TIME-BARRING AND PRESCRIPTION OF PENSION FUNDS COMPLAINTS: A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE

Masters of Laws (LLM) in Labour Law

N.S Matloga

TIME-BARRING AND PRESCRIPTION OF PENSION FUNDS COMPLAINTS: A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE

by

Nicholas Sylva Matloga

A mini-dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Laws (LLM) in Labour Law

in the

FACULTY OF MANAGEMENT AND LAW (SCHOOL OF LAW)

at the

UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO

Adv. L.T Nevondwe

2012

ABSTRACT

The amendment of section 30I (3) of the Pension Funds Act No.24 of 1956 by the provisions of section 30I of the Pension Funds Amendment Act No.11 of 2007 poses a serious threat to the constitutional right to social security (Section 27 (1) (c) of the Constitution). The amendment places this challenge on this right because it places some form of time-barring on the member of the fund or the complainant (his or her dependent) when lodging a pension funds complaint after a prescribed time has elapsed (three years) and the Adjudicator will no longer have no powers to condone such a late referral despite good cause shown and prospects of success on the part of the complainant. The said amendment has placed the poor more especially those in the rural areas in a disadvantageous position, because most of them are illiterate and not aware of their pension law rights. This means that even though they are entitled to the pension funds benefits, they cannot access it if they lodged their complaint outside the three-year period.

DECLARATION BY SUPERVISOR

I, Adv. Lufuno Tokyo Nevondwe, hereby declare that this mini-dissertation by Nicholas Sylva Matloga for the degree of Master of Laws (LLM) in Labour Law be accepted for examination.
Signed
Date Adv. Lufuno Tokyo Nevondwe

DECLARATION BY STUDENT

I, Nicholas Sylva Matloga declare that this mini-dissertation submitted to the University of Limpopo (Turfloop Campus) for the degree of Masters of Laws (LLM) in Labour Law has not been previously submitted by me for a degree at this university or any other university, that it is my own work and in design and execution all material contain herein has been dully acknowledged.

Signed	
Date	

Nicholas Sylva Matloga

DEDICATION

To my father Jerry Mogale Matloga and my mother Merriam Mokgadi Matloga for being such wonderful parents to me and for supporting me since childhood, with love and gratitude, I would like to thank you.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I am grateful to God, the Almighty, for giving me life, protecting me and blessing me so far. I will like to thank him for his grace and wonderful love he gave to me in order to complete my Master's Degree and this mini-dissertation.

I wish to express my indebtedness to Adv. Lufuno Tokyo Nevondwe, my supervisor who kindly accepted to supervise my work despite a lot of lecturing, academic and writing commitments. Adv. Nevondwe found time to read and re-read drafts of this mini-dissertation that has very much improved, thanks to his invaluable comments and suggestions.

My parents to whom this work is dedicated sacrificed so much and I fully enjoyed the support of the whole family. Accordingly, I am also indebted to my sisters Ms Mpho Brendah Mabidi, Glendah Naletjane Matloga, my brothers Lebogang, Tshepang and Ntshepeng Matloga, my nephews Mashudu, Aluwani and Alusani Mabidi and Dimpho Matloga, my cousins, especially Mr Edwin Fhedzisani Nchinyane, my uncles, aunts, grand parents and friends for their uncompromising support, encouragement and love.

I also wish to convey my gratitude to all my teachers at primary and high schools and all my lecturers at the University of Limpopo. Finally, I also benefited from my classmates and colleagues especially Mr M.J Rapatsa and would like to thank each and every one of them.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAI	PTER ONE: INRODUCTION	1
1.1.	Historical Background to the Study	1
1.2.	The Problem Stated	8
1.3.	Literature Review	9
1.4.	Aims and Objectives of the Study	12
1.5.	Research Methodology	12
1.6.	Scope and the Limitation of the Study	13
СНА	PTER TWO: THE ESTABLISHMENT AND OPERATION	
OF T	HE OFFICE OF THE PENSION FUNDS ADJUDICATOR	14
2.1. lı	ntroduction	14
2.2. T	The Establishment of the Office	14
2.3. F	Parties and Definition of Complainant	16
2.4. 0	Complaints Typically Received	17
2.5. J	urisdictional Conundrums	18
2.6. T	he Operation of the Office	19
2.7. T	he procedure for lodging a complaint	20
2.8. 0	Conclusion	21
CHAI	PTER THREE: TIME-BARRING AND PRESCRIPTION	
OF P	ENSION FUNDS COMPLAINTS	23
3.1.	Introduction	23
3.2.	The previous position	23
3.2.1	Requirements for Condonation to be Granted	24
3.2.2	. Good cause shown	25
3.2.3	Explanation for the degree of lateness	25
3.2.4	. Prospects of success	28
3.2.5	. The importance of the case	30
3.3.	The reasons for the time limit	30

3.4.	Prejudice to either party	31
3.5.	The application for condonation should be made as soon as	
	possible	31
3.6.	The current section 30I of the Act	34
3.7.	Conclusion	38
CHAP	PTER FOUR: SOCIAL SECURITY AND RETIREMENT REFORM	41
4.1.	Introduction	41
4.2.	The Proposed Retirement Reform	42
4.2.1.	Reform of the Governance and Regulation of the Retirement	
	Funding Industry	44
4.3.	Conclusion	47
CHAP	PTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMATIONS	49
BIBLI	OGRAPHY	54

LIST OF INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

- 1. African Charter of Human and People's Rights ("Banjul Charter"), 27 June 1981.
- 2. Convention on the Rights of the Child, 20 November 1989.
- 3. European Social Charter, 18 October 1961.
- 4. Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 10 December 1948.
- 5. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Right, 16 December 1966.
- 6. International Labour Organisation's Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention No. 102 of 1952.
- 7. International Labour Organization Convention No. 29 of 2000.

TABLE OF STATUTES

- 1. Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 108 of 1996.
- 2. Government Employees Pension Law, Proclamation 21 of 1996.
- 3. Labour Relations Act, 66 of 1995.
- 4. Pension Funds Act, 24 of 1956.
- 5. Pension Funds Amendment Act 11, of 2007.
- 6. Prescription Act, 68 of 1969.
- 7. Promotion of Equality and the Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act, 4 of 2000.
- 8. Transnet Pension Fund Act, 62 of 1990.
- 9. United Kingdom Pension Act of 2004.
- 10. White Paper for Social Welfare, 1997.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CCMA Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration.

GEPF Government Employees Pension Fund.

LRA Labour Relations Act, 66 of 1995.

PEPUDA Promotion of Equality and the Prevention of Unfair

Discrimination Act.

PHC Primary Health Care.

TABLE OF CASES

- 1. Allround Tooling (Pty) Ltd v NUMSA and others [1998] 8 BLLR 847 (LAC).
- 2. Beira v Raphaely-Weiner & Others 1997 (4) SA 332 (SCA).
- 3. Brown v BPK Group Retirement Fund and Another (1) (2004) 3 BPLR 5557 (PFA).
- 4. Delbridge and Others v Liberty Group Ltd and Others (2011) 1 BPLR 19 (PFA).
- 5. Evins v Shied Insurance Company 1979 (3) SA 1136 (W).
- 6. Federated Employers Fire and General Insurance Co. Ltd & Another v McKenzie (1969) (3) SA 360 A.
- 7. Foster v Stewart Scott Inc (1997) 18 ILJ 367 (LAC).
- 8. Gaoshubelwe & others v Pie Man's Pantry (Pty) Ltd (2008) JOL 22302 (LC).
- 9. Glansbeeck v JDG Trading (Pty) Ltd (1998) 7 LAC 1.18.1.BLLR.
- 10. Government of the Republic of South Africa v Grootboom 2001 1 SA 46 (CC).
- 11. Human v Protektor Pensions Funds (2001) 9 BPLR 2462 (PFA).
- 12. Khosa and Others v Minister of Social Development and Others 2004 6 BCLR 569 (CC).
- 13. Kramer v Housewares Group Provident Fund (in liquidation) and others (2010) 2 BPLR 134 (PFA).
- 14. Jansen van Rensburg v BKS Group Pension Fund and Another (2011)1 BPLR 79 (PFA).
- 15. Lekota v Call Systems (Pty) 2002 (2) SA 656 (A).
- 16. Librapac CC v Fedcraw and Others (JA49/9) (1999) ZALAC 6.
- 17. Low v BP South Africa Pension Fund and another (2000) 2 BPLR 171 (PFA.
- 18. Luiz v The Pension Funds Adjudicator and Others (Cape Provincial Division, 8 October 2002 (Case No 6969/2002) unreported.
- 19. Mahlaule and Another v Minister of Social Development 2004 (6) SA 505 (CC).
- 20. Makobo v Black Tops Surface Provident fund PFA/NP/12091/2002/LTN).
- 21. Maluleka v Municipal Gratuity Fund & another (2007) JOL 20351 (PFA).

- 22. Mampana v Atlas Copco South Africa Group Pension Fund and Another (2010) 2 BPLR 177 (PFA).
- 23. Mazibuko and others v City of Johannesburg and Others 2010 (3) BCLR 239 (CC); 2010 (4) SA 1 (CC).
- 24. Melane v Santam Insurance Company Limited 1962 (4) SA 531 (A).
- 25. Minister of Health and Others v Treatment Action Campaign and Others 2002 5 SA 721 (CC).
- 26. MM Steel Construction CC v Steel Engineering v Alied Workers Union of SA & others (1994) 15 ILJ 1310 (LAC).
- 27. Mohlomi v Minister of Defence 1997 (1) SA 124 (CC).
- 28. Motloi v SA Local Government Association (2006) 3 BLLR 264 (LAC).
- 29. Ndwandwa v Auto and General Insurance Co. Ltd (2003) 6 BLLR 2141 (LAC).
- 30. NEHAWU obo Mofokeng & others v Charlotte Theron Children's Home (2004)10 BLLR 979 (LAC).
- 31. Novo Nordisk (Pty) Ltd v CCMA and Others (1997) 9 BLLR 1141 (LAC).
- 32. NUM v Council for Mineral Technology (1999) 3 BLLR 209 (LAC).
- 33. NUMSA obo Mabinda v Manganese Metal Co (Pty) Ltd (1994) BLLR 127 (IC).
- 34. NEHAWU v Nyembezi (1999) 8 LAC 1.18.5.BLLR.
- 35. Nyanyeni v Illovo Sugar Pension Fund and another (2004) 11 BPLR 6249 (PFA).
- 36. Oertel v Dirketuer van Plaaslike Bestuur 1983 (1) SA 354 (A).
- 37. PPWAWU & others v AF Dreyer & Co. (Pty) Ltd (1997) 9 BLLR 1141 (LAC).
- 38. Professional Security Enforcement v Namsusi (1999) 8 LC 1.11.25.BLLR.
- 39. Salojee & Another v Minister of Community Development 1965 (2) SA 139 (A).
- 40. Seripe v Emfuleni Local Municipality, PFA/GA/7765/06/FM (unreported).
- 41. Sligo v Shell Southern Africa Pension Fund and another (Case No. PFA/WE/54/98).
- 42. Soobramoney v Minister of Health KwaZulu-Natal1998 1 SA 765 (CC).
- 43. Thabethe v First National Bank Group Pension Fund and another (2010) 3 BPLR 353 (PFA).

- 44. Tsumi v ABI Pension Fund, PFA/GA/2505/2005/ SM (unreported).
- 45. Vandeyar v UTICO Staff Pension Fund (2000) 3 BPLR 332 PFA.
- 46. Van Harte v ICL South Africa Pension Fund (2000) 7 BPLR 799 (PFA).
- 47. Van Wyk v Sanlam Insurance Company (Pty) Ltd (1997) 9 BLLR 1141 (LAC).
- 48. Van Zyl v Cape Municipal Pension Fund (2011) JOL 28103 (PFA).