Global Terrorism: A Case Study of Botswana

E Bwalya
University of Botswana, Botswana

Abstract: In the post-Cold war and post-11 September 2001 period the problem of terrorism has received worldwide attention and led governments to take various anti-terrorism measures which in the case of the United States of America (US) included the invasion of Afghanistan and Iraq. This article examines the threat that Botswana faces from international terrorism and evaluates the antiterrorism measures that the government has undertaken. The paper argues that the anti-terrorism measures adopted by the government at the national, regional and international levels are not adequate to protect the country and its citizens from terrorism. It also contends that prevention is the single most effective response to terrorism and that the government of Botswana has to improve its counterterrorist mechanisms.

Keywords: Antiterrorism, Global Terrorism, International terrorism, Post-Cold war, Terrorism

1. Introduction

Globalisation has increased the vulnerability of all countries including Botswana to the evolving international terrorist attacks partly due to porous borders, improvements in technology, communication systems and the means of transportation that facilitate mobility of populations. Luckham (2003:4) sums the situation when he notes that: "the manufacture of global order has become intimately connected to the manufacture of global disorder, as poignantly illustrated by the tragedy of 11 September 2001." Similarly, others have argued that while centred in the greater Middle East, the fighting occurs in North America, Southeast Asia and in recent years Europe while Africa is one of the key theatres (Shillinger, 2005; Wills, 2018). Most of the attacks have been attributed to the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL) operatives, operatives of Al Qaeda, and Islamist lone wolves. The economic, political and social impact of terrorism and its grave consequences to the individual, the community, and the state in terms of damage, deterring investments and tourism, are well documented (Buzan 1991; Luckham and Cathwara, 1991; Buzan & Wilde, 1998; Khadiangala, 2005; Shillinger, 2006). Consequently, it has been noted that there can be no development without security (Cilliers & Sturman, 2002). There appears to be a near consensus among analysts and observers that the growing threat of terrorism, including suicide bombings which began around the early 1980s in Lebanon, needs to be addressed comprehensively and effectively at the national (government and non-governmental), regional and international level in an integrated and coherent way (Crenshaw, 2007; Rosand & Ipe, 2008). It is also a well-known fact that terrorism or the threat to human security is not new to Southern African and Africa in general and dates back to the advent of colonial rule (Botha 2008). Michael Rifer observed that "there persists a seeming disconnect between SADC members in confronting the issue…Indeed, there may be questions about the commitments of some states to address the issue…Can southern African countries fight terrorism on a regional level? It is against this backdrop that that this study endeavors to illustrate that Botswana is not only vulnerable, like many other African states, to international terrorism but also needs to strengthen the counterterrorism measures that have been adopted to protect the people and the country's security.

The study has adopted what analysts like Adam Roberts (2008) have termed "British" or more ambiguously a "European" approach or perspective to fighting terrorism. This analysis emphasizes a multi-agency approach which is notable for its successes on terrorism and counter-terrorism and is more historically informed, encompasses certain elements distinctive from the American doctrine (Roberts 2008; Council of the European Union, 2005; Rigden, 2008). The US approach focuses on the military solutions to terrorism and counter-terrorism (Tanter, 1999; Foreign Affairs Committee, 2010, The White House, 2003). Using the "European approach" the study attempts to evaluate the effectiveness of the non-military counter-terrorist measures that the government of Botswana has put in place to defend the country and the people. There is a general view that terrorism is one of the most serious

threats facing the world today and that this trend is likely to continue in future and the government of Botswana appears to be cognizant of this and has ratified all the necessary international conventions United Nations Security Council (2001; Ward, 2003; Khunwane, 2015). The problem appears to be lack of implementation and weak ineffective antiterrorism mechanisms coupled with the fact that the government has never conducted an analysis of the security threats facing the country (Ontebetse, 2018).

The counter-terrorist measures that the government of Botswana has adopted have been influenced and motivated by the US so-called Global War on Terror (GWOT) which the data so far shows is unwinnable by military means alone (Bwalya, 2017; Benn, 2007; Crenshaw 2007; Zunes, 2003; Benn, 2007; Abbott *et al.,* 2007). Historical evidence shows that the effective countering of terrorism requires a wide range of instruments of power and strategies (Lakoff, 2006; Abbott *et al.,* 2007). Furthermore, counter-terrorism mechanisms require the cooperation and active participation of the citizens as well as regional and international organizations and other actors. Finally, despite the fact that the government of Botswana has ratified all anti-terrorism conversions, this study shows that it has not yet put effective mechanisms in place even after establishing a National Anti-Terrorism Committee in accordance with the United Nations Resolution 1373 of 2001.

2. Definition of Terrorism

The term "terrorism" is highly controversial, "intangible" and fluctuates according to historical and geographical contexts and governments have been grappling with it since recorded history (Combs 1997; Schmid 1997; Botha, 2008). In recent years the term has been closely associated with Islam even though it is a well-known fact that Islamists are not the only groups associated with modern terrorism. This is partly reflected by the failure of politicians, policy makers, academics and others, including the United Nation's (UN) to come-up with an agreed definition. According to Roberts (2008) the term terrorism is "confusing, dangerous and indispensable. There are many definitions of terrorism clearly indicating that it means different things to different people because it is a political, legal, moral and military issue (Ibid). Schmid and Jongman (2005) examined at least 109 definitions of the term illustrating the complex nature of the concept.

In spite of this, there are common elements that are found in the majority of useful definitions of the term by experts and analysts such as Wardlaw (1982), Combs (1997) and Roberts (2008). These elements emphasize the fact terrorism constitutes politically motivated unlawful violence usually perpetrated before an audience and purposely targets civilians (and none civilians), and infrastructure with the aim of attracting media attention (local, national and international), coercing, intimidating people and governments as well as international organisations in order to create a mood of fear to achieve political, ideological and/or religious goals. The US government defines terrorism under the Federal Criminal Code of 1 January 2004 Chapter 113B Part one of Title 18 Section 2331 and it is offence when it is committed primarily within the territorial jurisdiction on the United States and outside the country. Criminal acts, are defined as actions, including against civilians, committed with the intent to cause death or serious bodily injury, taking hostages, with the purpose to provoke a state of terror in the general public or group of persons, or particular persons, intimidate a population or compel a government or international organization to do or abstain from doing any act, which constitute the scope defined in the international conventions and protocols relating to terrorism (Ibid). The European Union (EU) has a more comprehensive definition that is contained in the "Common Position" adopted by the EU on December 27th, 2001 [2001/931/CSFP] and defines terrorism in part as acts aimed at:

- seriously intimidating a population, or

- unduly compelling a Government or an international organisation to perform or abstain from performing any act, or seriously destabilising or destroying the fundamental political, constitutional, economic or social structures of a country or an international organization (Cilliers & Sturman, 2002).

This definition is followed by a long list of specific activities deemed to be terrorist acts. In Africa, the term terrorism, which on the continent dates back to the pre-independence era, is also understood in the more or less same way. The African Union (AU) defines terrorism, in more or less the same way that its predecessor the Organization of African Unity (OAU) defined it under the Algiers Convention of 1990 Article 1(3), (Cilliers & Sturman, 2002). Unlike the other definitions of terrorism above, the AU

definition purposely excludes struggles for national self-determination because its predecessor the OAU supported liberation struggles. During the Cold War the term terrorism was highly controversial because the notion that one country's or person's terrorist is another's freedom fighter.

3. Types of Terrorism and Perpetrators

The history of terrorism and types of terrorist incidents or the threat of such action have been in existence for millennia and are very well documented (Ahmad, 2001; Schmid 1983; Alexander & Swetnam, 2001). Like the term terrorism, the terrorist acts appear to be difficult to define and there are many types of activities and types of violence that are covered under the umbrella of the term terrorism (Chomsky, 1988). The most common acts of terrorism include bombings, kidnappings and hostage-takings, armed attacks and assassinations, arsons and firebombing, hijackings and skyjackings, cyber-terrorism, use of nuclear, biological, and chemical (NBC) weapons. In the post 9/11 bombings, the numbers of suicide bombings have also increased and they are said to be generally as a last result of failed terrorism activities or aimed at driving foreign militaries from occupied territories (Crenshaw, 2017).

Terrorist acts can and have historically been perpetrated by states, groups (both religious and secular) and individuals (Botha, 2008; Rogers, 2008; Dearden, 2018). States also sponsor terrorism and it usually takes the form of propaganda, financial aid, training and/or assistance with intelligence and weapons. On the other hand, state terrorism is controversial because it is the government action against other states and or those of their agents or allies, people (including dissidents) in the form of assassinations, kidnappings, disappearances, and death squads (Glover, 1991; Chomsky, 1988; Chomsky, 1991; Chomsky, 2002). Non-state terrorism which is the most popular and is the focus of this study is carried out by different types of individuals (both male and females of all ages), groups of people and organizations (Hamden, 2006; Lia & Skjølberg, 2004).

3.1 Causes of Terrorism

The general consensus seems to be that individual terrorists may be deprived and uneducated people or affluent and well educated and that their acts are motivated by a number of multifaceted factors that include personal reasons, ideology and religion (Hamden, 2006). It is also a fact that many people link poverty to terrorism even though terrorism occurs in rich as well as in poor countries and the new industrialising world and in less developed areas, democracies and less democratic regimes (Lia & Skjølberg, 2004). Some analysts also contend that in some cases terrorists actives are motivated by reactions to foreign polices (perceived double standards) of certain western countries and this view was also shared by the British intelligence but not by the recent successive governments (Hewitt, 2017). Opponents all the foregoing views and any discourse on the causes of terrorism claim that such actions constitute a kind of justification for violence (Lia & Skjølberg, 2004). A common perception is the assumption that "terrorists use force or threat of force instrumentally in a conscious and premeditated fashion because they misguidedly think that it will enhance their probability of achieving a certain political or religious goal or set of goals" (Hamden, 2006:1).

Others claim that perceptions of world politics, coupled with the feeling of helplessness, generates support for terrorism among Muslims (Zhirkov *et al.*, 2014; Hewitt, 2017). The reality is that the causes, as with the perpetrators (above), are much more complex than this and sometimes very difficult to discern (Chomsky, Herman & O'Sullivan, 2002). This is because it is a well-known fact that religious zealotry does not cause terrorism since there are many religious fanatics who do not result to terrorism. Zalman contend that all terrorist acts are motivated by two things that may be difficult to swallow, sound too simple, or too theoretical: social and political injustice and the belief that violence or its threat will be effective, and lead to change (Crenshaw 2007). Therefore to suggest, as Zhirkov *et al*. (2014) do, that improvement in the relationships between the West and the Muslim world can reduce support for terrorism is rather farfetched and simplistic. Commonwealth leaders also acknowledge the multifaceted nature of causes of terrorism because they are of the view that this scourge should not be associated with any particular religion, race, nationality or ethnicity (Khunwane, 2015). Zalman argues that the question, "what causes terrorism?" is not quite the right question to be asking, because we will never be able to answer it, largely due to the fact that the presence of one factor does not provoke terrorism in the same way one can say with scientific

certainty that certain toxins cause diseases. Hence for Zalman, the more appropriate question to ask should be what are the conditions in which terrorism is most likely to take place?

3.2 Botswana's Antiterrorism Measures

As in many parts of the world, the anti-terrorist measures in Botswana, were greatly influenced by the United Nations (UN) and the American response to the 9/11 attacks after which President George W. Bush declared the GWOT and vowed to defeat all terrorists and punish states that sponsor terrorism (Pintak, 2003:183; Lia, 2006). It is in this context that the invasions of Afghanistan and Iraq, on 7 October 2001 and 20 March 2003 respectively were justified as part of making the world safer (Goldenberg, 2006). However, despite the fact that the Taliban were defeated in Afghanistan and Saddam Hussein was toppled in Iraq the ruthless insurgence wars that followed still continue to this day as well as the increase in the global terrorist activities (Shanker *et al*., 2011).

It is also now hardly undisputed, as noted above, that the GWOT has not only failed and generated more terrorist groups around the world but there is also recognition that the US needs to change it approach to fighting terrorism because the country is not much safer than before (Rogers *et al.,* 2007; Zunes 2003). The literature shows that in instead of massive military action, it is judicious, effective, and timely application of international, national laws that have broken the back of terrorist organizations and this has resulted in the perpetrators of terrorism being brought to justice (Roberts, 2008). On the overall, the Bush administration was accused of ignoring historical "lessons", lacking a political strategy and merely dealing with the symptoms of terrorism and not the root causes that are historical and decided to continue supporting many oppressive regimes around the world resulting in the Middle East becoming radicalised (Zunes, 2003; Gurtov, 2006; Roberts, 2008; Biddle, 2016).

The Trump administration has ignored the foregoing reality and decided to follow and intensity the unsuccessful military strategies of the former presidents, George Bush and Barack Obama. The results so far point to failure of the GWOT (http://carnegieendowment.org/2018/02/09/do-terrorist-trends-in-africa-justify-u.s.-military-s-expansion-pub-75476). The Africa Command

(AFRICOM) which was formed on 6 February 2007 by President George Bush as an additional tool for fighting terrorism and protecting US interest on the continent has not only failed to achieve its objectives it has generated hostility, exacerbate conflicts on the continent, and united unprecedented opposition from African leaders and civil society (Volman & Minter, 2009; Ploch, 2010; Pheko, 2011; Taylor, 2010; Cassata, 2011). These are some of the reasons why Botswana needs put on place effective antiterrorist mechanisms.

4. Botswana and International Terrorism

In the last decade or so, the terrorist bombings around the world have not only attracted media attention but they have also led to some analysts to question what measures are being undertaken to protect people in African countries such as Botswana (Cilliers & Sturman, 2002). The 2005 internet-based attacks that included the Zotob worm which temporally disrupted the machines within the US government and San Francisco Airport have further heightened the need for governments and businesses around the world to pay careful attention to the potential damage that may be caused by hackers, whatever their motives (Pool, 2005). Many analysts believe that the most effective protection against terrorism is effective preventive measures that take into account past similar experiences elsewhere (Moors & Ward 1998; Botha, 2008; Roberts, 2008; Rifer, 2005; SADC, 2002). The government of Botswana not only concurs but it has put in place 13 pieces of legislation to fight terrorism and money laundering, irregular migration, aviation security and stringent customs control (Disang, 2012). These measures have been undertaken as part of the country's support for the UN Security Council mandate (Resolution 1373) to prevent, combat and eradicate terrorism in all its manifestations. Botswana also passed the Counter-Terrorism Act by parliament in 2014 and has establishment a counterterrorism unit which is not fully operational.

On the other hand, even though there is no established known or proven link between al-Qaeda and Islamic groups in Southern Africa, this has not deterred Botswana and other countries in the region from taking local and regional counter-terrorist measures and joining the international fight against terrorism such as the US-led Trans-Saharan Counter-terrorism Initiative (Shillinger, 2005; Holt,

2004; Botha, 2004). The latter, has trained many Batswana police officers as well as those from South Africa, Kenya and Tanzania in anti-money laundering and anti-terrorism techniques. In 2008, the US allocated P4 million to the Botswana Defence Force as part of GWOT for the financial year 2009 (*Mmegi,* 7 August, 2008).

Botswana's vulnerability to terrorism is partly illustrated by the fact that Haroon Rashid Aswat, a British citizen suspected of masterminding the 7 July 2005 London bombings, stayed in the country without being detected by the authorities (Mooketsi, 2005). In another incident, Sheik Abdullah Faisal a Jamaican, who has been described as a radical Muslim intellectual with links to Al Qaeda was deported from Botswana for allegedly trying to convert young Muslims to become suicide bombers who are supposed to have targeted the 2010 World Cup in South Africa (Pitse, 2010). The country's susceptibility is also attributed to its porous borders, improvements in technology, communication systems and the means of transportation that facilitate mobility of populations and because of its relative prosperity and weak institutions (Rosand & Ipe, 2008). In general, the contemporary reality in Southern Africa is that it is:

Characterised by little policing, inadequate legislation and understaffed and under-resourced law-enforcement agencies. Numerous countries in the sub-region have set up counter terrorist units of one sort or another, but they are not yet all structured to collect, analyze and be able to share intelligence on terrorism so that pre-emptive or preventative measures can be taken. (Goredema, 2003:7).

According to Madzima (2009) Botswana's vulnerability to terrorism attacks is magnified by its renowned economic and political stability as well as openness to international financial markets coupled with efforts to attract more Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) for economic diversification and growth. Despite this the country's legal framework does not recognize the risk of money laundering in either limited-or high-risk situations. The controversy surrounding this issue was recently exposed in one of the country's newspapers (Sunday Standard 27 April 2018). The government is unable to determine whether or not the absence of any terrorism financing prosecution shows the Botswana's actual terrorism risk profile (Ontebetse, 2018). What is evident is that independent studies

and reports, including those US and the World Bank clearly show that money laundering is linked to terrorism and is a serious threat to the country. Prior to this, on 2 September 2003, US Ambassador to Botswana, Francis X. Taylor (2003), had expressed the significance of this threat when he argued that there is a clear link between organised crime, narcotics trafficking, trafficking in people, smuggling, poaching, and terrorism (Throup, 2011). The country's heavy dependence on its neighbour South Africa for critical needs such as food, electricity (until recently), and petroleum means that a serious terrorist attack in that country could result in the disruption in the flow of these items creating very serious difficulties (Ibid.). Many of these were weaknesses were also recently reiterated by Ontebetse (2018). It is also important to acknowledge that in sub-Southern Africa terrorist attacks that had surged in the aftermath of 9/11 increased moderately up to 2007 and reached their peak between 2014 and 2015 but have decreased significantly (http://carnegieendowment). In fact, if the activities of Al-Shabab and Boko Haram, the two most lethal organizations are removed from the data, it is clear that terrorist activities in the last decade or so have only increased moderately. However, terrorism is unpredictable there is no reason for any country to believe it is one hundred percent safe as the recent events in Europe and the United States have demonstrated. Perhaps more concerning in this context is the fact that many ordinary Batswana, do not believe that terrorist attacks could occur in the country or that locals might be used during such attacks or in money laundering activities connected to terrorism (Mokongwa, 2004; Ontebetse, 2018).

As with many African states, it is very difficult, if not impossible, to ascertain how much money Botswana allocates to different sectors in defence and it is even much harder to figure out the actual amount spent on anti-terrorist measures because the military expenditure continues to be elusive and shrouded by a cloak of secrecy (Molomo, 2001; Keorapetse, 2012; Botswana Guardian, 2012; Bule, 2011; Trading Economics, 2018). Others have also expressed concern regarding budget allocations to the Directorate of Intelligence and Security Services (DISS) which, among other things is tasked to fight terrorism (Keorapetse, 2012; Staff Writer, 2009; Mooketsi, 2009; Motshipi, 2010). The DISS has been accused of engaging in corrupt actives and the head of the organization was fired this year by the new president (Botswana Guardian, 2012; Mathala, 2018).

5. Counterterrorism Measures

Botswana's commitment to anti-terrorism is partly reflected by the fact that on 11 September 2001, it was one of the two countries, the other being the UK, that signed all 12 United Nations (UN) anti-terrorism conventions. In 2012, Segakweng Tsiane, the Permanent Secretary in the Ministry of Defense, Justice and Security, told a visiting United Nations Security Council Counter Terrorism Committee session in Gaborone that that Botswana was committed to full and effective implementation of its international obligations in the fight against terrorism and related crimes (Kgamanyane, 2012). She went on to note that one of the challenges the country was facing regarding comprehensive and integrated implementation of counter terrorism measures is resource limitations. In addition, Tsiane explained that despite resource constraints, her country had made progress by creating a strong legislative environment against terrorism and its proceeds by either amending or enacting new legislation (Ibid).

The country has passed an antiterrorism Act (2014) also established and a National Counterterrorism Committee which deals with issues pertaining to terrorism and weapons of mass destruction. The Committee is made up of officials from; the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which chairs the Committee; the Office of the President; the Attorney-General's Chambers; the Department of Civil Aviation; the Botswana Defence Force; the Botswana Police; the Department of Customs and Excise; the Department of Immigration and Citizenship; and the Bank of Botswana (Mokongwa, 2004). In addition, there are 13 pieces of legislation in place that can be utilized in anti-terrorism activities and related crimes like money laundering, illegal migration, aviation security (Kgamanyane, 2012).

Botswana is also a party to the Vienna Convention, and has ratified the international Suppression of Financing of Terrorism Convention and ratified all the 11 other conventions related to terrorism and at the regional level. These include: the Southern SADC) Protocol against Corruption; the SADC Protocol on Combating Illicit Drug Trafficking; SADC Protocol on Wildlife Conservation and Law Enforcement; SADC Protocol on Extradition; SADC Protocol on Firearms, Ammunition and Other related materials; SADC Protocol on Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Madzima, 2009:11). Botswana also has bilateral agreements with the United States of America and regional arrangements like the Southern African Regional Police Chiefs Cooperation Organization (SARPCCO), the African Union, Commonwealth of Nations, and these are supposed to contribute to collective efforts directed at reducing threats from terrorism (Ewi & Aning, 2006; Government of Botswana, 2003).

Since 9/11 (http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/42249.pdf) the government has also issued several statements regarding its commitment to fighting terrorism (Disang 2012; Kgamanyane, 2012). Furthermore, the country has been praised for being "an exemplary market-oriented democracy" which is contributing to regional stability and supporting US goals in Southern Africa (Lyden, 2004). Botswana is credited with providing a venue for regional military exchanges that have furthered a spirit of regional cooperation and the country cooperates with US law enforcement agencies and is home to the only International Law Enforcement Academy in Africa (ILEA). Among other things, the academy provides anti-terrorism training (Ibid). There are also claims, which the government denies, that Botswana hosts a US lily pad or military base (Njini, 2004; Kagiso, 2009).

Evidently, the government of Botswana has undertaken various anti-terrorist measures to protect its citizens. At the same time, Botswana like most countries in the region still faces serious challenges regarding antiterrorism measures. According to Minister of Defence, Justice and Security, Dikgakgamatso Seretse, the vulnerability the country to terrorism is partly to the fact that the country has not formalised its national security strategy (Mmegi, 8 October 2008). The country appears to have serious problems detecting potential terrorists despite having access to the Southern African Police Chiefs Co-operation Organisation (SARPCCO) links and an International Criminal Police Organization – (INTERPOL) data base, the secure global police communication system (I-24/7) which gives the country's police agencies direct access to INTERPOL's criminal databases. The case of Sheik Abdullah Faisal which is cited above demonstrates this problem.

In addition, despite having ratified regional, continental and various international agreements on terrorism, Botswana has not taken significant effective measures to serious combat terrorism even after the establishment of the controversial DIS (Ontebetse, 2018). There seems to be no exchange of information in Botswana society relating to money

laundering and terrorism in the domestic and international context (Mokongwa, 2004). Perhaps even more serious, is the observation that despite the fact that there have been a number of prosecutions regarding money laundering, "Botswana has not yet undertaken an assessment of its risks and vulnerabilities to money laundering and the financing of terrorism in terms of international requirements" (Madzima, 2009:1). Critics argue that in order to combat terrorism merely implementing landmark decisions is not enough there is need to also ensure that the counter-terrorism instruments are effected (Ewi & Aning, 2006). There is also a general observation that tougher anti-terrorist laws are controversial because they often require a surrender of certain basic freedoms that people enjoy in liberal democracies (Hübschle, 2005).

Being landlocked, Botswana which shares borders with Zambia and Zimbabwe on the north and north east and South Africa and Namibia on the west and north, has had a very difficult task of policing the borders even after enlisting the army's help (Molomo, 2001). This has also exposed the country to organized crime, money laundering, and the possibility of terrorist acts (Madzima, 2009; Nkala, 2003; Goredema, 2003). In 2008, *The Zimbabwean* (13 December 2008) reported that Namibia and Botswana had arrested and secretly deported several members of the Egyptian Muslim Brotherhood, which has links with the Al Qaeda movement. Many of the suspects, who were investigated for money laundering and trying to establish a sleeper cell in Botswana, are believed to have come to the country because of the booming imported second hand car trade (Ibid.).

These developments led to the British government telling the authorities that Batswana would need visas to visit the United Kingdom unless the government significantly reduced the risk posed by its citizens (Ibid). The problem is further compounded by the presence of many foreign nationals who entered the country using fake documents or crossed the border illegally. The government is unable to respond effectively to these challenges because of lack resources in the form of manpower, funding, and equipment and lack of a strong legal counterterrorism framework and poor bureaucratic capacity (Rosand & Ipe, 2008; Republic of Botswana, 2006). In fact, the country does not even have a specific ministry designated as a focal point in the event of a terrorist attack (Mokongwa, 2004). The importance of community policing and intelligence sharing between the police and civilians has been emphasized by the government of Botswana but they have not been implemented.

Some critics contend that like most Southern African states, Botswana does not appear to regard terrorism, especially international terrorism, as an urgent African threat (Du Plessis, 2006; Rosand & Ipe 2008; Rifer, 2005). Instead, Botswana and other countries in the region have tended to perceive international terrorism as the focus of the UN counter-terrorism program, as well as a Western problem and see it as less salient to their own concerns such as HIV/AIDS and violent street crime (Center on Global-counter-terrorism Cooperation, 2007). It is therefore not surprising that Botswana's National Anti-Terrorism Committee which is mandated to enforce financial laws and regulations, immigration control, aviation security, asylum control and other law enforcement measures does not explain how it works with other law enforcement organs and it is not empowered by any law (Mokongwa, 2004.) Many detractors contend that Botswana which is a member of the Eastern and South African Anti-Money Laundering Group, a Financial Action Task Force-style regional body, still remains very vulnerable to terrorism because terrorist financing has not been "criminalized as a specific offense".

6. Improving Antiterrorism Measures

It is evident from the foregoing that Botswana, like other African countries, is not immune to the threat of domestic and international terrorism because stable states "provide the infrastructure enabling extremist entities to transfer and launder funds and acquire material and logical support for operations, but generally lack sufficient security controls and capabilities" (Schillinger, 2005:3). This is part of the reason why Botswana and other African states need to beef-up their efforts urgently (Donahue, 1998; Botha, 2008). It cannot be overemphasised that successful counter terrorist campaigns in Botswana and elsewhere require greater close collaboration between the military and civil society because there are dense and complex informal global networks that sustain terrorism (Mokongwa, 2004; Luckham, 2003; Hutchful & Bathily, 1996; Ottaway, 1997). Guarding against the terrorist threat requires understanding ways in which people and money move through Africa and across the globe (Shillinger, 2005). Hardly surprising therefore that at the time of writing this article the government

of Botswana was engaged in the process of passing amending the antiterrorist act (Ramatiti, 2018). It is also important to acknowledge that fighting terrorists is a very complex process and that no country is immune to terrorist attacks (Rubin & Gershowitz 2006). Botswana should not heavily depend on regional and international counterterrorism measures to defend itself because these efforts often take a long time to be operational (MacHugh, 1998; Khadiangala, 2005). There is also need for the police and other security agencies to guard against cyber terrorism as part of the overall anti-terrorist measures since it is a well-known fact that terrorism occurs because the terrorists are one step ahead of governments (MacHugh, 1998). Botswana needs to confront the international terrorist threats head-on despite arguments by some analysts, like Laurie Garrett, who claim that the AIDS epidemic is a greater threat to international security than terrorism (*Pittsburg Post,* 19 July 2005; Baregu & Landsberg, 2004).

The terrorist activities around the world illustrate that the country's level of development, income, ideological orientation and or foreign policy cannot shield it from terrorism. In short, all countries are potentially vulnerable and need international assistance including from the American and European partners (Mair, 2003). At the national level, Botswana needs to enact appropriate and effective anti-terrorist measures as a safeguard because experience elsewhere shows that many countries act after some terrorist attack (Mokongwa, 2004; Hübschle, 2005). Despite the scholarly debates around the issues of human rights versus protection against terrorist attacks and whether or not anti-terror laws deter terrorist activities, many observers, analysts and experts contend that it is better to have them in place than after the fact (Schönteich, 1998; Botha, 2008). It is also true that the anti-terror laws around the globe have generally generated some degree of trepidation and even, outright opposition, from civil society and human rights activists because of the danger of detaining and punishing innocent people as has been witnessed in many parts of the world (Schönteich, 1998).

7. Conclusion and Recommendations

Evidently, globalisation has not only increased Botswana's vulnerability to terrorism but it has also led to the country to take several counterterrorist measures that need to be improved through the enactment of proactive anti-terrorist policies and effective counter terrorism mechanisms. It also clear that despite the fact there is no clearly established terrorist threat to the country, Botswana, like its neighbours, needs to improve its overall anti-terrorism measures internally and the country should continue to actively participate in the formulation and implementation of counterterrorism policies and mechanisms at both regional and international levels. The porous borders, money laundering, the existence of western interests in the country and the weak financial regulations appear to exposed the country to potential terrorist acts as the expulsion of people who were alleged to be connected to Al Qaeda illustrate. There is also urgent need to come-up with sophisticated mechanisms for monitoring and containing the trafficking of false documents (Shillinger, 2005). The amendment of the antiterrorist Act which is being debated in parliament will be a positive step in the right direction regarding the key concerns raised in this discourse (Ketumile, 2018). At the regional level, it has been argued that it is in the interest of every SADC country "to ensure that the proper precautions be in place to militate against" terrorism and that Southern Africa must "demonstrate to the world that it is serious about the issue, and to explore the creation of a regional anti-terrorism strategy" (Rifer, 2005). It also seems evident that the challenge for Botswana and the rest of Africa with regard to counterterrorism and security cooperation involves conducting an honest assessment of the current threats facing the continent and utilizing the past lessons of regional government cooperation and developing realistic policies and strategies for addressing cross-border issues. This could be achieved through the effective and efficient use of the limited national, regional and international financial and human resources.

References

Alexander, Y. & Swetnam, M. 2001. Osama Bin Laden's Al-Qaida: Profile of a Terrorist Network. NY: Transnational Publishers.

Al-Qaeda World Cup Arrest Follows South African Professor's Warning, 2010. Available at: http://news.xinhuanet.com/eng lish2010/world/2010-05/17/c_13299697.htm. Reuben Pitse, Muslim cleric had extensive (South African & Nigerian) links in Botswana. Sunday Standard, 18 January 2010.

Anneli, B. 2008. Challenges in Understanding Terrorism in Africa: A Human Security Perspective. *African Security Review*, 17:(2):28-41.

Botha, A. 2004a. Political Dissent and Terrorism in Southern Africa, Institute for Security Studies Occasional Paper 90, August.

Botha, A. 2004b. Terrorism, In Goredema, Charles and Botha, Anneli. African Commitment to Combating Organised Crime and Terrorism: A Review of Eight NEPAD Countries. Monograph: African Human Security Initiative.

Botha, A. 2005a. *PAGAD: A Case Study of Radical Islam in South Africa,* Terrorism Monitor, Volume 3, Issue 8, September, Available at: http://www. jamestown.org/terrorism/.

Botha, A. 2005b. *An assessment of Terrorist Countermeasures Adopted by the African Union,* Washington: National Defence University, Africa Center for Strategic Studies, Commissioned Papers Series.

Botha, A. 2008. Challenges in Understanding Terrorism in Southern Africa: A Human Perspective. *African Security Review*, 17(2):29-33.

BBC News. 2008. 18 February.

Biddle, S. Available at: http://www.strategicstudiesinstitute.army.mil/pdffiles/Pub603.pdf.

Botswana Guardian. 2012. Auditors blow whistle on DISS corruption, 30 March.

Botswana Police Service. Available at: http://www.interpol.int/Member-countries/Africa/Botswana.

Breaking News, 2009. 2 February.

Bule, E. 2011. Is Defense and Security a Priority in Botswana? The Monitor, 11 April.

Buzan, B. 1998. People States & Fear: An Agenda for International Security Studies in the Post-Cold War Era. Harlow: Pearson Longman.

Buzan, B. 2000. The Logic of Regional Security in the Post-Cold War World. In B. Hettne, A. Inotai and O. Sunkel (eds.). *The New Regionalism and the Future of Security and Development*, 4. London: Macmillan Press, 1-25.

Buzan, R. (eds.) Governing Insecurity, *Ibid*. and Barry Buzan, Ole Weaver, Jaap de Wilde, Security: A new Framework for Analysis. Boulder: Lynne Lynner.

Bwalya, E. 2017. The American African Command (AFRICOM) and the war on terrorism: is the war winnable? *African Renaissance*, 14(2):117-137.

Cassata, D. 2011. AFRICOM Chief: Libya Mission Upset Some African Nations. Available at: http://www.navytimes.com/news/2011/04/ap-libya-africom-chief-carter-ham-says-mission-upset-some-040511.

Center on Global-counterterrorism Cooperation. 2007. Implementing The UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy in Southern Africa. Discussion Paper, Kopanong Hotel, Benoni, South Africa, 17-18 September.

Chomsky, N., Herman, E. & O'Sullivan, G. 2002. What Anthropologists Should Know About the Concept of Terrorism. *Anthropology Today*, 18(2):22-23.

Chomsky, N. 1988. The Culture of Terrorism. Boston: South End Press.

Chomsky, N. 1991. Terrorising the Neighbourhood. Cambridge: MIT Press.

Chomsky, N. 2001. Interview by David Barsamian, in *Monthly Review*, Volume 53, Number 6, November: 10-19.

Chomsky, N. 2002. What Anthropologists Should Know about the Concept of Terrorism. *Anthropology Today,* 18:(2).

Cilliers, J. & Sturman, K. 2002. Africa and Terrorism, Joining the Global Campaign Published, Monograph, 74, July.

CNN News. 2002. Bush: Join 'coalition of willing'. 20 November.

Combs, C. 1997. Terrorism in the Twenty-first Century. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Combs, C. 2003. *Terrorism in the Twenty-First Century*. Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall.

Council of the European Union. 2005. The European Union Counterterrorism Strategy Brussels: 30 November.

Crenshaw, M. 2007. Explaining Suicide Terrorism: A Review Essay Journal.

Dearden, L. 2018. Number of white people arrested for terror offences outstrip any other single ethnic group, new figures show, The Independent 3 September.

Disang, L. 2012. Botswana upholds UN counter terrorism initiatives. Sunday Standard 6 Feb.

Du Plessis, A. 2006. The Role of the United Nations in Providing Technical Assistance in Africa. In Wafula Okumu and Anneli Botha eds., Understanding Terrorism in Africa: In Search for an African Voice, Seminar Report, 6 and 7 November.

Ewi, M. & Aning, K. 2006. Assessing the Role of the African Union in Preventing and Combating Terrorism in Africa, *African Security Review*, 15(3):23-46.

Foreign Affairs Committee - Fourth Report. The UK's foreign policy approach to Afghanistan and Pakistan. Available at: https://www.parliament.uk/business/committees/committees-a-z/commons-select/foreign-affairs-committee/news/publication-of-report-on-the-uks-foreign-policy-approach-to-afghanistan-and-pakistan/.

Francis, J.D. Ed. 2010. US Strategy in Africa: AFRICOM, Terrorism and Security Challenges Routledge Global Security Studies. London: Routledge.

Glover, J. 1991. State Terrorism. Frey R.G. and Morris W.C. (eds). *Violence, Terrorism and Justice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Goldenberg, S. 2006. *President Bush Recently Admitted that Saddam was not Responsible for 9/11.* Guardian, September 12.

Goredema, C. 2003. Initiatives Against Terrorism in Southern Africa: Implications for Human Rights. *African Security Review*, 12(1):1-8.

Goredema, C. 2005. *Organised Crime and Terrorism: Observations from Southern Africa,* Occasional Paper 101, March 2005. Available at: http://www.iss.co.za/index.php.

Government of Botswana. 1999. Budget Speech, 1990-1999, Gaborone: Government Printer.

Government of Botswana. 2003. Agreement Between the Government of the United States of America and Government of the Republic of Botswana regarding the surrender of Persons to International Tribunals. Gaborone.

Government of the United States. 2006. *The National Security Strategy of the United States.* Washington DC: Government of the United States.

Gurtov, M. 2006. Superpower on Crusade: The Bush Doctrine in US Foreign Policy Boulder. Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Hamden, H.R. 2006. Psychology of Terrorists: 4 types, The Foundation for International Human Relations. Washington, D.C: Human Relations Institute Dubai, United Arab Emirates.

Hewitt, S. 2017. Is there a link Between Foreign Policy and Terrorism? British intelligence thinks so. Available at: http://theconversation.com/is-there-a-link-between-foreign-policy-and-terrorism-british-Intelligence-thinks-so-78692.

Holt, A. 2004. *South Africa in the War on Terror,* Terrorist Monitor. Available at: http://www.jamestown.org/terrorism/news/article. php?articleid=2368948. Accessed 8 August 2018.

Hübschle, A. 2005. *South Africa's Anti-terror Law Among the Least Restrictive? African Security Review*, 14(4):105-108.

Kagiso, S.D. 2009 US Military Bases Unacceptable in Africa, 10-17 June. Available at: http://www. African executive. com/modules/magazine/articles.php?article=4429&magazine=233.

Keorapetse, D. 2012. Defence and Security budget and Accountability. Gaborone: Government printers.

Kgamanyane, N. 2012. Botswana commits to war on terror, Mmgegi, 3 February.

Khadiangala, G. 2005. *Legal, Human, and Accountability Challenges to Combating Terrorism in Africa.* Washington: National Defence University.

Khunwane, T. 2015. Botswana alert to terrorism. The Daily News, Nov 30.

Lia, B. & Skjølberg, K. 2004. Causes of Terrorism: An Expanded and Updated Review of the Literature, (Forsvarets Forskningsinstitutt, Norwegian Defence Research Establishment, Kjeller, Norway.

Lia, B. 2011. Insight and hypotheses on causes of terrorism identified on the basis of a survey of the literature on terrorism Appendix 4. In Alex P.S. (ed.) *Handbook of Terrorism Research*. London: Routledge.

Luckham, R. 2003. Democratic Strategies for Security in Transition and Conflict. In Luckham, R. and Cathwara, G. (eds.) *Governing Insecurity: Democratic Control of Military and Security Establishments in Transitional Democracies.* London: Zed Books.

Lyden, M. World's Highest HIV/AIDS Prevalence Rate Highly Likely To Severely Impact US National Interests Over Next 10-15 Years. Available at: http://nie.wikispaces.com/. Botswana. Accessed on 12 February 2018.

Mathala, S. 2018. Isaac Kgosi fired. The Voice, May 7.

Mair, S. 2003. Terrorism and Africa: On the Dangers of Further Attacks in Sub-Saharan Africa, *African Security Review*, 12(1):107-110. Available at: http//www.issafrica.org. /pubs/ARS/ 12No1/ Content.html.

Mmegi. 1997. BDF to Get Tanks from Austria. 30 May-5 June.

Mmegi. 2018. Botswana commits to war on terror. 19 March.

Mokongwa, K. 2004. Botswana's Legislative Capacity to Curb Money Laundering, Monograph No 107, October .

Molomo, G.M. Civil-Military Relations in Botswana's Developmental State. *African Studies Quarterly*, 5(2):3:38-58.

Mooketsi, L. 2005. Botswana police deny knowledge of terror suspect Mmegi, 8 April.

Mooketsi, L. 2009. Police Brutality Worries Tsimako. Mmegi, 15 June.

Moors, C. & Ward, R. (eds.) 1998. *Terrorism in the New World Disorder*, Chicago: Office of International Criminal Justice, University of Illinois.

Motshipi, M. 2010. The Future of DIS. Botswana Gazette. 7 April. Gaborone: Government printers.

Njini, F. 2011. Africa: Final Conquest for Pentagon's Global Military Sphere of Influence A US military Base in Africa, Global Research, September 6.

Nkala, G. 2003. *Penetrating State and Business Organised Crime in Southern Africa,* edited by Peter Gastrow, Monograph, Number 89.

Pheko, M. 2011. US Africa Command a Tool to Recolonize Continent. Pambazuka News, Issue 558, 16 November.

Pintak, L. 2003. Bloodshot Lens: America, Islam and the War of Ideas. London: Pluto Press.

Ploch, L. 2010. CRS Report R41473, Countering Terrorism in East Africa: The U.S. Response, November 3.

Pool, J. 2005. *New Forum Positing Call for Intensified Electronic Jihad Against Government Websites,* Spotlight on Terror, Volume 3, Issue 8, 29 August. Available at: http://www.jamestown.org/ terrorism/news/ article.php? issue_id=3446.

Ramatiti, K. 2018. Botswana Muslims suspicious of new anti-terrorism law, Weekend Post 18 June.

Republic of Botswana. 2006. *Annual Economic Report Published as a Supplement to the 2006 Budget Speech*. Ministry of Finance and Development Planning. Gaborone: Government printers.

Republic of Botswana. 2008. Budget Speech 2008 Gaborone: Gaborone: Government Printers.

Republic of Botswana. 2012. Budget Speech by Honourable O.K. Matambo Minister of Finance and Development Planning Delivered to the National Assembly on 1st February 2012, Gaborone: Government printers.

Rifer, M. SADC and Terrorism Where is the regional strategy? Available at: http://www.iss.co.za/ pubs/asr/14No1/ERifer.htm.

Rigden, I.A. 2008. The British Approach to Counter- Insurgency: Myths, Realities and Strategic Challenges. Available at: http://www.dtic.mil/cgi-bin/GetTRDoc?AD=ADA479660 check date.

Roberts, A. 2008. The 'War on Terror' in a Historic Perspective. *Institute of Security Studies,* 17(2):42-60.

Rubin, M. & Gershowitz, S. 2006. *Political Strategies to Counterterrorism*: *The Evolving Threat: International Terrorism in the post 9-11 Era.* July 12. Available at: http://www.meforum.org/article/974.

Schmid, A. 1983. *Political Terrorism: A Research Guide to Concepts, Theories, Data Bases and Literature*. New Brunswick: Transaction;

Schmid, A. 1997. The Problems of Defining Terrorism. In M. Crenshaw & J. Pimlott (eds.) *Encyclopedia of World Terrorism*. New York: M.E. Sharpe.

Schmid, P.A. & Jongman, A.J. 2005. Political terrorism: a new guide to actors, authors, concepts, data bases, theories, & literature. New Jersey: Transaction Publishers.

Schönteich, M. 1998. Laws as weapons: Legislating against terrorism. Boshoff, H., Botha, A. and Schönteich, M. *Fear in the city, ISS, Pretoria, September 2001 and South African Law Commission.* Discussion Paper 78, Project 105, *Review of Security Legislation*, Pretoria, November.

Shanker, T., Schmidt, S.M. & Worth, F.R. 2011. In Baghdad, Panetta Leads Uneasy Moment of Closure. New York Times, 16 December.

Shillinger, K. 2005. *After London: Reassessing Africa's Role in the War on Terror.* 6 September. Available at: http://www.aei.org/ publications/pubID.23130, filter.all/ pub_ detail.asp.

Southern African Development Community, 9 July 2002 AFR 01/008/2002. *Southern African Policing to Protect.* Available at: http://groups.google.com/group/misc.activism.progressive/ browse_ frm/ thread /ec4bba8ae166280b.

Staff Writer. 2009. Botswana: DIS eyes P1bn – major portion for 'high-tech surveillance platform'. Mmegi. Wednesday, 12 August.

Taylor, I. 2010. The international relations of Sub-Saharan Africa, London: The continuum International Publishing Group.

The Director General Directorate of Intelligence and Security, Keynote Address During the Security Association of Botswana Annual General Meeting, Gaborone, Oasis Motel, 11 August 2010.

The U.S. Africa Command Public Affairs Office. 2011 United States Africa Command-The First Three Years, Headquarters U.S. Africa Command: Stuttgart, March

The United States Federal Criminal Code. Chapter 113B of Part I of Title 18 of the Code defines terrorism and lists the crimes. Available at: http://www.anthropoetics.ucla.edu/ ap0801/ terror.htm#n16.

The White House (Press release). 2003. President Bush Announces Major Combat Operations in Iraq Have Ended. May 1. Available at: http://georgewbush-whitehouse.archives.gov/ news/ releases/ 2003/05/ print/20030501-15.html.

The White House. 2003. National Strategy for Combating Terrorism, Washington, DC: 15-28 February.

Throup, D. 2011. Botswana: Assessing Risks to Stability. Washington D.C: Center for Strategic Studies and International Relations.

Trading Economics. 2018. Botswana Military Expenditure 1977-2018. Available at: https://tradinge conomics. com/botswana/ military-expenditure. Accessed on 12 February 2018.

Tumelty, P. 2005a. New Developments Following the London Bombings. *Terrorism Monitor,* 3(23):8-11.

Tumelty, P. 2005b. An In-Depth Look at the London Bombers. *Terrorism Monitor,* 3(15):1-4.

United Nations Security Council. 2001. Letter dated 27 December 2001 From the Chairman of the Security Council Committee Established Pursuant to Resolution 1373 (2001) Concerning Counter-terrorism Addressed to the President of the Security Council, S/2001/1267.

United States Congress. 2001. Public Law 107-56 Stat. 115 Stat. 272. United States Congress, 2001.

United States Government, Laws: Cases and Codes: U.S. Code: Title 18. Crimes and Criminal Procedure. Available at: http:// caselaw.lp.findlaw.com/casecode/uscodes/18/parts/i/chapters/113b/toc.html.

Volman, D. & Minter, W. 2008. AFRICOM: Making Peace or Fueling war? Available at: http://www.ww4report.com/node/7239.

Ward, C.A. 2003. Building Capacity to Combat International Terrorism: The Role of the United Nations Security Council. *Journal of Conflict and Security Law*, 8(2):289-305.

Wardlaw, G. 1982. Political Terrorism: Theory, Tactics and Counter-measures. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Wills, E. Europe Faced 205 Terror Attacks last year... And more than half were reported in the *Evening Standard*, 20 June 2018.

Zalman, A. AFRICOM: Controversial Command Suspected of Bringing US War on Terror to Africa. Available at: http://terrorism.about.com/od/globalwaronterror/ a/AFRICOM.Htm. Accessed on 15 February 2018.

Zalman, A. The Causes of Terrorism. Available at: http://terrorism.about.com/od/causes/a/causes_ terror. htm. Accessed on 15 February 2018.

Zhirkov, K., Verkuyten, M. & Weesie, J. 2014. Perceptions of world politics and support for terrorism among Muslims: Evidence from Muslim countries and Western Europe. *Conflict Management and Peace Science*, 31(5):481-501.

Zunes, S. 2003. Tinderbox: US Middle East Policy and the Roots of Terrorism. London: Zed Books.