 19 gives every citizen the right to free and fair regular elections and the right to stand for office and to vote using a secret ballot in these elections.

The South African democratic electoral dispensation is premised on Section 19 of the Constitution. The section gives every citizen the right to free, fair and regular election and the right to stand for office and to vote using a secret ballot in the elections. According to this section, everyone has the right and the freedom to make political choices, such as the right to form a political party, join any political party and campaign for a political party or cause.

Sections 16, 17 and 18 give every citizen freedom of speech, assembly and association. These sections give opposition parties the right to compete in the democratic election process. Citizens also enjoy the freedom to criticize the ruling party. They also have the freedom to choose from several candidates or parties. The sections give the citizens the freedom to vote or not to vote or even to abstain.

Section 19 also provides for periodic or regular elections. Regular elections consolidate accountability of elected officials. They account to the citizens and they must return to the voters at prescribed intervals to seek their mandate to continue in the office. According to section 19, a legitimate government cannot be chosen by a small and exclusive group. It is an inclusive process regardless of a person's sex, language or social status.

Chapter 1 (d) also provides for the use of secret ballots. In a democracy such as South Africa, voters cast their ballots in secret. Tallying of vote totals must be conducted openly and transparently.

Chapter 9 of the Constitution establishes the Electoral Commission of South Africa as one of the institutions supporting democracy. As such the IEC is independent and subject only to the Constitution and the law. The institution is also supposed to be impartial and perform its duties without fear or favour.

The Electoral Act no. 73 of 1998 provides further regulations regarding the operations of the national elections. The Act gives the Electoral Commission the responsibility of administering the electoral Act and ensuring that key events in the election time table are carried out in line with the Electoral Act.

The Electoral Commission Act no.51 of 1996 regulates the composition and tenure of the election commissioners, specific areas of the responsibility of the commissioners and the administrative set-up of the commission.

For the purpose of this study, it is imperative and important to interrogate the assumptions advanced by some scholars about the democratic election process. This discussion will lay the foundation for the ANC's electoral manifestos and the message contained therein.

In the literature, a host of theories attempt to provide a justification for the democratic election process. The section that follows will attempt to provide that justification.

2.7 EXISTING THEORIES OF DEMOCRATIC ELECTION

The theoretical framework is crucial in holding or supporting a theory of a research study (Kotze and Van Wyk (in Van der Waldt and Du Toit, 2011:56). It is therefore critical to examine the

theories of democratic elections and their relevance and significance in the context of election manifestos.

2.7.1 Definition of theory

Kotze and Van Wyk (in Van der Walldt and Du Toit, 2011:56) define a theory as a number of statements which are systematically selected and which can be measured or verified scientifically or empirically. The role of the social scientist in this instance is to determine the relationship or correlation between the variables through qualitative research. Each of the theories hereunder discussed has produced a body of literature much too vast to review in this chapter. The researcher will only attempt to allude to a few central examples of work in each theory. This mini-dissertation will look into the economic theory, the rational ignorance theory and participatory democratic theory.

2.7.2 Definition of an election process and the history of the vote

Siddiqui (2012:54) defines an election as a formal decision-making process by which a population chooses certain individuals to occupy government or public offices. For this process to qualify as democratic and credible, it has to take place in an open environment of civil and political liberties (Schedler, 2002:103). The election process has been in operation throughout modern representative democracy since the 17th century. The system has been in use since as early as ancient Greece and ancient Rome and throughout the medieval period to elect rulers such as the Holy Roman Empire and the Pope (Siddiqui, 2012:54). Wieland (2001) traces the genesis of the electoral system to India and the Raju during the Vedic Period around the 700 BCE. The electoral system then became prominent in Tamil Nadu during the medieval India in the 920s Anno Domini and was referred to as the Kudavolai system (Siddiqui, 2012:54). The popular democracy of today which the rest of the world seems to have modeled around North America and European democracies has therefore evolved from practices from all over the world. The South African electoral evolution has been covered extensively in literature since 1948. According to Horowitz (2003:115), electoral systems are the rules and procedures by which votes cast in an election are translated into seats won in the parliament. The scholar argues that an electoral system is designed to perform the following activities:

- to translate the votes cast into seats won in legislative chamber.

- to act as a conduit through which the people can hold their elected representatives accountable.

Ugen and Manza (2002:777) hold the view that the election process is a critical feature in a democracy and the foundation of citizenship in democratic communities in the world. Pive and Cloward (in Ugen and Manza, 2002:777) argue that the right to vote is the basis of all other political rights. Botes et al. (1992:50) cites the most important principle on which elections are premised called *vox populi, vox rex*. This principle implies that the wishes of the voters have to be respected. The second equally important principle is accountability which holds that elected officials are accountable to voters and must seek their mandate to continue in office (Siddiqui, 2002:53). As mentioned earlier, the study considers some relevant theories. Below is a discussion of those, beginning with the economic theory.

2.7.3 The economic theory

A manifesto serves as an important benchmark for measuring the performance of government in terms of, among others, the state of the economy in the country. The researcher's argument in this instance is that the state of the economy in the country does not often influence the voter's electoral decisions.

The economic theory helps one to understand the relationship between the state of the economy and voting. It addresses the question: do voters assess economic performance of the government (Martinelli, 2006:225)? The economic theory adherents advocate that voters will choose a political party on account of the state of the economy or fiscal policy (Leigh, Fair cited in Garretsen et al, 2014:2). Similarly, Alvarez et al. (1999:2) agree that some voters' decisions are based on their own perception of the macro economy. In contrast with the above assumptions, scholars such as Campbell, Converse, Muller, and Stokes (in Garretsen et al, 2014:3) argue that voters are largely ignorant about political issues.

The researcher will argue that voters are ignorant about political matters because of lack of knowledge and information. From 2009 to date, South Africa has been witnessing a downturn that spawned a noticeable increase in interest rates, a general rise in inflation and unemployment (Campbell, 2014:1). Nonetheless, although the ANC was blamed for the country's woes, the party was still re-elected by a handsome margin. In 2004, the ANC obtained 69.7% of votes cast

on the national ballot, while during the 2014 national government elections; the party received 62.15% (IEC, 2014). Therefore, in South Africa, the state of the economy or the fiscal policy does not motivate the voters' choice of political parties and leadership. In Canada, the support shown for the governing party depends upon voters' perceptions of the national economy (Clarke and Stewart, cited in Alvarez et al., 1999:3). Conversely, Friedman (2009:114) emphasizes that voters in South Africa remain loyal to a political party that represents their identity irrespective of its economic or the fiscal policy.

A case in point is Ward 35 in Thulamela Municipality which is made up of Duthuni, Tshisahulu, Haratshiedana and Hamushavhanamadi villages. The four villages serve as the research area of this study. The economic situation in these villages is dire. There have been protests for service delivery to pressure the Thulamela Municipality to address, among others, the following:

- inadequate water supply.
- no infrastructure where some residents still get water from streams and rivers.
- high unemployment rates.
- lack of serviced streets in the village to connect to the main road.
- widespread alcohol and drug abuse.
- spiralling crime rates.

But a look at the election result during the 03 August 2016 local government elections belies the economic situation. In Thulamela Municipality as a whole, the ANC scored a landslide victory. Therefore, it could be argued that the state of the economy is less important in the minds of some of the voters.

There are a number of scholars who have attempted to advance reasons for the continued vote for the ANC in elections regardless of its poor service delivery performance. Friedman (2009:114) argues that South African electoral choices are based on identity and not necessarily on the performance of those in government. For the purpose of this study, the following reasons have been identified to corroborate the view of the author cited above:

- the ANC's continued status as a symbol of liberation from apartheid.
- the party is being rewarded for introducing democracy.

- majority of South African voters do not trust alternative political parties. Voters believe that the ANC can still self-correct and sort out its problems of corruption, infighting and lapse in legitimacy.
- voters cannot disassociate the ANC from its former leader, President Nelson Mandela.

Therefore, the above compels one to question the rationality of the whole election process. The question that arises is whether South African voters are ignorant about political and economic matters. The next section will discuss the rational ignorance theory.

2.7.4 The rational ignorance theory

According to the rational ignorance theory, voters refrain from acquiring knowledge when the cost of educating themselves on an issue exceeds the potential benefit that the knowledge would provide them with (Martinelli, 2006:225). Election manifestos—depending on voters’ perceptions—may ensure that the government becomes accountable to the electorate based on the promises outlined in them (Owusu-Amoah, 2012:1). This suggests that voters must scrutinize these manifestos, as well as hold their leaders accountable for poor performance. The rational ignorance theory explains why voters are mostly ignorant about political matters. The theory assumes that voters do not understand nor identify their political interests and benefits because they are not well informed. As a result of this lack of knowledge and ignorance, the election outcome cannot be a credible measure of democracy (Martinelli, 2006:225). Modern scholars such as Lippmann, Dickinson, Schuppeter, Barelson et al. and Converse (in Achen and Bartels, 2002:2) also dispute the authenticity of the election outcome because they doubt if voters are knowledgeable and competent enough to understand and articulate their own policy preferences.

Many voters in South Africa do not have the time to devote to researching every aspect of the candidate’s political or economic policies (Martinelli, 2006:226). Therefore, they find themselves making rational decisions by letting others who are more versed in the subject do the research and they form their opinions based on the evidence provided. They are being rationally ignorant because they simply don’t have the time. According to Martinelli (2006:226), voters simply do not have the information they need to make an informed decision. The author emphasizes that they tend to choose not based on facts or values but on the bases of political allegiance or party affiliation. These voters’ behaviour is to some extent rational because the

pay-offs are essentially zero for them becoming more informed. Section 2.6.5 (the participatory democratic theory) will give a more detailed discussion of the reason for voters' ignorance.

2.7.5 The participatory democratic theory

The participatory democratic theory is based on the notion of public participation. According to Arnstein (1996:216), public participation “is the strategy by which the have-nots join in determining how information is shared, goals and policies are set, tax resources are allocated, programs are operated, and benefits like contracts and patronage are parceled out”. That is why public participation remains one of the pillars of democracy and it is indispensable for sustaining democracy (Cloete, 1995:4). Public participation encourages a “bottom-up” approach to policy-making and policy implementation (Fox & Meyer, 1995:29). The same argument could be advanced about parties' election manifestos. The electorate should participate in the production of manifestos so that the process does not become top-down but bottom-up. This would hopefully ensure that manifestos do not become “embellished” and do not turn into “unrealistic promises” (Owusu-Amoah, 2012:1).

In South Africa, participatory democratic theory is confirmed by the South African Constitution, Act no. 108 of 1996, which asserts the need for the realization of a participatory democracy which calls for the active involvement and participation of the citizenry in the political decision making process. Public participation is a fundamental element of democracy. Its main aim is to influence government policy decision-making process.

Promotion of public participation is a constitutional imperative as clearly reflected in Section 59 of the Constitution (public access to and involvement in national assembly):

(1) The national assembly must:

(a) Facilitate public involvement in the legislature and other processes of the assembly and its committees; and

(b) Conduct its business in an open manner, and hold its sittings, and those of its committees, in public, but reasonable measures may be taken to

(i) Regulate public access, including access to the assembly and its committees.

(2) The national assembly may not exclude the public including the media, from a sitting of a committee unless it is reasonable and justifiable to do so in an open and democratic society.

Creighton (2005:18-19) lists the following benefits of public participation:

- improved quality of decisions.
- minimizing costs and delay.
- consensus building.
- increased ease of implementation.
- avoiding worst- case confrontations.
- maintaining credibility and legitimacy.
- anticipating public concerns and attitudes.
- developing civil society.

Many authors have written about participatory democracy. Carothers (2005:8) expresses a negative view about the theory of participatory democracy. He posits that political participation by citizens cannot be expected in an environment where poverty, inequality and corruption are rife. As a result of the social conditions mentioned above, the gap between citizens and state institutions widens and becomes what Skorpel (2003:11) terms “diminished democracy”. In some cases, public participation is used as a public relations exercise by the “powerholders” to “educate” or “cure” the citizens (Arnstein, 1996:216). The author believes participation without redistribution of power between the have-nots and the powerholders is meaningless because real power remains in the hands of the latter.

South Africa’s participatory democratic tradition emphasizes the importance of political participation by the public in order to redress the social ills reflected in the preceding paragraph. Through participatory democracy, citizens become more politically and socially educated. They can develop their political consciousness and be able to ask those in power hard questions about their poor performance. Participation is able to produce better democratic citizens while lack of it leads to disinterest, disengagement and apathy. Unfortunately, the reality in South Africa is that citizens’ participation is mostly reduced to participation by the elite with access to resources. South Africa’s democracy therefore becomes what Crenson and Ginsberg (2002:114) call the monopoly of participation by the elite. The two scholars cited above refer to this kind of

democracy as a “down-sized democracy”. Arnstein (1996:216), on the other hand, refers to this kind of participation by the elite as “placation strategy” whereby the powerholders use the poor as mere tokenism in order to achieve their own goals. In this kind of unfortunate set-up, the poor are marginalized because they cannot access the participation mechanism within the state. Therefore, it is the researcher’s view that the South African participatory democratic tradition is premised on a narrower role for the public. The elite, who are knowledgeable and have expertise, make all the decisions while the public (the poor) are not afforded direct involvement.

The view expressed above is shared by Mattes (2002:30) who argues that South African voters’ support for democracy is lukewarm as a result of the emergence of a poor democratic political culture. The author blames this political passivity on a number of factors, amongst others, party–list proportional representation which offers voters few incentives to participate. According to this system, voters do not have the power to determine the party list. They vote for political parties. They have no say at all about who is on the list. It does not matter whether the individuals on the list are not liked by the public. The system does not give full expression to the will of the people. Voters cannot remove a parliamentarian even if he\she has betrayed them. The public has no one to approach when grievances occur because the system delinks parliamentarians from their constituencies. As a consequence, the South African electoral system has serious implications for voter participation in the democracy.

Several factors have favoured the retention of Proportional Representation systems. Norris (1997:9) emphasizes that a government based on this system rates highly on representivity. The author maintains that parliament is not only a representation of major parties but also includes small parties. The system fosters inclusivity and representation of a wide spectrum of political views, racial communities and historically marginalized groups such as women and the disabled. According to Horowitz (2003:115), the system also moderates inter-party conflicts that stem from skewed representation.

Mattes and Southall (2004:59) conducted a survey of popular attitudes towards the closed-list proportional representation system. Some of the findings are that the system does not allow the electorate to hold individual parliamentarians and government officials accountable. The research assumed that South African communities prefer an electoral system that empowers them to select their own representatives more directly. The assumption is based on the following

argument: communities believe that a) their representatives would better reflect their opinions and interests, b) the question of proximity is very important, and c) familiarity and trust are of equal importance when it comes to who represents the community (Mattes and Southall, 2004:59).

2.7.5.1 Comparison of citizenship participation with other Southern African States

A review of a range of public opinion indicators collected by the Institute for Democracy in South Africa (IDASA) since 1995 on citizenship participation is important. According to these indicators, South Africa has one of the most passive citizens in Southern Africa. As of mid-2000, only eleven percent of South Africans said they “frequently” engaged in political discussion and only 12 percent said they paid attention to government and public affairs “always” or “most of the time”. These figures were the lowest of all Southern African countries. Findings of the entire 2000 survey indicated that South Africans display extremely low levels of actual contact with government leaders or other influential community leaders. Just 6 percent said they had contacted a government or party officials in the previous year. This figure was the lowest in Southern Africa. The most damning finding of the survey was that just 0, 2 percent- only four of the 2200 respondents –said they had made contact with a sitting member of parliament between 1999 and 2000. Absolutely no one in the sample said he had attended any hearing or meeting organized by parliament.

Contrary to the above assertions, research conducted by Yadav (1999) and Bratton (2006) in India and Sub-Saharan Africa respectively, indicated that the public (the poor) participate more in politics and vote more frequently than those who are not poor. Yet states in these regions do not reciprocate the voters’ gestures by providing better services for them. The World Bank (2003) also reveals that even when the poor participate in government through voting honestly, they are often denied basic services due to them.

Friedman (2009:114) seems to differ slightly with the above assumptions. He is of the view that South African democratic electoral choices are based on identity. Voters will remain loyal to the political parties that represent their identity regardless of poor political performance, distrust, poor service delivery record and policy uncertainty. The researcher will argue in the next section that education and information are critical in making rational political decisions.

2.8 THE IMPORTANCE OF EDUCATION AND INFORMATION

Section 2.6.4 above (about the rational ignorance theory) confirms the importance of education and information in guiding the voters to make rational choices. Bratton and Seligson (cited in Devarajan and Widlund, 2007:11) propose that political empowerment through education and information can be of major importance. The two scholars highlight the role of education in raising political engagement and activism. They are of the view that more educated citizens are more highly engaged in politics. Bratton maintains that education has the potential to widen poor people's political consciousness. Seligson on the other hand, is convinced that education constantly increases the participation rate of the poor in democratic politics. Krishna (in Devarajan and Widlund, 2007:12) advocates the importance of providing information to the poor about their democratic rights. The scholar argues that democracy without information is neither reliable nor credible since it promotes the exclusion of the poor. The three scholars cited above are in agreement that education and information are the basis on which meaningful participation by the poor in politics can occur.

According to Mattes (2002:33), voters' apathy cannot be blamed solely on lack of information since South Africans have the highest rate of radio, television and newspaper coverage in the region. Neither can it be blamed on poverty since South Africa's much poorer neighbours tend to have far higher rates of contact. The author is convinced that the reason is the system which offers them no incentives to participate. The researcher argues that lack of electoral consequences is one of the reasons for voters' apathy and disinterest in politics.

2.9 THE ELECTORAL CONSEQUENCES

The three democratic electoral theories discussed above are all in agreement on this fact: there are institutional mechanisms or systems in place which allow for political parties which don't govern well to be dismissed. They can be voted out of office through a democratic process. The public has the final decision on who governs them and on what grounds. Therefore, the electoral process empowers the citizens with an instrument to expel poor performers. The researcher registers no objection to a majority of voters continuing to support a particular party, so long as other basic freedoms are maintained and elections are conducted freely. It is clearly the ultimate

prerogative of an electorate to change its government which is one of the key indicators of a democracy.

When a party in power fails to live up to its election manifesto promises, it should face electoral consequences. The manifestos of the ruling party, for example, the ANC in this research, tell the people about its achievements during its last tenure (s). The manifestos of the opposition parties point out the failure of the ruling party and mobilize public opinion against them. After the elections, the citizens can put pressure on the ruling party to deliver on the promises it made in its manifesto. If the party doesn't implement its policy and programmes, it could be punished electorally during the next elections. The ANC's election manifestos promise of better service delivery remains a conundrum to many scholars. Maybe the relevance, effectiveness and purposefulness of the election manifestos should be questioned.

2.10 THE CONUNDRUM OF SERVICE DELIVERY

The literature review of public administration advocates that one of the most critical roles of public service is to provide an efficient and effective service to the people. In line with this view, the researcher's point of departure in this section is that service provision is a highly politicized and contested area (Mc Lennan and Munslow, 2009:19). This is due to the fact that the political stakes are high. The ANC's political election manifestos are thus service delivery orientated as indicated in detail in section 2.10 of this chapter. For the ANC to win grass-roots support, its election manifestos have to be based on critical service delivery areas in order for the party to realize its developmental agenda. According to the NDP (Vision 2030), the most important and critical service delivery hotspots are housing, water, sanitation, electricity and public transport. However, according to the NDP, there is a danger that the country's developmental agenda could be jeopardized because the state is incapable of implementing it. Because of poor implementation capability, promises in the ANC's election manifestos could become compromised. Therefore, the party should reassure the people through its manifestos, that it is determined to tackle the roots of poverty and inequality. There are challenges which might impede proper implementation of the manifestos: South Africa as a developmental state requires leadership, sound policies and clear lines of accountability. There are also high levels of corruption in the country which frustrate the state's ability to deliver on its developmental mandate (NDP: Vision 2030). In order to arrest these challenges, political will is essential.

According to Venter, Van der Waldt, Phutiagale, Khalo, Van Niekerk and Nealar (in Shaidi, 2013:71), service delivery refers to the provision of tangible and intangible public goods and services by government. McLennan and Munslow (2009:20) agree and refer to public service as the provision of public goods and services by a government or other public organizations to those who need or demand them. Therefore, the rendering of public goods and services to local communities in South Africa is a constitutional obligation enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act no. 108 of 1996. In terms of Section 40 of the 1996 Constitution, government is made up of national, provincial and local spheres which are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated. Chapter 7 of the Constitution (1996), Section 152 (1) empowers municipalities to:

- provide democratic and accountable government for local communities.
- ensure the provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner.
- promote social and economic development.
- encourage the involvement of local communities and community organization in local government issues.

Section 153 on the other hand empowers the local sphere of government to:

- promote social and economic development to communities.
- promote community participation in local government.
- provide basic and essential services to the communities.

The above discussion indicates quite clearly that the provision of service delivery is a constitutional obligation. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) has laid down a concrete foundation for service delivery for the benefits of the citizens.

All ANC's national election manifestos (1994-2014) have public service delivery as the central priority of government. Despite this argument, public service delivery in South Africa remains a very sensitive, confusing and difficult grey area in the country's body politic. There are a number of factors cited by different scholars in support of this view. It is therefore crucial to analyse some of these scholars' views on the service delivery conundrum in South Africa and link them with the ANC's election manifestos messages about service delivery. This will arguably

reinforce the view that election manifestos do not exist in isolation. There are inherent dynamics involved.

According to Fakir (2007:2), South Africa, is a democratic developmental state. The public service has the mandate to contribute to societal development by providing the essential services in order to maintain the dignity and right of citizens. The same should be said about election manifestos. Their messages should be about changing citizens' lives for the better. The aim should thus not only be to attract votes. The World Bank (2003) paints a bad picture. It says public service in many democracies, meant for the poor, is fraught with problems of corruption absenteeism and low and poor quality. The bank reports that funding is misappropriated while service providers fail to honour their contractual obligations and basic materials are stolen. A look into all the ANC's election manifestos (1994-2014) put service delivery at the centre. Yet the provision of better services to the poor remains a figment of the imagination and ignores the promises enshrined in the manifestos. The World Bank (2003) also revealed that even as the poor participate in politics through voting, they are often denied significant material reward, let alone access to better public services. In South Africa, the function and mandate of public services is broadly defined by the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act, 108 of 1996 which states that "there is a public service for the Republic which must function and be structured in terms of the national legislation and which must loyally execute the lawful policies of the government of the day". Therefore, provision of public service is a constitutional obligation.

2.10.1 Service delivery protests

Service delivery protests are an indication that the citizens are not satisfied with the rate of implementation of promises made in the manifestos. When these promises fail to materialize, citizens become agitated and resort to violent protests. According to Craythorne in Shaidi (2013: 16), service delivery protests refer to a community action through which the residents of an area decide to voice their dissatisfaction with the manner and scale at which public services are rendered to them.

Apartheid policies caused huge social-economic damage to the country. This is one of the reasons South Africa's new democratic government is struggling to overcome the legacy of apartheid in areas such as the delivery of basic public services. This could also be the reason for

the eruption of violent service delivery protests (Gaffney, 2004: 13). The protests are in all likelihood concerned with poor service delivery as well as uncaring and self-serving political leaders (www.amandlapublishers.co.za).

Shaidi (2013:95) provides the following as the main causes of service delivery protests:

- abject poverty.
- lack of and slow pace of quality housing delivery.
- unemployment.
- lack of water and sanitation.
- inadequate electricity.
- poor refuse removal record.
- political infighting.
- inadequate participation.
- widespread corruption.

Botes et al. (2007:16-25) add the following to the list above:

- lack of economic development.
- poor governance.
- unfulfilled promises and expectations created by politicians during election.

In collaboration with the authors above, Musitha (2016:16) posits that “poor roads” and “poor school infrastructure” also contribute to service delivery protests.

According to the NDP (Vision 2030) released by the Planning Commission and adopted by the South African Parliament, poverty, unemployment and inequality are the triple challenges facing the country. Authors such as Aliber (2002: 2), blame poverty in South Africa on apartheid and colonialism. On inequality, South Africa’s individual Gini coefficient was 0,73 in 2002, making the country one of the most unequal in the world (Aliber, 2002: 5). According to Patel (2011:5), in the first quarter of 2010, the unemployment rate among young people (16 to 30) was about 40%. The statistics indicate that unemployment is more prevalent among the youth. No wonder young people are at the forefront of service delivery protests.

South African voters go back to the streets to protest against poor service delivery soon after casting their votes. But come the next election, vote outcome patterns do not change (Netswera and Kgalane, 2014:261). The ruling party does not get punished significantly for not keeping its electoral promises reflected in its manifestos. It is the researcher's contention that in South Africa, the service delivery protest puzzle is not adequately and clearly addressed in the literature. However, the predominant view is that the service delivery protests are aimed at the ANC's government lack of commitment to its election promises contained in its election manifestos. The question is: are service delivery protests likely to have an effect on the ANC at the polls? According to Friedman (2014:37) service delivery protests are not aimed at the ANC. The scholar maintains that in most cases, the ring leaders in the protests are ANC leaders themselves who want to enhance their influence within the ANC's structures. Therefore, the author doubts if the protesters come election day, would vote against their organization or even stay away from the polls. He also argues that the protesters are on the streets demanding a voice and a chance to participate actively in politics and certainly not an attack on ANC leaders and government.

Regardless of the above argument, protests are a symptom of a serious problem within the ANC over its failure to commit to its election manifestos. There is also an emerging view that argues that protests are incited by a faction within the ruling party which has been marginalized politically. It is claimed that the protests are not necessarily service delivery protests but a result of the uneven distribution of services (Fakir, 2007:2). According to Kotze (2009:19), the ANC's electoral hegemony seems to be under threat. The party has been losing a considerable percentage of votes. Between 1994 and 2014, the organization experienced a growth phase while between 2004 and 2014 it went through a decline phase. The available literature does not provide a tangible motivation for this claim. However, the unsubstantiated view points to the poor service delivery record and also to the emergence of a black middle class which influences new voter behaviour patterns as well as the ANC's internal problems as some of the reasons for the decline (Kotze, 2009:19). The scholar maintains that the ANC's electoral hegemony, especially in its traditional rural provinces remains unscathed where, ironically, public service delivery is dire compared to urban areas.

The discussion below will focus on the ANC's national election manifestos between 1994 and 2014.

2.11 THE ANC'S NATIONAL ELECTION MANIFESTOS (1994-2004)

In both chapter one (general introduction) and chapter two (literature review) of this study, election manifestos have been defined as the electoral strategies of political parties to win votes during the upcoming elections. This section examines the degree to which the ANC's election manifestos have a bearing on service delivery in South Africa.

While policies and legislation provide an enabling environment for the provision of service delivery, there are other processes, such as the ruling party's election manifestos, which promise the promulgation of such legislation. In this regard, the ANC's election manifestos inform the design and implementation of government programmes. To contextualize this argument, the decisions taken at ANC's policy conferences and election conferences have a significant bearing on the party's election manifestos. In the same vein, the party's election manifestos will inform the IDP's in municipalities where it governs. It is therefore important for the researcher to reflect on the five election manifestos of the ANC and their impact on service delivery in the country. The five ANC's national election manifestos are discussed below.

2.11.1 1994 National Election Manifesto: "Together we have won the right for all South Africans to vote"

The 1994 ANC election manifesto revolved around the theme "together we won the right for all South Africans to vote" (www.anc.org.za/documents/1994-national-elections-manifesto). The ANC had inherited a highly unequal society. Therefore, in the 1994 election, the party promised "a better life for all" which was its commitment to make a better life for all South Africans, especially the poor and the working class by improving the quality of their lives (Vukuzenzele, May 2016). The party's election manifesto- the Reconstruction and Development program (RDP)-promised that attacking poverty and deprivation would be the first priority of the democratic government. The RDP was supposed to empower the poor to seize the opportunities available to them in the new dispensation (ANC, 1994: 15-16).

The ANC 1994 national election manifesto committed the party to build a new society liberated from all apartheid social, economic and political evils and emphasized the urgency to redress social inequality (ANC, 1994:1). According to Van der Berg (1998), addressing social spending would be the most effective method to deal with the above situation. The author is convinced that addressing social inequality was the party's critical priority for its own survival and its own political legitimacy in the country.

The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) was integrated into the party's 1994 election manifesto. The programme was aimed at addressing social inequality by meeting the basic needs of the people of South Africa (RDP, 1994:7). The RDP (1994:7) defines the basic needs as jobs, land, housing, water, electricity, telecommunication, transport, clean and healthy environment, nutrition, health care and social welfare. Therefore, the ANC (1994:2-4) document used the catch phrases such as improving the quality of life of ordinary people, creating more jobs and opportunities, starting a national public works program which will address community needs and create jobs, ending rural poverty, opening the doors of learning, providing houses and services for all to include water, electricity, telecommunication, transport, clean and healthy environment, nutrition, health-care, social welfare and pensions. According to Michie (1997:155), if social inequality had been addressed, the ANC government would have attempted to overcome the social, economic and political evil of apartheid. Harris (1997:91) on the other hand believed investing in housing, education and health was an important measure to raise the standard of living of the majority. The author also argued that the RDP, as a socio-economic framework, was aimed at the final eradication of apartheid.

The ANC's 1994 national election manifesto was, according to Barnard (1994:119), a very powerful instrument which won over many with its clear vision of a better life for all. The promise of a better life for all was reinforced by the promise of education, peace, land and jobs as remedies for social economic and political oppression and exploitation (Ranchod, 2013:90-91). Above all, the most vote-catching promise was one of building one million houses and of providing running water to one million people and building 2.5 million urban and rural houses within the first five years in government (Welsh, 2009:540-541). The person of Nelson Mandela was the cherry on top. Johnson and Schlemmer (1996:85) argue that it was imperative for the

ANC to also make use of its liberation icon, Mandela, who was regarded by many around the world as a person of integrity, credibility and legitimacy.

2.11.2 1999 National Election Manifesto: “Change must go at a faster pace!”

In the 1999 elections the ANC campaigned around the general theme that South Africa was changing (Lodge, 1999:64). Hence the theme “Change must go at a faster pace” (<https://www.anc.org.za/documents/1999-national-elections-manifesto>). The main focus of this election manifesto was to bring about greater change by removing the system of apartheid and replacing it with democracy. According to Butler (2009:65), the ANC, the same as during 1994 national elections, had a strong presidential leader in Thabo Mbeki. President Mbeki proudly spoke about “the season of hope” and “better quality of life” in direct contrast with “the terrible system of apartheid” (ANC, 1999:1).

In the 1999 election manifesto, the ANC cited the following achievements since 1994:

- bringing water to 3 million people.
- housing nearly 3 million people.
- connecting 2 million households to electricity.
- improving health care of the poor.
- transferring land to communities.
- implementing non-racial education.
- connecting telephone lines for 3 million people (ANC, 1999:1).

The manifesto was honest and recognized the challenges that still needed to be addressed: inequality, lack of jobs, high crime rate, corruption, poverty and the HIV/AIDS pandemic (ANC, 1999:3).

2.11.3. 2004 ANC’s National Election Manifesto: “A people’s contract to create work and fight poverty”

The slogan for the 2004 election manifesto was called “A people’s contract to create work and fight poverty” (<https://www.anc.org.za/documents/2004-national-elections-manifesto>). This 2004 election manifesto was aimed at building the people’s contract that had been endorsed by

the majority of South Africans. Creating work and fighting poverty were the main focuses of the contract. The ANC resolved to engage citizens at local level through the Integrated Development Plan (IDP).

The ANC prided itself on the achievements of the past ten years. The party was proud that it had brought electricity and water to millions of households, built houses for millions, opened up access to quality education, turned the economy around, improved social services, made sure that the economy was better managed and dealt with corruption (ANC, 2004:1-2).

The party committed itself to vision 2014 (second decade of freedom). Some of the most important targets and objectives making vision 2014 were as follows: reducing unemployment by half, reducing poverty by half, providing the skills required by the economy, reducing cases of TB and AIDS and reducing crime rates (ANC, 2004:2).

The manifesto committed the ANC government to pay particular attention to the following programmes in the next five years: a growing economy, sustainable livelihoods, comprehensive social services, fighting crime and corruption, access to services and ensuring constitutional rights and good governance (ANC, 2004:3).

2.11.4 2009: ANC's National Election Manifesto: "working together we can do more"

The slogan "working together we can do more" (<https://www.anc.org.za/documents/2009-national-elections-manifesto>) summed up the possibilities of cooperative interaction. The assumption was that South Africans needed each other to achieve the goals of the government (www.politicsweb.co.za). The manifesto reflected on major challenges facing South Africa, namely, high unemployment, poverty, deepening inequality and rural marginalization. The document also highlighted the many social and economic achievements of the ruling party over the past 15 years (ANC, 2009:1). The manifesto identified five developmental priority areas of the party in the next five years: creation of decent jobs and sustainable livelihoods through expansion of public works programmes. The ANC government would implement broad-based economic empowerment through affirmative action policies for the benefit of those previously disadvantaged. Rural development and reform would become the central pillars in the fight against unemployment. The government would ensure a major renewal of schooling and the education system. The purpose was to liberate South Africa from illiteracy by 2014. The

government would implement the national health insurance plan. The ANC promised to overhaul the criminal justice system in order to reduce the level of crime and corruption and also to work towards a comprehensive social security system to ensure social transformation. The manifesto also promised to increase access to secure and decent housing for all. With regard to water and sanitation, the ANC government would work with municipalities to ensure the continued implementation of free basic services to the poor including universal access to quality water sanitation by 2014 (ANC, 2009:4-13).

2.11.5 2014 African National Congress Election Manifesto: “Together we move South Africa forward!”

The 2014 election manifesto “Together we move South Africa forward!” (www.anc.org.za/documents/2014-national-elections-manifesto) was premised on growing an inclusive economy, which would create jobs and provide opportunities for all. The ANC’s government promised to work hard to put South Africa on the path of prosperity and success (www.vukuzenzele.gov.za). The 2014 manifesto was an extension of the 2009 one. It aimed to further provide access to adequate human settlements and improve the quality of living conditions. A key promise was the provision of houses and employment. The ANC committed itself in the next five years to build on the progress made in the 2009 manifesto: creation of more jobs, rural development, land reform food security, education, health and fighting crime and corruption (ANC, 2014:5).

The National Health Insurance Plan (NHI) would be implemented to benefit the communities. The fight against HIV/AIDS and TB will be intensified (ANC, 2014:39-40).

The promises the ANC made are based on the National Development plan (NDP) (Vision 2030) which detailed the developmental vision of national government. This is the implementation plan to address the achievement of economic equality.

Job creation is still a priority. But the party made no specific promises in the manifesto but did commit to six million work opportunities through a public works programme. This is a worthwhile way to give unemployed people a chance but it is not the long-term sustainable work that was the emphasis of the 2009 manifesto (ANC, 2009:4).

The discussion below aims at gauging the effectiveness of the ANC's election manifestos in the Thulamela Municipality. The researcher has sampled two instruments for this purpose, namely Thulamela Municipality Annual Reports and the Auditor-General 2014 -2015 financial year report with specific focus on Limpopo Municipalities.

2.12 INSTRUMENTS TO GAUGE THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE ANC'S ELECTION MANIFESTOS

The motivation for including this topic in the study is to interrogate the effectiveness of the ANC's election manifestos. The Thulamela municipality is governed by the ANC. Therefore, the municipality's IDP's are informed by ANC's policies. The annual reports and the Auditor-General reports are thus a reflection of the true picture on the ground.

2.12.1 Thulamela Annual Municipal Report

Section 121 (1) of the Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003 (MFMA) stipulates that: "every municipality and municipal entity must for each financial year prepare an annual report in accordance with its guidelines". The purpose of the annual reports is to:

- provide a record of activities of the municipality during the financial year.
- provide a report on performance against the budget of the municipality for the financial year reported on.
- provide accountability to the local community for the decisions made throughout the year by the municipality.

According to Section 153 (a) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, the Integrated Development Plan (IDP) has to be produced by municipalities for a period of 5 years. All municipal planning has to happen in terms of the IDP and it should be revised annually. The annual municipal budget should also be based on the IDP. The municipal annual report should also flow from the IDP.

The IDP of the Thulamela Municipality has water as priority number one followed by electricity. The municipality, however, is hamstrung in this regard because these services are located in

institutions other than the municipality itself. For example, the Vhembe District Municipality is the water service authority while the Thulamela Local Municipality is the water service provider. The Thulamela Municipality also does not have the license to provide electricity to the municipal area. It is Eskom that has the license.

According to the Thulamela Municipality IDP Review (Draft) Annual Report 2015-2016 Financial Year, the Thulamela Municipality has the following water challenges:

- inadequate water supply.
- shortages of pre-paid water meters.
- no water infrastructure in some areas.
- a large number of residents still get water from streams and rivers.

In spite of the preceding difficulties, the provision of piped water has increased from 167 419 in the 2013 to 2014 financial year to 186 548 in the 2014 to 2015 financial year (Vhembe District Municipality Annual Reports, 2013 -2014 and 2014-2015).

In terms of electricity supply in the Thulamela Municipality, all villages have been electrified. Only the new villages and extensions are still to be electrified. The backlog stands at 13123 (Thulamela Local Municipality Draft Annual Report, 2015-2016).

Provision of housing in the municipality is the responsibility of the Department of Co-operative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs (COGHSTA). In this regard, Thulamela only plays an auxiliary role in terms of compiling a housing needs analysis and identification of beneficiaries. The backlog stands at 26804 (Thulamela Local Municipality Annual Report, 2015-2016 Financial Year).

The municipality strives to provide free basic water and electricity to all indigent households. Indigent households are those unable to make a monetary contribution towards basic services. According to STATS SA, 372557 people are without income. This means the majority of households in the Thulamela Municipality are unable to pay for services (Thulamela Local Municipality Draft Annual Report, 2015-2016 Financial Year).

A deeper analysis of the above discussion reveals the dire state of service delivery in the municipality. It can be safely assumed that the provisions in the ANC's election manifestos are not entirely being realized. It can also be argued that there is nothing inherently amiss with these manifestos. The challenge is however on implementation. The ANC's claims with regard to access to piped water and electricity hides the fact that the Thulamela municipality community still suffer disproportionately from poor service delivery. The ANC's "good stories" does not reflect the reality of the lived experience of broken promises and poor service delivery.

2.12.2 Auditor-General 2014-2015 Financial Year (with specific focus on Limpopo Municipalities)

Chapter 9 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996 establishes the Auditor-General of South Africa (AGSA) as one of the seven state institutions supporting constitutional democracy. It is the responsibility of these institutions to make sure that the governments, including municipalities, do their job properly. The Auditor-General performs the following functions ([www.gov.za>sites>www.gov.za>files](http://www.gov.za/sites/www.gov.za/files)):

- audits financial statements of municipalities and submits an audit report within three months of receipt of the statement.
- submits the names of municipalities that have not submitted their financial statements to parliament and to provincial legislatures.

According to the Auditor-General 2014-2015 financial report, not a single municipality in Limpopo received a clean audit nor did any company owned by any town or city in Limpopo. The report revealed that the Thulamela Local Municipality received unqualified outcomes with findings. The Vhembe District Municipality received adverse outcomes with findings. It can therefore be argued that the situation in Limpopo local municipalities is bad. This situation exposes the ineffectiveness of the policies of the ruling party in terms of service delivery implementation. However, the situation can still be turned around. The following are summarized recommendations for improvement on audit outcomes of municipalities ([www.salga.org.za>documents](http://www.salga.org.za/documents)):

- Leadership

Municipalities should deliver on commitments to fill key positions with competent people. They should deal with transgressions and poor performance. They should also support and participate in initiatives to improve audit outcomes, such as operation clean audit.

- Financial and performance management

Municipalities should implement audit action plans to address audit findings as well as root causes of the audit findings. They should also enable monitoring and oversight through regular and credible reporting.

- Governance

Municipalities should enhance governance by well-functioning audit committees. They should support internal audit units. Councils and municipal management should implement recommendations of audit committees.

2.13 CONCLUSION

Chapter 2 reviewed the existing literature currently on and around the topic discussed. A literature review, as a concept, has been explored citing a number of scholars on the subject. Manifesto, as a concept, has also been discussed. Three very important theories underpinning democratic elections were also discussed. The service delivery conundrum and its relationship with the ANC's election manifestos have also been reviewed. A synopsis of all ANC's national election manifestos since 1994 has also been provided. The Thulamela local municipality annual report and the Auditor-General Report (2014-2015) have also been discussed. The next chapter explains the design and methodological activities undertaken to validate the collected data. The literature review will become the basis for the development of the semi-structured interviews and questionnaires.

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1. INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter discussed the literature review for the purpose of critically evaluating previous scholarly writings that are relevant to the research topic (Bless, Higson-Smith & Kagee, 2006:24). This chapter provides a detailed description of how the research was conducted. It explains the research design and methodology to be employed in the research. It describes data collection methods and data analysis instruments to be used. The study population, sampling technique, quality criteria and ethical consideration issues will also be discussed.

The discussion below is about the research design chosen for the purpose of the study and justification thereof.

3.2. RESEARCH DESIGN

Remenyi et al. (1998:120) are of the view that as a point of departure in conducting research, the researcher has to decide on an appropriate starting point and on the conceptual framework or research strategy which will be the basis on which the evidence of data will be collected, analysed and interpreted. Remenyi (1996:22) shares the same view of the rationale behind the adoption of a research design. The author agrees that the purpose is the provision of the most valid and accurate answers possible to the unexplained phenomenon. Kumar (2011:94) describes a research design as a detailed plan, structure and strategy the researcher uses to find answers to unexplained research question. Without the correct selected design, the researcher may not succeed in addressing the research problem effectively and appropriately. The function of the research design in this study is to ensure that the information that will be obtained from participants (ANC's members) enables the researcher to answer the research question as clearly and logically as possible. There are two broad research designs: qualitative and quantitative. For the purpose of this research, a qualitative research design was adopted and is discussed below.

3.2.1 Qualitative research design: case study research

According to Mouton (2001:144-145), there are six types of qualitative research designs: conceptual studies (critically engages with the understanding of concepts), historical research (describes, analyses and interprets the past), action research (focuses on a practical problem experienced by participants), case study research (involves a deep understanding through multiple types of data sources), ethnography (the researcher immerses himself in the target participants' environment in order to understand the cultures and systems that emerge) and grounded theory (looks to provide an explanation or theory behind the events). The researcher used a case study research design using a literature review, semi-structured interviews and questionnaires and documentation analysis. The choice of the research design was appropriate because in a case study, "the meaning is socially constructed by individuals in interaction with their world" (Meriam, 1998:3). The participants in the study expressed their views of the ANC's manifestos and other related aspects. According to Yin (2003:13), a case study relies on multiple sources of data and it enables the researcher to gather the data from various stakeholders. Multiple sources of data in this study were the interviews, questionnaires and document analysis. Various stakeholders were the officials of the ANC Vhembe Region, Lwandani branch of the ANC (both BEC officials and general membership), local traditional leaders, SANCO executive committee members from the four villages and ward committee members (Ward 35). Babbie and Mouton (2012:281) refer to a case study as an intensive investigation of a single unit which can provide the researcher with as much information as possible to understand the case in its entirety. According to these scholars, the unit of analysis could be an individual, a group, communities, organizations or institutions. Kumar (2011: 126) adds the following to the list: an instance, an episode, an event, a subgroup of a population, a town or city. In this study, the unit of analysis (the case being studied) is the ANC's national election manifestos. The choice of the research design was appropriate because the case study design studies human action in its natural setting and through the eyes of the participants. The participants lived experience plays the central role (Babbie and Mouton 2012:278). The "natural setting" in this study was the ANC as a political party in the Vhembe Region. The participants were ANC card-carrying members. As members of the community, ANC members should be able to relate their lived experience of the ANC's national election manifesto promises.

The following were aspects which motivated the choice of the research design as explained in Maree (2010:75): case studies offer a multi-perspective analysis in which the researcher considers not only the side of the story of one or two participants. The side of the story of other relevant groups is also taken on board during the research inquiry. The researcher hoped to get a multi-perspective response to his research question. The other consideration was the fact that the researcher using a case study is able to have an in-depth encounter with the participants through face-to-face interview sessions (Laforest and Bouchard, 2009). However, the researcher was aware of the shortcomings of this design: it is said to be subjective as it is dependent on a single case and is therefore qualitative and unreliable and its results may not be generalized to the entire population (Maree, 2010:76). This view represents a misunderstanding of the purpose of case study research, which is to describe that particular case in detail and not necessarily to draw generalizable conclusions. The researcher, rather than sample a large number of participants with a view to making generalization, purposively selected a few participants (42) whom he assumed would best shed light on the ANC's election manifestos being analyzed. The proportional sample total percentage was 82%. The research process or methodology of this study is explained in detail in the section that follows.

3.3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research design focuses on the end product: what kind of study is being planned and what kind of result is aimed at. The research methodology, on the other hand, focuses on the research process and the kind of tools and procedures to be used (Vosloo, 2014:316) According to Holden and Lynch (in Katebire, 2015:16), the methodological choice is dependent on the nature of the phenomenon to be investigated and the researcher's own assumptions in relation to such a phenomenon. Babbie and Mounon (2012:646) emphasize that the methodology includes concepts such as paradigm, qualitative and quantitative methods.

3.3.1 Paradigm

A number of scholars have attempted to define the concept "paradigm". Collins and Hussey (in Vosloo, 2014:300) define it as a philosophical framework. Lincoln and Guba (in Maree, 2010:48) refer to it as "what we think about the world (but cannot prove)". This research followed the interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach.

There are two distinct research approaches in social and behavioral sciences, namely quantitative and qualitative approaches.

3.3.1.1 Quantitative approach

According to Attieno (2009:13), quantitative research involves empirical (scientific) investigation of social phenomena using statistical and mathematical techniques. As a positivist paradigm, its design makes use of randomized samples that are scientifically drawn from large target population (Maree, 2010:57).

3.3.1.2 Qualitative approach

According to Babooa (2008:137) qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world through an in-depth understanding of his or her behaviour and the reasons for this behaviour. This research approach is based on a naturalistic approach (Maree, 2010:78). It also involves in-depth understanding of participants' behaviour and the motivation for the given behaviour (Babbie and Mouton, 2001:270). A small unrepresentative sample of participants is used.

When selecting a research approach for a study, researchers base their choice on the following considerations: the underlying philosophical assumption of the research, the strategy of conducting the research and the method of data collection (Cresswell, 2014:65). The qualitative research approach was applied in the process of conducting this research. The choice of this approach was informed by the fact that qualitative research provides the researcher with the opportunity to obtain a more holistic picture of what is happening in the given situation (Fraenkel and Wallen, 1994: 379). In this regard, the researcher was able to form a complete picture of the ANC's election manifestos by analysing the real world situations of the participants (Thomas, 2010:305).

In this approach, the research questions are general and broad as they seek to understand participants' experiences within the central unit of analysis. The sample size is small and is targeted at those participants who have the most thorough understanding and knowledge of the topic being studied (Patton, cited in Maree, 2010:259).

Since this study employed qualitative techniques, the role of the researcher entailed being an active participant as the interviewer. He became what Maree (2010:79) refers to as “a research instrument” by adopting interpretative methods of data collection. Since the research is interpretative, the researcher is able to explore the complexity of a social phenomenon being studied (election manifestos) with a view to gaining an understanding of, as well as to interpret everyday life experience as a direct consequence of service delivery. Qualitative research leads the researcher to understand what the research participants make out of events, situation and their own experiences. The researcher also understands the participants’ contexts as they influence their actions as well as the process by which events and actions occur (Maree, 2010:59). In this regard, the qualitative approach is best suited to use as the basis for achieving the study objectives of this study. The interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach is discussed below.

3.3.1.2.1 Interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach

According to Babbie and Mouton (2003:28), the interpretivist paradigm is about the study of society that concentrates on the meanings people associate with the social world. According to these authors, reality is constructed by people themselves in their daily lives. Barnard (2013:525) emphasizes that the approach ensures adequate dialogue between researchers and those with whom they interact in order to collaboratively construct a meaningful reality. Therefore, a qualitative paradigm based on interpretivism strives to comprehend how individuals in everyday settings construct meaning and explain the events of their world (De Vos et al. in Vosloo, 2014:307). Researchers use qualitative research which is flexible and ask open-ended questions to gain an understanding of underlying reasons, opinions, beliefs and attitudes of the participants (Attieno, 2009:14).

By utilizing interpretative research, the researcher was able to become part and parcel of the study and fully explored with his participants their opinions, beliefs and attitudes towards their organization’s manifestos. The experience was about sharing knowledge and creating data together in an interactive and participatory fashion (Barnard, 2013:525). According to Maree (2010:59), the researcher has to interpret the facts before him. Therefore, the researcher was convinced that the qualitative approach would better account for the complexity of the participants’ behaviour in this study and he hoped to find a qualitative description of their

experiences meaningful for the purpose of the research (Babooa, 2008:137). The data collection techniques in the study will now be discussed.

3.3.2 DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES

Data collection is the process of gathering data on variables of interest for the study in order to enable one to answer a stated research question (Maree, 2010:34). To ensure the collection of appropriate and accurate data, the researcher must adopt appropriate data collection methods.

In order to yield data for the qualitative study, three measuring instruments were adopted, namely interviews, questionnaires and document review. The three complemented the literature review as one of the instruments of data collection. Kumar (2011: 127) argues that the application of multiple data collection method is an integral element of a case study.

It is important to distinguish between two kinds of data, namely primary data and secondary data. Primary data refers to original data that has been collected for the purpose of the research and this data is useful for the current study. Secondary data is data that is being reused, such as books, articles and the internet (Hanekom, 1987:28). The collection of primary data was necessary for the purpose of this study. The original sources of data in this instance were the ANC's national election manifestos. The secondary data were complementary. Below is a discussion of the data collection techniques that were used in this study.

3.3.2.1 Interview

Many scholars have attempted to define the concept "interview". Richie and Lewis and Gillham (in Newton, 2010) define an interview as "a managed verbal exchange". According to Kvale (in Alshenqeeti, 2014:39), an interview is a "conversation whose purpose is to gather descriptions of the life-world of the interviewee" with respect to interpretation of meanings of the "described phenomenon". Schoslak (in Alsheqeeti, 2014:40) refers to an interview as "an extendable conversation between partners that aim at having "an in-depth information about a certain topic or subject and through which a phenomenon could be interpreted in terms of meanings interviewees bring to it". Maree (2010:87) emphasizes that the purpose of a research interview is to explore the views, experiences, beliefs and motivations of individuals on specific matters.

Gubrium and Holstein (in Alshenqeeti, 2014:40) differentiate among three types of interview, namely the unstructured interview, the structured interview and the semi-structured interview. The latter, according to the scholar, is a more flexible version of the structured interview. It has thus become the choice for this study.

The researcher has recognized and addressed the weaknesses prevalent in the method. According to Adamson (2004:114), the participants may respond differently depending on how they perceive the researcher (interviewer effect). Maree (2010:87) warns that trivial aspects such as the sex, age and ethnic origins of the interviewer may have a bearing on the amount of information participants may be willing to share. The participants' responses may be influenced by what s/he thinks the situation requires. The author also maintains participants may say what they think the researcher wants to hear. Cohen (2006:1) however, believes the method has some strength in that questions can be prepared ahead of time and it allows participants the freedom to express their views on their own terms. The method also provides reliable, comparable, qualitative data and encourages two-way communication. Participants can openly discuss sensitive issues with the assurance that their confidentiality will be protected (Adamson, 2004:125).

3.3.2.1.1 Face-to-face interview

The face-to-face interview was used in this research to find out at first-hand the attitudes of ANC's members towards the party's national election manifestos. Cohen and Manion (in Adamson, 2006) are of the view that a semi-structured interview is the preferred choice for researchers wishing to interpret responses from participants and if they wish to get a deeper understanding of the topic of interest. Face-to-face interviews were conducted with four local traditional leaders, four Vhembe REC officials and four Lwandani BEC officials in order to generate qualitative data on their views and opinions regarding the African National Congress election manifestos. The interview schedule (a guide with a written list of questions and topics to be covered) was designed in such a way that questions asked yielded as much information as possible about the research topic and also addressed the aims and objectives of the researcher (Bernard, 2012:182). A set of predetermined open-ended questions on an interview schedule were developed to guide the interviewer. The interview schedule was piloted on several

participants prior to data collection proper. A digital voice recorder was used to record the responses of participants.

The fact that face-to-face interviews are flexible does not mean that one does not have to be prepared before implementing them. According to Laforest and Bouchard (2009:3), they require “rigorous preparation”. In this regard, the researcher had to:

- study the interview schedule and decide which questions were most appropriate for the participants.
- draw up a consent form specifying the rules of the interview and the confidentiality commitment.
- contact the participants and explain the goal of the interview, obtain permission, schedule an appointment and agree on the location.
- send the consent form.
- prepare equipment for recording the interview.
- contact the participants again to confirm the date and location of the interview.

According to Guest, Bunce & Johnson cited in Katebire (2007:129), an average of 12 participants for in-depth interview is recommended. For the purpose of this research, a total of 12 individual interviews were conducted in a period of three weeks with intervals. The interview lasted for 20 to 30 minutes per participant. The interview atmosphere was relaxed and informal. Participants expressed their views freely knowing full well that the information they give will not be disclosed but will be used solely for the purpose defined in the study as explained in the informed consent form (Annexure B).

3.3.2.2 Questionnaire

Babbie and Mouton (2012:646) define a questionnaire as a set of written questions and/or statements to which the research participants respond in order to obtain information which is relevant to the topic of interest. The authors above also describe it as a document containing questions and other types of items designed to solicit information appropriate to analysis. O’Sullivan et al. (2008:216) refer to a semi-structured questionnaire as a document consisting of

both open-ended and closed-ended questions, which provides a greater depth than is possible with a structured questionnaire.

The questionnaire was designed to be completed anonymously by the participants. A covering letter for the attention of the participant was written to accompany each questionnaire. The covering letter explained the purpose of the research. It also contained important information for the completion of the questionnaire. The questionnaire was developed in line with the literature review in Chapter 2. The final questionnaire was discussed with the statistical department at the University of Limpopo. Management of literacy and language barriers, response rate, validity and reliability of the data collected were maximized by careful design of individual questions, clear layout of the questionnaire form, lucid explanation of the questionnaire, pilot testing and purposive selection of participants (Maree, 2010:58). All the participants had education attainment beyond grade 12 level. Therefore they possessed sufficient literacy and language capacity to be able to participate in the study. The questionnaire was hand-delivered to the participants by the researcher himself. They were collected a day thereafter. They were distributed to sixteen card-carrying members of the ANC (Lwandani branch), six ward committee members (ward 35) and eight SANCO executive members (two from each village).

It is the responsibility of the researcher to ensure that data collected is accurate so that the analysis of the results is reliable. According to Mouton (1996: 156-160), a study relies on the quality of the data on which it is based. Leedy and Ormrod (2014:19) caution that “data can be defective”. Therefore, the researcher had the responsibility to plan and execute the study in a manner that minimized any threat to the reliability of the results.

3.3.2.2.1 Semi-structured questionnaire

There are three different formats of questionnaires from which researchers can choose, depending on the research method which they have adopted for their studies: semi-structured, structured and unstructured questionnaires. Semi-structured questionnaires are based on a naturalistic qualitative method of research. They contain both open-ended and closed-ended questions (Maree, 2010:51). Responses from participants are therefore qualitative. If a yes or no question is asked, it is followed by an open probe for further explanation about why the participants selected a given response. These kinds of questions are analysed from a descriptive

and qualitative point of view. They are appropriate for someone who wishes to gain a better understanding and greater insight into the underlying reasons and motivations (Bless et al, 2006:132). In this study, the researcher's aim was to gain an understanding of the dynamics of the ANC's members about their organization's manifestos. In this regard, open-ended questions gave the researcher more valid data as the participants could say what was important to them and expressed it in their own words (Cumming and Worley, 2001:15). The researcher, however, was mindful of the limitations of this format. For example, it is often criticized for failing to meet the standard of reliability as compared to quantitative methods which produce standardized and quantifiable data. Some participants may also have trouble expressing themselves accurately. The "Halo Effect" (common bias) can set in where one trait of a person or thing is used to make an overall judgment of that person ([www.nngroup.com>articles/haloeffect](http://www.nngroup.com/articles/haloeffect)). For example, highly educated participants in the sample might be falsely assumed to be more knowledgeable about everything about the phenomenon under investigation. This can be a disadvantage when using open-ended questions.

The structured questionnaire format, on the other hand, is a positivist quantitative method of data collection (Maree, 2010:87). This method includes a low-level involvement of the researcher and a large number of participants who answer the questions. It contains only close-ended questions. The format is rigid with responses which a participant ticks off, such as yes or no or selects from a list of options. Participants are limited only to what is on the questionnaire. Therefore, there is a possibility that the researcher may miss many important points that the participant can provide. The format is appropriate for someone who wishes to quantify the problem or generate numerical data for the purpose of statistical analysis. This is not the purpose of this study. Proponents of qualitative methods argue that quantitative procedures lack ecological validity. They maintain that such a questionnaire may produce neat and tidy quantifiable data, but the process of completing it is a long way from people's normal everyday life (Maree, 2010:87).

As for the unstructured questionnaire, the specific questions and the sequence in which they are asked are not determined in advance (Monette et al. in Kumar, 2011:144).

On the strength of the preceding discussion, the researcher decided to adopt the semi-structured questionnaire with closed-ended and open-ended questions.

3.3.2.3 Documentation review

For a researcher analysing the ANC's election manifestos within the interpretative paradigm, it was important for documentary analysis to be applied. Documentary sources (literature review) were textually based and were available in electronic and physical format. Data collection of the literature sources was done via library, web searches, journal articles, textbooks on the subject, newspaper articles, research reports, policy frameworks, legislation relating to elections and election manifestos. These documentary sources provided the researcher with an overview of current and sometimes not so current yet still sufficiently relevant information appropriate to the research topic. Some of these literature sources are briefly reviewed below. Mattes (2000) in the journal article "Democracy without the people?" provides the researcher with a rich review of public opinion indicators collected by the Institute for Democracy in South Africa (IDASA) since 1995. Their observation was that South African political culture is not yet mature enough to consolidate credible democratic electoral practices. I argue that citizens are ignorant and are unable to connect their political and economic preferences to their political choices. Such a situation raises significant challenges to the conception of a credible democratic election outcome. The ANC's policy framework document, the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), was also reviewed. I focus on the RDP because as a policy document, it was adopted as part of the ANC's election manifesto in 1994. I argue that the ANC used the allocation of basic services, as provided for in the RDP, as a political currency during the elections. Through careful data preparation, coding and interpretation, the results of the qualitative documentation review helped to provide a rich and detailed description of the ANC's manifestos. The next section focuses on how the data collected by the instruments above was analysed.

3.4 QUALITATIVE DATA ANALYSIS

Vithal and Jansen (2001:27) are of the view that data analysis aims at making sense of the data accumulated during the data collection phase of the research. This process involves the reduction and interpretation of the data (Cohen & Manion, 1995:116).

The data analysis in this study was based on the research data collected through various methods discussed in chapter 3, namely interviews, questionnaires and document reviews.

Qualitative data analysis is generally based on an interpretative research paradigm. According to this approach, participants try to make sense or meaning of the subject of the research by analysing their perceptions, attitudes, understanding, knowledge, values, feelings and experiences (Merriam, 1998:178). According to Maree (2010:102), the above is best achieved through a process of inductive analysis of qualitative data. The main purpose in this regard is to allow research findings to emerge from the recurrent themes in the raw data. For the purpose of this study, the qualitative data consisted of words and observations and not numbers or statistics. The purpose was, in line with the preceding view, to interpret what was in the data but never to measure it.

The qualitative data analysis strategies adopted for this study were: conversation analysis, discourse analysis and content analysis. Conversation analysis studies conversation by intensely listening to tape recordings and transcriptions made from such recordings. This strategy was used to analyse interview data (Maree, 2010:102). Discourse analysis is concerned with studying and analysing written texts. The strategy was adopted for analysing responses from the questionnaire (Jorgensen & Philips, 2002:2).

According to Hsieh and Shannon (2005:178), qualitative content analysis is “a research method for the subjective interpretation of the content text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or patterns”. Elo and Kyngas (2008:108) emphasize that as a method of data analysis, content analysis is used by researchers to make replicable and valid inferences. The definitions above imply that the qualitative content analysis research method entails a systematic reading of a body of text with the aim of providing a descriptive account of what a given text contains. Once data has been coded, the researcher qualified the data by generating themes or categories for the purpose of interpretation. These themes or categories were translated and inferences made in order to address the research question.

To operationalize the method, the researcher simply coded categories or themes which were derived from the text data (election campaign manifestos) and thereafter counted and compared the keywords derived from the codes followed by an interpretation of the underlying context. The analysis involved the identification of key and most frequently repeated words in each election manifesto in order to examine trends and relationships in the texts.

Qualitative content analysis was supported by a computer program called NVIVO provided by the University of Limpopo (UL) in order to assist the researcher to organize, manage and code data in a more efficient manner. The next section attempts to give a motivation for the use of the three data collection methods.

3.5 TRIANGULATION

Triangulation implies the use of multiple methods or data sources in an investigation in order to produce a comprehensive understanding of the phenomenon of interest (Maphazi, 2012:169). The main purpose for the application of triangulation is to increase the credibility and validity of the research results, minimize the weaknesses of a single data collection strategy as well as cross-checking (Yeasmin and Rahman, 2012:156).

As a social study research, this study sought to unearth a social phenomenon (election manifestos) involving human behaviour (of society at large). Because election manifestos as a social phenomenon are susceptible to various elements and changes in society, they cannot be measured by using only one data collection method.

According to Easterby-Smith et al. (1991:33), there are four types of triangulation:

- data triangulation.
- investigator triangulation.
- methodological triangulation.
- triangulation of theories.

For the purpose of this study, data triangulation was applied. Data was collected at different times and from different sources, namely interviews, questionnaires and document analysis to ensure cross-validation of data. The three different strategies complemented and verified one another (Yeasmin and Rahman, 2012:157). Stake (2000:443) emphasizes that triangulation is important for ensuring reliability and establishing data credibility. In this study, triangulation was used as a qualitative research strategy to test validity through the convergence of information from the interviews, questionnaires and document analysis in order to establish trust in the validity of the study's conclusions. For example, the researcher analysed transcribed interviews along with participants' responses to the questionnaires and documents authored by the ANC

(election manifestos). Section 3.5 discusses population and sampling methods adopted for the study.

3.6 POPULATION AND SAMPLING METHODS

3.6.1 Population

McMillan and Schumacher (2000:169) refer to population as the entire group of people or objects to which the researcher wishes to generalize the results of the research. A population is therefore the aggregate or total of elements from which the sample is actually selected. A qualitative researcher should be able to learn and understand the socio-cultural realities and experiences of the people through the population of the study. It is therefore preferable that the researcher should be able to reach every individual of the population. But for practical reasons, this may not be possible or even necessary because some individuals may not be capable of offering information. In such cases, the researcher will usually target members of the population that share the same specific characteristics of interest to the study. This is called the target population (Katebire, 2007:37). The population of this research comprised the ANC's Regional Executive Committee in the Vhembe Region, the ANC's Branch Executive Committee of the Lwandani branch, the ANC's general membership of the Lwandani Branch (both active and not so active branch ordinary members), local traditional leaders as well as Ward 35 committee members. According to this research, active members were those who carry the organization's membership cards and attend branch meetings regularly when called upon to do so. Those referred to as not active were those who were card-carrying members but who did not actively participate in the organization's rituals. The total population was 184.

3.6.2 Sampling methods

A sample is a sub-group of the population which is the focus of the research enquiry and it is selected in such a way that it represents the study population (De Vos, 1998:191). Sampling therefore is a process of selecting a few people (a sample) from a bigger group (population). Kumar (2011:193) argues that a sample provides "the basis for estimating or predicting the prevalence of an unknown piece of information". Maree (2010:176) differentiates between the two methods of sampling: probability and non-probability. According to the author, a probability sampling method utilizes some form of random selection while non-probability does not involve

random selection. In the latter method, the samples are gathered in a process that does not give all the individuals in the population equal chances of being selected. Doherty (1994:169) emphasizes that the non-probability samples are selected based on the subjective judgment of the researcher.

In accordance with the qualitative research approach, the study was conducted by applying non-probability sampling. According to Babbie and Mouton (2012:160), this method cannot draw important conclusions or generalize the results to the population. As a result, rather than sample a large number of participants with the intention of making generalizations, the researcher selected a few participants (42) whom he anticipated would best provide enough information on the topic. The non-probability sampling method for the study was purposive sampling. Kumar (2011:207) refers to this method “as the best when the researcher seeks to construct a historical reality...”. Purposive sampling helped the researcher to hand-pick the participants in order to develop a sample that was large enough yet possessed the required traits (Bailey, 1987:93-94). For the purpose of this study, the sampling procedure had two components: selection of the study sites and selection of participants. The study was limited to the Vhembe region of Limpopo Province in South Africa. Thohoyandou is the seat of Vhembe District Municipality and Thulamela Local Municipality. The study area is Ward 35 of Thulamela Municipality which comprises of four purposively selected villages that make up the Lwandani Branch of the ANC: Ha-Mushavhanamadi, Ha-Ratshiedana, Duthuni and Tshisahulu. The rationale for choosing the four villages arose from the following: the area of analysis of election manifestos is a relatively new field; there were also time constraints and limited financial resources for feedback.

A non-probability sampling procedure was used for the selection of knowledgeable and experienced members of the ANC. For this reason, a purposive sample was used to select five Regional Executive Committee (REC) members in the Vhembe District of the ANC; five from the Branch Executive Committee (BEC) members of the Lwandani branch; eight active members as well as eight non-active members; four local traditional leaders from Duthuni, Tshisahulu, Ha-Ratshiedana and Ha-Mushavhanamadi villages and four ward committee members (Ward 35) and eight SANCO executive committee members (two from each village). The participants in this research were purposively selected based on their involvement in the ANC’s structures. The researcher’s selection was on the basis of his knowledge of the population, his judgment and the

purpose of the study (the purpose he wanted his participants to serve) (Bernard, 2013:164). The researcher is a resident of Duthuni village. He is clear about which participant best fit the criteria of the study. However, the researcher’s knowledge of his participants did not compromise the study. In this study it can be confirmed that the number of participants was sufficient and enough information was provided to enable the researcher to compile a questionnaire for the study that would be reliable.

The researcher was aware of the importance of the sample size. If the researcher wanted to use a well-designed probability method, a large sample would have been used. On the question of the sample size, Bernard (2013:175) argues that “10-20 knowledgeable people are enough to uncover and understand the core categories in any well-designed cultural domain or study of lived experience”. According to Ngulube (2005:134), a 10% sample size based on the sampling frame is enough. The author cautions researchers against using too large a sample as this can have a negative impact on the reliability of the research results. In view of the foregoing considerations, this study targeted a total sample size of 42 participants who were divided into two categories: twelve for the interview and thirty for completion of the questionnaire. In line with this argument, the researcher thought his sample size was sufficient for the purpose. The table below shows the purposive sampling procedure adopted for the study:

Table 2: Purposive sampling procedure

Structures	Total population	Target population	Proportional sample	Gender distribution	Level of education beyond Matric
REC	25	8	5 (63%)	Female 1 Male 4	5
BEC	15	5	5 (100%)	Female 2 Male 3	5
Active	50	9	8 (89%)	Female 2	8

members				Male 6	
None-active members	50	9	8 (89%)	Female 3 Male 5	8
Local traditional leaders	4	4	4 (100%)	Female 0 Male 4	4
Ward committees	20	8	4 (50%)	Female 2 Male 2	4
SANCO	20	8	8 (100%)	Female 2 Male 6	8
Total	184	51	42 (82%)	Female 12 Male 30	42

Source: own creation

The researcher can confirm that the trustworthiness of this research phase was ensured by applying the following criteria: credibility, dependability and confirmability.

3.7 QUALITY CRITERIA

3.7.1 Trustworthiness (credibility, dependability, confirmability, transferability)

The trustworthiness of data is a very critical aspect of qualitative studies. According to Lincoln and Guba (in Johnson and Turner, 2003), the term “trustworthiness” refers to the way in which the researcher is able to persuade his readers that the findings in the study are worth paying attention to and that the research is of high quality. According to Vosloo (2014:327), there are scholars in the qualitative approach who prefer not to use the term validity in qualitative research. They instead suggest the adoption of the words: credibility, dependability,

confirmability and transferability (generalizability). These are strategies aimed at achieving trustworthiness of qualitative research (Vosloo, 2014:327).

3.7.1.1 Credibility

Credibility refers to the extent to which the results of the research are credible and believable from the perspective of the participants in the study (Durrheim and Wassenaar, 2002:64). The researcher established credibility by applying data triangulation to the method of data collection (interview, semi-structured questionnaire and document review) (Stake, 2000:443). The use of the three methods compensated for their individual limitations and exploited their respective benefits (Yeasmin and Rahman, 2012:157). In this study, supporting data was obtained from documents (ANC's national election manifestos) to provide an acceptable perspective to the study.

3.7.1.2 Dependability

Dependability is the extent to which research findings can be replicated with similar subjects in a similar context (Durrheim and Wassenaar, 2002:64). The researcher aimed to achieve dependability by employing member checking during which identified themes were discussed with the participants. Their feedback was requested about the accuracy of the content.

3.7.1.3 Confirmability

Vosloo (2014:330) describes confirmability as the extent to which the results of findings can be corroborated by others. To achieve this, the researcher had to archive all collected data in a well-organized and retrievable form so that it could be made available if the research findings were to be challenged.

3.7.1.4 Transferability/ generalizability (external validity)

Transferability refers to evidence supporting the generalization of findings across different participants (Maree, 2010:151). For the purpose of this study, transferability was not considered as a necessary strategy because the study was interpretative. The aim of an interpretative study is to provide a rich description of the perceptions of ANC's members and not necessarily to generalize the findings (Babbie and Mouton, 2012:160).

According to Maree (2010:80), most scholars consider qualitative research that adopts the quality criteria of credibility, dependability and confirmability as trustworthy and valid.

3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

As a qualitative study, the researcher had to interact closely with the participants. This means he had to enter into their private spaces to collect the data. This reality raised several ethical issues that had to be addressed during and after the research. Therefore, appropriate steps had to be taken to adhere to strict ethical guidelines in order to uphold participants' privacy, confidentiality, anonymity and rights. (Babbie and Mouton, 2003:523).

In view of the foregoing discussion, the following section describes how ethical issues in the conduct of the research were addressed.

3.8.1 Informed consent

According to Kumar (2011:244), the researcher must obtain informed consent from participants (ANC's members) of the purpose, nature, data collection methods and extent of the research before implementing the interview and the semi-structured questionnaire. The researcher also explained to them their typical roles. In line with this, the researcher had to obtain their informed consent in writing.

During the interview, the researcher presented the participant with a letter of consent in which the research process was described. He requested the participant to read the letter, ask questions to give clarity and sign the consent form if he or she was willing to participate in the research. The participants were again reminded that they could withdraw at any time during the process if they wished to do so.

For the participants using a questionnaire, consent was requested in the introductory communication in the questionnaire which made assurances about the confidential handling of the information that was sought.

3.8.2 Harm and risk

The researcher guaranteed that no participants would be put in a situation where they might be harmed or subjected to risk of unusual stress and embarrassment as a result of their participation

in the research (Leedy and Ormrod, 2014:105). The researcher had to guard against any behaviour that might offend the participants, such as not exposing them to undue physical or psychological harm.

3.8.3 Honesty and trust

The research was conducted in accordance with the ethical requirements to report the findings in a truthful and honest way (Leedy and Ormrod, 2014:108).

3.8.4 Privacy, confidentiality and anonymity

Babbie and Mouton (2012:523) are of the opinion that the researchers should ensure that the privacy, confidentiality and anonymity of the participants are maintained throughout the research project. The researcher made it clear that the names of the participants would not be used for any other purpose nor would information be shared that recorded their identity in any way.

3.8.5 Voluntary participation

Despite all of the above precautions, it was made clear to participants that the research was only for academic purposes and that participation in it was absolutely voluntary. No one would be forced to participate (Maree, 2010:41-42).

In addition to the ethical aspects discussed above, the researcher continuously conducted the research according to the statement provided by the research Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Management and Law of the University of Limpopo.

3.9 CONCLUSION

The chapter gave a detailed discussion of the research design and methodology to be employed in this study. It was indicated that the study would follow an interpretivist paradigm with a qualitative approach. The qualitative design for the study is case study research. The chapter also provided a detailed description of the data collection methods to be used which included interviews, semi-structured questionnaires and document analysis. The population, the sample,

research area and size as well as quality criteria and ethical issues were explained. Data analysis, findings and interpretation will be discussed in detail in the next chapter.

CHAPTER 4

DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Chapter 3 discussed the research design and research methodology which included the data collection methods (interviews, questionnaires and document analysis) as well as a brief reflection on the qualitative data analysis techniques adopted for this study. The primary focus of this chapter is to present raw data and the findings of the four research objectives set out in chapter one and to analyse them. The research objectives of this study are:

- To analyse the ANC's 1994 to 2014 national election manifestos.
- To explore the reasons for constant voting patterns relative to public service delivery.
- To assess public participation in relation to public service delivery.
- To investigate the reason for lack of resonance between messages in the manifestos and actual service delivery.

The analysis and interpretation of the data has been carried out in the light of all the research questions set out in chapter one. The research was guided by the following questions:

- What messages did the ANC manifestos carry during the period between 1994 and 2014?
- What are the reasons behind the constant voting patterns among the ANC's voters after each election in the light of the party's poor service delivery record?
- What does public participation entail in its application within the domain of public service delivery?
- What are the reasons for lack of resonance between promises in the election manifestos and actual service delivery?

4.2 PRESENTATION OF DATA

In this study, samples were not selected according to the principle of statistical randomness. They were selected purposively and non-randomly with a specific purpose in mind. Inevitably, this approach had negative implications: statistical theories of probability did not apply to non-random samples, making it almost impossible to generalize the findings to the study population.

The study adopted three data collection methods: interviews, questionnaires and document analysis as highlighted in chapter three of this study. The rationale for adopting these three methods was so that the weaknesses of a single data collection strategy could be minimized as well as to increase the credibility and validity of the research results. Qualitative data analysis and interpretation of all data collection strategies were executed through words and not numbers or statistics. That was because there was no intention on the part of the researcher to quantify the findings or to generate numerical data for the purpose of statistical analysis. On the contrary, the intention was to obtain a more holistic picture about the sentiments expressed by participants and then analyse them from a qualitative point of view.

4.3 INTERVIEW

The questions posed to the participants were guided by the interview schedule that was prepared in advance. The questions were grouped according to the research themes or topics. The interviews were conducted with twelve persons who were non-randomly and purposively selected by the researcher. This selection procedure helped the researcher select knowledgeable and experienced members of the ANC who would best respond to the questions posed. Admittedly, since the researcher played an active role in deciding who should be and should not be interviewed, bias might have cropped up.

An agreement was reached before the interview sessions that participants would not be identified. This was meant to ensure anonymity as well as to make participants feel free to express their views, beliefs and opinions without fear of victimization or intimidation.

The researcher listened to what the participants had to say on each topic under discussion. They were asked similar questions and their responses and feelings were compared to obtain an overall picture of their views through the questions asked. Recurrent themes and patterns were then identified, analysed and interpreted. The qualitative data analysis used for this purpose was conversation analysis. In analyzing and interpreting data, the researcher listened to the conversation attentively and read every transcript of the interviews more than once. There were five interview topics, each accompanied by a set of questions relevant to the topic.

Individual verbatim expressions were used to support the discussion of qualitative findings. Thereafter, responses from participants were qualitatively, descriptively and thematically

analysed and interpreted. The literature review played a significant part in this regard in providing the theoretical justification and enabling the researcher to contextualize the findings of his study, as well as to link the findings to what other scholars have said on the issues under discussion.

4.3.1 ANALYSIS OF DATA FROM THE INTERVIEWS

4.3.1.1 Participants' responses to warm-up questions

The first set of questions (warm-up questions) was asked primarily to set the stage and to enable the participants to readily express their views, beliefs and opinions freely. They were also meant to prepare the participants for the subsequent topics of the interview.

Participants were asked how long they had been card carrying members of the ANC as well as the positions they occupied in the organization. They were also asked about the aspects of their membership which they felt most rewarding. Lastly, they were asked to walk the researcher through their experiences and feelings towards the ANC's national election victories from 1996 to 2014. Those who were interviewed which make up 100% (12) were card-carrying members of the ANC. None of them was a card-carrying member before 2004. By 2004, only one had a membership. By 2009, all of them (12) were members in good standing. 67% (8) occupied leadership positions in the ANC's structures. 33% (4) did not occupy any leadership position but are very active in the organization and other community structures. All the participants were very happy about the fact that they were able to attend meetings, conferences and take part in political discussions.

The participants expressed different sentiments and emotions about the ANC's electoral victories since 1994. One participant who expressed a positive sentiment said: "I am excited because my organization defeated apartheid. I am proud about the liberation struggle. A lot of good is yet to come."

The one who expressed a negative and pessimistic sentiment had this to say: "I am disappointed. If you look around, poverty is all over. Service delivery is non-existent. I think the people are going to punish us at the voting booth one of these days."

Regardless of the fact that the questions were referred to as “warm up” in the study, they, in their own right talked to the research objectives as well as the problem statement as set out in chapter one.

All in all, 42% (5) of participants were satisfied about what their organization has achieved. 58% (7) were not happy. The surprising question that needed to be addressed was why people were not translating their unhappiness about their organization into votes against the governing party. A search of the literature on why the situation was like that in South Africa revealed the following reality: South African voters choose their political parties during elections on the basis of identity. Poor performance on the part of the leaders does not necessarily mean a significant loss electorally (Friedman, 2009:114). This mentality is diametrically opposed to the economic theory according to which voters should choose their political leaders on the basis of the economic and political performance of their own countries (Alvarez et al, 1999:2). This argument is also supported by the rational ignorance theory which posits that many voters in the world today do not understand or identify their political interests and benefits because they are not well informed. As a result of this lack of knowledge, poor information and ignorance, election outcomes cannot be a credible measure of a mature democracy (Martinelli, 2006:225).

4.3.1.2 Participants’ understanding of election manifestos

Participants were asked to explain their understanding of the phenomenon “election manifesto”. Although their explanations were different, they showed they understood the concept. There were those who called manifestos “policies”, “ideas”, “promises” and “slogans” 83% (10). 17% (2) of participants thought manifestos were “lies”, “propaganda”, and “statements”. One participant who represented the majority view (83%) said:

“Manifestos are political parties’ policies and promises before an election. The reason is usually to win the votes during the upcoming elections. A party with a good election manifesto wins”.

The one who represented a minority view (17%) said:

“They are empty slogans. Nothing is truthful about them. They don’t do what they promise in those manifestos. Where are the roads?. The youths are sitting at home unemployed.”

Participants were also asked if they thought the ANC was serious about addressing priorities in its election manifestos. The majority view 67% (8) was that the organization was trying to address priorities in its manifestos. One participant had the following to say:

“Look at primary schools and other secondary schools where school children are fed. Almost every household is electrified. Yes, there are challenges but we must acknowledge that our lives have changed for the better. You can’t see this if you are from a well-to-do family.”

33% (4) of participants responded negatively. They pointed to rampant crime, unemployment and poor health facilities as some of the indicators of poor performance. One participant said:

“Yes, the organization is trying. But we can’t discount the question of unemployment and crime. The grants are not going to help our people. The youth will despair. Think about 2019.”

On the manifestos of the ANC being top-down, the majority of participants 10 (83%) said there was no engagement with members on the ground. This was supported by the following verbatim quotation from a participant:

“Manifestos are imposed on us. There is no such a thing you call engagement. It is a myth. We are instructed to support the manifesto”.

The remaining 2 (17%) expressed positive views as represented by this view:

“Consultation is done through structures. People don’t attend branch meetings. Some comrades don’t read documents given to them. People are being engaged”.

Only 33% (4) of participants said they had attended the organization’s manifesto launch as opposed to 67% (8) who said they had never attended one, let alone invited.

A synthesis of the responses and discussion above showed, inter alia, that a big majority of participants understood what the concept “election manifesto” encompassed. However, there were divergent views. Even those who were “wrong” in their explanations were not totally wide off the mark.

On the whole, the central idea for posing those questions was to attempt to find out whether the ANC was committed to addressing service delivery priorities in the country. There was no

consensus on the matter. The majority of participants was sympathetic to the organization while there was a minority view which responded negatively.

The literature on public administration emphasizes that the most important responsibility of public service is to provide effective services to the public. Mc Lennan and Munslow (2009:19) corroborate this assertion by indicating that provision of services to the public is a highly politicized and contested political terrain. Failure to provide services can therefore be suicidal for the governing party. Political stakes are high. Even the literature on the ANC's election manifestos as discussed in chapter two of this study confirms the view that the organization's manifestos are service delivery sensitive.

4.3.1.3 Poor service delivery and constant voting patterns

Of the 100% (12) participants who were interviewed said they were not satisfied with the quality of service delivery in their communities. The general sentiment was that communities were not getting what they were expecting and were not even involved.

The subsequent question asked participants if they would vote for a political party with a poor service delivery. 83% (10) of participants indicated that there had to be consequences for poor service delivery. The general view was that if a party fails to implement its manifesto promises in terms of service delivery, it should be punished on the ballot paper. One representative of this view had this to say:

“It is ridiculous. We South Africans are a strange lot. We do not act against our leaders in government when they do not deliver on their promises. They come before an election and promise this and that. After the elections, they disappear into thin air, only to emerge again after five years to lie to us again. It is about time we use the power of our vote to correct this, but it doesn't happen in our communities”.

A tiny minority of participants 17% (2) said that a party like ANC should be given enough time to correct the damage done by the previous regime. The view of the participant hereunder sums up this sentiment:

“The apartheid regime had decades and decades to cause damage to our country. The ANC has only been in government since 1994. Think about the homeland system, separate development,

Bantu education system. Our government is trying its level best. It is going to take some time. I think we should be patient, but I understand the anger and hopelessness out there”.

On why people remain loyal to their party regardless of its poor performance, the following is a summary of some of their views 100% (12):

- the Mandela legacy.
- the ANC’s liberation history.
- no alternative political party.
- patience is needed.

On the question about some South Africans not being well-informed politically, 58% (7) of participants raised a number of reasons, amongst others,

- apathy.
- disinterest.
- disengagement.
- poor political education.
- lack of relevant information.

25% (3) of participants were of the view that South African voters are well-informed

The remaining 17% (2) did not answer this question clearly or legibly.

Nevertheless, 100% (12) of participants said they were willing to vote for the ANC. 75% (9) agreed with the view that not all South Africans understand the process of a democratic election process. Only 25% (3) disagreed.

As the presentation above indicated, there was a consensus amongst the participants that across their communities, the quality of service delivery was totally inadequate. The researcher would, therefore, ideally have expected those communities to punish the ruling party severely for poor service delivery.

Participants were expected to interrogate the conundrum of constant voting patterns relative to poor service delivery in South Africa. But as can be deduced from the preceding responses, poor service delivery in South Africa does not necessarily translate into political consequences in the

ballot box. Unexpectedly, there is a wide margin between those who are for electoral consequences for poor service delivery and those sympathetic to the governing party of the day.

The researcher in this regard agrees with the argument that for the ANC to win grassroots support, its election manifestos have to be implemented efficiently and effectively. The organization's manifestos should also be realistic. When implementation fails to materialize, there must be accountability. It should also be understood that Section 19 of the Constitution (Act 108 of 1996) gives every citizen the right to free, fair and regular elections and the right to vote using a secret ballot in the elections. Regular elections consolidate accountability and are one of the pillars of democracy in a country. This mechanism is available and free for the citizens to use.

4.3.1.4 Public (membership) participation

Participants were asked about public (general membership) participation in the affairs of their organization. 75% (9) of participants said they attended meetings, conferences and rallies when called upon to do so. They said that in the meetings they contributed to discussions without undue restrictions. They also indicated they also participated in the production of manifestos through their branches delegates. They agreed that participation by the general membership was beneficial to the organization as a whole. In terms of quality of participation, a huge majority of participants 83% (10) said that it was poor while only 17% (2) said it was good. One participant who represented the view of the majority said:

“We attend branch meetings. People get invited to these meetings, but not everyone attends. But usually the attendance rate is always satisfactory. We are told of the organization's manifestos before elections. We do discuss these things. Our delegates attend manifesto launch. It can't be the whole branch. We sell these manifestos to the people. Yes, membership participation leads to members' sense of ownership of the manifesto programmes. It also discourages lack of enthusiasm and energy on the part of members”.

One of those who represented a negative view 25% (3) had this sentiment:

“Not at all. I have never been invited. Some of us are busy. I have never attended a meeting which discussed a manifesto. I have never been to a conference. But I am a card-carrying member. I think membership participation is good for the organization. ”

A comparative analysis of the above responses revealed that the majority of the participants believed that members do participate in the ANC’s decision making process. However, the minority sentiment painted a different picture.

It is the view of the researcher that participation by general membership plays an important role in the organization such as the ANC which is mass based. The researcher therefore agrees with the view expressed by Creighton (2005:18-19) in which the author argues that participation by members:

- empowers quality of decisions.
- minimizes costs and delays.
- ensures consensus building.
- increases ease of implementation of resolutions.
- maintains credibility and legitimacy of decisions.
- minimizes confrontations.

Without participation, the distance between the leaders and ordinary members widens. The culture of democracy is also negatively affected and turns into what Skorpel (2003:11) refers to as a “diminished democracy” and is relegated to what Crenson and Ginsberg (2002:141) call “down-sized democracy”. The three scholars cited here are of the view that without due participation, any decisions taken are made by the elite while the public is marginalized.

4.3.1.5 Disconnection between messages in the manifestos and actual service delivery

The first question under this theme or topic asked participants to gauge the extent of the disconnection between messages in manifestos and actual service delivery. The majority of participants 58% (7) said there was a huge disconnection between what the manifestos said and what people actually saw in terms of service delivery. The general sentiment among this group of participants was that there had been no tangible changes in their communities since 1994. Some participants in this category said politicians only appeared during the elections to make promises

and thereafter they were nowhere to be seen. Some of the reasons cited for the disconnection were corruption, lack of accountability and party politics. This sentiment by one participant summed up the whole story:

“Politicians do not have to worry about our support. To them, our support for them is obvious. Service delivery or not, they know we will vote for them. They know that nothing will happen to them. Poor performance or not. They don’t have to worry. They are rich any way. Corruption and unaccountability are the names of the game.”

25% (3) of the participants blame it on the apartheid regime. The view of this group of the participants was generally that the apartheid backlog was too big and that communities had to be patient. For this group, not all politicians were bad. Ironically, this group, like the one before it, also blamed the disconnection on greed, party politics and lack of political consequences. One representative of this group had the following to say:

“Look, things are happening. We can’t expect complete change overnight. Yes, we have to deal with greed, impunity and unaccountability. You must understand that apartheid has destroyed this country. People have to be patient”.

There was a neutral view 17% (2) about this topic but there was a sense that corruption was bad for the country but at the same time not all was bad. One neutral participant is quoted verbatim hereunder:

“Yes, there are rotten apples here and there. Not everything is bad. There are good politicians and the bad ones. Service delivery is happening. Yes, not everywhere of course. Some communities are yet to see service delivery. Corruption and lack of accountability are to blame. You see I am sitting on the fence as far as your question is concerned.”

On the strength of the above presentations, it is clear that participants had divergent views on the topic. To analyse the above findings appropriately, the argument advanced by Owusu-Amaoh (2012:1) offers an illuminating insight. The author is of the view that political parties’ manifestos should reflect the vision of the national strategic framework. In the context of South Africa, this framework is the NDP (Vision 2030). The NDP’s main priority is to eliminate poverty and reduce inequality by 2030. The ANC’s five election manifestos being analysed also have poverty

elimination and reduction of inequality as their main focus. It can therefore be safely argued that all ANC's manifestos are in compliance with the NDP. The question that arises though is whether the implementation of the promises in those manifestos is being kept or not. Is the spate of protests throughout the country not a reflection of the ANCs failure to implement its own manifestos? The protests are in all likelihood a result of poor service delivery, uncaring and self-serving leaders (www.amandlapublishers.co.za).

According to the World Bank (2003), the poor participate in politics through voting regularly. But the same poor people are often denied access to better public service delivery. There are many causes for the disconnection. The NDP (Vision 2030) cites the following reasons, inter alia:

- corruption.
- poor leadership.
- lack of clear lines of accountability.

Chapter 7 of the Constitution (Act 108 of 1996), Section 152 (1) empowers municipalities to provide accountable government for local communities to ensure the provision of service delivery to communities in a sustainable manner and promote social and economic development.

4.3.1.6 Participants' last comments

Participants were asked if they had any other comments they might wish to make.

The comments of the vast majority were, inter alia:

- there is an urgent need to root out corruption.
- ordinary members should be involved.
- there is a need to revitalize the organization.

The above comments are reinforced by the following verbatim quotations from some of the participants:

“For the good of this glorious movement, corruption should be dealt with once and for all”.

“If members on the ground are used as voting fodder, we might as well kiss the ANC’s government goodbye”.

“The ANC as an organization needs some form of renewal”.

4.4 QUESTIONNAIRE

The set of questionnaires administered for the purpose of this study did not comprise quantitative questions. They only contained open-ended questions of a qualitative nature. In cases where a Yes or No question was posed, it was followed by an open probe for further explanation about why such a response was given. Therefore, the responses to the open-ended questions were analysed qualitatively to further determine the opinions of participants of the topic under investigation. Each participant was given the questionnaire to go through before engaging in the research.

For the participants responding to the questionnaire, consent was requested in the introductory communication in the questionnaire which made assurances about the confidential handling of the information sought.

4.4.1 FINDINGS FROM THE SEMI-STRUCTURED QUESTIONNAIRE, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

4.4.1.1 Participants’ understanding of a democratic election process (C)

C: 5-9. These questions were included to obtain demographic information from the participants in order to describe the study population. Only two variables, namely, gender distribution and education levels, were considered important and indispensable for analysis. The rest of the remaining variables were not considered relevant for analysis as all participants were purposively recruited into the study.

The first set of questions (C:10-15) were based on the participants’ understanding of a democratic election process with a view to addressing the question of constant voting patterns among the ANC’s voters as well as the extent of public participation in politics.

The first question (C: 10) asked the participants if they had voted in the 2014 national elections as well as to explain their experiences and feelings on that day. 25 participants (100%) indicated

that they had voted. The experiences and feelings of the participants were however divergent. There were 16 participants (64%) who indicated that they were extremely excited on the day. It was this participant who succinctly expressed total joy and happiness:

“Yes, I was overjoyed to express my democratic right. I do this every time after five years to honour the struggle heroes and heroines”.

However, other participants, 5 (20%) had mixed feelings. They were happy but at the same time disappointed at the pace of the socio-economic situation in their communities. One participant had this to say:

“I voted and I will do it again. It is something we fought for. Yet I am dismayed that poverty and unemployment are on the rise. Where I come from, service delivery is non-existent. There is no water. But I will vote again”.

The remaining 4 participants (16%) expressed total dejection. A participant who represented this view had this to say:

“I did vote. That was for the last time. It is not worth it anymore. We voted for them and where are they now?”

In view of the foregoing responses from participants, it is clear that all participants understood the importance of casting a vote. Regrettably, as a result of the sad socio-economic situation in the country, some are becoming, understandably so, apathetic and disillusioned.

A search of the literature on the above engagement points to a bleak picture. The World Bank (2003) indicates that even as the people, especially the poor, participate in politics through voting, those in power deny them significant material rewards, let alone access to better public services. This argument is corroborated by Fakir (2007:2) who refers to South Africa as a democratic developmental state whose public service has the mandate to contribute to societal development by providing essential services in order to maintain the dignity and rights of citizens.

The subsequent questions (C: 11-13) asked participants to express their views about the importance of national elections, to explain what motivates them to vote, as well as to describe

their understanding of a democratic election process. The responses from participants were wide and varied. C: 11. 25 participants (100%) understood the importance of national elections. However, this understanding is not homogenous. There were three categories of participants to this question. There were 15 participants (60%) who expressed the view that national elections gave the citizens the opportunity to express their democratic right to choose their leaders who decide on their behalf. This view was expressed quite clearly by a participant who stated that:

“Elections give power to the citizens to participate. They are empowered to choose who will represent them in the national parliament”.

Another category of participants, 8 (32%) is of the opinion that national elections are important for ensuring the accountability of leaders. One participant who shared this sentiment had this to say:

“As citizens we are able to hold our leaders accountable. Leaders know that if they don’t deliver, we will get someone to replace them”.

The third category of participants 2 (8%) equated elections with democracy. This idea was summarized in these words written by one participant:

“Without elections, we can’t speak of democracy”.

C: 12.100% (25) of participants said they were motivated to vote because it was their democratic right to do so.

C: 13. 72% (18) answered in the affirmative. There was no participant who gave an explanation of his or her answer.

The presentation above indicates that participants are knowledgeable about the importance of national elections. The question that arises is why, in the light of voters understanding of their democratic right to vote, the ANC remains in power regardless of its poor performance in government.

The participants’ responses to this question are confirmed by Ugen and Manza (2002:777) who define an election process as a critical feature in democratic communities in the world. This view

is shared by Pive and Cloward (in Ugen and Manza, 2002:777) who argue that the right to vote is the basis of all political rights.

There are also a number of theories which have attempted to answer this question in the literature review. The economic theory posits that voters choose political leaders and parties during elections on account of the economic situation in their country (Leigh, Fair cited in Garretson et al., 2014:2). However, there are scholars who disagree with the preceding assumption. They argue that voters are largely ignorant of socio-economic issues (Campbell, Converse, Muller, Stokes, in Garretsen et al., 2014:3). Therefore, in South Africa, the state of the economy and politics do not necessarily motivate the voters' choice of political leadership and parties.

Questions C: 14-15 were based on what participants thought could be done to improve understanding of a democratic election process. C: 14. A majority of participants, 23 (92%) expressed the view that information and education were of primary importance for citizens' understanding of a democratic election process. One of the participants who represented the majority sentiment had this to say:

“Voter education should start at school. The young should be taught about the value of making informed choices at an early age”.

C: 15. Only a tiny minority of participants 8% (2) had a different view. Those participants believed the importance of improving service delivery was the basis for improving citizens understanding of a democratic election process. A voter who expressed this thought said:

“If service delivery is improved, people will understand what a democratic election process is all about. Without service delivery, we can't even start to speak about a democratic election process”.

Analysis of the above indicates that not all participants understood the question. However, only few participants answered it irrelevantly.

Literature on the above discussion emphasizes the importance of education and information in guiding the voters to make rational choices during an election. Bratton and Seligon (cited in Devarajan and Windlund, 2007:11) propose that political empowerment through education and information can have a positive impact on people's political consciousness. Krishna (in

Devarajan and Windlund, 2007:12) argues for the importance of providing information to the poor in order to broaden their understanding of democracy as well as to encourage them to participate in politics.

There are scholars, however, who do not agree that an election process is a credible measure of democracy. The rational ignorance theory proponents assume that voters do not understand nor know their political interests and benefits because they are not well-informed. As a result of this lack of knowledge and information and ignorance, voters tend to choose political leaders and parties not based on facts or values but on the basis of political allegiance or party affiliation. The authenticity of the election outcome therefore becomes the subject of dispute (Martinelli: 2006:225).

4.4.1.2 Election manifestos (D)

Questions D: 16-19 are based on election manifestos. The purpose of including this question was to find out what the ANC's election manifestos reveal about the organization's seriousness in addressing the key priorities in its manifestos.

Question D: 16 asked participants to indicate what they thought were the purposes of election manifestos. 21 participants (84%) indicated that manifestos tell potential voters about an election. One of the participants who represented their views said:

“They are important documents showing the policies of political parties. They are prepared and issued before an election to attract voters”.

The remaining 4 participants (16%) used words such as; propaganda, lies, useless documents, slogans to demonstrate the futility of manifestos.

The participant who expressed a negative sentiment about them said:

“They are empty slogans prepared by politicians. They never keep their promises”.

It became clear from the participant's responses that they were divided. There were those who held a positive attitude towards election manifestos and they represented a majority view. Those who held a pessimistic view were in the minority. It may thus be interpreted that the two

categories of participants understood election manifestos and their purposes despite the divergence of views they expressed.

The presentation above finds resonance in the literature review where scholars are also divided on the purpose of election manifestos. For example, Trepida (2009:2) maintains that election manifestos show that a political party in charge of government has been taking the demands of citizens into consideration. On the other hand, Petlane (2009:1) refers to them as sloganeering tools which many don't even read.

Question D:17 asked participants if they thought the ANC was achieving, through its national election manifestos, the aims of the NDP, namely eliminating poverty and reducing inequality. The question divided the participants into two groups. One group made up of 22 participants (88%) believed the ANC was trying its level best to ensure its election manifestos reflected the aim of the NDP. This participant's observation was that:

“If you look at all the manifestos from 1994-2014, the ANC's central preoccupation was to fight poverty and reduce inequality. The ANC may not be achieving this, but its manifestos do reflect this. This is a fact”.

3 participants (12%) did not believe the ANC was achieving the aim of the NDP (poverty elimination and reduction of inequality). A participant who represented this view said:

“I have never read one line in the ANC manifestos which particularly addresses the NDP vision. Yes, I do read about poverty elimination and job creation. But as for the NDP, I have not read”.

Analysis of the presentation above showed that the participants from both sides know about the NDP (Vision 2030). They however differ in terms of whether the election manifestos of the ANC reflect the spirit of the NDP about poverty and reduction of inequality. According to Owusu-Amoah (2012), political parties should ensure that their manifestos reflect the vision of the national strategic framework. In South Africa, the National strategic framework would be the NDP (Vision 2030).

On question D: 18, participants had to list the reason (s) for the poor implementation of the ANC's election manifestos. Interesting findings emerged. A wide margin was observed between participants who blamed poor implementation on corruption, 18(72%) and those who blamed it

on poor implementation capacity, 2 (8%), poor leadership, 2 (8%) and lack of political consequences, 3 (12%).

The huge margin could be attributed to the fact that corruption has become so endemic in the country that many people associate everything bad about service delivery with it. It does not necessarily mean that opinions cited by other participants are less important or less urgent.

A follow-up question D: 19 asked participants to agree or disagree with whether a political party which does not keep its manifesto promises should suffer the consequences. The rest of the participants 100% (25) agreed that those who perform poorly must suffer electoral consequences. The following are some verbatim expressions made by some of the participants:

A. "I agree. They must be punished so that they can start to respect the power of the voters".

B. "Yes, I do agree. Elections give us the mandate to choose leaders who will perform".

C. "Without electoral consequences, there will be no service delivery".

D. "I agree. To put pressure on those in government to deliver on their promises".

In a democracy, there are mechanisms or systems in place which allow for political parties which do not implement their election promises to be voted out of office through a democratic process. The public has the final say on who governs them.

4.4.1.3 Service delivery (E)

Questions E: 20-22 are based on service delivery issues. These questions specifically address the problem statement of the study, which claims amongst others, that the single most prominent category of grievances cited by protesters relate to lack of or poor service delivery.

Question E: 20 asked participants what they thought should be the key priorities of service delivery. A brief synopsis of those issues raised as key priorities of service delivery were: roads,

electricity, housing and health care. During the analysis of the questionnaire, it came to light that 96% of participants (24) touched on one or more of those issues. Generally, those issues featured prominently as ones that must receive undivided attention of those in government. About 4% of the participants (1) raised issues such as sanitation and refuse removal. The reason for such a huge margin here could be attributed to the fact that the study was conducted in villages where sanitation and refuse removal did not play a major role in participants' lives.

A follow up question (E: 22) asked why South Africa has so many service delivery protests. The following reasons were cited by 100% of participants (25) altogether: corruption, lack of water, lack of housing delivery, inadequate electricity, unemployment, poor roads.

There were varied responses to what participants thought should be done to reduce service delivery protests. Unanimously, 25 participants (100%) agreed on the following solutions:

- job creation.
- involvement of local communities on local government issues.
- arresting, prosecuting and convicting the corrupt.
- promotion of social and economic development.

This is how one participant responded:

“There is no miracle. If the youths are roaming the streets unemployed, protests will be the order of the day. Arrest those involved in corruption and send them to prison”.

Another one remarked:

“You can't speak of social and economic development without involving the local communities. They will not accept it”.

One participant was very blunt:

“Corruption and greed are the worst enemies of the masses”.

The analysis of the responses made by the participants show that service delivery issues that were most pressing include: housing, electricity, roads, water and health care. The analysis also indicated that service delivery protests were a reaction to societal problems such as rampant corruption and inadequate community involvement. Participants suggested that for protests to be

reduced, the state must be proactive in, amongst others, arresting those engaged in corrupt activities and by creating job opportunities for the youth.

In agreement with the presentation above, the NDP (Vision 2030) cites the following as some of the reasons for poor implementation of service delivery: poor implementation capability, poor leadership, high levels of corruption, absence of political will and blurred lines of accountability.

One of the questions raised in the problem statement is: why does South Africa remain the service delivery protest capital of the world? The irony is that come the election season, vote outcome patterns do not change significantly. The party in government does not get punished electorally for poor service delivery. Authors such as Friedman (2009:114) blame it on identity politics. According to this author, voters will remain loyal to a political party that represents their identity regardless of its poor political performance.

4.4.1.4 Public (general membership) participation (F)

Question F: 23 was based on public (general membership) participation. The question was posed primarily to evaluate the importance of public participation in politics. Participants had to express their views on implications of the South African electoral system – closed-list proportional representation system- for public participation and leadership accountability.

Two opposed views emerged. 19 participants (76%) expressed negative views about the system in terms of its implications for public participation and leadership accountability. The following are direct quotations from comments made by some of the participants who thought the system was not good for South Africa.

One participant wrote:

“It is a bad system. We endorse the leaders selected by a few ANC members at an election conference. We don’t directly participate in the process. We are effectively disenfranchised”.

The other one said:

“It is bad for democratic accountability. The system must be changed to allow us to vote for individual candidates who represent our constituencies, not party leaders. We can’t hold our leaders accountable”.

There were, nevertheless, 6 participants (24%) who had different opinions. This group was of the view that the system was good. These were some of their comments:

“We should be realistic. The system is good for minority parties and independent candidates. It gives them a better chance of winning seats in parliament.”

The other one made the following observation:

“This system reduces an absolute majority for one party. It also requires greater consensus in policy making”.

The majority view in this regard is confirmed in the literature review. Mattes (2002:30) argues that poor public participation in South Africa rests on the closed party list proportional system which offers voters very few incentives to participate in politics. The will of the people is frustrated. Those in the minority who were sympathetic to the system get some form of support from Horowitz (2003:115) who argues that the system fosters high rates of representivity and inclusivity. A survey conducted by Mattes and Southall (2004:59) however found that South African communities prefer an electoral system that empowers them to select their own representatives directly.

The interpretation of the researcher is that the present electoral system marginalizes the voters. Their participatory role is diminished. The powers-that-be make all the decisions while the public are not afforded direct participation. Skorpel (2003:11) aptly calls this “diminished democracy”.

4.4.1.5 Challenges facing the ruling party (G)

The questions were posed to address the underlying causes of lack of resonance between promises in the election manifestos and actual service delivery. Question F: 24 was close-ended (yes/no response). The follow-up question (F: 25) asked participants how they thought the ANC should address the challenges of the disconnection between its manifestos and real service

delivery. All 25 participants (100%) understood what “A better life for all” meant. Some of their explanations revolved around the following:

- ensuring the realization for the provision of services to everyone.
- improvement of people’s lives.
- creating conditions for inclusive economic growth and job creation.
- making life better for all.
- redressing apartheid injustices.
- reducing inequality.

Participants were divided on whether the ANC was successful in making “A better life for all” a reality. There were 14 “yes” (56%) and 11 “no” (44%). On the challenges facing the ANC (F: 25), a majority of participants 17 (68%) cited corruption while the minority 8 (32%) mentioned the implementation of manifestos. It is important to indicate that the poor implementation of manifestos could be a result of corruption. There was unanimity on how these challenges should be addressed: arrest, prosecution and conviction of those found guilty.

It can be deduced from the foregoing presentation that the heart of the problem lies in the lack of accountability for maladministration and corruption. There is a growing perception, as revealed in the participants’ comments, that there was continuing impunity on the part of those who were politically and financially powerful. There was a consensus from the participants that corruption undermined state legitimacy and service delivery.

According to the World Bank (2003), public service delivery in many developing countries such as South Africa, is fraught with the problem of corruption whereby funding is misappropriated. In South Africa, an important barometer of the extent of this problem is growing public sector corruption, whereby public funds are being diverted away from the public good towards private interests. The Human Sciences Research Councils (HSRC) Annual South Africa Attitudes Survey shows that the proportion of people who think that tackling corruption should be a national priority has almost doubled from 14% to 26% in five- year between 2006 and 2011.

4.4.1.6 Participants' comments (H)

Participants were given the opportunity to make any comments on any issue of relevance that has not been covered by the questionnaire. Only 7 participants (28%) were prepared to make comments. Generally, the comments were of a warning nature to the ANC. Some of the comments were:

A. "2019 is coming! The 2019 elections will pose a serious challenge for the ANC if it fails to win sufficient electoral support. Its support has been in decline since 2004."

B. "Without political will from the top, calls for the fight against corruption remain empty slogans. The deep-seated discontent in the communities will culminate in total lawlessness."

C. "The ANC must smell the coffee. Its worst performance was registered in 2016 local government elections where it received just 55, 6% of the vote and lost three key metros: Johannesburg, Tshwane and Nelson Mandela Bay. What does 2019 hold in store for the party?"

4.5 RESPONSE RATE AND DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION

Response rate, also called completion rate or return rate measures the rate of completion of the data collection instruments by the study participants (Babbie and Moution, cited in Katebire, 2007:142). The authors maintain that a high response rate helps ensure that the study results are representative of the target population. In this study, all 12 participants (100%) identified for the face-to-face interview sessions were interviewed. Questionnaires were administered to a sample of 30 participants non-randomly and purposively. Of these, 3 questionnaires were not returned while 2 were considered invalid because participants did not respond to some of the items or put answers to wrong questions or supply unintelligible responses. Altogether, 5 (17%) questions were excluded from the final analysis of the responses. The response rate in this regard was 25 (83%).

Demographic information constitutes a very important consideration in research (Maree, 2010:164). The questionnaire in this regard had five items on the demographics of the participants: area of residence, gender, home language, age and level of education. In terms of these variables, the study participants were widely spread and were identified purposively on the

basis of their ability to respond to the questions. However, two variables were important for analysis, namely, gender distribution and the education levels of participants. The gender distribution in the study suggests that more men 71.4% (30) were available to participate than women 28.6% (12). This study did not probe the reasons for women's low participation. However, the researcher agrees with Evertzen (2001:03) who observed that "women are still hampered by many barriers; individual as well as institutional factors related to the organization of society and the political system, with the risk that they will not reap equal benefits". Many scholars have reported that there is a strong correlation between high education levels and high information seeking behaviour (Katebire, 2007:181). With a 100% education attainment beyond Grade 12 level, it may be suggested that the participants in the study possessed sufficient educational levels to be able to participate effectively in the study.

4.6 DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

According to Bowen (2009:27), document analysis is a procedure used in qualitative research to review documents for the purpose of gaining information relevant to the study. Through the application of content analysis procedure, the researcher was able to organize information into categories related to the central questions of the research. The researcher simply coded categories which were derived directly from the manifestos. Accordingly, he counted and compared keywords derived from the codes followed by an interpretation of the underlying context. The analysis involved identification of key and most frequently repeated words in each election manifestos in order to ensure message re-enforcement.

Five national election manifestos of the ANC were reviewed for the purpose of producing reliable research results. In this study, documents analysis was used in combination with interviews and questionnaires as a means of triangulation. By triangulating data, the researcher ensured that his research results were more credible as well as to guard against accusation that the study findings were dependent on a single method of data collection.

The five manifestos mentioned above contained primary data on the service delivery priorities of the ruling party, namely, education, electricity, roads, housing, water, poverty elimination, job creation and crime reduction among others. This section of the study will not discuss each of the

priorities emerging from various manifestos. These issues were sufficiently discussed in the literature review (section 2.10).

Further analysis of the ANC’s national election manifestos suggests that each must be preceded by a slogan which gives members of the public an idea about the party’s focus and priority at any given time. The general message of the manifesto is also preceded by the party’s presidential message. Each of the presidents seems to have described a particular strategic vision or framework which obviously had an impact on the ANC’s manifestos at a particular time. President Nelson Mandela is associated with reconciliation and the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP). President Thabo Mbeki represented the era of the African Renaissance, as well as Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) and the Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa (AsgiSA). President Zuma is associated with a “back to basics” approach as well as the National Development Plan (NDP) as guiding frameworks.

Table 3: Election manifesto slogans and presidential strategic frameworks.

Election year	Election manifesto slogan	President	Strategic framework
1994	“A better life for all”	Nelson Mandela	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reconciliation • Reconstruction and Development program (RDP)
1999	“Change must go on at a faster pace”	Thabo Mbeki	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • African Renaissance • GEAR • AsgiSA
2004	“A peoples’ contract to create work and fight poverty”		

2009	“Working together we can do more”	Jacob Zuma	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Back to basics • NDP
2014	“Together we move South Africa forward”		

Source: own creation

It is important to analyse and explain the above table in order to indicate the implication of election manifestos and respective strategic frameworks on service delivery. For the purpose of this table analysis, focus will be placed on education, electricity, unemployment and poverty. All the priorities that emerged in the analysis are true South African challenges since 1994. The educational reforms of the post 1994 government were designed for purposes of correcting the historic problem of inequality, as well as to bring about “a better life for all”. According to Netswera and Mathabe (2006:29), education is an important area of focus to any political party that aspires to engender social transformation. It seems to have continuously received a growing attention since 1994. Harris (1994: 41) argues that investing in education is an important measure to raise the standard of living of the poor and the marginalized. Hence the RDP, as a strategic framework, was aimed at addressing social inequality by meeting the basic needs of the poor.

The message in the election campaign wherein electricity featured predominantly was in 1999. In the 1999 election manifesto, the ANC boasted about connecting 2 million households to electricity. As far back as 1989, Wilson and Rampedi (1989:262) compared the provision of electricity with poverty reduction. Providing access to electricity became a very important campaign strategy in line with the slogan “change must go on at a faster pace.”

The 2004 election manifesto committed the ANC to vision 2014 which targeted reducing unemployment by half, hence the campaign slogan “A peoples’ contract to create work and fight

poverty.” Mattes (2002:24) argue that unemployment may become an important determinant of voting patterns. The national development plan: A vision for 2030 is South Africa’s development plan launched in 2012 as a blueprint for how the country can eliminate poverty and reduce inequality by the year 2030. The NDP became a rallying strategy during the 2009 and 2014 election campaigns.

4.7 Conclusion

The primary objective of chapter 4 was to explore the research findings and analyse data obtained from participants. The central focus was on the research questions posed in chapter 1. Data utilized for this purpose was collected using methods which included interviews, questionnaires and document analysis as a means of triangulation. Answers produced from the above mentioned data collection strategies were analysed qualitatively and thematically. The literature review provided a theoretical justification for the discussion and enabled the researcher to contextualize the findings of his study.

Based on the discussion and analysis above, the conclusions and recommendations of the research study will be made in chapter 5.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter focused on the presentation of the raw data, findings and analysis of data obtained by means of data collection strategies discussed in chapter three. The data were analysed and coded into categories in order to identify meaningful patterns and recurrent themes. This chapter provides a summary of the preceding chapters. It also makes conclusions drawn from the findings. There is also a discussion on recommendations as well as critique, limitations and delimitations of the study. The chapter is based on the premise that researchers should be cautious about discussing conclusions and recommendations without relating them to the research findings as well as to the research questions (Bouma and Atkinson, 1995:227). In agreement with the foregoing assertion, Williamson (in Katebire, 2007:224), emphasizes that when writing the conclusions and recommendations, the researcher should ensure that he clearly relates them to the research findings and that they answer the research questions.

5.2 SUMMARY OF CHAPTERS

Chapter one served as the foundation for subsequent chapters. The discussion of the rationale, significance and aim of the study provided the basis for the research and justified the research topic. The problem statement undertook to investigate whether there was resonance between the messages in the election manifestos and public service delivery. In order to address the research problem, research questions were raised. The researcher also developed research objectives in order to assist him to answer the research questions.

Chapter two established the academic and research areas that are of relevance to the subject of the research. The chapter provided a theoretical justification and enabled the researcher to contextualize the findings of his study. The literature review also assisted in addressing the flaws in the body of existing knowledge as well as shortcomings in terms of methodological weaknesses.

Chapter three discussed the methodology and data collection methods employed to investigate the research questions. The study is qualitative in nature. The chapter detailed how the study was

undertaken, how participants were selected, the data collection procedures and instruments adopted. Data triangulation methodology was utilized. Qualitative data analysis methods were also provided.

Chapter four provided raw data, findings, analysis and interpretation of the data. The analysis is based on data collected through various methods discussed in chapter three. In this chapter, analysis and interpretation of the data were carried out in the light of all the research questions set out in chapter one. After a brief reflection on the preceding chapters, it is only appropriate to develop concluding remarks drawn from the findings discussed in chapter 4.

5.3 CONCLUSIONS FROM THE FINDINGS OF THE STUDY

This study was focused on four specific objectives:

- To analyse the ANC's 1994 to 2014 national election manifestos.
- To explore the reasons for constant voting patterns relative to public service delivery.
- To assess public participation in relation to public service delivery.
- To investigate the reason for lack of resonance between messages in the manifestos and actual service delivery.

The findings on the above objectives were presented in chapter four. At the end of each and every finding, there is a corresponding reflection on what other scholars have observed on various issues under discussion. From the findings discussed in chapter 4, a number of conclusions are made. Like the findings, the conclusions have also been drawn and presented systematically in alignment with the objectives of the study. The presentation of the following conclusions is made thematically in the same sequence as the findings in chapter four:

- Although members of the ANC are proud of their membership as well as their organization's legacy, they are not satisfied with what it has achieved so far in terms of public service delivery promised in the manifestos. Among others, members are not happy about the increase in poverty, unemployment, the poor conditions of the roads and lack of water.
- The general perception is that promises in the election manifestos are not being kept. The priorities in the organization's manifestos are discarded without the public being informed of the reason for such a decision.

- In South Africa, electoral choices are, in most cases, based on the political party that represents their identity. Although the majority of people are not satisfied with the implementation of the ANC's manifestos in terms of public service delivery, they still vote for the party. They continue to vote for the party primarily because of the legacy of former President Nelson Mandela as well as the ANC's continuous status as a symbol of liberation from apartheid.
- Participation by the general membership in the organization's policy formulation is below adequate. There is a sense that a distance between the leadership and ordinary members is getting wider by the day. The poor participate by voting in large numbers, but those in power do not reward them with a better basic service delivery.
- There is a huge disconnection between what the manifestos promise and what is actually happening in the communities.
- In general, the overriding sentiment is that the renewal and revitalization of the ANC as an organization and a political party is not only important but imperative and urgent otherwise, it will implode and disintegrate.
- Although members understand the importance of a democratic election process, there is an urgent need for more information and education, especially for the marginalized poor so that their political consciousness can grow.
- While the ANC's election manifestos do incorporate the spirit of the NDP-poverty elimination and reduction of inequality –it is the implementation thereof that remains compromised by, inter alia, rampant corruption and poor leadership.
- Service delivery protests are a reflection of a serious problem within the ANC over its failure to commit to its election manifestos.
- The closed-list proportional representation election system diminishes the participatory role of communities in politics as well as marginalizes them from holding their leaders accountable.
- “A better life for all” is compromised by lack of accountability for maladministration and corruption as well as the culture of impunity.

The presentation of the above conclusions was based on the data collected and analysed in chapter four. The four objectives of the study, set out in chapter one (section 1.7) have all been achieved as the presentation above indicate. The conclusions of the study were also based on the research objectives mentioned above. The study brought about a better understanding of the ANC's national election manifestos between 1994 and 2014 as they relate to service delivery. The conclusions covered all the pertinent themes in the study; inter alia, members' deep sense of dissatisfaction about service delivery, inadequate public participation in politics, identity politics, disconnection between manifestos and actual service delivery. It also covers the challenges the ANC is likely to face in the light of poor implementation of its manifestos. This may include an increase in voter apathy about the organization's policies and programmes. According to Levine (2005:19), a good conclusion of a study should help to point to grey areas that require urgent attention. It is on these areas that recommendations are based.

5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS ABOUT THE FINDINGS

There are a number of recommendations to be made on the basis of the conclusions arising from the findings:

- The rendering of public services to local communities is a constitutional obligation. Therefore, the ANC should ensure that municipalities are empowered to provide services to communities in a sustainable manner in line with its manifestos. Local communities must be involved in these issues as a matter of course.
- The ANC government must reward the voters by implementing its manifesto priorities without fail. Otherwise, the party is likely to witness severe public apathy, disinterest and disengagement about its policies and programmes. This will in all likelihood affect its electoral hegemony in South Africa. The upcoming generations are unlikely to allow themselves to be entrapped in the politics of historical legacies and the hollow invocation of the heroes and heroines of the liberation struggle.
- Participation by the general membership increases ease of implementation of manifestos. The ANC should therefore ensure that there is conscious and active participation in politics by the public. This process should be as inclusive as possible and not be reduced to participation by the elite.

- The ANC should deal with poor or lack of implementation of its manifestos by, inter alia, ensuring there are stringent accountability systems in place, filling key positions with competent people, ensuring there is monitoring and oversight through regular and credible reporting and dealing harshly with policy transgressions and poor performance.
- The ANC should conduct voter education campaigns in communities as a way of guiding them to make rational choices during elections as well as to empower them politically.
- There must be strong institutional mechanisms in place to ensure that corruption and poor leadership are dealt with harshly. For example, those who have misappropriated public money must be charged, prosecuted and imprisoned, if found guilty.
- The ANC should address the main causes of protests, namely abject poverty, widespread corruption and lack of water and electricity.
- There is a need for the ANC to initiate a national discourse on an alternative electoral system to the one we have at the moment.
- Corruption is not a victimless crime. It compromises the legitimacy of the governing party and affects the marginalized poor. Therefore, tackling corruption should be a national priority.

The opinion of the researcher is that the solution to the problem statement posed in chapter one (section 1.3) has been established through careful collection and analysis of data. In an attempt to successfully respond to the research problem statement, appropriate research objectives (chapter one, section 1:7) have been adequately addressed as discussed in section 5.3 above. The set objectives have assisted and guided the researcher in developing informed and relevant recommendations. It is argued that the recommendations above may assist in changing the status quo of the ANC in terms of the implementation of its manifestos. However, the adoption and application of the above-mentioned recommendations must be cautiously approached and be informed by the dynamics within the organization itself.

5.5 CRITIQUE, LIMITATIONS AND DELIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Marshall and Rossman (1999:24) caution that there is no research which is perfect. According to the authors, what is critical is how a researcher attempts to mitigate the effects of a given

limitation or delimitation. Although the study has yielded some preliminary findings, attention needs to be paid to a number of caveats regarding the study. Generalizability is a limitation for this study because data has been treated qualitatively. Open-ended questions on the semi-structured interview and semi-structured questionnaire have been used. The amount of effort it takes to digest the information provided by open-ended questions can be overwhelming for some participants. Since they ask for critical thinking, they are perfect for gaining information from a specialist but the majority of the participants in this study, even though they are card-carrying ANC members, cannot be categorised as specialists on the party's election campaign methods.

The researcher has recognised and acknowledged that the study may be susceptible to what Leedy and Ormrod (2014: 217) refer to as “elite bias”. Bias, according to these authors, is “any influence, condition or set of conditions that singly or in combination distort the data”. “Elite bias” is introduced by the tendency of the researchers to overweight data from more articulate, well informed, high status participants and underrepresent data from less articulate participants. The researcher, however, was able to safeguard against this bias by judicious planning and selection of participants. He also minimized bias by declaring his values and assumptions vis-à-vis the research situation. A non-randomised sample employed in this study can be prone to selection bias. In this study, the ideal study population was clearly defined and accessible. This fact may increase the risk of it being biased. The researcher mitigated this bias by making sure open-ended questions were thoughtfully posed and delivered in a way that allowed participants to reveal their inner-most feelings and provide honest answers. In future, this study can be repeated using a larger randomised sample. It can also be conducted using quantitative design that will allow for the generalizability of results.

5.6 CONCLUSION

This study primarily analysed the ANC's election manifestos about service delivery between 1994 and 2014. The thesis focused on one central proposition of democratic theory, which is that political parties should serve to articulate the voters' choices, and when they win elections, represent those choices in government. I argue that despite widespread criticism of the ANC about poor service delivery, the party enjoys continued high levels of electoral support. I extend this argument by positing that voters must be appropriately informed in order to make genuine

electoral choices. Public education- that emphasises broad and active citizen participation- is needed to ground citizens in democratic values that go beyond dutiful voting every five years.

The study finds that voters repeatedly vote overwhelmingly for the ANC- that has consistently broken its promises on service delivery. They may criticize the ruling party but they do not hold government accountable for the existence of the problems by punishing it at the following elections. I argue that voters' capacity to hold the ANC to account has been compromised largely by lack of credible alternatives at the national level.

From the findings, a number of conclusions have been made. The fact that the ANC enjoys robust electoral support and dominates in wide range of social and economic constituencies reinforces a culture of lack of accountability for maladministration and widespread corruption.

Several recommendations generated from the conclusions have been made. The study recommends that there should be, among others, stringent accountability systems and strong institutional mechanisms in place to ensure that promises made before elections are kept. Those found to have been involved in corruption should be prosecuted.

Finally, this study should be viewed as a starting point. Further quantitative research on the topic might be needed in order to contribute to the continued relevance of the Science of Public Administration in South Africa.

LIST OF REFERENCES

Books, journals and papers

Achen, C.H. and Bartels, L.M. 2002. Ignorance and bliss in democratic politics: Party competition with uninformed voters. Centre for the study of democratic politics, Princeton University.

Adamson, J. 2004. Unpacking Teacher Beliefs through Semi-structured Interviewing: Insights into the Interviewing Process in Context. *Journal of Language and Learning*. Vol. 2. No.2. pp 114-128.

Aliber, M. 2002. Poverty eradication and sustainable development. Human science research council publishers: Cape Town.

Alsheqeeti, H. 2014. Interviewing as a data collection method: A critical review. Newcastle: UK. *English linguistic research*. 3 (1). 2014. URL:<http://dx.doi.org/10.5430/elr.v3n1p39>.

Alvarez, R.M., Nagler, J. and Willette, J.R. 1999. Measuring the relative impact of issues and the economy in democratic elections. Paper presented at the 1998 conference on Economics and Elections in Denmark.

Arnstein, S.R. "A ladder of citizen participation, *JAIP*, 35 (4), July 1969, pp: 216-224.

Ary, D., Jacobs, L.C & Razavich, A. 1990. Introduction to research in education. Florida: Holt Rinehart.

Atieno, O P. 2009. Analysis of the strengths and limitations of qualitative and quantitative research paradigms. *Problem of education in the 21st century*. Vol.13.2009.

Auriachombe, C.J. 2001. Guide lines for drawing up research proposals and preparing theses/dissertations. Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Babbie, E R. 1998. The practice of social research. Belmont: Wadsworth publishing.

Babbie, E. & Mouton, J. 2001. The practice of social research. Oxford University Press.

Southern Africa: Cape Town.

Babbie, E. & Mouton, J. 2003. *The practice of social research*. Oxford University Press. Cape Town.

Babbie, E. 2010. *The practice of social research*. United States: Wadsworth.

Babbie, E. and Mouton, J. 2012. *The Practice of social research*. Oxford University Press: Southern Africa.

Bailey, K.D. 1987. *Methods of social research* (third edition). Macmillan, Inc: New York.

Barnard, S.L. 1994. "The election campaign of the general election in South Africa in 1994". *Journal of Contemporary History*, 19 (2), September. 119.

Becker, P. & Raveloson, A J. 2008. What is democracy? From: <http://www.hsl.ethz.ch/pdfs/2003.4-517-papadopoulos.pdf> (accessed 5 February 2017).

Beetham, D. 1998. *Democracy: Key Principles, Institutions and Problems*. Centre for Democratisation Studies, University of Leeds, United Kingdom. Interparliamentary union.

Bernard, H.R. 2012. *Social research methods. Qualitative and Quantitative Methods* (2nd edition.). University of Florida. SAGE.

Bertelsen, E. 1996. "Selling change: Advertisement for the 1994 South African Election." *African Affairs*, 95 (379):229.

Bless, C. Higson-Smirth, C. & Kagee, A. 2006. *Fundamentals of social research methods: an African perspective*. Cape Town: Juta.

Bojabotsheha, T. Moloi, K C. 2014. A critical analysis of the African National Congress's dominant hegemonic liberal discourse. *Mediterranean journal of social sciences*. Mcser publishing, Rome-Italy. 5 (1) January 2004.

Brand South Africa: Official custodian of South Africa's Nation Brand. <https://www.brandsouthafrica.com> (accessed 21 June 2017)

Bottes, L. Lenka, M. Marais, L. Matebisi, Z. & Sigenu, K. 2007. The new struggle: service delivery related unrest in South Africa. University of Free State. Bloemfontein.

Botes, P.S., Brynard, P.A., Fouri, D.J., Roux. N.L. 1992. Public Administration and Management: A guide to Central Regional and Municipal Administration and Management. Kagiso Tertiary: Pretoria.

Bouma, G & Atkinson, B. 1995. A handbook of social science research a comprehensive and practical guide for students. Oxford University press.

Bowen, G A 2009 "Document analysis as a Qualitative research method" "Qualitative research journal, 9 (2), pp.27-40.

Booyesen, S. and Masterson, G. 2009. In Kadina, D. and Booyesen, S. (eds). Compendium of elections in Southern Africa, 1989-2009. 20 years of multi-party democracy, EISA, Johannesburg, pp. 399-402.

Bratton, M. 2006. Poor people and democratic citizenship in Africa. Paper presented at workshop in poverty and democracy. Duke University, February 17-18, 2006.

Butler, A. 2009. "The ANC's National Election Campaign of 2009: Siyanqoba" In Southall, R. & Daniel, J. (eds.), Zunami! The 2009 South African Elections. Jacana Media (Pty) Ltd: Sunnyside: P65.

Campbell, J. 2014. Black and white income inequality in South Africa and the United States. Council on foreign relations. <http://blogs.cfr.org,campbell/2014/09/12/black-and-white-income-inequality-in-south-africa-and-united-states>.

Carothers, T. 2005. "What really lies behind challenges of deepening democracy and establishing the rule of law"? Presentation at the centre for the future state conference. New challenges in state building, 21 June 2005, London.

Cloete, J J N. 1991. Public administration and management. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Cloete, F. 1995. Improving public policy. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Cohen, D. 2006. Qualitative research guidelines project: semi-structured interview. New Jersey: Robert Wood. Johnson foundation. From: <http://www.sswm.info> (accessed 03 March 2017).

Cohen, L. & Manion, L. (1995). Research methods in education. 4th ed. New York: Routledge Falmer.

Creighton, J.L. 2005. The public participation handbook. San Francisco, USA: Jossey-Bass.

Crenson, M.A. & Ginsberg, B. 2002. Downsizing democracy: How America side-lined its citizens and privatised its public. A journal of political economy. 9 (1). pp. 141-143. Summer 2004.

Creswell, J.W. 2003. Research design: qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approach. 2nd edition. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Creswell, J.W. 2014. Research design: qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches. 4th edition. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Cummings, T.G. & Worley, C G. 2001. Organisation development and change. 7th edition. Cincinnati, Ohio: South Western College Publishing.

De Wet, J. 2004. "Poster Themes in Bloemfontein during the 2004 general election campaign". *Communitas: Journal for Community Communication and Information Impact*, 9: 109-110.

Devarajan, S. & Widhund, I. (Eds.). 2007. The politics of service delivery in democracies. Better access for the poor. EGDI. Stockholm (Edita).

De Vos, A.S. 1998. (Ed.). Research at grassroots: a primer for carrying professions. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Doherty, G.D. 1994. Developing quality systems in education. New York: Routeledge Falmer.

Durrheim, K. & Wassenaar, D. 2002. Putting design into practice: writing and evaluating research proposal (54-71). In Terre Blanche, M. & Durrheim, K. (Eds), research in practice:

applied methods for the social sciences. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Easterly-Smith, M. Thorpe, R. & Lowe, A. 1991. Management research and introduction. London: Sage publishers.

Ebrahim, F. & Holland, W. "changing voting patterns?" Journal of administration: special issue (2011): 1139-1152.

Elos, S. & Kyngas, H.2008. The qualitative content analysis process Journal of Advance Nursing. 62 (1), 107-115.

E.W.N: Eyewitness News, 3 July 2017.

Evertzen, A. (2001). Gender and local governance. SNV-Netherlands Development Organisation.

Fakir, E. 2007. Public service delivery in a democratic state. Policy issues and actors. Vol. 20. No.3 pp. 1-11.

Fox, W. & Meyer, I.H. 1995. Public Administration Dictionary. Cape Town: Juta & Co Ltd.

Fox, W. & Meyer, I.H. 1995. Public and development management. Bellville: University of Stellenbosch.

Frankel, J.R. & Wallen, N.E. 2006. How to design and evaluate research in education. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Friedman, S. 2009. "An Accidental Advance? South Africa's 2009 Elections." Journal of democracy. RO (4), October 2009. P 108-121.

Friedman, S. 2014. "The path of the past: South African democracy twenty years on". EISA. Election update compendium. 2014, pp 37-42.

Gaffney, S. 2004. Local government 2004-2006. Official year book. Department of provincial and local government. Pretoria.

Garretsen, H. Stoker, J. Lammers, J. and Allessie, R. 2014. Simply a matter of luck and looks?

Predicting elections when both the world economy and the psychology of faces count. CEFISO Working Paper, No. 4857. University of Munich: Centre for economic studies & Ifo Institute.

Hanekom, S.X. 1987. Public Policy: Framework and Instrument for Action. Johannesburg: MacMillan.

Harris, L. 1997. Economic objectives and macroeconomic constraints. In J Michie and V Padayachee (Eds). The political economy of South Africa's transition. Policy perspectives in the late 1990's. pp. 91-100. London: The Dryden Press.

Hart, A W. 1995. Reconceiving school leadership. Emergent views. The elementary school journal. Vol. 96. No.1. September 1995. Chicago: University of Chicago.

Hofstee, E. 2006. Constructing a good dissertation: a practical guide to finishing a Masters, MBA or PHD on schedule. Johannesburg: EPE.

Horowitz, D.L. 2003. Electoral systems: a primer for decision makers. Journal of democracy, 14 (4), pp. 115-127.

Hsieh, H. & Shanon, S.E. 2005. Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. Qualitative health research, 15(9) pp. 1277-1288.

Johnson, B. & Turner, F. 2003. Data collection strategies (297-315). In Tashakkori, A & Teddlie, C. (Eds), Handbook of mixed methods in social and behavioural research. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Johnson, R.W. & Schlemmer, L. 1996. "National issues and national opinion". In Johnson, R W. and Schlemmer, L. launching democracy in South Africa: the first open election, April 1994: London.

Jorgensen, M.W. & Phillips, L.J. 2002. Discourse analysis. A theory and method. London: SAGE publications.

Joshi, A. 2010. Review of impact and effectiveness of transparency and accountability

initiatives: service delivery. From: <https://www.ids.ac.uk> (accessed 3 March 2017).

Katebire, D.A. 2007. Social research methodology: an introduction. Kampala: Makerere University printers.

Knoesen, S.G. 2009. The Politics of Distribution in South Africa. For presentation at WGAPE: May 15 and 16 2009, UCLA.

Kotze, D. 2009. "The working of the South African electoral system. Is the playing field level?". EISA. Election update compendium 2009. EISA (2010), p.16-19.

Kumar, R. 2011. Research Methodology. A step-by-step guide for beginners (3rd edition). London: SAGE.

Laforest, J. & Bouchard, L.M. 2009. Guide to organising semi-structured interviews with key informants: safety diagnosis tool kit for local communities. Quebec: Department of Communications. From: [http://www.sswm.info>reference-attachements](http://www.sswm.info/reference-attachements) (accessed 05 February 2017).

Leedy, P.D & Ormrod, J.E. 2005. Practical research planning and design. (7th Ed.). New Jersey: Merrill Prentice Hall.

Leedy, P.D & Ormrod, J.E. 2014. Practical research planning and design. (10th Ed.). London: Pearson.

Lemon, A. 2009. The implications for opposition parties of South Africa's 2009 general elections. Paper for presentation at the Democratization in Africa Conference, Leeds University.

Levine, S.J. 2005. Writing and presenting your thesis or dissertation. Michigan: First Lulu.com. Leaner Associates.net. also available: <http://www.leanerassociates.net> (accessed 20 September 2017).

Lodge, T. 1999. "The African National Congress" in Andrew Reynolds (ed.), election '99 South Africa: From Mandela to Mbeki (London:James Currey) 64-87.

- Lovitts, B. & Wert, E. 2009. Developing quality dissertations in the social sciences: a graduate student's guide to achieving excellence. Sterling, VA: Stylus Publishing.
- Maluleka, T.S. 2009. Much ado about election manifestos: Focus on the 2009 South African elections.
- Maree, K. (Ed). 2010. First Steps in Research. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Marshall, C. & Rossman, G.B. 1999. Designing qualitative research. London: SAGE publication.
- Martinnelli, C. 2006. Would rational voters acquire costly information? *Journal of Economic Theory* 129 (2006), 225-251.
- Mattes, R. 2002. South Africa: Democracy without the people. *Journal of Democracy*, 13 (1): 22-36.
- Mattes, R. & Southall, R. popular attitudes towards the South African electoral system. *Democratization*, 1 (1), February 2004, pp. 52-77.
- Mckinley, D.T. 2009. South Africa: a critique of the ANC and COPE election manifestos. From: <http://www.links.org.za> (accessed 20 December 2016).
- Mc Lennan, A. & Munslow, B. 2009. The politics o service delivery in South Africa. Pretoria: HSRC publishers.
- McMillan, J.H. & Schumacher, S. 2000. Research in education. A conceptual introduction. (4th Ed.). New York: Priscilla McGeehgon.
- McMillan, J.H. & Schumacher, S. 2002. Research in education. A conceptual introduction (6th Ed.). New York: Longman.
- Merriam, S.B. 1998. Qualitative research and case study applications in education. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Michie, J. 1997. Developing the institutional framework: employment and labour market policies. In J. Michie and V Padayachee, (Eds.). *The political economy of South Africa's*

transition. Policy perspectives in the late 1990's. pp. 155-171. London: The Dryden Press.

Morenikeji, A.A & Oluwafemi, O.J 2014. Towards a theoretical definition of public administration. Vol. 1. Issue 3. Ver. V (March 2014), pp 65-70.

Mouton, J. 1996. Understanding Social Research. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Mouton, J. 2001. How to succeed in your Masters and Doctoral studies: A South African guide and resource book. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Musitha, E.M. 2016. Integrated development plan as a redistribution policy in South Africa: prospects and challenges. European journal of research in social sciences. Vol.4 no.6. 2016. Progressive academic publishing, UK.

Netwera, F.G. & Mathabe, N. 2006. A pervasive apartheid? An analysis of the changing high education in South Africa and its relationship with the state. Journal of Education Administration History, 38 (1), pp. 29-40.

Netswera, F.G. & Kgalane, S. 2014. The underlying factors behind violent municipality service delivery protest. Journal of Public Administration. 49 (1). March. 2014. Pp. 261-273.

Ngarhodjm, N.F. 2007. African Charter on Democracy, Election and Governance. A critical analysis. Open Society Institute. Africa Governance, Monitoring and Advocacy Project.

Ngulube, P. (2005). Research procedures used by Master of Information Studies students at the University of Natal in the period 1982-2002 with special reference to their sampling techniques and survey response rate: a methodological discourse. The international information and library review, 37. pp 127-143.

Norris, P. 1997. Choosing electoral systems: proportional, majoritarian and mixed systems. International political science review, 18 (3). "contrasting political institutions" pp.297-312.

Oliver, P. 2004. Writing your thesis. SAGE study skills. New Delhi: SAGE publishers.

O'sullivan, E. Berner, M. & Rassel, G.R. 2008. Research method for public administrators. New York: Pearson education Inc.

Oxford English Dictionary. Retrieved: 18 April 2015, from <http://www.oxford.com/concise-oed/medium>. View=uk.

Oxford South African Concise Dictionary. 2010. Cape Town: ABC Press.

Owusu-Amoah, D.2012. the importance of political party manifestos for national development. From: <https://www.modernghana.com/news>. (accessed 22 March 2015).

Patel, E.2011. The new growth path: framework. Economic Development Department Publication. Republic of South Africa. Pretoria: government printers.

Petlane, T.2009. Election manifesto: Time for a different approach. From: <http://www.saiia.org.za/opinion-analysis/election-manifestos-time-for-a-different-approach>. (Accessed 16 March 2017).

Powell, D.M. O'Donnovan, M. & de Visser, J. 2013. Civic Protest Barometer. Cape Town: MLGI.

Ranchod, R. 2013. A kind of magic: the political marketing of the ANC. Sunnyside: Jacana Media (Pty) Ltd.

Remenyi, D. 1996. So you want to be an academic researcher in business and management studies! Where do you start and what are the key philosophical issues to think about? South African Journal of Business Management, 27 (1/2): pp.22-33.

Remenyi, D. William, B. Money, A. & Swartz, E. 1998. Doing research in Business and Management. London: SAGE publications.

Schedler, A. 2002. The nested game of democratisation by elections. International political science review 23 (1) pp. 101-122.

Siddiqui, A.B. 2012. An empirical study of managing fairness in electoral system through reforms. International journal of marketing and technology. 2 (3), 53-74.

Skorpol, T. 2003. Diminished democracy: from membership to management in American civil life. Norman University of Oklahoma Press.

Southal, R. 2010. South Africa's 1994 elections in an African perspective. *African Insight*. 24. (2).

Stake, R.E. 2000. Case studies. (435-454). In Denzin, N.K. & Lincoln, Y.S. (Eds). *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 2nd edition. California: SAGE.

Strauss, S. & Corbin, R.G. 1998. *Basic qualitative techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE.

Strydom, H. 2002. Ethical aspects of research in the social sciences and human service professions (62-75). In De Vos, A.S. (Ed.), *Research at grass roots: for the social sciences and human services professions*, 2nd ed. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Taylor, S J. & Bogdan, R. 1998. *Introduction to qualitative research methods: A guide book and resource* (3rd Ed.). University of Florida: SAGE.

Terre Blanche, M. & Kelly, K. 2002. Interpretative Method (123-146). In Terre Blanche, M. & Durrhein, K (Eds), *Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Thornhill, C. & van Dijk, G. (2010). The Domain of Public Administration. *Journal of Public Administration*. 41(4.1). December 2006.

Trapida, M. 2009. ANC manifesto: South Africa first. From: <http://www.thoughtleader.co.za/traps/2009/01/11/ancmaifesto-south-africa-first>. (Accessed 15 February 2017).

Twala, C. 2014. The Historical Significance of the African National Congress (ANC) election campaign 1994-2014: A genuine process of political liberalisation. *Mediterranean. Journal of Social Sciences*, S (7). P562-567.

Uggen, C. & Manza, J. 2002. Democratic construction? political consequences of felon disenfranchisement in the United States. *American sociological review*, 67 (Dec 2002), 777-808.

Van der Berg, S. 1998. "Consolidating South African democracy: the political arithmetic of

budgetary redistribution”. African affairs.

Van der Waldt, G. & Du Toit, D.F.P. 2011. *Managing for excellence in the public sector* (2nd Ed.). Landsowne: Juta & Co. Ltd.

Vithal, R. & Jansen, J. (2001). *Designing your first research proposal: A manual for researchers in education and the social sciences*. Durban: Juda.

Vukuzenzele, May 2016.

Welsh, D. 2009. *The rise and fall of apartheid*. Johannesburg and Cape Town: Jonathan Ball publishers.

Wieland, C. 2001. Ethnic conflicts addressed: Patterns of contrast, interest of elites and clientelism of foreign powers in comparative perspectives- Bosnia, India, Palestine nationalities papers. *The journal of nationalism and ethnicity*, 29 (2) pp. 207-214.

Wilson, F. & Rampedi, R. (1989). *Uprooting poverty in South Africa*. New York: Hunger project paper no.7. pp. 261-263.

World Bank. 2003. *World development report (2004) making services work for poor people*. Washington Dc. From: [http:// www.worldbank.org/worldbank2003](http://www.worldbank.org/worldbank2003). (accessed 24 March 2017).

Yadav, Y. 1999. “Electoral politics in the time of change: India’s third electoral system, 1989-1999”, *economic and political weekly*, Mumbai, August 21 1999.

Yeasmin, S. & Ferdousour-Rahman, K. 2012. “Triangulation” research method as the tool of social science research- *BUP journal*. Vol.1, issue 1, September, 2012, pp. 2217-4851. From: <https://www.bup.edu.dd>journal>. (Accesses 21 February 2017).

Yin, R K. 2003. *Application of case study research* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, Ca: SAGE.

Zalani, M.N. & Hua, A.K. 2016. A Review of Research Framework in Manifesto in General Elections: An experience of Malaysia Politics. *Journal of Scientific and Engineering Research*. Vo.3. no. 3. Pp325-327.

Policy documents and reports

African National Congress. 2014. The 2014 African National Congress: National Election Manifesto.

African National Congress. 2009. The 2009 African National Congress: National Election Manifesto.

African National Congress. 2004. The 2004 African National Congress: National Election Manifesto.

African National Congress. 1999. The 1999 African National Congress: National Election Manifesto.

African National Congress. 1994. The 1994 African National Congress: National Election Manifesto.

African National Congress. 1994. The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP). A Policy Framework. Johannesburg. Umanyano.

Manuel, T. 2011. National Development Plan-Vision 2030. Planning Commission: Pretoria.

Thulamela Local Municipality. IDP Review (Draft) Annual Report of 2015/16. Thohoyandou

Thulamela Local Municipality. Annual Report of 2015/16. Thohoyandou.

Vhembe District Municipality. Annual Report of 2013/14. Thohoyandou.

Legislation

South Africa. 1996. Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. 1996 (Act 108 of 1996). Pretoria; Government Printers.

South Africa. 1996. Electoral Commission Act. 1996 (Act 51 of 1996). Pretoria; Government Printers.

South Africa. 1998. Electoral Act.1998 (Act 73 of 1998). Pretoria; Government Printers.

South Africa. 2003. Municipal Finance Management Act. 2003 (Act 56 Of 2003). Pretoria; Government Printers.

Unpublished Sources: Dissertations and Theses.

Babooa, S.K. 2008. Public participation in the making and implementation of policy in Mauritius with reference to Port Louis' Local Government. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis. University of Pretoria.

Maphazi, N. 2012. A critical analysis of the role of public participation in governance and service delivery with specific reference to the Buffalo City Municipality. Unpublished thesis for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Faculty of Arts, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. Port Elizabeth.

Shaidi, E W. 2013. Investigation into causes of service delivery protests in municipalities. A case study of Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality. Doctorate Dissertation.

Thomas, P Y. 2010. Towards developing a web-based blended learning environment at the University of Botswana. D. Ed. Thesis (Didactics), University of South Africa.

Vosloo, J.J. 2014. A sport management programme for educator training in accordance with needs of South African Schools (Doctoral Dissertation).

Internet

<http://www.anc.org.za/documents/1994-national-election-manifesto.1994> African National Congress National Election Manifesto. 1994. Available on (Retrieved 23 April 2016).

<http://www.anc.org.za/documents/1999-national-election-manifesto.1999> 1999 ANC National Election Manifesto. (Retrieved 24 April 2016).

<http://www.anc.org.za/documents/2004-national-election-manifesto.2004> 2004 ANC National Election Manifesto. (Retrieved 24 June 2016).

<http://www.anc.org.za/documents/2009-national-election-manifesto.2009> 2009 ANC National Election Manifesto. (Retrieved 24 June 2016).

<http://www.anc.org.za/documents/2014-national-election-manifesto.2014> 2014 ANC National Election Manifesto. (Retrieved 24 June 2016).

<https://www.salga.org.za/documents> Audit outcomes. Auditor-General South Africa. (Retrieved 13 March 2017).

<http://www.gov.za/sites/www.gov.za/files> General report on provincial audit outcomes of Limpopo-South African government (PFMA 2013-2014). (Retrieved 16 August 2016).

<http://www.thefreedictionary.com/legal> Legal- dictionary. The freedictionary. (Retrieved 16 December 2016).

<https://www.nngroup.com/articles/haloeffect> The Halo Effect. (Retrieved 04 August 2016).

<http://www.vukuzenzele.gov.za> Working together we move South Africa forward! (Retrieved 02 February 2017).

<https://www.vukuzenzele.org.za> 2014 election manifesto. (Retrieved 12 September 2017).

<https://amandlapublishers.co.za> Service Delivery Protests. (Retrieved 12 September 2016).

<https://www.politicsweb.co.za> ANC's national election manifestos (Retrieved 13 August 2016).

<https://www.sahistory.org.za>articles> IDASA survey to reveal voters' thinking/ South African history online (Retrieved 16 April 2017).

ANNEXURE A

Dear participant

I am Mpfareni Norman Ramukosi. I am a registered candidate for a Master of Public Administration (MPA) degree at the University of Limpopo. I am currently working on my mini-dissertation in partial fulfillment of the requirement of the said degree. I therefore request your participation in the study. Without your participation, the whole project might not be credible. It is against this background that a face-to-face interview schedule and a semi-structured questionnaire were designed as they are the most effective methods to elicit opinions from participants. I would like you to respond to the questions as frankly and objectively as possible. For those participants who will participate in the interview, the session will take approximately 20 minutes of your time. For those who will complete the questionnaire, about 30 minutes of your time will be needed. Participants are reminded not to write their names on the questionnaire.

Details of my study supervisor are: Dr. Mavhungu Musitha

Contact numbers: 072 687 3557/082 452 4965

Email: mavhungu.musitha@gmail.com

The registered title of the research mini-dissertation: Analysis of the election manifestos of the African National Congress about service delivery between 1994 and 2014.

Yours sincerely

MN RAMUKOSI

ANNEXURE B

Dear participant

On the next page you are cordially invited to provide consent for participating in the research. This is meant to inform you about the facts of the research so that you can decide whether or not to participate.

Yours sincerely

MN RAMUKOSI

INFORMED CONSENT FORM

I agree to participate in this study, the conditions of which are as follows:

- The information I give will be used solely for the purpose defined by the study.
- I understand that by agreeing to participate in this study, I have not waved my human rights.
- I understand that I may refuse to participate or I may withdraw from the study at any time without prejudice to myself.
- To facilitate the interviewer's job the interview will be recorded. However, the recording will be destroyed as soon as it has been transcribed.
- All interview and questionnaire data will be handled so as to protect their confidentiality. Therefore, no names will be mentioned and no information will be recorded.
- I understand that if I have any concern about my treatment during the study, I can contact the Chairperson of the Research Ethics Committee at the University of Limpopo.

Participant's signature: _____ Date: _____

Researcher's signature: _____ Date: _____

ANNEXURE C

Face-to-face interview schedule

Hello, my name is Ramukosi Mpfareni Norman

In my letter requesting this interview, I have indicated to you that I am busy with a study on the analysis of the ANC's national election manifestos between 1994 and 2014. You have consented to take part in this interview. The aim of the interview is to obtain your views, opinions and experiences regarding these manifestos. The information obtained will be used only for the purpose of the research and names of the participants will not be revealed.

May I please audio-record the interview to make it easier for me to transcribe and analyze it?

Do you have any question before we start with the interview?

A. Warm-up questions:

- Where and when were you born? Is your age group 20-30, 30-40 or 40-60?
- In which municipal ward are you?
- Who is your ward counselor?
- May you kindly share with me your highest qualification?
- Are you currently working? If yes, where?
- Are you a member of the ANC? If yes, for how long have you been?
- What position do you hold in the ANC and in which structure?
- Are you happy to be a member of the ANC? If yes, why?
- The ANC has been winning election since 1994. May you please, walk me through your emotional experience towards the ANC's national election victories from 1994 to 2014?

B. Open-ended questions

Election manifestos

- Do you vote in elections?
- Do you understand what election manifestos are all about?
- Is your party (ANC) serious about addressing service delivery priorities (the most important and that need attention first) in its election manifestos? What are your views?
- What are your views about the ANC's election manifestos being referred to as top-down (members are alleged to have little or no contribution)?
- Have you attended the ANC election manifesto launch before? If yes, can you share with me your experience or feeling? Tell me about your experience of an election manifesto launch which you have attended.

Poor service delivery and constant voting patterns

All ANC's national election manifestos have public service delivery as the central priority of the government.

- Are you satisfied about the quality of service delivery in your community? If yes, share with me how? If no, please share with me why?
- Does the ANC deliver services through its manifestos?
- Are you still willing to vote for it?
- Why do you think voters continue voting for the ANC regardless of the perception of its poor performance in service delivery?
- It is alleged that many voters in South Africa do not have the time to devote to researching aspects of political and economic policies of their political parties. Therefore, they don't have the information they need to make informed voting decisions. What are your views about some of the South African voters being referred to as uninformed politically? Explain further.
- In your view, do South Africans of all races understand the process of a democratic voting process? Explain your view.

Public (general membership) participation

- Do you attend ANC's meetings?
- Do you propose agenda issues?
- How are you invited to the meetings?
- Do you oppose views/opinions that are not in line with ANC policies?
- Do you have a say in the ANC's structures in your community?
- Are you satisfied with the quality of public participation within your organization? How do you think it may be improved?
- Describe an experience that stands out for you in terms of public participation within your organization.
- What would, according to you, be the benefit of general membership participation?

Gap between messages in the manifestos and actual service delivery

- What is your view about the fact that there is a gap between messages in the ANC's manifestos and actual service delivery? What has been your experience in your community?
- What do you think are the reasons for this gap?

C. Participants' comments

Thank you very much for your time. The session has been useful and productive. If you have any matter that you wish to add, feel free to do so now.

ANNEXURE D

Semi-structured questionnaire

- Thank you for your willingness to complete this questionnaire.
- The purpose of this questionnaire is to assist the researcher in the analysis of the ANC's national election manifestos between 1994 and 2014 about service delivery.
- It is important that you answer all the questions as accurately, objectively and freely as possible.
- Your answers to this questionnaire will be treated confidentially.
- The results of the questionnaire will be utilized only for the purpose of the research.
- Your response will enable the researcher to answer the research questions as well as to suggest a possible solution to the problem statement highlighted in Chapter 1 of this study.
- Please, do not write your name on the questionnaire.

The questionnaire has been designed as follows:

- A. Number 1 to 4: the personal information of the researcher.
- B. 5 to 9: the biographical data of the participants.
- C. 10 to 15: are based on the understanding of a democratic election process.
- D. 16 to 19: are based on the election manifestos.
- E. 20 to 22: seek to address service delivery.
- F. 23: address public (general membership) participation.
- G. 24 to 25: tackles challenges facing the ruling party.
- H. 26: participants' comments on the questionnaire.

1. First name(s): Mpfareni Norman

2. Surname: Ramukosi

3. Student number:

4. Place of birth: Duthuni (Ha-Mushavhanamadi)

5. Gender: _____

6. Age: _____

7. Home language: _____

8. Residence: Urban area or rural area _____

9. Level of education: _____

10. Did you vote in the 2014 national elections? Explain your experiences and feelings on that day.

11. Elections in South Africa are held for the National Assembly, Provincial Legislatures and Municipal Councils. Elections follow a five-years circle, with national and provincial elections taking place simultaneously and municipal elections held two years later. What are your views about the importance of national elections? Explain your views.

12. What motivates you to vote during elections? Explain in detail.

13. Would you describe your level of understanding of a democratic election process as adequate? Explain your understanding in full.

14. What do you think should be done to improve the understanding of a democratic election process in your community? What are your views?

15. What are the functions of voter education with regard to a democratic election process?

16. What are the main purposes of the election manifestos?

17. The national development plan (Vision 2030) aims at eliminating poverty and reducing inequality. Do you think the ANC is achieved that through its previous five national election manifestos? Explain further.

18. What do you think are the reasons for poor implementation of the ANC'S election manifestos? Give these reasons.

19. According to the principle of political accountability, a political party which does not keep its election manifesto promises should suffer political consequences. Do you agree with this statement? Explain your stand-point on this.

20. What do you think should be key priorities of service delivery in South Africa? Motivate your answer.

21. Why does South Africa have many service delivery protests? Motivate your argument.

22. What do you think should be done to reduce service delivery protests in South Africa? Give your opinion.

23. The South African electoral system is a closed-list proportional representation system. In this system, voters vote for parties-not for individuals. It is the parties' prerogative who it wants in the legislatures. The lists are "closed" and can't be altered by voters. At the end of the election process, these lists are used to fill seats allocated to each party. This system has serious implications for both public participation and leadership accountability. Express your views.

24. Can you explain to me what "A better life for all" means? Do you think the ANC is achieving this?

25. What do you regard as challenges facing the ruling party in view of the gap between its election manifestos and actual service delivery on the ground? How do you think these challenges should be addressed?

26. Please, make any comment you would like to that has not been covered by this questionnaire.

Thank you very much for your time!

ANNEXURE E

Confirmation of text editing is on the next page:

